Université de Montréal

The Dismembered Family

Youth, Memory, and Modernity in Rural Southern Chile

par

Rita Isabel Henderson

Département d'anthropologie
Faculté des Arts et des Sciences

Thèse présentée à la Faculté des études supérieures
en vue de l'obtention du grade de doctorat (PhD)
en anthropologie

Janvier 2013

Université de Montréal

Faculté des études supérieures et postdoctorales

Cette thèse intitulée :

The Dismembered Family: Youth, Memory, and Modernity in Rural Southern Chile

Présentée par :

Rita Isabel Henderson

a été évaluée par un jury composé des personnes suivantes :

Jorge Pantaleon, président-rapporteur

Deirdre Meintel, directeur de recherche

John Leavitt, membre du jury

Carlota McAllister, examinatrice externe

Catherine Poupeney Hart représentant du doyen de la FES

Titre : La famille fragmentée: Jeunes, mémoire et modernité dans le Chili rural du sud

Résumé :

Cette thèse traite de la supposée perte de culture politique et citoyenne que connaît le Chili de la période post-dictature. Bien qu'une telle perte soit généralement considérée comme une évidence, nous évaluons dans quelle mesure celle-ci est bien réelle en nous intéressant aux processus d'apprentissage du comportement civique de la plus jeune génération politique du pays qui a aujourd'hui atteint la vingtaine. Étant donné que les membres de cette génération étaient soit au stade de l'enfance, soit pas même nés au moment de la transition démocratique de 1990, ils ont habituellement pris connaissance des événements de répression étatique et de réconciliation démocratique par l'intermédiaire de leurs aînés. Ce phénomène est encore plus marqué dans les régions rurales du sud du pays où la majeure partie de ce que les jeunes générations savent du passé conflictuel de leur pays, incluant le colonialisme, le socialisme révolutionnaire et le fascisme, n'a pas été transmis par la communication verbale ou volontaire, mais indirectement via les habitudes et préférences culturelles qui ne manquent pas d'influencer les décisions politiques. À travers l'analyse des mécanismes de transmission inter-générationnelle de diverses perspectives d'un passé contesté, notre travail explore les processus par lesquels, à l'échelle micro, certains types de comportement politique sont diffusés au sein des familles et de petits réseaux communautaires. Ces derniers se situent souvent en tension avec les connaissances transmises dans les domaines publics, comme les écoles et certaines associations civiques. De telles tensions soulèvent d'importantes questions au sujet des inégalités de statut des membres de la communauté nationale, en particulier à une époque néolibérale où la réorganisation du fonctionnement des services sociaux et du contrôle des ressources naturelles a transformé les relations entre le monde rural pauvre et la société dominante provenant des centres urbains.

Au sein de la jeune génération politique du Chili, dans quelle mesure ces perspectives situées concernant un passé pour le moins contesté, ainsi que leurs impacts sur la distribution actuelle du pouvoir dans le pays façonnent-ils des identités politiques en

émergence ? Nous abordons cette question à l'aide d'une analyse ethnographique des moyens auxquels les jeunes recourent pour acquérir et exprimer des connaissances au sujet de l'histoire et de son influence latente dans la vie civique actuelle. Nos données proviennent de plus de deux années de terrain anthropologique réalisées dans trois localités du sud rural ayant été touchées par des interventions industrielles dans les rivières avoisinantes. L'une d'entre elles a été contaminée par une usine de pâte à papier tandis que les autres doivent composer avec des projets de barrage hydroélectrique qui détourneront plusieurs rivières. Ces activités industrielles composent la toile de fond pour non seulement évaluer les identités politiques, émergentes mais aussi pour identifier ce que l'apprentissage de comportement politique révèle à propos de la citoyenneté au Chili à l'heure actuelle.

Mots-clés : Chili; période post-dictature; mémoire; Mapuche; développement; jeunesse; parenté; environnement; responsabilité sociale des entreprises; Valdivia.

Abstract:

This thesis tells a story of the supposed loss of political and citizen culture in post-dictatorship Chile. Focusing on the learning of civic behaviour among the country's youngest political generation, now in its twenties, I question the taken-for-granted nature of this sense of loss. Given that members of this generation were either children or not yet born at the time of the 1990 democratic transition, they have largely learned from others about recent state repression and democratic reconciliation. This is amplified in sectors of the rural South, where much of what younger generations know about the conflicted past, including colonialism, revolutionary socialism, and fascism, has not been communicated through deliberate or verbal instruction, but transmitted indirectly as cultural tastes and habits that nevertheless influence political decisions. Through analysis of inter-generational transmissions of perspectives on the contested past, this thesis explores micro-level processes by which certain kinds of political behaviour are learned within families and small community networks. These are often in tension with lessons transmitted in public domains, such as in schools and among civic associations. Such tensions raise important questions about uneven membership in the national community, especially in a neoliberal era in which the restructuring of social services and of control over natural resources have transformed relationships between the rural poor and dominant society emanating from urban centres.

Among Chile's youngest political generation, in what ways do situated understandings of the contested past and its impacts on the current distribution of power in the country, shape budding political identities? I broach this question through ethnographic analysis of the means by which youth acquire and express knowledge about history and its lingering influence on civic life today. Observations draw on over two years of anthropological fieldwork in three localities of the southern countryside impacted by industrial interventions in nearby rivers. These include the contamination of one from a pulp mill, and the proposed hydroelectric damming and diversion of several others. Industrial activities offer backdrops for assessing emergent political identities, as well as for

identifying what the learning of political behaviour communicates about citizenship in Chile today.

Título: La Familia Desmembrada: jóvenes, memoria y modernidad en el Chile rural del sur

Resumen:

Esta tesis narra la historia de la supuesta pérdida de la cultura política y ciudadana en Chile después de la dictadura militar. Enfocándome en el aprendizaje de la conducta cívica en la generación política más joven, ahora veinte añeros, cuestiono la naturaleza de esta sensación de pérdida que se ha tomado por sentada. Dado que los miembros de esta generación eran niños y niñas o aún no habían nacido en la época de transición democrática en los 1990s, en su mayoría han sabido a través de otros acerca de la reciente represión estatal y la reconciliación democrática. Esto es amplificado en los sectores rurales del Sur, donde mucho de lo que las generaciones jóvenes saben acerca del controversial pasado, incluyendo el colonialismo, el socialismo revolucionario, y el fascismo, no ha sido comunicado a través de instrucciones deliberadas o verbales, sino que ha sido transmitido indirectamente como gustos, preferencias, y hábitos culturales que aún así tienen influencia en las decisiones políticas. A través del análisis intergeneracional de transmisión de perspectivas sobre el controvertido pasado, esta tesis explora los procesos a nivel micro por los cuales ciertos tipos de comportamientos políticos son aprendidos dentro de las familias y pequeñas redes comunitarias. Éstas muchas veces están en tensión con las lecciones transmitidas en ámbitos públicos, tales como las escuelas y entre las asociaciones civiles. Tales tensiones hacen surgir cuestionamientos importantes acerca de la integración desigual en la comunidad nacional, especialmente en una era neoliberal en la cual la re-estructuración de los servicios sociales y de control sobre los recursos naturales ha transformado las relaciones entre los pobres rurales y la sociedad dominante que emana de los centros urbanos.

¿De qué maneras los aprendizajes situados acerca del controvertido pasado y sus impactos en la actual distribución del poder en el país forman identidades políticas en la generación política más joven de Chile? Abordo esta pregunta a través del análisis etnográfico de los medios por los cuales la juventud adquiere y expresa el conocimiento de la historia y su persistente influencia en la vida cívica de hoy. Las observaciones se dieron durante dos años de trabajo antropológico de campo en tres localidades del área sureña rural

impactada por intervenciones industriales en los ríos aledaños. Éstas incluyen la contaminación por parte de una planta procesadora de celulosa, y la propuesta para construir una represa hidroeléctrica, primer paso para la multiplicación de muchas otras contempladas en el mismo lugar. Las actividades industriales ofrecen el escenario contextual para el estudio de las identidades políticas emergentes, como también para identificar qué es lo que comunica el aprendizaje del comportamiento político acerca de la ciudadanía en Chile actual.

Palabras claves: Chile; post-dictatorial; memoria; Mapuche; desarrollo; juventud; parentesco; medioambiente; responsabilidad social de las empresas; Valdivia.

Table of Contents

PART III: RESTORATIVE PROJECTS

Common Acronyms & Abbreviations

CODEPU — *Corporación de Promoción de los Derechos del Pueblo*
Corporation for the Promotion of the People's Rights

CONADI — *Corporación Nacional de Desarrollo Indígena*
National Corporation for Indigenous Development

CONAF — *Corporación Nacional Forestal*
National Forestry Corporation

CONFECH — *Confederación de Estudiantes de Chile*
Students' Confederation of Chile

CORFO — *Corporación de Fomento de la Producción*
Production Development Corporation

E.I.A. — Environmental Impact Assessment

EIB — *Educación Intercultural Bilingüe*
Intercultural Bilingual Education

FONDART — *Fondo Nacional para el Desarrollo de las Artes*
Fund of the National Council of the Arts

GOPE — *Grupo de Operaciones Policiales Especiales*
Police Special Operations Unit

La Jota — *Juventudes Comunistas de Chile*
Chile's Communist Youth

MCR — *Movimiento Campesino Revolucionario*
Revolutionary Peasant Movement

MINEDUC — *Ministerio de Educación*
Ministry of Education

MIR — *Movimiento de Izquierda Revolucionaria*
Revolutionary Left Movement

O.E.C.D. — Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development

UP — *Unidad Popular*
Popular Unity

Glossary of Terms Used

Araucano   An ethno-denomination for the Mapuche people with dated and colonial origins.

Asentamiento   The name used to refer to collective farms set up during the Popular Unity's Agrarian Reform.

Changle   A spongy fungus that grows at the base of certain trees in the Autumn.

Comuna   Referred to here as a commune, this is a municipal jurisdiction similar to what in North America is called a county. Communes often involve rural spaces surrounding an urban or semi-urban hub.

Dihueñe   A spherical mushroom that grows on the branches of young trees in the Springtime.

Foye   The Mapuche term for a tree that is in English called winter cinnamon or winter's bark.

Huilliche   The ethno-denomination for Mapuche people from communities in the southern reaches of the ancestral territory, usually South of the Toltén River.

Lafkenche   The ethno-denomination for Mapuche people from communities in close proximity to the coast.

Machi   A Mapuche shaman.

Mapudungun   The Mapuche language.

Mestizaje   Throughout Latin America, this term commonly denotes mixity, and in English is often called miscegenation or inter-ethnic mixity.

Nalca   Giant rhubarb found throughout southern Chile and harvested in late Spring.

Plan Mínimo   A minimum employment program that existed under Pinochet from 1974-1988, also known as the *Programa de Empleo Mínimo* (PEM).

Reducción   Land that was assigned to indigenous communities as reserves in the late-nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

Rehue   A Mapuche altar.

Rogativa   The Spanish language term for a public oration or prayer of appeal that is not specific to any religion.

Suralidad   A term coined by a team of literary and anthropology scholars in southern Chile to examine the production of southern identity according to its own regional patterns. The word implies a crossover between southern identity, rurality, and surrealism.

Toma   Literally the taking over or seizure of a contested domain, be it physical property or institutions.

Voqui Pil Pil A thin vine used in Mapuche communities for basket-weaving and other artisanal designs, found almost exlusively in coastal areas near Valdivia.

Wallmapu   The Mapuche homeland or ancestral territory, in its broadest form encompassing regions in contemporary Chile and Argentina.

Wingka   The Mapudungun term commonly used for Chileans of Spanish descent. Widely used, it may have negative connotation as it is believed to derive from a Mapudungun term for theft or usurpation.

A Note on Terminology

   I have translated names of organizations, laws, and other titles into English. I have also left Spanish acronyms in their original form, without adding periods separating the letters. All interviews were conducted in Spanish, and quotes are translated into English directly in the text. This has invariably removed conversational pauses, stutters, and other forms of non-verbal communication that do not contribute to the overall intention of their interlocutors. Translated quotations from literature, whose original language is French or Spanish, appear in chapter endnotes.

   While all research participants to whom I refer directly are ascribed pseudonyms, not all go by typical names in their everyday lives. Young men are especially known by nicknames that caricaturize their physical features or occupations. For this reason, some pseudonyms chosen do not reflect typical surnames. Furthermore, in spite of using pseudonyms for all research participants, when refering to men and women who I would normally address in a formal fashion, I preface their first names with "Don" or "Sra." (pronounced *señora*). These are used in southern Chile for addressing members of older generations with deference. There are two contexts in which I refer to people according to actual names. The first is with public figures, including politicians, corporate agents, and wealthy benefactors, whose activities are publicly known. For these, pseudonyms would serve no real purpose, as their public profiles would already make them identifiable. The second context is with regards to historical figures whose names may further knowledge about collective history, especially in areas where little historical information is recorded. Finally, on one occasion where identification of a research participant could be possible due to their biographic information, I draw on personal details from similar individuals in order to cloak their identity within a composite portrait. This is done without changing the material relevant for analysis.

Maps

Prepared by Rita Isabel Henderson using ArcGIS Explorer Online base maps.

Map 1 (to right). XIV Rivers Region in National Perspective.

Map 2 (below). Mariquina & Panguipulli in Regional Perspective.

Acknowledgements

Introduction

Nadie sabe muy bien cómo se ha transmitido esa memoria de igualdad en los sectores populares chilenos… Nos podríamos preguntar si proviene de la hacienda, de la experiencia en las salitreras, de las mancomunales, de las industrias posteriores, de la educación sistemática de los partidos políticos… En este comentario queremos afirmar *que en la base de las identidades populares existe una suerte de nostalgia por la comunidad de iguales frente a una sociedad que ofrece, antes y ahora, una comunidad de desiguales.*

No one really knows how this memory of equality has been transmitted among Chile's popular sectors … We could ask ourselves if it comes from the hacienda, from experiences in the nitrate mines, from labour unions, from industries that followed, from the systematic education of political parties… In this text, I argue *that at the root of popular identities there is a sort of nostalgia for the community of equals in the face of a society that offers, both in earlier times and now, a community of unequals.*

-José Bengoa, *La Comunidad Reclamada* (2006: 165, emphasis in original)

This thesis departs with a metaphor of a dismembered society, whose dismemberment is traced to a repression in the very bellies of families. This was Don Tito's judgment of the gravest impact of the Pinochet regime on Chilean society when he explained to me that "*with the arrival of Pinochet came a repression in the stomachs of people, he dismembered the family*" (Personal communication, February 2008). Don Tito shared these words as I enquired about his perceptions of delinquency and disaffected youth in San José de la Mariquina. I had been asking teenagers and young adults from both settler and indigenous Mapuche backgrounds in this growing provincial city in southern Chile about their family biographies. I had noticed that they seldom associated a national wave of

urbanization with the arrival of their parents and grandparents to emergent industrial centres such as this. Even more uncommon was recognition that their families' migrations, described by older generations, mostly occurred as coerced displacement during a military regime that ended when they were small children, or not yet even born. That regime reversed agrarian reform policies of the 1960s and early 1970s, pushing thousands out of the countryside and into industrial or domestic labour wherever it could be found. In 1990, it gave way to a democratic transition in which the state remained heavily structured by legislation laid out by its military predecessors. In the two decades since, this legislation has opened the country wide to multi-national investors and unprecedented natural resource extraction, forcing southerners to reconstitute relationships to the increasingly privatized landscape, as well as to one another and to decision-making powers in distant urban centres. In this context, as I began doctoral research into social memory in southern Chile, historical perspectives among youth struck me as not merely a matter of taste or habit; by all indications they were charged terrain upon which the interests and preoccupations of older generations appeared to contend for influence over the future of the Chilean nation.

Upon beginning two years of anthropological fieldwork in 2008, the macro-level processes described above stirred persistent questions for me regarding how youth in Chile today acquire knowledge about history and civic organization. I asked: in what ways do their understandings of the contested past, and its impacts on the current distribution of power in the country, shape budding political identities? In the following chapters, I explore perceptions among members of diverse families in southern Chile, of rapid social change in the countryside. Of interest is what these perceptions communicate to younger family

members in their late teens and early twenties, about local relationships to yet unsettled national histories. I follow these relationships as they are nurtured differently in spheres inhabited by youth, in the home, at school, and among community associations. These spheres are social spaces that are often in tension with one another over what constitutes appropriate forms of political behaviour, and together they form key sites in which contradictory lessons about one's supposed place in the national order are transmitted, negotiated, and often contested and transformed. In this fashion, the ethnographic analysis presented here assesses ways in which young Chileans whose families retain connections to the southern countryside, manifest impacts of a military repression that they did not personally experience.

Questions about Lost Generations

Curiously, the sense of dismemberment that Don Tito communicates does not draw on the grisly crimes of military repression, specifically torture and massacre, following the September 11, 1973 coup d'état by the Armed Forces. Rather, he makes reference to transformations in labour opportunities and the restrictions these imposed on family life in the rural South.

> **Don Tito:** *Oh, how the working class was punished. Those who were left without work were punished with a labour of hunger…All this had repercussions on the young people, who had no North [no direction]. Many had to beg, and many had to rob to just survive. That was the beginning of the social dismemberment that we see now. Many mothers had to abandon their children to work; there were many absentee fathers.*

Working to support their families, parents simply left their children all on their own. It totally dismembered the family. And this was the dismembering of society. Today we see the effects in delinquency, lack of resources, the concentration of people in small and big cities… (Personal communication, February 2008)

Don Tito's image of a dismembered society is heavily invested in memories of a childhood spent surrounded by growing peasant and worker mobilizations in the 1960s. This was a reality even in the Mapuche community in which he grew up. He recalls that in those times, in addition to having work, families had other resources on which to live; they raised chickens and tended gardens. One lived with less money and comforts, but in his words one lived better and more at peace. I was inviting his assessment of opportunities presented to today's youth compared to opportunities he experienced in his younger years in San José de la Mariquina, some thirty-five years ago. Once a dedicated member of *la Jota*, Chile's Communist Youth, he recalled the volunteer work sponsored by the state during weekends and holidays. That was during the Popular Unity presidency of Salvador Allende (1970-1973), a socialist experiment in democratic revolution, when youth were given a snack by regional authorities and sent into poor neighbourhoods to clean up garbage and converse with common people. As he recounted this work, I could hear singer-songwriter (and for some national hero) Víctor Jara's tune in my head, *Qué lindo es ser voluntario*, a song of that era that praises the building of a common destiny through volunteerism in raising bridges, constructing houses, and fixing roads.

Turning to the present, he described a fear among youth today that he did not remember in his own generation. Himself a torture survivor, he was not speaking of fear entrained through immediate physical and psychological trauma. Today's youth were at most young children at the time of the 1990 transition to democracy. They personally experienced little of the nearly seventeen-year military regime (1973-1990) that crushed Chile's experiment in democratic socialist revolution. In Don Tito's view, their fear is of both past and future, achieved to a great degree through a restrictive and increasingly privatized education system that discourages young Chileans from imagining themselves as active participants in history.

> **Don Tito:** *President Allende would say to us "Young people, you need to study, you need to work," and he had a policy for youth so that we would open up our eyes. They used to teach politics to kids; today it's something elite ("*cupula*"). Back then, almost all political leaders were at one time youth leaders, we became involved young. Now leaders come from the economic powers. I think youth are watching this, and they too want to know about politics, but they don't have any idea where to start. I think that in another generation or two we will see youth return to politics, but at least two generations, at the very least two generations have to pass. For me, there's a lost generation.* (Personal communication, February 2008)

Over the course of my investigation, I encountered three torture survivors in their fifties and sixties who, unknown to one another, spoke of their children and grandchildren as belonging to a lost generation. Such reflections at first seemed counter-intuitive in light of the personal losses these individuals had themselves endured during their youth. On the

surface, they betrayed nostalgic hopes that, with time, class struggle will recover former convictions. They also expressed a range of other disappointments, such as frustration with the widespread dissolution of community ties since the 1990 democratic transition, and dismay that impunity endures for many human rights violators of the military regime. Allusions to community fragmentation, or what Don Tito calls the "*social dismemberment that we see now*," are anchored in memories and judgements of a society whose organizational structure seemed, not so long ago, very different. Memories of leaders originating from common sectors, youth who used to help their neighbours, and families once better positioned to feed their children, have become reference points for measuring a general sense of loss that is both collective and perplexing. The public circulation of such memories, as well as their transmission, protest, and transformation, raise important questions about citizenship and political horizons in Chile today. This is because the social lives that these memories acquire, especially among the country's youngest political generation now in its twenties, reveal the 'civilizing dimensions of citizenship' (Schild 2000), those coming-of-age processes by which social norms are internalized and generate diverse forms of political agency and 'politically organized subjection' (Abrams 1982).

In our 2008 conversations, as Don Tito compared today's leaders to those of his youth, he signalled that Chile had not simply undergone political changes over the decades, from socialism to fascism, then from left to right leaning coalition governments. It had undergone changes in the nature of its politics, and by implication changes in its political and citizen culture. Politics and citizenship overlap in this case, as both depend on the social construction of a civic community capable of modelling a society's future. This collective

action of forming a community of citizens is what political scientist Norbert Lechner calls "cultural labour," whereby politics exist in the construction of social ties that permit people to experience and imagine themselves as a society of governable subjects (2002: 119). Unlike the vassal subject, who is instead an *object* of gracious concessions and mercy on the part of the rich and powerful, the citizen is a subject of rights, in its ideal form participating in its own freedom to collective self-determination (Bengoa 2006: 44). In Don Tito's assessment, this citizen subject is lost among Chile's younger generations. In Lechner's, the loss is more diffuse, evident across generations and within areas of civic life far removed from political activity.

Describing Chile in the early 2000s by drawing on data from United Nations Human Development Indicators (PNUD 1998, 2000, & 2002), Lechner writes of a general "indifference towards democracy" and the "erosion of the mental maps of social reality" (Lechner 2002: 24-27), neither of which he attributes to political or economic crises. It is no straightforward task to explain why, while measures indicate that the overall quality of life has dramatically improved in recent decades, Chileans express greater discontent with their circumstances than before. Lechner holds that such subjectivities can only be grasped through analysis of the deepest layers of political culture, its value systems, symbolic representations, and collective aspirations. He argues that the most important data for assessing this "age of disenchantment" is that which is neither verbalized nor made explicit, those beliefs and practices about democracy that are so obvious to Chileans that they are experienced as natural. Interestingly, with the momentum of 2011 university student protests, as well as with recent municipal elections in October 2012 and presidential

elections the next year, questions about civic culture among youth have been catapulted into the public eye.

This thesis tells a story of the supposed loss of political and citizen culture in post-dictatorship Chile. It questions the taken-for-granted nature of this sense of loss that is often suggested to characterize younger generations. Through ethnographic analysis, I contrast public and domestic means by which young Chileans acquire and express knowledge about history and its lingering influence over civic life today. Observations draw on fieldwork in three localities of the southern countryside that have been impacted by industrial interventions in nearby rivers. These include the contamination of one river from a pulp mill, and the proposed hydroelectric damming and diversion of several others. Such projects constitute transformations of both the natural and the social landscapes. They also prompt even the most politically disengaged residents to take clear positions on the future well-being of their communities. In this way, industrial activities in these localities offer backdrops for assessing emergent political identities, as well as for identifying what the learning of political behaviour communicates about citizenship in the country today.

In the coming chapters, I explore the not-quite-conscious aspects of political behaviour, exposing what Lechner dramatically characterizes as Chilean society's "*angustiante orfandad de códigos interpretativos*"[1] reflected in current citizen dispersion (2002: 29, emphasis in original).[2] Through the analysis of inter-generational transmissions of memories of the contested past, I observe micro-level processes by which certain kinds of political behaviour (i.e. disengagement from civic affairs, participation in land seizures, production of public art) are learned within families and small community networks. Given

that members of Chile's youngest political generation were either children or not yet born at the time of the 1990 democratic transition, they have learned about the contested past largely from others. The impact of the dictatorship on this generation, which for the most part has not personally experienced state repression, complicates our understanding of the nature of memory and its effects on everyday life. This is amplified in sectors of the rural South where much of what younger generations know about the conflicted past, including colonialism, revolutionary-socialism, and fascism, has not been communicated through deliberate or verbal instruction, but transmitted indirectly as cultural tastes and habits that nevertheless influence political decisions. Accordingly, my approach to the processes by which youth learn to be (and not be) political, is informed mainly by anthropological literature on social memory.

Background: Democratization and Its Discontents

Far from a triumph of the left, Allende's Popular Unity administration is remembered by many Chileans as an historical period marked as much by emergent social solidarity, as by the tensions that this solidarity provoked (See Stern 2004, 2006, 2010). Tensions existed not only between workers and the so-called owners of the means of production. They erupted between all factions of a society that was driven on the one hand by an emerging sense of dignity and rights for the poor, and on the other hand by anxieties over property, labour, and food security that were fuelled by international anti-communist ideology. Even though Allende's measures were not revolutionary in the sense of directly provoking immediate social upheaval, they threatened a property-owning elite whose

influence over economic affairs was oriented towards maintaining the status quo. The radical measures of the Popular Unity administration, which included nationalization of mines and accelerated agrarian reform policies, eventually precipitated the 1973 coup d'état.

While the Popular Unity's most vocal enemies agitated for military intervention for months prior to the coup, disputing the legitimacy of Allende's mandate as a minority leader, divisions internal to his administration also destabilized his democratic road to socialism. Members of the left-wing coalition of parties that formed the Popular Unity government[3] could agree that their intentions for revolution proposed a radical, anti-imperialist transformation in the existing political, economic, and social structures. Nevertheless, cleavages emerged in the precise means by which to dispossess the bourgeois classes of control over the direction of the country (Pinto 2005: 10-14). Once Allende had taken office on a platform to carry out a democratic socialist revolution, the tactics, policies, and speed with which this ambitious project would be realized were undermined by disagreements over who would be its key protagonists, and whether this revolution should resort to armed confrontation to achieve its goals. Chile's three-year Popular Unity administration produced a generation that tasted the possibility of popular social justice, however ill-defined and unlikely it was to be achieved. This taste of social justice is what lingers in Don Tito's accounts: on-the-ground memories of youth assisting in the construction of infrastructure in poor neighbourhoods, workers taking over factories and directing the production process, and professionals dedicating their labour to society.

Like memories of the Popular Unity period, experiences of Chile's military regime vary greatly. State intimidation and disappearances were by no means the only remarkable

features of the Pinochet era. While the documentation of torture and killings at the hands of authorities form an important literature on that period,[4] the regime's repression of the political left does not hold a monopoly on memories of the dictatorship. Among many social transformations, it was a period that saw an unprecedented influx of imported market goods (Moulian 1997; Stillerman 2004; Tinsman 2006), as well as the division of indigenous lands whereby dominion titles were assigned to individuals occupying portions of land previously recognized as collective ancestral territories (Le Bonniec 2003; Mallon 2005, 175-176). These transformations reflect fiscal policies oriented to expanding consumption among Chileans. On the bureaucratic level, they aimed at homogenizing the social and physical landscapes in order to undermine competing claims to primary resources, whose subsequent exploitation has financed Chile's recent economic strength.

Transformed Modes of Political Participation

In her historical monograph on memories of nation-state formation and violence in Chile's northern mining regions, Lessie Jo Frazier observes that following the 1990 democratic transition, each of the first three civilian presidents at some point took it upon themselves to declare an end to the transition. In so doing, the leaders were "signalling Chile's arrival as a modern nation-state" (Frazier 2007: 244). Each of these declarations was eventually retracted, proof that the transition to civilian democracy reaches well beyond electoral politics. In Frazier's view, the retraction of such statements by presidents is emblematic of the difficulty of delineating the political past from the present. For Latin Americans of all political stripes who have survived military regimes and who now live in

subsequent liberal democracies, memories of social confrontation, intimidation, and repression often affect the extent to which citizens are willing to publicly express opinions on neoliberal governance and industrial interventions that have immediate impacts in their everyday lives. This not only applies to those with personal and familial experiences of torture or disappearance, or those with lingering psychological trauma. As my field experiences suggest, it is also true for those whose memories justify past military interventions, as well as for those whose absence of personal memories of such periods leaves their judgment of the use of military force in civilian contexts ambiguously open to negotiation.

When the *Concertación*, Chile's coalition of parties for democracy, negotiated the terms by which the military would cede control over the republic in March 1990, it agreed to retain the regime's Constitution of 1980 and to dedicate at least nine of the senate's forty-five seats to direct appointment by the Armed Forces. The latter would also retain a power of veto. These apparently anti-democratic conditions were defended as necessary for the new democracy to have 'neutral' protection, to avoid the sort of political polarization that led to the 1973 coup d'état (Frazier 2007: 199). Throughout the 1990s, these functioned as neoliberal safeguards against populism, discouraging political parties from embracing platforms perceived to be too radical by an elite class that retained implicit backing of the Armed Forces. In 2005, some of the preceding regime's conditions were repealed, but a dampening of citizen involvement in political life had already occurred. In her study of a working class neighbourhood of Santiago, political scientist Verónica Schild (2000) identifies a significant shift in citizen behaviour that occurred around that time, away from

12

community associations and towards an increasingly market logic of competitive access to state resources. During the 1990s, she observed transformations in programs for alleviating poverty, whereby new institutional structures changed the modes for accessing benefits, rendering access to development funds an increasingly competitive process that rewards the most entrepreneurial applicants.

Suggesting possible reasons behind a concurrent trend toward non-participation in the electoral process, political scientist Paul Posner (1999) has characterized rising rates of abstentions and void ballots as an increase in political apathy. In one study, he interviewed a range of party leaders at distinct political levels regarding their perceptions of shrinking electoral interest. Nearly 80% of grassroots leaders attributed this seeming apathy to unresponsiveness on the part of political parties to the needs of local groups (Posner 1999: 71). Curiously, leaders of the *Concertación* (the group of parties suggested to be unresponsive to the needs of local groups) emphasized instead that political disinterest was a consequence of the lingering effects of authoritarian repression, such as fear of retribution or social strife. Posner's study confirmed that leading politicians during the 1990s became progressively out of touch with local concerns. It also illustrated that the decade following the transition effectively saw the breakdown of linkages between political parties and their bases of grassroots supporters.

The age demographics behind this trend in electoral disengagement are important. For the 1988 plebiscite responsible for ending Pinochet's leadership, 95% of the eligible population (i.e. minimum of eighteen years old and registered to vote) participated. That number has dropped by a third, in large part owing to fewer new registrants. In the past

decade, the proportion of eligible voters between 18 and 34 years of age who registered to vote declined further, from 55% to 27% (Riffo & Bustos 2008), such that only 23% of eligible voters under 29 was registered to participate in the 2008 municipal elections (Barrionuevo 2009). Among this age category, those coming from lower socio-economic and rural areas were vastly underrepresented in the voter registries for the presidential/parliamentary and municipal elections, especially in comparison to their age cohorts in urban, middle-class areas. Putting this in perspective, since Chile's 1990 return to democracy, people between 18 and 34 years of age (none of whom today would have participated in the plebiscite of 1988) have gone from representing a third of all registered voters to less than a tenth, and these are primarily of upper-middle class and urban origins. This alone raises questions related to how political behaviour is learned. Among them: what processes led to this generation's diminished motivation to fulfill a hard-fought citizen right, to vote, that so effectively mobilized preceding generations little more than twenty years ago?

The Limits of Reconciliation

Ethnographer Julia Paley (2001b) has argued that signs of electoral disengagement or citizen apathy are hardly reducible to political indifference. She has focused on the deeper social implications of the illusions of choice with which Chileans were battered through popular media during the democratic transition. A rapid upsurge in opinion polls and market surveys during the 1990s presented citizens with countless opportunities to express their positions on topics ranging from issues of political importance to household

preferences for consumer goods; items that many Chileans could scarcely afford, but about which they were endlessly invited to opine. The public was cast as a population of choice-makers, when in fact only the political elite had control over the framework of available choices. One reason for this was that the electoral system that had been negotiated with the military regime had created a binominal election process that marginalized small parties and those in opposition to the *Concertación* and other large coalitions. The nature of the new democratic order was something over which Chilean voters had little control. Importantly, this lack of control over the terms of public debate restricted the participation of working class and peasant sectors in determining the accepted historical truth about the dictatorship. In Paley's words, "major elements of the Chilean political elite…had reassessed the history leading up to the military coup and come to the conclusion that the dictatorship was an outcome of the extreme political and social polarization that had characterized Chilean society before 1973" (Paley 2001b: 152). This contrasts with the view that the coup arose from the resistance of elite sectors to socialist reforms pursued by the popular classes. Frazier comes to a similar conclusion, recognizing that while leaders of the *Concertación* seemed genuinely concerned about dealing with questions of recent human rights violations, those same leaders also closed down public discussion about President Allende's Popular Unity government, which was cast as having failed on its own accord and as being irrelevant to current questions of governance. In her words (Frazier 2007: 191):

> Even sectors further on the Left that still hold those core principles (such
> as the state's responsibility for ensuring the equitable redistribution of
> resources) have found little space for their expression.

Hence, the upsurge of opinion polls during the 1990s was not a means for citizens to participate in the policy-making process or in public debates. Polls formed a "feedback mechanism that would allow politicians to shape public consensus in favor of decisions that [had] already been made" (Paley 2001b: 147). These developments had considerable consequences for how Chilean society would move forward following the dictatorship. The breakdown of ties between party leaders and their grassroot supporters impeded direct debate over the bringing to justice of human rights violators. Meanwhile, opinion polls offered limited choices through which citizens were encouraged to express their concerns. Paley argues that polling invariably framed the issue of recovering a sense of national community in terms that presented social reconciliation with the military as the only desirable course of action, even as the Armed Forces had no obligation to participate in the original truth and reconciliation process known as the Rettig Commission.[5]

In many respects, Chile's civil society has been subjected to a state-sponsored discrediting of positive memories of the Popular Unity period, an era admittedly marked by social tension, but also by unprecedented solidarity between discrete class and cultural groups. In this thesis, I argue that, far from achieving massive historical re-education, these developments have merely pushed memories that diverge from dominant discourse about the past into private domains. Like José Bengoa (2006: 65), I dispute the theory that popular media (i.e. television and its barrage of polls and marketing) or even public education can "innoculate" ideas into the brains of people, wiping critical memory from future generations.

Analytical Framework: The Hidden Restoration of a Segmented Society

Don Tito's historical reflections are unusual in the southern communities where I have lived and circulated these past years. What sets his descriptions apart is not his knowledge of certain political periods and the power interests that shaped them. In fact, the historical knowledge contained in his reflections is not uncommon. Nor is Don Tito's willingness to speak about political issues particularly unusual, even when many shrug off such topics as irrelevant or confrontational. For the most part, his contemporaries are well aware of massive transformations in rural life over the past half-century. They tend to attribute these to a multitude of plausible factors: rural-to-urban migration, the military repression's breaking apart of relationships of reciprocity and mutual support in the countryside, the onslaught of mass consumer society, the introduction of agro-chemicals to farming, and the industrial exploitation of natural spaces. At least two dozen people described to me, in similar terms, their lives before and after watershed moments significant in their communities. Such moments include the Great Chilean Earthquake and the Valdivia tsunami of 1960, years of nightly curfews under the dictatorship, participation in guerrilla campaigns, and later in truth commissions. Stories about such events were interspersed with narratives of a range of other personal crises, like the burning down of a home, the death of a child, long periods of migration, or the loss of livelihood due to unforeseen illness.

What is striking about Don Tito's testimony is his sense of historical continuity, his recognition of national and international interests acting in southern Chile throughout the twentieth century, and his capacity to weave his personal experiences into a narrative that makes meaning of events of great social significance. He unites his stories with those of his

community and country in a fluid narrative about the causes and consequences of contemporary discontent with democracy. For instance, while many of his fellow southerners may suspect CIA involvement in hastening the military coup, most of his neighbours are primarily informed by popular media, which are owned by a powerful elite and tend to be more conservative than is the general population. While such media do not overtly support Pinochet or his legacy of repression, they usually avoid rehashing details about controversial events like the military coup or the pacted nature of the democratic transition. In consequence, I met few southerners who were able to support with concrete arguments their suspicions that the CIA had helped precipitate the coup, a fact that was recognized quite early on internationally (See NACLA 1973a, 1973b, 1974a, 1974b), and that has since been confirmed in scholarly literature addressing the opening up of CIA archives (See Grandin 2004).

While Don Tito's testimony offers a compelling point of departure, very few of the participants in my investigation share the clarity of his historical perspective. Rather, their suspicions and speculations communicate feelings about the remembered and transmitted past that have become the pulp of my analysis. As a former exile and as a regular reader of a communist newspaper, Don Tito belongs to a minority of southerners who routinely revisit and vocalize uncomfortable memories as a means of critically interpreting current realities. His candidness stands in sharp contrasts with less active segments of civil society, namely people who do not congregate in public rallies unless by accident. Those are the people who interest me most here. Generally speaking, they do not self-identify as an interest group, and without objectives to unify their actions, they do not coherently articulate shared beliefs and

values about political life. While many vote, I found that, especially among older generations, it was often because at some point in their lives they previously signed up for the voter registry and could incur a steep fine if they were to later abstain. As I elaborate here, none of this means that the perspectives of these people on national leadership are not shared with more politically engaged neighbours, that such people are never encouraged when public protests of diverse forms develop, or that they might not themselves one day become civically engaged. It only means that we have yet to understand people who are seemingly disengaged as a group who, in spite of considerable differences among them, relate with a similar degree of reserve to the imagined community of the nation, and their political role as citizens within it.

Nevertheless, the dispersion of most historical narratives that I encountered during fieldwork presents significant methodological and analytical challenges to my investigation, which examines the impacts of the contested past on political behaviour among young adults. Most of these challenges pertain to the nature of ethnographic evidence relating to memory, drawing my observations away from heavy reliance on the spoken word, towards more conventional anthropological attention for cultural phenomena, that is shared beliefs, practices, and values. I came to ask at what point memory ceases to be conscious, becoming more akin to cultural adaptations to new social circumstances than to knowledge about historical events. What might we accept as evidence of memory when there are no verbal signals to indicate its lingering presence? And, to what extent should an ethnographer account for contradictions and evidence of lies in personal testimonies about the past? I

address some of these questions as I outline my approach to fieldwork in Chapter 1, and again when I examine the social science literatures on memory in Chapter 2.

Aiming for what Unni Wikan calls an experience-near anthropology that goes "beyond the words" (Wikan 1992), beyond reading or even looking at what people say too deeply, my approach to fieldwork and writing has been that both speech and silence are full of memory (i.e. Passerini 2007; Smith & Sider 1997; Tedlock 1983). This approach requires paying attention not just to what people end up saying and how, but to the *intent* behind what they try to convey, the form of their utterances and silences, and what is ultimately received by others (See Leavitt 1996). Instead of "groping for some 'larger' answers within the particulars of [people's] spoken words" (Wikan 1992: 466), the challenge here has been to open up analysis to recognize broader contexts that frame historical perspectives and political sentiment among Chileans in their late-teens and twenties. This involves accounting for contradictions between the statements and the actions of research collaborators. One example was that of research participants who verbalized to me their unrelenting opposition to the degradation of the natural environment, and yet who held thinly veiled hopes that the arrival of new industries would bring jobs and economic security in an insecure local labour market, regardless of environmental concerns.

Guiding my inclusion of the uncertain, incomplete, and contradictory aspects of memory transmission is work by prominent Chilean anthropologist and historian José Bengoa. He has argued that one of the gravest impacts of the Pinochet regime on Chilean society has been the restoration of a social order that pre-dates the formation of the Chilean state itself, an order felt by many to be natural. This order, he argues, is modelled on the

social institution of longest duration in Chile, the *hacienda*[6] (2006: 45). This was the primary space for socialization in the Central Zone[7] before the administrative and municipal structures of the Chilean state were established. In Bengoa's view, the restoration of this socio-cultural model undermines all attempts to strengthen citizenship in the country, as it negates civil society's foundation in the consciousness and recognition of rights, two processes that limit the power of the state and wealthy classes. Bengoa's attention is not focused on the coup's disruption of agrarian reform in the countryside, but rather on the transforming relationship between classes and cultural groups. He argues that policy towards the poor today has returned to being a question of generosity and good will on the part of the rich (2006: 49). This stands in stark contrast to the Popular Unity's vision of poverty as a social injustice and violation of citizen rights to work and education. Seen in this light, the coup of September 11, 1973 was not a rupture, but a restorative project of social segmentation that remains beyond explication to most Chileans today. To paraphrase Bengoa, Chilean society at the start of the twenty-first century more closely resembles its form at the end of the nineteenth century than its form throughout the twentieth, when it was characterized by an obsession with democracy and equality (Ibid, 152). This restorative project has left traces in local value systems, symbolic representations, and collective aspirations available to ethnographic observation.

Any number of localities throughout Chile could be effective for exploring the ways in which macro processes impact local involvement in political affairs. However, I am not only interested in the workings of global power and elite interests, but also in the ways by which young adults who have grown up in contexts of restricted discussion about the past

conceive of it, as well as how they shape their political identities. Hence, my choice of field

sites was guided by attention for contexts in which locals would not merely recount to me

elements about their personal and collective pasts, but ones in which current

transformations facilitated by neoliberal reforms are challenging residents to take public

positions on the enduring impacts of the Pinochet regime. Accordingly, the southern towns

of San José de la Mariquina near the coast, and Liquiñe and Neltume in the Panguipulli pre-

cordillera became focal points for my fieldwork and analysis. During my investigation, each

of these was facing industrial interventions in nearby rivers, in the first case from

contamination due to lumber processing, and in the second two cases, from diversion of

flow for hydroelectric production. However, as I describe in the next chapter, selection of

these sites depended less on rational choice than on social networks and circumstance.

Thesis Overview

Memory transmissions in Chile today, specifically in multi-ethnic sectors of the

South, call up social science literatures that only partially overlap: theory on citizenship and

the state, the anthropology of social memory, the history of class and inter-cultural relations

in the Southern Cone, and decolonizing processes. These literatures broadly correspond to

the various theoretical, methodological, analytical, and ethical dimensions of this thesis.

Rather than occupying discrete sections, they are interwoven throughout. The chapters in

Part I concentrate on situating this study methodologically by way of a description of my

fieldwork activities (Chapter 1), as well as theoretically within social science literatures on

memory and the cultural construction of history (Chapter 2). The chapters in Part II address

geographic and political realities that frame historical perspectives. They do so by focusing on national and international interests that have penetrated social life in the southern regions of Chile. This includes considerations of literary and historiographical works on Chile's rural South (Chapter 3), a region that occupies a particular place within the imagined community of the nation. A portrait of rapid social change is also presented here (Chapter 4), as a means of exploring to what extent current industrial incursions are experienced as the culmination of processes addressed in historical literature.

Part III returns to Bengoa's allusion of the military regime's restoration of a segmented society. Contextualizing recent university student strikes, I elaborate on ethnographic reflections from my work as a teacher in a southern municipal school throughout 2009 (Chapter 5). Through the public school system, where both state and local interests are at play, I trace systemic constraints on education that result from policies introduced during the Pinochet regime. Recognizing José Bengoa's suspicion of elite interests, I pay attention to the agendas of state and corporate actors in the affairs of schools and other civic associations, especially in instances where these compete for the political compliance of locals. Departing from the politicized nature of formal education, I turn to indigenous struggles for the recovery of usurped lands, highlighting that restorative projects belong to groups beyond the state alone (Chapter 6). This sets the stage for recognizing that personal and family stories within specific localities convey important dimensions to political identities that are often overlooked by middle-class intellectual sensibilities (Chapter 7). Spanning the entire twentieth and early twenty-first centuries, the stories collected during my investigations indicate processes of nation-state formation and

consolidation in areas not widely occupied by European settlers until the last decades of the 1800s. Both the stories themselves, and the milieus in which they were shared, reveal progressive transformations in experiences of community belonging, as regional, national, and international interests have shifted local community dynamics. Drawing on lessons from the anthropology of social memory, I conclude with reflections on the implications that this study may have for political ethnography among oppressed groups and for memory research in post-repression contexts.

As mentioned, I bring these discussions to bear on Bengoa's postulation that political culture in Chile today reflects elite efforts to restore nineteenth century relations of inequality between wealthy and labouring classes. As a means of fostering continuity between chapters that treat sometimes only peripherally related material, I begin each with quotes drawn from passages in Bengoa's book *La Comunidad Reclamada* (2006). While his original words are on the left, my translations appear to the right of each quote. I consider that book and the trilogy to which is belongs (See also Bengoa 1996 and 2009a) to be uncommon for bringing together in a single analytical framework, discussions that parallel mobilizations by youth and indigenous groups in recent decades. Poignant as Bengoa's words may be, they are largely essays inspired by a rich career dedicated to history, memory, and identity in Chile, and are limited in localized ethnographic scope.

Insofar as this thesis treats indigenous mobilizations in the Araucanía and Rivers Regions, it does so in order to trace transformations in avenues for political action in recent decades, and to highlight generational dynamics that cross-cut indigenous and non-indigenous communities. Without evaluating the legitimacy or relevance of the political

strategies of diverse indigenous actors and their allies, I argue that reaching beyond ethno-cultural and class differences is an important element in appreciating political behaviour among those who did not personally experience the Popular Unity period or recent dictatorship. Several months after I settled on the title of this thesis, I discovered that anthropologist Claudia Briones had drawn on the same metaphor used by Don Tito in her work on Mapuche activism in Argentina since the 1980s. In her article "Remembering the Dis-Membered: Drama about Mapuche and Anthropological Production in Three Acts" (2003), she addresses the emergence of a pan-Mapuche political identity in both Argentina and Chile. This coincidence in attention for remembering the dismembered seems all the more valid here, as I elaborate how the sentiment of restoration—more precisely, of *restorative projects*—is not restricted to indigenous society, but resonates with inhabitants of the southern countryside more generally.

Notes: Introduction
[1] My translation: "agonizing orphanhood of interpretive codes."
[2] Since March 2011, students in both secondary and post-secondary institutions have dramatically challenged authorities on the privatized structure of education in the country. This has led to violent confrontations on numerous occasions, and protests continue.

[3] These were the Socialist, Communist, Radical, and Social Democratic Parties, as well as the MAPU (Movimiento de Acción Popular Unitario, translated as the Unitary Popular Action Movement).

[4] See Ahumada et al. 1989; Brinkmann 1999; Constable & Valenzuela 1991; Dorfman 1992 & 1998; Ensalaco & Izquierdo Martín 2002; Hayner 2001; Huneeus 2003; Muzzopappa 2005; Raymont 2007; Rettig Commission 1991; Stern 2004 & 2006; Timerman 1987

[5] Chile's experience of national reconciliation differs from that of several countries that have pursued such processes. Unlike South Africa following the Apartheid era, where the Truth and Reconciliation Commission released radio and television broadcasts and printed stories in major newspapers on a daily basis, the Rettig Commission originally published its results as an insert to a single daily newspaper. The Rettig Commission's mandate was to investigate only those cases of persecution during the military regime that resulted in death or disappearance. As its mandate excluded cases of torture that did not result in death, it is speculated that between 50,000-200,000 torture survivors were not listed as victims (Hayner 2001: 36). The Valech Commission subsequently addressed cases of torture and detainment not leading to death, and its report released in 2004 was based on nearly 35,000 testimonies. This second commission was criticized for receiving testimonies for a relatively short period of several months and for not widely publicizing its activities. The Valech Commission re-opened to receive testimony for several months in 2010.

[6] I refer to the *hacienda*, *latifundo* or *fundo*, and estate interchangeably.

[7] The Central Zone, often also called the Central Valley, stretches the width of Chile from just north of the Santiago Metropolitan Region to the northern reaches of the Biobío Region. Inhabited by nearly three quarters of the Chilean population, the Central Zone comprises the earliest territories integrated into the Republic of Chile upon its independence from the Spanish Crown in the early 1800s. As I discuss in Chapter 3, territories south of the Biobío were occupied and forcibly annexed to Chile much later, in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. In that chapter, I highlight that estates in the Central Zone were largely established during the Spanish colonial period (throughout the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries), while estates in the southern regions were established more recently, following Chile's independence.

Part I: Orientations

Chapter 1: Fieldwork

[L]as personas no se atreven a hablar con su nombre, del Golpe de Estado de 1973. Se utilizan frases alambicadas, "lo que nos ocurrió", "lo que todos sabemos", etc. La misma memoria es temerosa… Esta ausencia de memoria, o temor a expresarla, es unas de las características de las masas… La transformación de las clases sociales en masas…

People don't dare address it by its name, the coup d'état of 1973. They use distilled phrases, "what happened to us", "what we all know", etc. The memory itself is scary… This absence of memory, or fear of expressing it, is one characteristic of the masses… The transformation of social classes into masses…

-José Bengoa, *La Comunidad Reclamada* (2006: 161-162)

When I set out to do research on political subjectivities among young adults in southern Chile, I aimed to collect family stories of origin from six different kin networks within a single area. I expected that stories of origin would be core data enabling me to compare the influence of factors like class and ethno-cultural background on what younger generations understand their choices to be regarding the future well-being of their communities. I did not take class and ethno-cultural background to be structural determinants of political or citizen behaviour. Rather, I anticipated that these criteria marked a range of social positions from which struggles over the country's economic and social organization have been perceived, remembered, and to varying degrees transmitted or forgotten. Though not entirely mistaken, this approach proved deceptively simple.

In this chapter, I describe how my early investigative attention directed to families became a stepping-stone for a broader examination of the social and cultural spheres that

ultimately educate young Chileans on their possibilities for political participation. I begin by discussing my orientation to ethnographic analysis of power dynamics in a global era, drawing on the work of other ethnographers who have studied power dynamics in contemporary Latin America. Turning to a description of my fieldwork activities, I then identify how a participatory approach guided my eventual focus on three localities instead of just one, all of which were facing industrial interventions in nearby rivers. During my fieldwork, these interventions led to rapid transformations in relationships between neighbours, as well as between residents and the natural landscape. My attention was piqued by the impact of such transformations in diverse social spheres, such as schools, resident associations, as well as local and regional indigenous organizations. Upon wrapping up investigation and returning to my initial research contacts, I saw the family re-emerge analytically, as a key institution that mediates personal relationships to broader communities (i.e. residential, ethnic, national). So, while I initially set out to tackle very similar questions to those analysed here, in the end I seem to have taken the long road to appreciating just how family commitments and stories of origin nurture those 'deep layers of political culture' about which Norbert Lechner writes (See Introduction). This chapter closes with a discussion about ethical dimensions of this project in both the research and writing stages.

Ethnography of Political and Citizen Culture

Sociologist Philip Abrams has noted that many scholars who have tried to study even modest power structures like local communities have had their field sites "transformed

into a swamp of virulent accusations of methodological ineptitude" (1988: 66). Part of his

argument is that taking for granted the existence of power structures, in his case the state,

risks obstructing "the effective study of a number of problems about political power which

ought to concern us" (Abrams 1988: 63). Some of these problems are salient in the contexts

described in this thesis, where multiple public interests compete for control over natural

resources, be it for their exploitation, conservation, or for the restitution of ancestral rights.

In such contexts, political consent is a great deal more complex than electoral patterns. So in

spite of what national leaders may affirm, presidential elections and leadership races alone

do not necessarily cement state legitimacy. By this token, it would be mistaken to presume

that Chile's 2010 election of a right-wing financier as president reflects a majority of the

electorate's consent to his pro-business political platform, or that Chileans generally favour

the acceleration of natural resource extraction.[1] At best, elections reflect historically specific

strategies by which a particular form of consent is established. This presents a dilemma for

anthropologists. How might we address power without overstating its impacts on social

behaviour? The answer to this methodological question is perhaps best found in the work of

ethnographers who have tackled local relationships to state policies in the neoliberal era in

various ways.

Cultivating Peripheral Vision

Ethnographers studying political processes in Latin America emphasize that policy

alone does not determine the nature of relationships between states and citizens (See Frazier

2007; Glick-Schiller & Fouron 2001; Goldstein 2004; Hecht 1998; Kelly 2008; Paley 2001;

Sawyer 2004). In various ways, anthropological studies of state power, that privilege the perspectives of people caught up in struggles over the influence of broader publics, expose the complex processes involved in politics, as well as the complex nature of social entities commonly understood to be states and nations. This is an underlying theme in anthropologist Suzana Sawyer's analysis of indigenous demands in the 1990s that Ecuador become a pluri-national state. Her work is an important example of ethnography's ability to contrast competing visions of social order, highlighting that state power is never complete, and its nature is never given. Her book, *Crude Chronicles* (2004) focuses on a single company's efforts to pursue petroleum exploration and extraction in Ecuador's Pastaza province. Sawyer contrasts expectations of social development in the Amazonian region as they are expressed in consultations held between local, regional, national, and corporate leadership. She finds that at the heart of indigenous demands is a rejection by Achuar, Shiwiar, Quichua, and other aboriginal groups of discourse prevalent among government and company representatives. The manner in which politicians and corporate executives speak about multi-national industries is troubling to the indigenous leaders, as the former imply that industry benefits the greater common good of a presumably homogeneous national community. In the view of the indigenous leaders, dominant notions of harmonious Ecuadorian nationhood serve the material interests of an urban elite. This elite not only retains control over the distribution of development funds, it disregards ancestral land management practices that involve distinct understandings of community, development, and productivity. In the end, poor rural residents of all backgrounds—including settlers and

Afro-Ecuadorians—are disproportionately excluded from forms of development promised by neoliberal commerce.

In Sawyer's observations, state control over the uses to which profits from natural resource extraction are put arrives through the "formalistic language of democracy" (2007: 7). Its proponents emphasize the rights of liberal subjects (citizens) to negotiate compensation on individual bases. State and corporate actors thereby reject calls for the recognition of collective territorial rights that are claimed by regional indigenous groups who vie for greater influence over development activities in their provinces. In their own defense, officials from the company studied, and agents from the Ministry of Energy and Mines, assert that they are merely respecting democratic protocol. In practice, the company opts to access the region via a small minority of isolated property-owners who are willing to host well sites on their lands in exchange for immediate cash rewards. By equating free markets with free people, neoliberal "government policies that aim to privatize, liberalize, and deregulate the national economy so as to encourage foreign investment" (Ibid) have had the tacit effect of reducing citizenship to individual rights. This overrides local-level associations by which citizens have historically organized. Interestingly, in 2008 pluri-nationalism was included in Ecuador's new Constitution, generated by constituent assembly (Becker 2011). The mounting pressure of indigenous mobilizations in recent decades, given that indigenous groups represent nearly 40% of the country's population (Sawyer 2007: 225 n. 3), is an important instance where diverse groups of historically excluded peoples have effectively influenced state policy, affirming novel models of citizenship.

Sawyer's work underscores a key advantage of ethnography in the global era. Long-term investigation in specific localities fosters attention to on-the-ground workings of macro power formations that are otherwise difficult to grasp, including the 'imagined community' of the nation (Anderson 1983). In particular, participant observation offers a unique perspective for assessing this age of flexible capitalism, in which conglomerate identities enable state and corporate actors to elude accountability for socially destructive activities, such as environmental contamination and displacement of populations. Referring to the Zapatista uprising in Mexico's southern state of Chiapas, anthropologist June Nash argues that ethnography can be a means of tracing out how "the peripheral phenomena of everyday life everywhere in the world" (Nash 2001: 15) are often the lived impacts of values and decisions made in distant centres of power (national and international). In this view, fieldwork in apparently out-of-the-way places is scarcely about describing curious beliefs and behaviour among distant peoples. Through "direct historical investigation of the political practice of class (and other) relationships…" (Abrams 2006[1998]: 125), it is a unique and critical component of the ethnographic toolkit. In Nash's words, ethnography is the 'cultivation of peripheral vision,' implying that fieldwork is a means of perceiving the otherwise difficult-to-perceive power formations at the heart of contemporary globalization.

Perceiving the Field

One implication that Nash's vision of ethnography has for anthropological fieldwork today is that it often involves studying fractured populations whose internal hostilities betray the duress of rapid social change (See Warren 2005). This is especially true in

contexts of political turmoil or in which people are engaged in aggressive competition over scarce resources. It is certainly true of my own field experiences, in which my research was constrained by widespread distrust between neighbours, a sentiment that for reasons I elaborate in coming chapters, seems to have flourished in Chile's post-dictatorship period. Much of my analysis in this thesis involves observing generalized distrust among research participants (of one another and not just of me), which was nurtured by a healthy rumour mill. This was often exacerbated by the unscrupulous activities of state and corporate actors exploiting local hopes for improved living conditions in isolated sectors of the southern countryside. It also often drew on a long history of tense relationships in specific localities, which to varying degrees have been transmitted to youth today. While interesting on an analytical level, distrust among neighbours shaped this study from my very first moments in the field. So from very early on, I needed a practical approach to recruitment and participant observation, one that did not expect that all people affected by industrial developments in nearby rivers would inevitably welcome the presence of a prodding outsider with whom to collaborate in an abstract anthropological enterprise. My way through this challenge was largely a matter of trial and error; in retrospect, the experiences of other anthropologists have helped me acknowledge that antagonism is a common feature of fieldwork for political ethnography.

Urban ethnographers in particular have confronted challenges arising from complex power dynamics during their research. This is especially evident in their accounts of struggling to distinguish their activities from prior investigations carried out in their field sites. One of anthropologist Tobias Hecht's (1998) most poignant conclusions from his

35

research on street children in northeastern Brazil, is his critique of widespread misinformation that permeates policy studies and journalistic reporting on such youth. He observes that the dominant genre for representing street kids has tended to draw on statistics that do little to distinguish street children from poor youth more generally. That dominant genre also frequently draws on superficial interviews with poor youth in public spaces, regardless of whether or not those interviewed actually spend their nights there. Hecht finds that studies of this nature unjustly exaggerate the prevalence of child homelessness, presenting two very real dangers to this population (1998: 25). First, inflated statistics fuel the wrath of urban Brazil's so-called Death Squads, which are often bent on eradicating a perceived plague of street children through brutal violence. Second, staggering statistics make it difficult for middle and upper class Brazilians to foresee viable solutions to the problem. Hecht dispels rampant stereotypes about this population as he follows the relationships that street children sustain with one another. He notes traces of maternal abandonment in their stories about home life, as well as affirmations by the youth themselves that they *choose* to be in the street. An ethnographic portrait emerges that is quite distinct from the victims often portrayed by middle class writers and photojournalists, Brazilians and foreigners alike.

An adaptable approach to participant observation allowed Hecht to make a series of observations that are at odds with prevailing ideas about the phenomenon of street children among policy-makers and journalists. Among these is the revelation made through testimony of street children about their own experiences, that homicidal deaths occur considerably more often at the hands of one's fellows than by Death Squads or corrupt

police. Hecht finds this point significant, as it suggests that street children have acquired their own forms of discipline, where techniques for making alliances and carrying out beatings are often acquired through direct and indirect contact with police and detention centre officials. In Hecht's case, fieldwork of life in the street involved extended engagement not only with the youth who live there, but also with diverse elements of the city whose public spaces the children occupy. It implied that researching this transient population necessarily involved a number of field sites simultaneously. Hecht volunteered with a non-governmental organization that aimed to assist such youth. Additionally, he hung out informally in parks and on doorsteps where the youth often congregated, and visited the family homes of those with whom he developed stronger relationships. He also travelled to detention centres and Christian farms that aimed to reform this deviant population. While some sites provided more enlightening interactions than others, research for the monograph *At Home in the Street* (Hecht 1998) was not possible without multiple institutional and grounded perspectives.

While Hecht's study highlights challenges to fieldwork among a vulnerable population, others who have more directly engaged with state institutions reveal diverse possibilities for anthropological positioning vis-à-vis unevenly empowered actors. In Bolivia, anthropologist Daniel Goldstein (2004) earned trust among residents of Cochabamba's squatter settlements when he moved into a marginal neighbourhood normally visited only briefly by students conducting social surveys. Despite collaborating with a core residents' organization, he was eventually approached by people excluded from that network who wanted to ensure that he would include their perspectives in his study. In

his book *The Spectacular City* (2004), he reflects on whether the fact that his wife and newborn son also resided in the neighbourhood may have enhanced the trust that diverse residents who were unaffiliated with his key informants eventually invested in him. In the end, this involvement of people not represented by his main contacts was critical to his ability to contrast two very distinct urban spectacles: 1) the yearly *carnaval*, and 2) the unpredictable but rapidly proliferating incidence of mob lynching. In the first case, collaboration with a neighbourhood organization rendered an ethnographic perspective on one migrant community's hierarchical structures. In the second, participation in his study by some of the most marginal residents of the squatter settlement led him to better understand the multiple strategies by which residents seek to pressure municipal authorities to provide standard services (i.e. policing) to sectors of the city long deemed illegal.

Lastly, anthropologist Patty Kelly's (2008) fieldwork in a state-regulated brothel in southern Mexico was not restricted to interviewing sex workers. During her fieldwork, she sought to access the perspectives of professionals working in the brothel, such as doctors, nurses, teachers, and guards. At times her strategies were subtle, such as wearing a lab coat while inside the brothel as a gesture to the professionals who saw in the coat an indication that she would not fraternize too closely with the stigmatized sex workers. At other times, she benefitted from contacts developed with a number of state agents, including a city mayor and police officers. Such contacts led to Kelly riding along in a police truck during a night raid of illegal street prostitution. While her object of analysis (the brothel) was located in a single physical structure on the outskirts of the city of Tuxtla Gutiérrez, the investigation behind the book *Lydia's Open Door* (2008) required engagement in diverse

urban milieus as a means of contextualizing regulated prostitution within the city, the state

of Chiapas, and neoliberal Mexico more broadly.

Anthropologist George Marcus (1998) notes that multi-sited fieldwork is

increasingly the reality of contemporary ethnography. He implies that it is certainly not

restricted to urban fieldwork. Indeed, parallel challenges to contextualize and situate my

fieldwork experiences required me to re-map the boundaries of my field throughout the

course of this project. This occurred in a much less organized manner than Marcus would

make it seem. In his words, "[s]trategies of quite literally following connections,

associations, and putative relationships are…at the very heart of designing multi-sited

ethnographic research" (Marcus 1998: 81). As I outline in the following sections, fieldwork

for this thesis involved experiences that went far beyond any deliberate design on my part.

In fact, multi-sited ethnography seems to have emerged as a necessary result of my attention

to political withdrawal among youth. The more I tried to perceive my object of interest, the

more it seemed to slip from view, leading me to seek it in an expanding set of spheres.

In the end, I pursued fieldwork primarily among eleven families and their broader

social networks in three localities affected by industrial interventions in nearby rivers. These

were concentrated near the towns and in the surrounding countryside of San José de la

Mariquina in the coastal commune[2] of Mariquina, and Liquiñe and Neltume in the pre-

cordillera commune of Panguipulli. These areas are home to interspersed populations of

indigenous Mapuche and non-Mapuche residents. The total geographic area over which the

families and communities with whom I collaborated were dispersed covered a distance of

about 40 kilometres north to south by 170 kilometres west to east. I moved between these

areas in a used 4X4 vehicle purchased for my research. Occasionally, I attended events (i.e. concerts, civic meetings, art exhibits) in the regional capitals of Temuco and Valdivia. However, like many of the residents of small towns and rural sectors situated between these cities, my connections to urban centres were primarily administrative, for medical consultations, official documents, important purchases, or family visits. For the year that I lived in the more isolated Panguipulli interior, usually all of these were packed into a single weekend trip each month to make the three-hour commute from the cordillera to the coast worthwhile. At that time, Panguipulli was the site of five proposed hydroelectric installations in its abundant rivers. Some of these projects were at more advanced stages of planning than others, but as of the beginning of my investigation none had yet been approved by the regional state regulating body responsible for permitting projects to proceed.

Mariquina

My fieldwork began in the southern commune of Mariquina by virtue of personal circumstances. Home to my in-laws, it presented me with a place in which my own modest insertion into social networks facilitated six months of exploratory research in 2006 and 2007. During this time, and prior to focusing on younger generations, I was perplexed by changing, often contradictory political alliances between people affected by a pulp mill that was installed in 2004 a few kilometres upstream from the commune's capital city of San José de la Mariquina. My ability to formulate questions about these contradictions evolved as I visited neighbouring towns, lingered in diverse milieus such as dance halls and public

university seminars, pursued new contacts, and elaborated relationships of confidence. During that time, I frequented churches, rural schools, shopping malls, civil registry offices, attended community association meetings for state-sponsored inter-cultural projects, hung out in parks with town youth, and shared many meals and *onces*[3] in family homes.

Like many of Mariquina's residents, I spent long periods of time bewildered by things that may or may not have been connected to the new mill's dumping of toxic waste into the adjacent Cruces River. Among these things were simultaneous cases of colon cancer in our own home, which in the case of my twenty-year-old brother-in-law proved terminal in late 2009. Whether or not this illness had anything to do with toxic emissions from the plant, my attention was piqued by a displayed lack of interest among others for even wondering about this possibility. This lack of interest is perhaps best described as an expressive indifference to the civic sphere, to relating circumstances in the household to anything beyond. I observed it in the quiet retreat of people in diverse parts of Mariquina when, for instance, conversations turned to the contamination of the adjacent river and hazards this posed to the town's drinking water. I wanted to understand what beliefs about public life guided so many diverse people with whom I interacted, "*to not get involved*" (*a no meterse*).

Mariquina is a short distance from the capital city of the Rivers Region, Valdivia. For more than fifteen years now, San José de la Mariquina has supplied the workforce to one of South America's largest pulp mills, Celco Valdivia. Coinciding with the plant's initiation in March 2004, the continent's largest population of wild black-necked swans (nearly 8,000)[4] was decimated within the span of a few months. In just over a year, the

41

mortality rate of the birds grew by more than 600%, with scarcely 500 swans remaining alive in May 2005.[5] By 2010, I never saw more than four swans at a time in the wetlands between San José and Valdivia, a place where they are said to have once congregated in the thousands. Their deaths were publicly disturbing. Prior to perishing, the swans first lost muscle strength in their necks and the ability to fly. Several fatally crashed into backyards and other public spaces. A number of scientific reports debated the cause of this tragedy, often claiming that results were too inconclusive to attribute to the plant's operations.[6] Meanwhile, citizen groups in Valdivia tackled the political and economic interests behind scientific denials of any obvious correlation between the plant's activities, the rapid depletion of vegetation in the river, and the tragedy of the swans (Gross 2008).

I began to ask what cultural or socio-economic characteristics, outlooks on the world, and life experiences motivated those who actively organized either for or against the paper plant, versus those who keenly withdrew from public debates. Was I correct to suppose that perceptions of past interventions significantly oriented the positions taken by people in affected communities? By past interventions, I refer not just to industrial projects, but also to moments in which localities have come into direct and often coercive contact with those perceived as outsiders. These are encounters provoked by non-residents, which could include both military patrols enforcing curfews and unionists seeking to mobilize local labour. Following this line of questioning, I set out to observe contexts in which memories of past confrontations were shared between locals, and to evaluate whether such sharing of memories influenced decisions about how to relate to current environmental transformations from industrial interventions. The challenge was not only to appreciate how

specific memories survive and are carried into the present through stories, habits, and tastes that keep them relevant to individuals and groups. It was also to perceive the transmission of certain memories (and possibly not others) across generations, and how this transmission fosters social identities relevant to present circumstances. My energies turned to evaluating whether and how patterns of talking (or not talking) about the conflicted past influence the political decisions of Mariquina's residents today, many of whom were not yet alive when watershed confrontations relating to the Allende presidency and Pinochet dictatorship occurred. I listened for competing judgments about Chile's divisive past, asking how these congeal around observable narratives, and I tried to identify ways in which references or allusions to past confrontations carry lessons for how to behave in public and political milieus today.

My curiosity in people who were seemingly apathetic about the future well-being of their local communities directed my attention to the emotional aspects of political withdrawal, as I resisted the urge to equate seeming apathy with actual indifference. This interest eventually drew me beyond Mariquina, to sectors similarly affected by industrial transformations in local relationships to nearby rivers. Through my collaboration with a young artist from Mariquina who aimed to paint an historical-cultural mural in the lakefront of the city of Panguipulli, located in a nearby commune of the same name, I began to develop research relationships in and around the pre-cordillera towns of Liquiñe and Neltume.

Panguipulli

In 2008, together with my artist friend Chascón, I received a grant from Chile's National Council for the Arts (FONDART) that included a small budget to collect historical narratives in the pre-cordillera. The grant was intended to inform our mural. Between July and October of 2008, I collaborated with residents of the town of Liquiñe and its surrounding indigenous communities in Panguipulli's interior. At the time, Liquiñe was the site of one of four proposed run-of-river hydroelectric projects in the area (this one 118 MW), for which Norway's partly state-owned energy company, SN Power, was attempting to conduct an Environmental Impact Assessment (E.I.A.). The company was encountering resistance by local property-owners who refused scientific consultants access to sites necessary for elaborating technical studies. Together with a local Mapuche leader, I conducted interviews with residents both in town and in surrounding indigenous communities, several of which were involved in barring company access to the area. With other local leaders, our objectives of collecting historical narratives expanded to address an imminent concern among locals, which was how to effectively respond to an Environmental Impact Assessment that could be submitted by the company to the regional commission on the environment at any time. Should an E.I.A. be submitted, our recording of interviews and systematization of perspectives on the proposed installations would enable concerned residents to critically and collectively respond within the sixty-day timeframe allotted by legislation for citizen participation in the impact assessment process.

Over a period of four months in 2008, I spent two to three days a week in the Liquiñe valley collecting oral testimonies and using these to elaborate an independent social

impact assessment in collaboration with preoccupied residents. We interviewed nearly forty people at length, one quarter of whom were elderly. During these encounters, we listened to stories of the valley's settlement by both Chilean and Mapuche families, whose grandparents and great-grandparents escaped economic hardship in the Central Valley to the north, as well as genocidal violence in Argentina to the east. We heard about local experiences of natural disasters like the 1960 earthquake, and about other devastating earthquakes remembered through stories transmitted by kin now long since deceased. These led to descriptions of recent transformations in the landscape, especially since the lumber industry clear-cut the majority of old-growth forest between the 1930s and 1970s. Observed transformations included the increased risk for mudslides and the dramatically reduced volume of area rivers. To a great extent, the landscape itself emerged as a map of social memory in Liquiñe, unravelling for us the nature of relationships between its diverse Mapuche and settler inhabitants.

By the time our mural was installed in the city of Panguipulli's lakefront in May 2009, I was living in the former lumber company town of Neltume, a short distance from Liquiñe. Sponsored by a private foundation, I worked as an English teacher in a municipal school. At the time, Neltume was also facing the impending installation of a hydroelectric facility, except this one was a much larger 480 MW plant proposed by the former state electric company Endesa. Privatized in the 1980s, Endesa has since merged with various energy companies throughout the continent and at the time belonged to a European energy conglomerate based in Italy. During my time in both Liquiñe and Neltume, I also witnessed strategies employed by executives of these multi-national companies (usually under the

45

banner of their Chilean subsidiaries) to entice residents into accepting—or at least not opposing—the hydroelectric installations.

While interested in local reactions to proposed hydroelectric projects, my attraction to Panguipulli's interior also drew on the town's particular relationship to political mobilization. As mentioned already, it was a key site in which lumber workers once seized productive power during the Popular Unity years, making Neltume the centre of the *Complejo Forestal y Maderero de Panguipulli* (Panguipulli Forestry and Timber Complex). In the early 1970s, workers took over twenty-two large estates from private owners and began to run the Complex themselves. The workers had formed the largest lumber union in Chile's history, taking over some 360,000 hectares, an area that at its peak encompassed almost the entire pre-cordillera of the Province of Valdivia. While it was the Allende administration that incorporated this new entity into the CORFO (the state agency responsible for fostering production),[7] the estates did not return to private ownership for nearly two decades.

Especially for Chileans formerly affiliated with the MIR (Revolutionary Left Movement),[8] Neltume often symbolizes peasant commitment to socialist militancy, as it was the industrial centre of the forestry complex. This is partly in recognition of events that occurred in the weeks immediately following the military coup, when union leaders and lumber workers alike were rounded up by helicopter and military caravan (Ahumada et al. 1989; Verdugo 1994[1989]). Most were young men in their twenties and early thirties. Those accused of assaulting Neltume's police station on the day after the coup were assassinated at gunpoint in Valdivia's Isla Teja prison or at a shooting range near the

highway to the southeast of the city, under order of a court-martial (Rojas et al. 1991: 50-65). In total, seventy-one men massacred in diverse sectors of the pre-cordillera are commemorated for their involvement in and struggles for the forestry complex. Seventeen from Liquiñe were picked up with the collaboration of a civilian businessman by the name of Luis García, who not only provided lists of names and whereabouts of the victims, but loaned vehicles to military officials to transport the prisoners (Amorós 2004; LaNacion.cl 2008). The detained from that sector were shot on the bridge over the Toltén River in the pre-cordillera city of Villarrica, and their bodies dumped in the current along with several dozen others rounded up in one of the coup's most infamous military operations, the Caravan of Death (See Centro de Estudios Miguel Enríquez 2003; Rojas et al. 1991).

Neltume is also widely known for later subversive activities, as its surrounding hillsides were host to returned exiles hiding as guerrillas during the early 1980s. These were discovered by authorities at a time when Pinochet's own son-in-law, Julio Ponce Lerou, was president of the Timber Complex (del Pino and Jelin 2004: 117-120).[9] Eleven were massacred by the Armed Forces stationed in town and two who escaped were killed in subsequent years (See Comité Memoria Neltume 2003; Leiva 2001). In the last three years of the Pinochet regime, the Complex was privatized and its properties sold off. Today, these remain in the hands of Chile's affluent elite. The lingering effects of this very particular history of social struggle and state repression intrigued me throughout fieldwork. To what extent did memories of such events play into current encounters between area residents and outsiders seeking to develop new industries in the area?

Natural and Social Geography

Despite common dependence on agricultural production and lumber extraction, geo-politics and natural topography distinguish life in Mariquina and Panguipulli from one another. Due to its proximity to Valdivia, Mariquina was among the first valleys in the southern regions settled by Spaniards, while Panguipulli remained relatively isolated from settler activities until well into the nineteenth century. In the early colonial period, the *Madre de Díos* gold mines discovered near Mariquina motivated the installation of Spanish forts near the coast (See Guarda 1973; Pedersen 1992). Meanwhile, the fine quality of gold extracted from these led to the assignation of *encomienda* rights to conquerors throughout the latter half of the sixteenth century (See Chapter 3 for more on this history). However, along with six other settlements in territories occupied by ancestors of today's Mapuche society, these were sacked by Mapuche warriors and the invaders were killed or driven away for the next half century. When Spaniards returned to reconquer the settlement of Valdivia in the 1640s, they were accompanied by Jesuit missionaries who would play a crucial role in submitting the area's indigenous population to European influence. Eventually, Franciscan and Capuchin missions would also penetrate unconquered territories, and the mission in San José de la Mariquina would become a hub of religious and political influence in the region for centuries to come. Until as recently as the 1990s, the presence of Mariquina's mission was evident in the dozens of monks commonly seen walking its streets. These left the city permanently for other missions in the region, when their seminary burned in a disastrous fire little more than a decade ago. The influence of the mission does not seem to have kept Mariquina any more Catholic in the face of new

religious influences, especially those of evangelical Christian churches that have been increasingly established in the southern regions since the 1970s. With a population of approximately 18,000, almost one quarter of which claimed Mapuche heritage in the 2012 census, the proportion of Mariquina that affirms the Catholic faith is slightly below the national average of 70% (Biblioteca del Congreso Nacional de Chile 2012). A cathedral, a private seminary that is one of the most prestigious high schools in the region, and a sanatorium established by nuns are the last remnants of Mariquina's mission heritage.

Landscape & Livelihood in Panguipulli's Interior

Tucked into the northeast corner of the Rivers Region, the relatively expansive commune of Panguipulli is among the largest in the country in geographic terms (See Appendix A: Panguipulli's Social Geography). Panguipulli borders Argentina, and with a population of approximately 35,000, it covers an area of nearly two hundred and thirty square kilometres. According to the 2006 census, more than half of its residents live in rural areas. As of the 2012 census, 35% identified as Mapuche, well above the regional average of 16% and the national average of 6%. Located only thirty kilometres to the south of the Toltén River, which was the southern frontier of autonomous Mapuche territory until the region's forced annexation in 1893, Panguipulli's interior received Mapuche families fleeing military campaigns just over a century ago. That was when both Chilean and Argentinian states pushed to expand their territories, displacing Mapuche society in both the Araucanía and the pampas across the Andes. Residents in its pre-cordillera sectors today find clay jugs in their fields and forests, buried long ago by predecessors who filled them

with precious items (i.e. cooking utensils, silverware), and presumably hid them in the landscape while fleeing colonial violence.

With some 1,200 inhabitants, the town of Liquiñe is located in a valley that skirts the southern slopes of three stratovolcanoes which run perpendicular to the surrounding Andean cordillera. From east to west, volcanoes Lanín, Quetrupillán, and Villarrica (also known as Rucapillán) cut across the Liquiñe-Ofqui fault line that begins in this valley and runs more than 1,000 kilometres southward. This geological fault is where the Antarctic tectonic plate meets the Nazca and South American plates. Geological barriers complicate access to the Liqiuñe valley. Most commonly, visitors and residents enter via the main roadway which passes along unreinforced hairpin turns at the Añiques hill, which is often closed during winter months. Locally, a few people enter via a precarious logging road that winds twenty-five kilometres around a mountainside to the town of Neltume. After nearly meeting my death on a broken bridge along this road, on the few occasions that I travelled between Liquiñe and Neltume directly, I travelled the more than 100 kilometre alternative route between the two. This is a substantial distance given that the towns are physically removed by only fifteen kilometres. Normally only tourists access the Liquiñe valley via a mountain pass from Argentina. However, as Mapuche residents in the area are accustomed to walking long distances for meetings and trade, on several occasions I encountered men who had just returned from Argentina, apparently a short distance by foot away. They journeyed on transnational footpaths long followed by parents and grandparents alike.

Due to heightened geological activity, the Liquiñe valley forms the densest collection of hot springs in South America, where geothermal water at dozens of sites

emerges from the ground at more than 80°C. Dozens of families live off of the tourism that these springs attract, either directly by offering pools for bathing in the mineral rich waters, or indirectly through hostels, camping, and food services. The springs are only one element that contributes to Liquiñe's greater labour diversification compared to Neltume. While the latter was founded as a company town, to which workers and their families were brought by employers, settlers in Liquiñe arrived by more autonomous means, acquiring small plots of land known as *hijuelas*, which were carved out at the margins of larger estates. While both Mapuche and settler families depend on lumber extraction to varying degrees, their distance from the industry's former centre in Neltume and from newer firms located in Villarrica, has meant greater autonomy in developing alternative sources of income to the sale of lumber.

As in neighbouring communes like Villarrica and Pucón, tourism is an important local economy. Here, pockets of wealth prosper off the zone's snow-capped volcanoes, lush forests protected in national parks and private reserves, hot springs, and beaches. However, aspects of Panguipulli's commercial development set it apart from neighbouring adventure sports hubs like Pucón. As one of Chile's most popular destinations for foreign tourists, Pucón hosts backpackers in hostels and receives well-heeled clientele in several five-star hotels. Dozens of tour companies line its main street offering expeditions for rafting, canopy zip-lines, volcano ascents, skiing, rock climbing, mountain biking, and horseback riding. It also boasts one of Chile's newest casinos. While some local entrepreneurs have introduced outdoor tours to the area, Panguipulli lacks the infrastructure (paved roads throughout the interior, varied types of rented accommodations) to effectively mirror

51

Pucón's rapid expansion in recent decades. In the commune's capital city, also called Panguipulli, tourists accustomed to cosmopolitan amenities that are available in Pucón are easily disappointed by only a handful of typical Chilean restaurants (offering mostly the standard fare of beef, fried eggs, mashed potatoes, and soups), as well as a few modest hotels. Working class Chilean tourists often visit for the famous thermal hot springs in Liquiñe, whose home-grown infrastructure does not commonly appeal to more affluent tourists. In the past decade, the installation by a single owner of two five-star hotels in the forest near Neltume has seen wealthy tourists begin to arrive on package trips. These are shuttled into the interior by the hotel's owners and nearly all their activities (i.e. volcano ascents, hiking, fishing) are managed by a single enterprise. That initiative underscores Panguipulli's rigid class stratification.

In contrast to Pucón and even Mariquina, in Panguipulli private property is owned by formidably wealthy Santiagans who have built large summer cottages on isolated estates tucked into the rugged hillsides. Many local workers today permanently manage these, living on or adjacent to the expansive properties year round. The surnames of Panguipulli's current large estate owners form a list of some of Chile's most powerful elite. They include the owner of one of the country's largest grocery chains, another the owner of all the major national brands of beer and pisco, owners of canned foods and plastics companies, state ministers, and a foreign opera singer. Many of these have come together as Panguipulli's organized benefactors, calling their charitable committee *Los Amigos de Panguipulli* (Friends of Panguipulli). They meet regularly, usually in Santiago where most permanently reside, to coordinate development initiatives in the commune.

As indicated already, to presume that the wealthy in Panguipulli are of long-term duration in the zone would miss a very important dimension of the commune's recent history.[10] As it was host to repression of lumber workers during the Pinochet regime, properties appropriated by workers in the early 1970s were redistributed by the state in the late-1980s under unclear terms. Panguipulli's layered history of struggles against exploitation of both ethno-cultural and class nature render it an opportune window onto Chilean society's systematic exploitation of the rural South.

Eleven Families

In order to contextualize social processes occurring in these communes, I focused investigation on the experiences of eleven families spread throughout rural and semi-urban areas. Participant observation and interviews were carried out with at least two people from different generations within each of the families, in most cases during several encounters over periods ranging from four months to two years. At the time of research, three characteristics were shared by each of the families with whom I collaborated in Mariquina and Panguipulli. First, they all lived on scarce resources. Such circumstances make for commonalities in terms of strategies for obtaining food, shelter, and other basic needs, in spite of diverse cultural backgrounds and geographic dispersion between coastal areas and the cordillera.[11] Second, each family included children under thirty years of age. To side-step tensions over whom to work with in any given kin network, I approached families by following how younger members articulated to me their own sense of kinship and belonging. Third, most members of these families did not typically affiliate with social

53

movements or other aspects of organized civil society. The good opinion of these people is often actively sought by corporations proposing large industrial developments in remote areas, as a means of generating the impression of local consent for such projects. In this context, reluctance not only to participate in civic organizations, but to engage with potential corporate benefactors, suggests that in spite of their evident differences, such families belonged to a poorly understood group of citizens who are apparently ambivalent about Chile's current democracy.

The condition of living on scarce resources has many faces, but in these sectors I observed that it generally shared features in terms of housing and educational conditions (See Appendix B: What can a family of four purchase on Chile's minimum age?). Except for one family which acquired a government subsidized home in a new housing project in San José de la Mariquina in 2009, and another that rented a two-room home in Liquiñe, all have built their own houses. These were constructed in piecemeal fashion, as materials became available. To this day the houses remain works in progress. In the countryside, windows are often improvised with transparent industrial plastic stapled to the sills. Meanwhile, in town, homes are constantly being upgraded with new features, such as kitchen cupboards, washing machines, and septic tanks. In the past fifteen to twenty years, home improvements have increasingly been financed by state grants for low-income families. However, among more than half of the families who collaborated in this project, lack of knowledge about how to access such funds or reluctance to collaborate with a community association in order to do so, has meant that most of their homes are the product of the labour of family members alone. Unlike colder and more humid concrete structures in

54

cities like Santiago and Temuco, all of these families' houses were constructed of wood, and they are all heated by firewood, when it is available.

School-aged children from all of these families attended state-funded schools, as opposed to elite academies financed privately and attended by children from the wealthiest families in the region. Only four of the families had vehicles of their own, which were often used to supplement household income. One of these was a yellow school van owned by a teacher and used to transport pupils to school, while another was a flatbed cargo truck that the owner rented out to transport animals, firewood, and other local materials. Only three of the eleven families live most of the year in rural properties designated as collective indigenous lands under the Indigenous Law 19.253. However, all but three of the families have members who self-identify as Mapuche, indicating that indigenous heritage is affirmed by many more people than those who declare status before the state or who live in rural sectors of recognized communities whose properties are assigned as *reducciones* (See Appendix C: Ethno-Cultural Profiles). No one in any of these families has access to enough land to support commercial cultivation, nor large-scale cattle or dairy production.

Migration was a prominent experience among all eleven families. The quest for land, work, or mere survival throughout the twentieth century framed every resettlement process described. Only three families, all living within recognized Mapuche communities, live on properties inhabited by their families prior to the Popular Unity period. However, even several members of these had spent long periods working in distant cities to sustain family in the South. The prevalence of migration stories signals that for landless southerners of

both Mapuche and non-indigenous descent, relationships to place are heavily influenced by cycles of labour migration.

Southern Rivers

Residents of Mariquina and Panguipulli use rivers for multiple purposes, for drinking water, fishing, irrigation, tourism, household electricity generation, leisure, and in the case of some Mapuche communities, ceremonial cleansing (See Skewes et al. 2012). In certain areas, locals are astutely aware of changes that have occurred in their rivers in recent decades. Some flows have reduced substantially in lived memory, possibly consequence of the clear-cutting of old growth forests in the cordillera. Meanwhile, others have overflowed onto lands previously used for agriculture. A case in point is the wetlands through which the Cruces River passes near the regional capital of Valdivia and the commune of Mariquina. These were largely formed by a tsunami prompted by the Great Chilean Earthquake of 1960, to date the world's most intense ever recorded (9.5 on the Richter Scale). Following that same event, the San Pedro River which passes through a portion of the commune of Panguipulli directly upstream and to the east of Valdivia, became dammed as a result of hillsides sliding into its path. That river is the final draining point of water from seven lakes of glacial formation situated in Panguipulli's pre-cordillera; it is the only river to carry the water of all of these to the ocean.

The unexpected obstruction of the San Pedro River in 1960 not only flooded farmland and communities immediately affected near Riñihue, the lowest of the lakes, but even threatened populations in more distant urban areas. In the weeks following the

earthquake, thick walls of mud blocking the lake's only exit threatened to burst at any moment. This risked sending a torrent crashing down the uncharacteristically empty riverbed, potentially destroying villages along its shoreline and endangering over 100,000 residents in and around the metropolitan centre of Valdivia who were already devastated from the tsunami. In what is known as the *Riñihuazo*, in the weeks after the quake locals collaborated with members of the Armed Forces using some two-dozen bulldozers over the course of a month to dig a drainage canal to control the release of Lake Riñihue's unprecedented rising water level.

For some citizens and community leaders, it is preoccupying that in 2008, the company proposing a hydroelectric dam on the San Pedro River near Lake Riñihue was responsible for compiling its own Environmental Impact Assessment (E.I.A.), for procedural review by the region's Environmental Commission.[12] In the original assessment submitted to the Commission by the Endesa-affiliated company Colbún S. A., no seismological study was included. The Commission was newly established in Valdivia, where previously industrial projects of this nature were evaluated in the former regional capital of Puerto Montt some 300 kilometres further south. Preoccupation turned to alarm when in October of that year the new regional Environmental Commission refused citizen participation in the final meeting prior to voting on whether to approve the project. Mapuche leaders, representatives of the tourism industry, and concerned citizens already in attendance were escorted out of the Commission's assembly room by a delegation of police officers. Some protestors declared that the denial of citizen participation (a consultation

clause outlined in Law 19.300 on the General Bases of the Environment) signalled that they continued to live under a dictatorship.

Technically, citizen participation was reduced to written statements already submitted by concerned residents. Furthermore, no independent scientific authority or citizen group was permitted in the meeting, meaning that nobody except the Commission itself could ensure the consideration of material running counter to the company's E.I.A. recommendation that the project proceed. That day the San Pedro River hydroelectric project was approved sixteen votes to one (the only dissenter being the regional president of the Socialist Party). Within hours, footage recorded by citizens present began to appear on the personal video broadcasting website www.youtube.com. Most notable was footage of then mayor of Panguipulli—a torture survivor during the Pinochet regime and returned exile—being pushed to the ground and arrested by Special Forces officers without being advised for the reasons of his detainment (information that others in the video repeatedly demanded).

Outcry such as that over the approval of the San Pedro hydroelectric dam suggests local discontent with decision-making processes. Taking into account the magnitude of industrial projects in Chile currently presenting rapid transformations in local relationships to fresh and coastal waters, the San Pedro River's hydroelectric initiative is a minor instance in what critical observers like Norbert Lechner (mentioned in the Introduction) argue is a national crisis of citizen participation in decision-making processes.

Everyday Forms of Power and Resistance

During my investigation in Mariquina and Panguipulli, the powerful were not readily at hand or embodied in the typified figure of an absentee landlord. Formal power shifted between state actors, company agents, and local leaders of community organizations. This required a sensitivity to idioms and practices through which locals express their perceptions of authority and social structure in daily life. It involved, for instance, a critical approach to the "peasantry" or *campesinado*.[13] While such terms are occasionally used by members of older generations, the meaning of these categories has been significantly transformed in recent decades with the resurgence of indigenous identities throughout the continent, and with the ever increasing penetration of global capitalism into remote regions. Notions of a singular, homogeneous peasantry have been re-shaped as poor rural residents reorient themselves to transforming property regimes and emergent horizons for collective action. Reorientations are encountered in contexts where the privatization of natural resources has fostered the arrival of multi-national companies, as their extractive activities frequently frustrate locals who perceive few benefits from these initiatives. In such instances, we observe new alliances awkwardly emerge between previously dispersed groups (i.e. peasants of indigenous and settler descent), and even between actors long in opposition to one another (i.e. indigenous communities and neighbouring landlords). Reorientations of the so-called peasantry can also be observed in increased appeals to international protocols introduced in recent decades to protect historically vulnerable populations. New incentives to affirm aboriginal heritage come by way of the United Nation's 2007 Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, as well as the International

Labour Organization's Convention No. 169 on Indigenous and Tribal Peoples, ratified by Chile in 2008, twenty years after it was first drafted.

Meanwhile, anthropologists have noted that recent state attention for indigenous heritage has involved a bureaucratization of cultural difference that presents depoliticizing effects for those of Mapuche descent. Chile's first Indigenous Law 19.253, promulgated by the coalition for democracy the *Concertación* in 1993, offers a range of material benefits for people who claim indigenous status, including scholarships, as well as access to special funds for housing and small-scale economic endeavours. Nevertheless, like the Chilean Constitution, that law neither recognizes the Mapuche as a people, nor grants rights to collective self-determination. In anthropologist Ana Mariella Bacigalupo's assessment, under democracy successive administrations have "viewed Mapuche demands in terms of development and equality instead of recognizing cultural rights" (Bacigalupo 2007: 141).

In anthropologist Francisca de la Maza's (2008) assessment of Chile's new Intercultural Bilingual Education[14] (EIB) program, it was found that policies intended to promote structural change between the state and indigenous peoples are met with reluctance, despite the good intentions of state actors like teachers and school principals. Among the state's first local-level efforts to integrate indigenous peoples, the EIB initiative was introduced in select schools in 1995 by the Ministry of Education (MINEDUC) and pursued in conjunction with the *Orígenes* program. That is an indigenous development fund financed in part by an $80 million loan from the Inter-American Development Bank. In de la Maza's analysis of the EIB's elaboration in Panguipulli, where five schools throughout the commune hosted this program during her ethnographic fieldwork, paternalism persists

in the classroom's uni-directional transmission of knowledge from instructors to students. She observes primarily non-Mapuche teachers instructing indigenous culture (i.e. food, hands crafts, dances) and language to Mapuche children whose elders have, for whatever reasons, not transmitted the Mapudungun language. She finds that discourse among teachers conveys impressions of the Mapuche people as being reticent about sharing aspects of their own cultural knowledge, with the effect that teachers end up reproducing racist stereotypes about the Mapuche people being uncooperative and divisive (de la Maza 2008: 117). As non-Mapuche teachers express feelings of discrimination by Mapuche colleagues and parents, de la Maza finds that the very idea of inter-culturality as it has been applied within the schools tends to shut down dialogue, a notion at the heart of inter-cultural policy.

Scholars have also emphasized that Mapuche actors have been far from passive as subordinating mechanisms of the Chilean state have sought, over more than a century, to negate Mapuche identity and territorial autonomy (See Boccara 2002; Le Bonniec 2003). Such studies have put emphasis on emergent and transforming relationships between Mapuche people and the state. However, without turning directly to inter-cultural relationships in specific localities, the actual nature of relationships between Mapuche actors and their settler neighbours remains largely unexplored in the literature. During my own fieldwork, historical complexities surrounding rural identities revealed themselves on occasions, such as when music teacher Don Felipe declared to his adult daughter and me that the Mapuche did not exist when he was young. While his daughter was scandalized by the dismissal of his pupils' indigenous heritage, he corrected her by observing that *indios* (Indians) existed, they had their own beliefs, practices, and language, but they were known

61

as *paisanos*[15] all the same. Don Felipe was articulating something more subtle than his own perceptions of indigenous neighbours. He was highlighting an understanding of Mapuche society today as being equally the product of distinct cultural transmissions, as of a history of violent exclusion from the Chilean nation.

To say that in the 1960s the Mapuche did not exist, Don Felipe meant that at the time, there were very different possibilities for aboriginal actors who sought to transform their circumstances. In this manner, Don Felipe was suggesting to me that Mapuche men and women who once allied themselves with the leftist Revolutionary Peasant Movement,[16] should not be understood as having necessarily been card-carrying communists, so to speak. In his impression, the unique reasons for certain Mapuche actors to participate in takeovers of large estates should not be understood within the same historical prism as motivations driving socialist agitators of settler background. In many cases, Mapuche participants of such takeovers were seeking to recuperate territory usurped in preceding decades. At the time of the Popular Unity, they found convenient allies in communist militants, but such alliances are today seen by Don Felipe as largely of convenience. He was also suggesting that his elderly father's neglect to respond at length to my questions about relationships to Mapuche neighbours, did not mean that such relationships did not exist. At issue was my language. In a terse declaration about the Mapuche not existing during his youth, Don Felipe was insinuating that I needed to figure out how to speak about inter-cultural relations in ways that my questions would actually be understood by those I interviewed.

Narrative Training

Anthropologist Julie Cruikshank argues that extended periods of fieldwork are essential for 'training' in the narrative styles of communities not our own. In her ethnography *Life Lived like a Story* (1990), written in collaboration with three Yukon elders, Cruikshank recounts a revelation she had while conducting fieldwork in Northwestern Canada. It occurred when the native women she was interviewing frequently began telling stories (myths and family legends) in response to her questions regarding memories of the impact of the Klondike gold rush and the construction of the Alaska Highway on local cultures. Gradually, upon numerous retellings of the same stories, Cruikshank became sensitive to layers of meaning to the histories the women were recounting, layers that previously went unperceived by her. She was awakening to unfamiliar narrative strategies deployed through what she first took to be quaint folk tales. In her own words, Cruikshank describes how storytelling for these Yukon women contributes (Cruikshank, 1990; ix):

> …to strategies for adapting to social, cultural, and economic change…Their life stories tell us as much about ideas of community as about individual experience…When they talk about their lives, these women use narrative genres familiar to anyone sharing their cultural background but not always clear to cultural outsiders.

The lesson to draw from Cruikshank is that, in order for the transmission of meanings to occur (such as from parents to children, or research participants to anthropologist, and vice versa), some common understanding of what to listen for guides

what meanings are mutually drawn. Anthropologist Keith Basso's (1996) *Wisdom Sits in Places* makes a similar point, with the addition that the stories told by the Western Apache are located in distinct parts of the physical landscape surrounding them, and these contribute to a sense of place shared by community members. As an outsider, it took Basso years to even realize that the predilection for storytelling among his Apache friends transmitted knowledge far deeper than what was literally contained in the stories told and retold. I remind myself of Cruikshank and Basso whenever I am overwhelmed by the anxiety that I spent too long in the field. The extended time I spent in the homes of families who received me during more than two years in southern Chile, including a year that I spent teaching in a municipal elementary and high school, have taught me to appreciate politics and democracy in terms of local idioms shared among those who wrestle with uneven membership in the national community.

Much like Don Tito's reflections with which this thesis begins, research relationships usually began with me inviting stories of family origins. These almost invariably deviated to stories about non-familial groups as well, and often depended on my participants' own understandings of where my interests in contemporary manifestations of contested pasts should take us. This led to stories about the origins of cultural groups in the region (i.e. Dutch, Mapuche), as well as to stories about the founding of towns, the initial delimitation of rural estates, and to stories about people and communities who inhabited the landscape prior to anyone's living memory. Stories of origin were valuable orienting devices that helped alert me to how people conceived the state and social 'others' in their lives.

I therefore began this investigation attentive to the narrative styles that structure stories about the origins of families and their perceived social position. I listened to who told their stories as heroic sagas, romantic fables, or great mysteries. Similarly, I paid heed to how speakers attributed personal, historical, and social meaning to the stories they chose to tell. Group conversations (hardly interviews in the structured, conventional sense) proved illuminating of dominant personalities within families, while interviews with individual members often uncovered nuanced perspectives that qualified collective stories told. Among younger generations, I observed who adopts and variously adapts the perspectives intended for them by elders. And I asked: in what ways do these youth prefer to engage with intended transmissions of memory (i.e. through personal stories, looking at photo albums, or in the avoidance of listening to recollections altogether)?

Deep Hanging Out

Much of my time in the field was spent in activities that anthropologist Clifford Geertz (2000) calls 'deep-hanging out,' such as chit-chatting with colleagues as I warmed hands at the fireplace in the staff room of the school where I worked. On such occasions, I overheard teachers debate the development needs of their town and speculate on grim prospects for a tourism industry should the adjacent river, with its impressive cascades, be diverted to a reservoir for hydroelectric generation. Most of the time, this felt like wasting time with locals, and it often provoked in me anxiety about my fieldwork abilities. The direction and rhythm of research often seemed well beyond my control. Nevertheless, some elements were within my control. Among these was an effort to conduct formal recorded

65

interviews on a regular basis, a means for creating a necessary distance from the subject matter in order to eventually write about fieldwork, in spite of feeling increasingly swallowed up by it. In the end, I left Chile with more than fifty recorded hours of interviews from at least three dozen people. Several were group interviews that brought together families, friends, and colleagues; many more were never recorded but were written up in field notes.

Moving away from a strict focus on families and civic organization, fieldwork also came to involve collaborations with diverse actors who saw potential for achieving their personal and political goals with help they hoped that I could provide. These unexpected forms of Participatory Action Research[17] involved my assistance in writing grant applications, my contributions to an historical-cultural mural, and in the case already mentioned of Liquiñe, an independent social impact assessment of a proposed hydroelectric dam (a report never published due to the company's eventual retreat). As mentioned, this last was solicited after I was introduced to area residents and learned of local apprehensions that the company proposing a reservoir in the hills surrounding their homes was not obliged by law to take the cultural, social, historical, or economic perspectives of local people into account in the impact assessment. Recently, observations collected in that collaboration were shared with a research team at the University of British Columbia that is compiling a comparative study of Environmental Impact Assessment processes in six countries.

These types of services were not straightforward exchanges of my skills for access to data relevant to my research interests. The process of collaborating with locals to negotiate desired ends itself became data, and has come to play an important part in my

analysis. Collaborative projects of this nature revealed to me situated understandings of liberal democratic power. This power is manifested in complex bureaucratic structures that deploy technical documents and sophisticated argumentations, limiting access to social mobility and political influence among already marginalized people. These collaborations inserted me in positions I would not normally have experienced if I did not occupy a recognized role in local communities. This active positioning opened up opportunities for people to share memories about past outsiders who had come to intervene in and interpret their communities. To some degree, it also pressured me to become uncomfortably complicit with local power structures, such as during a two month teachers' strike in 2009 while I was working in a municipal school, when I was pressured to continue teaching in spite of the picket line. While public teachers are unionized, I was hired by a charitable foundation run by wealthy estate owners in the area. Paid in the form of a monthly honorarium and provided room and board in the charitable foundation's housing complex, I taught English courses guaranteed to youth by the public system, but denied them by the inability of the public schooling authority to retain qualified staff in such remote areas. As private donors took up the burden of financing quality education, the labour rights of teachers to organize collectively were progressively undermined.

Winters in southern Chile are famously damp, with heavy rain falling for weeks on end, and temperatures hovering around 0 degrees Celsius. In contexts such as these, research in a heavily structured sense was difficult, as pulling oneself out of bed in a freezing, humid house just to conduct interviews proved unhealthy, at least until I adapted to the daily routines of my hosts. Participation in everyday activities became an essential

means of learning how to physically survive with so few material resources in such a severe climate. In this fashion, fieldwork was also largely about daily chores such as chopping wood (never very well, for my part); congregating in stuffy, closed-in kitchens to conserve heat; and sipping maté or eating soup for lunch. Among many families, meals were most often the only point of the day in which members came together for more than a moment's interaction.[18]

I also encountered uncomfortable norms of sociability, disrupting my own standards for respect and personal boundaries. This was the case, for instance, when gossip over family meals turned to the perceived sexual indiscretions of teenaged girls. Sitting in on conversations that judged the pronounced mistakes of daughters of co-workers, neighbours, cousins, and even friends was difficult, especially in contexts where a young girl's claims of sexual assault were collectively diminished to speculations about her virtue and perceived lack of modesty. Not unlike Norbert Elias and John Scotson's observations on the stigmatizing effect of gossip (1994[1965]), I have come to appreciate how such forms of vicious talk serve to morally elevate one group that may otherwise seem indistinguishable from another.

Writing the Public Secrets of Others

Some people with whom I collaborated were especially welcoming because they believed that I would write their perspectives on history and social differences exactly as described to me. These presumed that I was not also observing contradictions between statements and actions, or putting their perspectives into dialogue with the perspectives of

others. This was the case with one young man who spoke eloquently of returning to the land and a traditional Mapuche way of life, while he also aspired for a secure salary as an urban functionary. Through gossip, I heard of his drinking escapades and visits to prostitutes, both of which he apparently took great care to hide from me. Presumably his discretion was because these activities fall outside of the essentialized notion of traditional culture to which he aspired. Scenarios such as this challenged the sense of informed consent that the Tri-Council Policy Statement on ethics for research involving human subjects (TCPS 2) requires Canadian researchers to establish.

To mitigate the potential for misunderstandings, I reminded participants from time to time (not just at the beginning of our relationships), of the nature of my observations, and that I did not focus exclusively on verbal statements. For some participants this seemed logical, while I recognize that for others it sometimes did not seem to resonate at all. Once, after over a year of collaborating on different grant projects to finance Chascón's outdoor mural, he realized that my research would not involve sitting down at a table with a tape-recorder in hand to compile his life history. In my view, we had already essentially done this conversationally on many occasions, without the recorder. Over the preceding year, he had expressed feelings of guilt that we always collaborated on his projects, giving him the impression that we did so to the detriment of my thesis, with which he hoped to help as a return favour. When my friend realized the subtler dimensions of participant observation as a research method, he likened ethnography to painting. Suddenly, he seemed to recognize that I was not seeking a singular truth invented for the purposes of establishing a clear historical narrative, but that my focus was on inhabited aspects of the past in everyday life.

Certainly Chascón had never heard of anthropologist Claude Lévi-Strauss, who refers to the process of creating ethnographic text as a work of *bricolage*, in which knowledge creation is adaptive to emerging material, and not pre-determined by theory or ready-made answers (1974[1962]: 29). When I suggested that my work was something like *bricolage*, an artistic technique with which Chascón was familiar, he exclaimed: "*¡Precisamente!*"

I preferred not to reject as untrustworthy participants whose spoken narratives were contradicted by their actions. Instead, I attempted to appreciate the tensions that constrain their aspirations and means for achieving their goals. Ana Mariella Bacigalupo has discussed similar challenges of representation in her work with Mapuche shamans in southern Chile called *machi*, whose co-gendered identities disrupt dominant gender roles. In the context of the marginalization and posed assimilation of Mapuche society in national discourse, Bacigalupo explores how *machi* variously respond to expectations that they behave as either folkloric symbols of the past, or as priests, nuns, doctors, nurses, and politicians (religious, medical, and government leaders familiar to mainstream Chileans). She finds that these shamans also often disagree among one another over the suitability of their responses to the restrictions that dominant society's imaginations of their otherness impose upon human experiences, the causes of suffering, and the means for healing. Her analysis culminates in a poignant critique of the coercive power that majority cultural discourses hold over *machi* and Mapuche people. A consequence of this coercion is public secrecy about the shifting gender identities of *machi*, in which the anthropologist finds herself privy to a cultural fact (co-genderism among shamans) that Mapuche people do not generally articulate to outsiders (2007: 259). Secrets being operational to the abuse of

power, the challenge for Bacigalupo was to balance the pressure to remain silent so that *machi* are not further misconstrued, with the responsibility of doing justice to complex forms of knowledge that are expressed through *machi*'s shifting gender performances.

This study attempts to evoke this complexity without betraying the privacy of subversive knowledge and its transformative power. There are many things that I learned from research participants that I do not share here, things imparted to me as either cultural secrets for protecting myself from envious eyes and harmful energies, or simply as a trusted friend who will respect that not all forms of knowledge have a place in academic analysis. I have no doubt that there are complexities to everyday politics that my friends and collaborators have either not shared with me in sufficient depth to be written about here, or whose secrecy forms a strategic means of negotiating one's position within a rigid national hierarchy. Like Bacigalupo, I have encountered Mapuche, but also non-Mapuche people whose perceptions of human, natural, and spirit worlds diverge from strict Western rationalism. The origins of these distinct experiences of the world are varied, sometimes cultural, sometimes religious, sometimes generational, and in my judgment almost always to some degree historical. As I turn my attention to memory studies in the social sciences in the next chapter, I elaborate my orientation to culture as practiced forms of collective and inter-generationally transmitted memories.

Despite my interest in the motivations that people have for political participation, and not merely their political stripes, my work has not escaped controversy. There were people who tried to use my presence for their own political ends, and others who distrusted my intentions in spite of the transparency I struggled to uphold. After all, the Other is an

ambivalent social actor who some people, against my best intentions, also perceived and distrusted in me.

—————————————

Notes: Chapter 1

[1] In January 2010, billionaire Sebastian Piñera became the first post-dictatorship president elected who does not belong to the *Concertación,* the coalition of parties that negotiated the 1990 transition from military rule.

[2] The entire country is divided into 346 *comunas*, which I call communes here. Each headed by an elected mayor, although they are not strictly urban spaces. While mayors are leaders of some form of urban centre, all rural areas fall under the jurisdiction of a municipality (*comuna* or commune), which makes their North American equivalent something like a county. These are the smallest political administrative bodies in the country. Outside of Metropolitan Santiago and other major cities, communes generally encompass vast rural spaces each surrounding a town that forms a commercial and government hub. Several towns can exist within a commune.

[3] A daily custom akin to "teatime" in Chile that usually involves a great deal of snacking and conversation.

[4] Located less than twenty kilometres downstream from the plant, the swans lived in the Carlos Anwandter Nature Sanctuary, protected by the Ramsar Convention on Wetlands, the only global treaty framing international cooperation for dealing with this ecosystem.

[5] Internet sources on this topic abound, with alternative media and research centres following the case closely. The following links, first accessed the November 15, 2012 offer a sample: http://prensa.politicaspublicas.net/index.php/mambiente/2009/03/18/valdivia-nuevo-informe-vincula-a-celco-c and http://www.olca.cl/oca/chile/cisnes.htm.

[6] The 2008 documentary *Ciudad de Papel*, directed by Claudia Sepúlveda and Jorge Garrido Barros offers an excellent portrait of the politics surrounding science in the case of Valdivia's perished swans.

[7] The acronym stands for *Corporación del Fomento de la Producción*.

[8] The acronym stands for *Movimiento de la Izquierda Revolucionaria*.

[9] While the CONAF (National Forestry Corporation) implemented reforestation projects in the area throughout most of the dictatorship, local testimonies indicate that logging of old-growth forests has continued until the present. During the dictatorship, Pinochet's son-in-law, who headed the forestry complex at that time, is believed by many to have lined his pockets with profits from the illegal sale of timber from estates such as the Neltume-Carranco *fundo*, located between Liquiñe and Neltume.

[10] Throughout the Province of Valdivia, owners of large tracts of land in the countryside frequently have German or Dutch surnames (i.e. Kuntsmann, Boetsch, Petermann, Riedemann, Reifschneider, Sheward, Spuler, Von Appen, Wagner). In several cases ownership of these estates is relatively recent. Meanwhile, none of the landowners who originally developed the lumber industry in the interior remain owners today (i.e. Etchevarry, Kenrhy). Surnames from other immigrant origins have also played prominent roles in the development of commerce in the region (i.e. Eltit of Palestinian origin), or have acquired large properties in recent years (i.e. Luksic of Croatian origin). Some Spanish surnames appear as owners of large properties, but no private estate at least in Panguipulli is owned by someone with a Mapuche surname.

[11] The recruitment of families according to material circumstances avoided presupposing class or ethnic identification, which varied even within families. From this approach, analysis does not restrict indigenous identity to those living in state-recognized Mapuche communities. This enabled the inclusion of perspectives from the 80% of Mapuche society that no longer lives in ancestral territories, as well as of Mapuche men and women who have married into non-Mapuche families. It also avoids naming as lower class a wide range of people who would not self-identify in this fashion, some of whom view themselves as belonging to an administrative or professional class due to their position in the workplace, which may do little to elevate their economic status.

[12] Responsible for reviewing and approving industrial projects with likely environmental and social impacts, each region's Environmental Commission is referred to by the acronym COREMA: *Corporación Regional del Medio Ambiente*.

[13] Margaret Paxson (2005: 31, n. 2) notes that anthropologists have become critical of this term, elaborating on its troubling connotations in rural Russia. When relevant, I employ "peasant" inter-changeably with the common Spanish form today: *campesino*.

[14] Referred to here as EIB in reference to its acronym in Spanish, the program for *Educación Intercultural Bilingüe*.

[15] To avoid treating residents of the countryside who work in agricultural labour as timeless or irrational, I avoid using *paisano*, as it is a term more commonly used by older generations in Chile and tends to efface indigenous heritage that is increasingly affirmed by those to which it is meant to refer.

[16] The MCR stands for the *Movimiento Campesino Revolucionario*, literally the Revolutionary Peasant Movement.

[17] I agree with Bagele Chilisa's (2011) assessment of the transformative potential of Participatory Action Research (PAR) as an indigenous research methodology. This form of investigation follows the researcher's direct and deliberate actions among a researched community with the intention of generating positive social change, ideally as it is guided by members of the affected community. Chilisa highlights that PAR is intentionally disruptive to the status quo.

[18] It took constant adaptation to synchronize my eating habits with those of my hosts. Unlike in Canada, where winters are often survived by eating Chilean produce like grapes, berries, avocadoes, and olives, in southern Chile these are not consumed with near the frequency with which I was accustomed. Generally, they are only eaten by those with the disposable income to afford such luxuries. Especially during winter months, reduced access to fresh fruit and vegetables, and a diet high in potatoes, bread, and meat lowered my energy level.

Chapter 2: Memory & Method

Las historias oficiales han sido y son por lo general "historias del Estado" por tanto intentos más o menos exitosos de entender a las sociedades de acuerdo a la lógica de la homogeneidad… Se busca el origen común de los habitantes…

La antropología moderna, en cambio, se construye a partir del principio de la diversidad. El concepto de la diversidad cultural consiste en comprender que el ser humano ha encontrado, a lo largo de la historia y a lo ancho del planeta, las más diversas alternativas de solucionar sus problemas…

Official histories have been and are generally "State histories" as more or less successful attempts to understand societies in terms of the logic of homogeneity… They seek the common origin of inhabitants…

Meanwhile, modern anthropology is built on the principle of diversity. The concept of cultural diversity consists in understanding that humans have found, throughout all of history and across the entire planet, the most diverse alternatives for resolving their problems…

-José Bengoa, *La Comunidad Reclamada* (2006: 128 & 131)

This chapter presents a literature review of memory as it pertains to the retention, transformation, and transmission of knowledge about the past. Inspired by Argentine writer Jorge Luis Borges' story about a man with perfect perception and memory, it departs with a brief overview of memory studies' foundations in classical and modern thought. This stirs questions about distinctions between individual and collective remembrances, as well as distortion, precision, truth, and willful forgetting that have been taken up in the social sciences. Highlighting memory's significantly narrative nature, I turn to what some have labeled a 'memory boom' in the disciplines of anthropology and history since the 1980s. In Latin America, signs of this boom appear in a proliferation of studies that focus on two

main areas: indigenous 'historicities' (See Whitehead 2003) and critical history in post-repression contexts (See Jelin 2002, 2003; Jelin & Langland 2003). The analysis presented in the following chapters engages processes that lie at the intersection of these approaches, between memory as cultural practice and memory as marginal perspective on national pasts, where both approaches require methodological sensibilities. This literature review closes with a discussion about what these various points about collective versus individual remembering, distortions from actual experiences, and divergent determinations of truth pose for investigation into inter-generational transmissions of the contested past.

Classical and Modern Foundations

With a degree of circular reasoning, we speak of remembering as the capacity to retain past experience, while forgetting is seen as the inability to remember. Memory is usually described as existing in bodies and places, and is a noun endlessly qualified by adjectives: collective, vicarious, partial, tacit, stolen, and fleeting memories. These adjectives do little to illuminate universal theories about what memory is or how it works. Most generally, it is an ontological enigma that enables all social life. It is enigmatic in that the social (behaviour, organization, language) simply could not exist without individual actors who *do* the remembering. Yet these very actors go about remembering in noticeably patterned ways, perceiving past experiences and meaningfully expressing them in reference to relevant social milieus. Take, for example, the title character in Jorge Luis Borges' fictional short story *Funes the Memorious*. Ireneo Funes, who became 'horribly crippled' when bucked from a horse during adolescence, is a young man known to the narrator. This

accident left him with the faculty of both perfect perception and memory.[1] The pride of the young and immobile Funes, who has perfect memory, borders on arrogance for his capacity to endlessly retain the most minute details perceived from the small universe of his bedroom. This meticulous quality of Funes' memory, which appreciates in infinite detail every aspect of that which he perceives, is absurd. In Borges' words (1998[1944]: 131-137):

> Funes, we must not forget, was virtually incapable of general, platonic ideas. Not only was it difficult for him to see that the generic symbol "dog" took in all the dissimilar individuals of all shapes and sizes, it irritated him that the "dog" of three-fourteen in the afternoon, seen in profile, should be indicated by the same noun as the dog of three-fifteen, seen frontally. His own face in the mirror, his own hands, surprised him every time he saw them… Funes could continually perceive the quiet advances of corruption, of tooth decay, of weariness… He was the solitary, lucid spectator of a multiform, momentaneous, and almost unbearably precise world. Babylon, London, and New York dazzle mankind's imagination with their fierce splendor; no one in the populous towers or urgent avenues of those cities has ever felt the heat and pressure of a reality as inexhaustible as that which battered Ireneo, day and night, in his poor South American hinterland…

The absurdity of Ireneo Funes' memory is that in everyday life, there is nothing perfect or even ideal about an infinitely individualized memory. His mechanically flawless perceptions of the minutest of changes render his world solitary, while his inability to generalize details render his appreciation of life processes like aging meaningless.

The absurdity of memory being merely a retainer of data or a storehouse of information, encyclopedic and robotic, is not always evident. As anthropologists Paul Antze

and Michael Lambek observe, "it is virtually impossible to imagine memory—what it is, how it works, where it lies—without recourse to metaphor" (1996: xi). Incidentally, metaphors long popular among cognitive psychologists have related it to technologies of information storage. Psychologist Alan Baddeley notes that with the invention of the computer, "terms such as 'buffer store', 'feedback', 'encoding', and 'retrieval' rapidly became absorbed into the field of memory research" (1990: 2). As the story of Ireneo Funes demonstrates, a significant problem with such metaphors is that they tend to neglect the imperative of time; a temporal distance is always assumed to hang between the rememberer and their memory, implying that one is autonomous from the other. Borges reveals the fallacy of this perspective when Funes is surprised by his own face and hands every time he glimpses them. As a "lucid spectator of a[n]…unbearably precise world," Funes is unable to recognize how time is constantly changing the things he perceives, without actually negating their previous states of existence. A pathetic portrait of Funes emerges, as he is rendered incomprehensible to others by his inability to even generalize enough between four-legged creatures to recognize a dog for being a dog. He is even unable to accept that from one angle to another, and from one moment to the next, a single dog in fact remains the same thing. His memory is supposedly a perfect catalogue of all his senses at every point in time. In reality, his is not even an adequate memory. What good is a memory that infinitely compartmentalizes perceptions to the point that the rememberer is unable to connect his identity to the individual and collective pasts he knows? By what analytical standards may we appreciate memory retention and its necessary distortion of past events?

Time and Experience

Memory research in North America was dominated by psychological behaviourism until the 1960s, meaning that interest in memory's utility as a storage facility mainly limited investigation to controlled laboratory conditions. Likewise in early 20th century Britain and Germany, very few psychologists took interest in the 'real world' science of memory (Baddeley 1990). In general, it was not until recent decades that psychologists came to see memory as more than a purely neurological or cognitive faculty, but as something also working at the interface between private and public perceptions. However, anthropologist Maurice Bloch (1998) remarks that psychological principles that long guided laboratory research were transferred in problematic ways to studies of lived memory in the real world. The move from the laboratory to a world of uncontrolled variables involved psychology awkwardly confronting questions about how the past is not only retained by individuals, but how individuals retain the past as members of groups. In Bloch's words, "psychologists stumble[d], almost by accident, but in a way which in principle should be very laudable, into territory normally occupied by anthropologists and historians" (1998: 68).

One challenge for memory studies outside of the laboratory was the dilemma of how to account for time, which in lived contexts is not containable like ordinary experimental variables. How, for example, might we account for representations of past experiences that substantially distort original events? In Funes' case, time is linear, his memory merely a bank of perceptions. This geometric view of time as progressing objectively forward attributes no value to human subjectivity, let alone emotional judgments of the past or culturally-framed anticipations for the future. It also says little about how memory generally

79

extends beyond the lifetime and personal experiences of individuals, as the accumulated knowledge of communities is transmitted through culturally shared traditions (i.e. dialects, customs, habits, tastes). In light of the uneven approaches to memory processes taken by early twentieth century scholars, it would seem that dominant Western conceptualizations of time—as linear and objective—limited inquiry into roles played by non-cognitive elements involved in memory processes, such as the perceiving body and the socio-cultural milieu. Until recent decades, this left certain aspects of memory under-theorized in the social sciences, at best relegating its unconscious and unspoken dimensions to the realm of Freudian psychology.

The distortion of real events in the form of memory has been a topic of reflection on time and the nature of the universe since well before the Enlightenment. The Ancient Greek poet Hesiod wrote of the titaness of memory Mnemosyne, who bore Zeus nine daughters. These became the Muses, who were a comfort from sorrow and grief among men; "when the servant of the Muses sings, at once he *forgets* his dark thoughts and *remembers* not his troubles. Such is the holy gift of the Muses to men" (Quoted in Hamilton 1940: 37, emphasis added). Forgetfulness in this tradition was a distinctly human quality, unenvied by the Gods whose powers lay in the naming and transmission of their legacies. In the Latin poet Virgil's *Aeniad*, the souls of the dead are described as gathered along the River Lethe in the underworld, waiting "for their time to drink and lose the memory of what in former lives they had done and suffered" (Hamilton 1940: 228). In this version, mortal souls drink from Lethe's waters of oblivion as a means of purification on their way out of the underworld to live again.

Danteist scholar Flavia Coassin (2000) contrasts representations of the River Lethe in Greek and Roman texts to distinct functions of oblivion found in later Christian interpretations of the ancient myths. In the older traditions, Lethe appears as a sort of salvation for mortals, sparing them memory of past trials and losses so that they may live anew. Later texts, such as Dante's *Divine Comedy*, came to associate foolish souls with drinking too freely from the River Lethe. In these versions, "[o]blivion, then, becomes synonymous with the lowly mind that does not seek wisdom and justice" through memory of past sins (Coassin 2000: 97). In this later tradition, memory is not merely a capacity to retain past experience, but a moral obligation to transform experience into the discovery of truth. Those who remember are on a path to wisdom, while those who forget are seen to be condemned to an eternal cycle of human suffering. In both traditions, man betrays a proclivity to forget past lessons, where memory is a moral act particular to divine beings. Memory as moral act is not merely the faculty to retain knowledge of one's sins; it involves a progressive detachment from these, so that the soul that approaches divinity may know its path, but not need to endlessly reflect upon or repent for past human error. This vision of de-personalized memory of past mistakes returns later in this chapter, as it relates to philosopher Tzvetan Todorov's (1998) warning against a modern appetite for the 'literal' over the 'exemplary' uses of memory. For now it is worth noting that in pre-modern thought, memory was not so much concerned with the objective passing of time as with its *experience*, as well as with the meaning of past events to present and future.

Contemporary philosopher Paul Ricoeur has noted that Aristotle and Augustine were both preoccupied with whether time exists without intelligence or a soul to perceive the

world. Both conceived the problem in terms of whether time is to be measured by movement (change between instants) or by the consciousness of movement (Ricoeur 1983: 35). In Ancient Greek philosopher Aristotle's dialogues, time is linear, measured outside of the perceiver, worldly. He emphasizes that in order to exist, a 'movement' (change through time) must be distinguished by instants of before and after, such that all movements are relative to one another. Without the temporal relationship between events, basically without instances of before and after, he argues that nothing would exist. More than six hundred years later, Saint Augustine's *Confessions* written in the fourth century would focus on the present as a moment determined by the perceiver. In this sense, the present moment exists so long as a perceiver determines the conditions of its existence by outlining the boundaries separating 'now' from past and future. The present could mean this minute (at 8:23 a.m. between 8:22 and 8:24), or also this time of year or this century, depending on how one imagines and narrates it in relation to other circumstances. Augustine's is an experiential view, for him time is something of the soul.

Classical reflections on memory underscore the deficiency of Ireneo Funes' memory, as well as shortcomings in conceptions of remembering as the conscious retention of past experience. Not merely a past-oriented activity, memory is forever caught up in the interests and agendas of current actors. From this, one might argue that the contemporary drive to establish historical truth in post-repression contexts, either in the interest of national reconciliation or of prosecuting war criminals, may overshadow questions about the significance of "false" remembrances. Such attention may also conceal processes of

memory transmission and transformation, when remembering is seen to be restricted to the individual mind and experience, not also extending to moral responsibilities.

Accounting for distortions between actual experiences and their remembrances opens a whole realm of inquiry into memory as a meaning-filled and affective process. In a short article on memory and objects, Juliet Ash (1996) discusses the power of her recently deceased husband's remaining clothing to stimulate visually and emotionally vivid remembrances of their life together. She asks whether using such objects to draw him back to her trivializes the person remembered, as objects can only imbue an essence of the original. Public commemorations have been seen to run the same risk, targeting specific memories for transmission at the expense of marginal, non-normative, or simply more complex perspectives of the events or people memorialized (Jelin 2002; Portelli 2003; Sider 1997).

Distortion

Oral historian Alessandro Portelli poses that what is at stake in memory processes (as opposed to historical investigation) is not just what happened in the past, but what those events mean in the present. His work on labour union activism during Italy's Fascist regime demonstrates that paying attention to personal experiences of repression offers insight into wider political processes, often having to do with much more than the original event experienced. He highlights that the goals of oral history are not merely to transform spoken history into written accounts. Emphasizing the "heightened awareness of interdisciplinarity" to which oral history gives rise, he defends the importance of discursive sources for

capturing what he calls a history of convergences. Through oral history, sociology, psychology, linguistics, anthropology, folklore, and music tap into the past that is available, distorted, and ultimately given greater meaning by way of memory and dialogue (Portelli 1991: xi and 52). In his words they "tell us not just what people did, but what they wanted to do, what they believed they were doing, and what they now think they did" (Ibid, 50).

Portelli reminds us that in order for traces of past experiences to effectively endure through time, they need forms of communication—stories, narratives—to carry them, to keep them alive so to speak, and to ultimately charge them with continued meaning in changing circumstances. In a different study from his work on labour union activism, Portelli (2003) explores public remembrances of a wartime massacre of 335 civilians in Rome. What is known as the massacre at the Fosse Ardeatine[2] actually unfolded quite differently than the people of Rome generally claim (and genuinely seem to believe) that it happened. Portelli's analysis of documentation and interviews with families of victims uncovers that for decades following Rome's occupation by German forces, false memories widely circulated in popular coverage about the event. The massacre occurred in retaliation to an anonymously thrown bomb that killed thirty-two German police officers as they walked along a Roman street in March 1944. The German reprisal was to assassinate ten Romans for every German who perished in the blast. The only trait in common between the victims was that they were all men; they ranged in age from fourteen to seventy-four. Many of the massacred were political prisoners held at the time, as well as Jews already detained and awaiting deportation to death camps elsewhere in Europe. However, many more were plucked from the streets and spanned the city's class and ethnic spectrum. Some victims had

been migrant workers originating from remote parts of the country, not even Romans at all. Victims were aristocrats and peddlers, professionals, factory workers, and even a former member of Mussolini's cabinet. So while it was by no means the largest mass killing in Italy during the war, the Fosse Ardeatine was unique in that it was the only which occurred in a large metropolitan context, and targeted an unusually diverse cross-section of the population.

What Portelli calls false memories of the Fosse Ardeatine emerged from controversy over who was to blame for the massacre: the German commanders who ordered and carried out the murders, or the communist resistors who provoked them. In his view, false memories have taken on the status of myth.[3] Part of the controversy is that those responsible for the original attack on the German forces were communists. According to Portelli, strong anti-communist sentiment in the country has meant that rather than a heroic act of resistance, the initial bombing is commonly seen as a terrorist act. In his view (2006: 32):

> Italy is the only nation that, fifty years after the fact, is still arguing over whether its freedom fighters were criminals or heroes; where it could be a matter for debate whether it was a crime to attack a marching unit of uniformed police attached to the SS, belonging to a foreign occupying army.

Many Romans today claim that the Germans gave warning that, should those responsible for the bombing not turn themselves in, the penalty would be paid by Rome's citizens. In spite of having interviewed hundreds of people directly affected by the massacre who stress that no warning was ever given by the Germans, Portelli frequently encountered

versions of the story in which the Germans are said to have given between a week and six month's warning before carrying out the killings. Testimonies by the families of victims indicate that little more than twenty-four hours actually transpired between the bombing and the massacre.

Sometimes those who claim false remembrances are young and have learned the story from elders.[4] Other times the myth is affirmed much like an urban legend, with claims by those from the wartime generation of having been there or having a close friend who was there to have witnessed it. However, among the families of victims, there is a resounding view that there was no warning, betraying frustration over the fact that public focus on who was rightfully to blame continues to eclipse the crimes committed and the memory of those who were actually killed. This has not been helped by controversy over formal commemoration of the victims, which portrays them as innocent martyrs of freedom. This is apparently the only unifying category that seemed to the commemoration's planners to be appropriate for a memorial of all 335 men who perished at the Fosse Ardeatine. Numerous families of the political prisoners who were killed have protested misrepresentation of the reasons behind their loved ones' assassination, which for a substantial portion (but by no means all of the victims) was detention for opposing the foreign occupation. Wide variations in stories surrounding the Fosse Ardeatine underscore the narrative nature of memory, especially in the public sphere. Importantly, an event may take on many forms as knowledge about it is carried into the future through its telling and re-telling, often by people who never personally experienced it. This example begs the question: if knowledge

about past events is heavily invested in the telling and re-telling of stories about them, then what is the relationship between memory and language?

Unreliable Justice

A short answer is that to ask about the social life of memory seems to be to pose a question about power. Moreover, to ask about memory's relationship to language is to take interest in processes by which memory as situated perspective on the past becomes sanctioned historical text. An extended answer to these questions that I propose here highlights the unexpected ways in which relationships between memory and language have played out in courts of law in post-conflict Guatemala and Chile. As impartial and universal as legal proceedings are meant to be, examples from these countries reveal that courtrooms are shot through with power structures that implicitly validate elite perspectives on the past, legitimating certain narrative forms over others. Expert witnesses, rigid criteria for scientific integrity, and the genre of victim testimony are all mechanisms for establishing an apparently level field upon which diverse actors in the courtroom may vocalize competing perspectives on the contested past. However, who has the authority to speak and who has the cultural capital to ensure that their words are heard, are processes that unfold well beyond the limits of impartial judicial procedure. Not all witnesses therefore speak with equal influence before modern arbiters of truth.

Anthropologist Patricia Foxen (2000) describes how K'iche' Mayans who testified in the few legal trials of war criminals immediately following the Guatemalan Civil War were repeatedly treated as unreliable witnesses. Judges found their testimonies disordered

and contradictory. In one case, three dozen illiterate peasants were accused of lacking credibility when they could not reconstruct dates and distances about diverse forms of traumatic violence endured. Foxen describes that (2000: 380 n. 16):

> The racist environment of the courtroom, wherein the defendant and his supporters smirked openly at the poor Spanish-language skills of the Mayans and one of the three judges slept, made clear the point that narratives of remembrance, like all discourse, are framed, privileged, and given credence (or not) within particular hierarchies of power.

The trial that Foxen attended was retried twice, in spite of abundant forensic evidence. She speculates that it only reached an Appeals Court and eventual conviction because of the intervention of Amnesty International. Such dynamics contribute to a climate of impunity that persists.

In Chile, the fallibility of memory contributed to impunity in an entirely different way when Santiago's Court of Appeals dismissed Supreme Court charges against Pinochet for the Caravan of Death case. Following his 1998 arrest in London, England, the first attempt in Chile to bring Pinochet to trial involved his role as head of the Armed Forces when a death squad of ten officers travelled the length of the country by helicopter during October 1973, apparently on orders to carry out executions of key political prisoners (See Escalante Hidalgo 2000). The dismissal of the case against Pinochet was based on defense arguments that the accused was mentally unfit for trial, and not in fact on lack of evidence linking him to the killings. His defense team successfully disputed whether he could be tried for actions that he could scarcely remember. It was argued that Pinochet's failing mind

divorced him from accountability for past crimes. As with the Mayan peasant witnesses, the Pinochet case had less to do with memory than with the accused's status, where appeal to the unreliability of memory could trump efforts to try elite defendants. The pursuit of justice was restricted to what one prosecuting attorney describes as the limits of Chile's political transition (Gutierrez 2002), in which actually trying the former dictator within a rigid legislative structure laid forth by the accused himself prior to leaving office was extremely difficult. Notably, the arrest in London only came to pass when Spanish judge Baltasar Garzón ordered Pinochet's extradition from England to Spain on charges of torture of Spanish citizens and the assassination of a Spanish diplomat. At the time, Chile's own leaders opposed the arrest and extradition to Spain, a move that fuelled international scrutiny and compelled Chilean courts to address the lingering impunity of numerous well-known human rights violators. Today, Garzón faces similar resistance in his own country, for his willingness to probe into atrocities committed during the Franco regime.

Time and again, memory complicates the establishment of unambiguous historical truth. In the first example, testimonies of Mayan peasants are dismissed for neglecting to describe events according to a legalistic notion of narrative order, detached and verifiable. Witnesses are discredited for failing to ground statements in temporal and spatial referents that are unfamiliar to them, but taken-for-granted by elite audiences. In the second example, a former dictator escapes conviction for state killings on grounds that a defendant must be conscious of his own relationship to crimes committed. This implies that accountability depends on shared perspectives on past events, and not rather that it may be achieved in spite of dissonant perspectives. Both cases highlight the role played by narrative in public

memory, as experiences of privileged actors compel the judicial apparatus, while those from subordinated groups go unrecognized.

In anthropology, narratives are not merely verbal narrations, but patterned styles of perception by which experiences are submitted to perpetual interpretation by all manner of social actors. Narrative analysis enables social researchers to contrast competing perspectives on the past, present, and future. Anthropologist Renato Rosaldo explains that a narrative relates personal and community memories to historical events according to their perceived contexts, "taking facts of a case and comprehending them in an act of judgment which manages to hold them together" (Rosaldo 1989: 131). It is upon this judgment that the process of truth-making in diverse social and cultural contexts hinges. Anthropologists Elinor Ochs and Lisa Capps explain that narrative "is an essential resource in the struggle to bring experiences to conscious awareness" (Ochs & Capps 1996: 21). For these authors, countless narrative genres exist: novels, diaries, letters, gossip, legal testimony, dance, and even painting. Some narratives affirm truth (i.e. urban legends appealing to an unspecified friend's first-hand experience), while others wrestle with a sense of the unreliability of memories or the partiality of limited points of view (i.e. families of Fosse Ardeatine victims).

Narrative analysis therefore poses that some memories have greater appeal in the public sphere than others, due to their uneven integration into dominant understandings about the order and nature of the universe. In the modern era, in which courts have become important mechanisms for establishing formal historical truth, verifiable facts and expert witnesses are elevated above the contradictory nature of traumatic experiences. In such

contexts, it is perhaps not surprising that elite defendants have successfully appealed to the unreliability of memory in order to escape persecution. In these contexts, anthropologists are challenged to unravel the processes by which truth about past events is established, and to situate distinctly modern patterns for relating to history within the range of possibilities displayed by diverse societies.

Colonized Memory

Michel de Certeau (1983) argues that Western society favours an objective past, treating its existence as independent of the people and communities that experience it. In this society, written history and particularly professional historiography take primacy over oral forms. This is not a symptom of Western modernity alone; for centuries religious traditions founded on written texts have externalized history in the eyes of followers, with diverse effects on whether and how people imagine themselves as actors or witnesses in greater historical processes (Bloch 1996; de Certeau 1983; Yerushalmi 1988). Based on fieldwork in Africa, anthropologist Jack Goody's distinction between oral and literate societies is also relevant here. Goody's proposes that the storage of knowledge among non-literate societies draws on mnemonic 'mapping' embedded in oral traditions, which assists in recollection (Goody 1998[1970]). As a 'map,' devices like epic poems and the *quipu* (a form of knotted chords that communicated social and historical developments for the Incan empire) leave some part of the histories remembered open to greater interpretation than would an alphabet. In oral societies—that is, societies entirely without writing—when it is an individual's turn to transmit information, Goody observes that a great deal is retained

from details previously learned. However, omissions and alternative elaborations are more common than in societies where the past is written, stored, and at least kept textually stable across generations. Goody does not deny that interpretation of texts in literate societies may transform across generations. His argument is simply that storing information in textual as opposed to oral sources alone makes for notable differences. Consequently, the role that elements like precision and imagination play in the transmission of historical memory is culturally variable.

Goody's observations emphasize that as traditions and technologies for recording the past vary, so too does emphasis on exactness and definitions of truth. In some contexts, precision may bow to imagination and performance in order to convey cultural values and lessons from the past. Goody's thesis calls for a methodological sensibility on the part of social scientists to recognize that remembering is not everywhere practiced according to the same principles of truth. This frames his analysis of what he claims are the potentially revolutionary effects of Western literacy's introduction into traditional societies. The impact of oral traditions on shared perceptions of truth has, in recent years, been the site of animated debate in contexts where crimes, such as genocide, have been systematically carried out against formerly colonized peoples.

In the 1980s the book *I, Rigoberta Menchú* (Burgos 1985) galvanized international attention for the massacre of indigenous Mayans during the Guatemalan Civil War. When anthropologist David Stoll (1999) highlighted inconsistencies between events described in the book and historical evidence, an academic backlash accused him of neglecting cross-cultural differences in the narration of memories, differences that inform competing

perceptions of truth (Arias 2001).[5] In that affair, post-colonial critique of the narrative power of Western academics and historical commissions on truth extended in all directions, eventually even by Rigoberta Menchú (the K'iche' Mayan woman whose life story the book relates) towards the published author, anthropologist Elizabeth Burgos. Shortly before winning the Nobel Peace Prize in 1992, the former sought credit for authorship. For Burgos, the book was a collaborative production, and the inclusion of Rigoberta Menchú's name in the title evidence of a commitment to the narrator's voice. Recognizing that Menchú wished to go beyond a journalistic account of the repression of Mayans during Guatemala's thirty-six year civil war, Burgos had ensured that the final version did not cut extensive sections from their interviews. Both a revolutionary and an anthropologist, Burgos explains that she felt it important not to remove in the name of political testimony reflections on cultural customs, spiritual visions of the world, and Menchú's sense of identity. Burgos would also later point out that other authors of the *testimonio* genre—a title she finds belittling, but which marks the emergent popularity in the 1970s and 1980s of politicized biographical accounts of marginalized peoples (Popular Memory Group 1982)—were never reproached for appearing as the authors of their books (Burgos 1999: 61).[6] In the end, Burgos explains that the controversy is a sad example of the "infighting that so often overcomes political movements after a war" (Ibid, 58).

However, the controversies surrounding Rigoberta Menchú's *testimonio* cannot be reduced to the infighting between revolutionaries in a post-war context, or to purely cultural differences in narrative forms of remembering the past. Anthropologist Mary Louise Pratt situates Stoll's critique within university hierarchies that privilege lettered knowledge over

narrated experience. Historicizing his analysis, she argues that a communications revolution that led to the rise of the *testimonio* undermined conventional academic hierarchies in the 1980s. Nevertheless, in her view "the process of constructing corresponding models of authority and meaning making has barely begun" (Pratt 2001: 41). She recalls that *I, Rigoberta Menchú* featured at the centre of what she refers to as the 'culture wars' in the American academy during the 1980s. The book cut to the heart of ideological conflicts in cultural education reform that saw the critical post-War baby boomer generation of the 1960s entering faculty positions. This increasingly diversified teaching body would push for the inclusion of non-hegemonic materials in the classroom. Resistance to this effort came from the political right, which was reinvigorated by Reagan's arrival in the Whitehouse. At stake was the intellectual recognition of women, twentieth century authors, and expressions representing non-elite perspectives. As a contemporary indigenous woman, Rigoberta Menchú fit all three of these criteria. From this perspective, her memories were not merely another object of analysis for the social sciences; they posed a serious challenge to established Western historiography, which values objectivity and the written text (See de Certeau 1983; Nora 1989[1984]), over the partiality and fluidity of forms that memory processes imply (See Climo & Cattell 2002; Ghosh 1998; Megill 1998). While the Rigoberta Menchú case created a heated public debate over the truth of oral testimonies, the specific questions it raised were not entirely new to cultural scholars. These questions, especially about adaptive strategies among indigenous groups to heal from past violations, as well as to access political influence previously denied them, challenge the degree to which the ethnographic goal of elaborating an insider's point of view is even possible.

94

Decolonizing Culture

Global geo-political events of the latter half of the twentieth century compelled cultural anthropologists to re-orient how the discipline long conceptualized its object of study. In the post-WWII era, Independence movements that swept the African continent played a role in stirring questions about the ethnographic representation of colonized Others. Tribal peoples once famous in Western universities for their cow-love, sorcery, myths of origin, kinship and ancestor worship were becoming leaders of their own states. While anthropologists behind such analyses presented complex readings of African societies, and were often implicitly critical of colonial authority (See Goody 1995), their methodologies have since been critiqued for insufficiently treating questions of subjectivity and the particularities of social experience (Rosaldo 1993: 139-143). The post-WWII era was therefore marked by dramatic social change around the world, coupled with its growing recognition within Western institutions of knowledge. This motivated critiques of the imperialism of capitalist culture, and saw some anthropologists take explicitly politicized positions on modern forms of governance (See Gough 2002[1968]). The Independence of African states, the Vietnam War, the Cuban and Iranian Revolutions, and the Partition of India and Pakistan each presented disruptions to dominant meta-narratives about Western expansion, modernization, civilization, and historical progress. By rattling essentialist ideas that persisted in Eurocentric imaginations about the non-Western world, such events fractured the categories of reference relevant to cultural scholars. It was no longer viable to treat the Orient, so-called primitive societies, and the traditional as isolated, objective realities. The people described as Oriental, primitive, or tradition-bound were increasingly

visible in their oppositions to such dominating narratives, if only scholars knew how to perceive local forms of resistance (See Starn 1991). Decolonizing processes and accelerated globalization would inspire several generations of critical social theorists to treat language and systems of signs as a new methodological base for understanding postcolonial history and cultural practices (Anderson 1983; Barthes 1957; Bhabha 1990 & 1994; Derrida 1967; Said 1978; Williams 1977).

The 1970s also saw the interpretive stream in American anthropology advocate a less static notion of culture as symbolic systems "by means of which people communicate, perpetuate, and develop their knowledge about and attitudes toward life" (Geertz 1973: 89). Recognizing the capacity of culture to bring meaning to the world, scholars could increasingly account for structural changes, as well as take pluralism into account. This emergent sensitivity to how anthropologists represent culture and research subjects bore consequences for conventional fieldwork. Importantly, it compelled researchers to more consciously treat those they represent as participants in the present, as 'co-temporaneous' (Fabian 1983). Conventional anthropological discourse became scrutinized for distancing those of non-European descent from the 'here and now' of fieldwork, for tending to envision research subjects as belonging to a faraway mythical past. Such writing practices long restricted anthropological recognition of research subjects as historical actors, treating non-Western subjects as temporally located in the past, and somehow remote from ethnographer, audience, and the political present. This is anthropologist Orin Starn's core argument for why, in spite of several ethnographic studies being produced on the Peruvian Andes by North Americans in the 1970s, none managed to predict the emergence of the

96

Shining Path guerilla movement's insurgency that spread throughout the region in the early 1980s. He observes that (Starn 1991: 63):

> For much of the 20th century, after all, anthropologists had figured as principal experts on life in the Andes. They positioned themselves as the "good" outsiders who truly understood the interests and aspirations of Andean people; and they spoke with scientific authority guaranteed by the firsthand experience of fieldwork. Why, then, did anthropologists miss the gathering storm of the Shining Parth? What does this say about ethnographic understandings of the highlands? How do events in Peru force us to rethink anthropology on the Andes?

Similar critiques of anthropology have led to important reflections on fieldwork practices. Some authors have questioned how investigative complicity and shared understanding of meanings are achieved between researcher and informants, usually in ways that escape textbook training. Eileen Kane's recent memoir *Trickster* (2010), on doctoral fieldwork on a Paiute reservation in Nevada in the early 1960s, exposes the gendered and age dimensions that inevitably frame field relationships. Amitav Ghosh has also unravelled layers of tensions that saturated his fieldwork in Egyptian villages of the Nile Valley. In the book *In an Antique Land* (1992), he elaborates how his Hindu origins, British training, and interest in Jewish historical documents often rendered fieldwork far from the harmonious experience many students have come to expect. Such works have raised questions about how researchers are to determine who to trust as legitimate informants in the field, how to interpret truth in cross-cultural communications, and the role

of the ethnographer's own emotions in interpreting meanings (See also Crapanzano 1980; Rabinow 1977).

Some argue that these developments have entirely transformed the objectives of anthropology, posing that an emerging concern of the discipline should be to critique Western, capitalist culture by articulating the local idioms through which marginalized peoples judge civilization, progress, and domination (Taussig 1980 & 1987; Tsing 1993). By 1989, Renato Rosaldo named this critique of classical anthropology's sense of detached impartiality the "remaking of social analysis," and related this to the rapid diffusion of post-modern social theory. In an article describing the logic of post-modern ethnography, Stephen A. Tyler explained that this involved a self-conscious sensitivity to issues of symbolic power in the relationship between "he who represents and she who is represented" (1986: 127). The opening up of ethnography to polyphony (or multi-vocality), was a means of rendering multiple perspectives on social reality, as well as of tempering the interpretive rigidity characteristic of scientific writing. Once the discipline's cherished concept, in some cases culture became too rigid and totalizing to adequately theorize the complexity of distant and rapidly transforming societies. In its wake, memory studies flourished, but not without its own methodological challenges.

Memory Boom

The remaking of social analysis that occurred with post-modern theory's diffusion throughout the humanities and social sciences coincides with what some call a "memory boom" that began in the 1980s (Berliner 2005). During that decade, memory studies rapidly

expanded as an area of research interest. As mentioned, it had previously been relegated to laboratories or largely absent from the intellectual map. Curiously, memory studies proliferated just as anthropologists were increasingly reckoning with Western historical authority's objectification of still unsettled pasts (Olick & Robbins 1998; Rosaldo 1993; i.e. Behar & Gordon 1995; Clifford & Marcus 1986; Fabian 1983). In the North American academy, anthropologists took greater interest and care in representing feelings, multiple and changing points of view, textual and oral constructions of truth, and the means by which language and representation structure knowledge about social worlds.

Uses and Abuses

This memory boom has not been restricted to the academy. French scholars in particular have developed a rich vocabulary to designate observations of a more diffuse 'boom' throughout contemporary societies. The terms *mnémotropisme, moment-mémoire,* and *la culte de la mémoire* all refer to the proliferation of academic and amateur work confronting the hegemony, inherent ambiguities and silences of established historical narratives. Anthropologist Joël Candau attributes this emergent interest in memory to an identity crisis in modern societies, whereby the memorial quest is seen to be a response to the widespread erosion of previously robust social identities (Candau 1998: 2). He remarks that the more a society seems unable to remember, the more fascinating its members seem to find memory. By this token, those in Chile uneasy about participating in public displays of remembrance, who have difficulty affirming a common national future, may very well be those most marked by lingering memory. Much like Hesiod's description of dead souls

99

drinking from the River Lethe before their rebirth, forgetting is then to some degree fundamental to community recovery.

Pierre Nora describes a contemporary consciousness of rupture with the past. Referring to France over the last century, the disappearance of peasant culture and the onset of mass global society disrupted traditions long committed to the inter-generational transmission of collective values. He directs attention to social sites (i.e. commemorative celebrations, war monuments, published memoirs of national heroes) in which a sense of historical continuity endures in spite of a general loss of traditions for remembering the past, such as oral storytelling. He calls these sites *lieux de mémoire*, which have replaced what were long *milieux de mémoire* (Nora 1989: 7). This sense of loss is, for Nora, what has inspired the recent fervour for vigilant archive keeping, museum preservation, and maintenance of anniversaries, all characteristics of the memory boom. Cautious as Nora is, Tzvetan Todorov seems even more uneasy with what he calls today's cult of memory. Considering ours to be an era gripped by commemorative mania, he questions the motives driving those who uncritically rally behind memory, as competing interests and historical revisions threaten the ethical use of the past (Todorov 2004: 51-52). He criticizes uses of memory that focus solely on the victim experience, that send survivors of past wrongs on memorial quests to document events for the sake of documentation itself. Todorov perceives that this drive towards preserving what he calls 'literal' memory often accompanies declarations about the incomparability of events like the Holocaust (1998: 34). Asking why so few survivors of deportation to Nazi death camps took public stances on

atrocities happening in Stalinist concentration camps following the war, he is concerned that lessons from similar historical atrocities are suppressed. He asks (Ibid, 34-35):

> Pour rester dans le registre de l'horrible, n'est-elle pas unique, la destruction presque intégrale de la population de tout un continent, l'Amérique, au XVIᵉ siècle? N'est-elle pas unique, la réduction massive à l'esclavage de la population d'un autre continent, l'Afrique? L'enfermement de quinze millions de détenus dans les camps staliens n'est-il pas unique?[7]

Without denying the singularity of an event like the Holocaust, Todorov favours memory's use as an example of the past for the present, as a means of identifying general categories from which to understand new events carried out by different agents. To paraphrase the author, 'exemplary' as opposed to 'literal' memory ceases to be purely private, it enters the public sphere as one opens memory to analogy and generalization, to draw lessons. In this fashion, "le passé devient donc principe d'action pour le présent"[8] (Ibid, 31). The literal use of memory submits the present to the past, and when taken to the extreme is seen to risk closing down dialogue and making of the past something incommensurable with all futures, restricting possibilities for the transmission of lessons via memory. Meanwhile, the exemplary use of memory enables us to make sense of the past in terms of the on-going present.

Candau, Nora, and Todorov largely develop their arguments in reference to Western Europe. Their focus on memory draws heavily on both remembrances of the Holocaust and questions of national identity, truth, and justice in post-Occupation France. Their works build on an expansive philosophical and literary legacy in that country, that throughout the

modern era has treated man's perception of and relationship to the past. Candau's small book *Anthropologie de la mémoire* (1998) is packed with references to heavy-hitters from the Enlightenment onwards: Montaigne, Rousseau, Voltaire, Proust, Lévi-Strauss, Sartre, Merleau-Ponty, Bastide, Vernant, Augé, Ricoeur, Virilio, Halbwachs, Wieviorka, Renan. One is tempted to wonder whether the French academy has not already written all there is to know on memory. Several of the authors mentioned above have penned whole compendiums on memory, in some cases between three and seven volumes each (i.e. Proust 1954; Ricoeur 1965, 1975, 1983, 2004; Nora 1984-1992). As the story of Ireneo Funes reveals, an effective memory depends a great deal on forgetting, through the selective generalization of details. Therefore, memory's very close and necessary relationship to forgetting means that analytical blindspots are always near.

Blindspots

From anthropological and Latin American perspectives, two notable blindspots surface. One is whether, within the discipline of anthropology, the observations of Candau, Nora, and Todorov sufficiently explain the memory boom. David Berliner addresses this problem in an article borrowing on Todorov's short book titled *The Abuses of Memory* (1998). Presenting a genealogy of the uses of memory within anthropology, Berliner explains that (2005: 203):

> [B]y a dangerous act of expansion, memory [has] gradually become everything which is transmitted across generations, everything stored in culture, 'almost indistinguishable' then from the concept of culture itself.

The question follows: In anthropology, does memory's relatively recent leap to the centre stage of research interests—where it was almost absent from the intellectual map prior—have anything to do with the supposed demise of the concept of culture (See Kahn 1989; Yengoyan 1986)?

This exposes a second blindspot, which is the question of whether a recent emergence in memory scholarship concerning other regions of the world matches the French experience. Do non-European societies not have distinct reasons to justify increased attention to memory? For instance, does the recent rise of state-sponsored programs dedicated to recovering Mapuche cultural knowledge in Chile signal the loss of previously robust indigenous identities, as Candau's thesis on modernity might suggest? Should we take these programs at face value alone as reflecting the state's genuine interest in restitution for past violations? Or, might such programs not betray more sinister objectives, such as innovative means for colonizing local understandings of cultural alterity and subsequently depoliticizing indigenous leadership?

Indigenous Historicities

The particularities of memory scholarship in Latin America do not stop there. Researchers among Amazonian peoples have elaborated phenomenological studies of indigenous historicities in recent decades, broadening understandings of culturally specific experiences of the past as more than mere temporality (See Whitehead 2003). Anthropologist Loretta Cormier's (2003) analysis of experiences of the past among a

foraging people in Brazilian Amazonia is an example in this vein. On the one hand, her work treats memory as a culturally distinct pattern for relating to past events, while on the other hand it reveals that memory's moral impetus is not a uniquely modern preoccupation. The people she studies are no more than 300 living in an aboriginal reservation set aside to protect so-called 'uncontacted' peoples. Less than half of Guajá society is in contact with Indian ministry agents, who offer help with horticultural training and access to fire-making technology. Cormier elaborates that variations in renditions of a key myth of origin told by Guajá men and women in contact with outsiders signal culturally specific patterns for recording history. In this myth, the figure of a jaguar—a powerful creature in the forest that is simultaneously dangerous to its prey and protective of its kin—is occasionally replaced by Guajá narrators with one or more figures described as 'people of the train.' Ever since the latter decades of the twentieth century, outsiders have increasingly penetrated Guajá territory either as builders of a railroad into the remote region, or as miners and others who work in extractive industries, often illegally, in the reservation. For Cormier, the increasing presence of such actors in the myth of origin suggests a form of ritualized remembering, where history progressively leaves its traces in known oral texts.

With no past tense in their vocabulary, Cormier argues that Guajá historicity conceives of the past spatially and cosmically, but it would seem not temporally. From "the Western perspective, memories of different times, different places, and different life stages are interpreted as mental imagery taking place in the single locus of the 'mind'" (Cormier 2003: 128). By contrast, for the Guajá these are conceived of as part of a physical and *contemporaneous* reality, with independent existence from the earthly present. While their

104

current lives in the earthly realm involve encounters with diverse outsiders who co-habit it, only the Guajá are believed to access the spirit realm upon death. Outsiders (i.e. settlers, Indian ministry agents, anthropologists, and miners) do not appear in the Guajá spirit realm, even though events that are described as occurring there often evoke happenings that would fall within the purview of a Euro-Western notion of memory of past experiences. Living Guajá people are said to access that realm in dreams, as well as in encounters while out in the forest alone, and in ceremonies. Cormier argues that these ceremonies in particular foster ritualized remembering that evicts outsiders from past events recollected.

In this view of the universe, only members of Guajá society are moral figures whose actions extend beyond present, earthly events. Elements of cultural contact with non-Indians (even comforts like matches and hammocks brought by outsiders), do not exist in the spirit realm. This uniquely Guajá form of ethnocentrism constructs, via ritualized remembering, a past in which what is of greatest importance to the rememberer is their perception of the world as it *should* have been, and not according to an objectivist notion of what *really* happened. This filtering out or 'ritualized forgetting' of the causes of Guajá misfortunes render the experience of Western impacts on their lives temporary. Hence, Cormier argues that the Guajá decolonize history. This seems to impact cognitive faculties in curious ways. For instance, while they have no taboo for naming the dead,[9] the Guajá tend to have a difficult time recalling the names of deceased relatives, even of parents, within a few years of their passing.

Other scholars have observed broad patterns in lowland Amazonian historicities, across ethnic groups who apparently share little else in common (i.e. linguistically or in

modes of production). Anthropologist Anne Christine Taylor frames this in terms of complex relationships between the living and the dead, whereby "Amazonian groups transform their dead quite systematically into paradigms of sociological foreignness" (1993: 654). She explains that there is "an insistence upon thinking of the dead as ever-present in the shape of a non-territorialized yet neighbouring social species or 'tribe'" (Ibid). Rather than memorialized as distant in time, ritualized forgetting produces a de-personalized version of the dead, who may look like the living but who are essentially Other in that they have become deceased. This helps explain why the behaviour of the dead described by members of several Amazonian groups is more likely to resemble features of culturally distinct neighbouring peoples, than the behaviour of one's own people. The implications of these observations are important; even among non-modern and illiterate societies, memory processes as relationships to past events are closely linked to identity. Rather than merely evoking relationships to past events, memory is given form in important narratives by which members of diverse social groups express their often tense relationships to Others.

Social Frameworks of Memory

Memory studies that took hold in the 1980s were not born of that generation. This emergent attention for memory traced roots back almost sixty years to French sociologist Maurice Halbwachs' pioneering work on collective memory. Halbwachs was deeply influenced by turn-of-the-century French philosopher Henri Bergson (Coser 1992[1977]) whose philosophy of intuitive time challenged objectivist, Cartesian notions that had dominated European philosophy in recent centuries. However, Halbwachs found Bergson's

emphasis on the inner experience of time to be excessively subjectivist, conflating the past with experiences of it (Coser 1992[1977]: 7). Certainly an event and its memory are not the same thing, he observed. When Halbwachs penned his three major works, *Les cadres sociaux de la mémoire* (1925), *La topographie légendaire des Évangils en Terre sainte* (1941), and later *La mémoire collective* (1950), he argued that individual memories cannot be recalled—or even situated in the past—without a group memory in which to frame them. His later work is at times awkward for its evident Durkheimian influence, treating the collective as having a nearly singular will. This aspect of Halbwachs' writings is among the most problematic features of his work, to the point where mention of his name by scholars today is often accompanied by a caution against the structural determinism suggested by his institutionalized and essentialized use of the "collective" (i.e. Bastide 1970: 82; Meintel 1998: 57; Tonkin 1992: 104-106). Fundamentally, it negates that individuals belong to multiple social groups with overlapping and inter-penetrating identities (See Appendix D: Identity and Ethnographic Lessons).

An early scholar to draw on Halbwachs was anthropologist Roger Bastide (1970 & 1978), who studied the persistence of certain cultural forms in afro-Brazilian religions carried over with African slaves. Bastide argues that the notion of 'collective memory' is relevant to a general theory of acculturation in plural (culturally or ethnically diverse) societies. Bastide takes as a point of departure the evident disappearance of cultural 'survivals' (or traces) of African heritage among North Americans of African slave descent. He contrasts this to the relative maintenance of African cultural signs and practices elsewhere in the Americas, especially in Cuba, Haiti, and Brazil (Bastide 1970: 77).

107

Disagreeing with suggestions that such differences amount to 'national psychologies' specific to each of these former slave colonies, Bastide also rejects the argument that racial segregation policies in the United States produced the divergence. Instead, Bastide compares Umbanda beliefs and practices in Brazil with Black Muslims in the United States. By "Black Muslims," I take him to be referring to the Nation of Islam forged in the 1930s by Elijah Muhammad and popularized by Malcolm X around the time of Bastide's writing. In both cases, Bastide finds that the language of religion expresses local critiques of contemporary racial politics. He sees the Nation of Islam as having built itself on an invented, mythical connection to Africa, whereas Umbanda is seen as a metamorphosis of ancient African religion into contemporary class ideology (Bastide 1970: 71). He emphasizes that at the time of the Atlantic passage, the ancestors of modern Umbanda practitioners did not bring a religion based on class consciousness, and the spiritual practices of these ancestors involved many elements long since lost. Umbanda today is therefore as much a product of the cultural past as it is of social realities in the present. Bastide concludes that what are effectively transmitted across generations are only those practices which find use and resonate in present social circumstances. In this sense, Halbwachs' *cadres sociaux de la mémoire* (social frameworks of memory) are aspects of the present, filters that let through only those forms of past knowledge (be they traditions, discourse, or images) that can adapt and remain relevant to current milieus.

Argentinian sociologist Elizabeth Jelin (2003) observes that Halbwachs' later work, explicitly titled *Collective Memory*, was published posthumously. He perished in 1945 at a death camp in Buchenwald (See Semprún 1994: 32-33). What Bastide, Jelin and others

(Olick and Robbins 1998; Fentress and Wickham 1992) find foundational in Halbwachs'
ideas is that "individual memories are always socially framed. They also include the
worldview and language of a society or group" (Jelin 2003: 11). These scholars emphasize
that frameworks, or *cadres*, signify that which has preoccupied memory studies in the social
sciences in recent decades: memory's fundamentally inseparable relationship to social
identity (Assman 1995; Candau 1998; Gillis 1994; Megill 1998; See also Appendix E:
Autobiographical versus Group Memory). Cautious of the association with some of
Halbwachs' more Durkheimian suggestions, but still interested in how individual memory
draws on landmarks common to social groups, many have preferred the more supple
concept of 'social memory' (Climo & Cattell 2002; Fentress and Wickham 1992; Meintel
1998; Olick & Robbins 1998). This is seen to target questions that most interest social
scholars, surrounding identity and the transmission of historical and cultural knowledge.
Remaining open to memory's variability from one person to the next, and recognizing that
it transforms in processes of transmission, these scholars build on Halbwachs' legacy
without being determined by it. This invites a practical question: how might the 'social'
qualification of memory be effectively deployed as methodological or analytical tool?

Memory and Repression in Latin America

Elizabeth Jelin and Carlos Iván Degregori have edited an extensive series that
focuses on the lingering impacts of political oppression in Southern Cone countries. In an
edited book series called *Memorias de la represión*, their objective has been to develop a
new generation of researchers with solid theoretical and methodological training to study

processes of social memory. They prepared nearly sixty contributors to confront diverse themes relating to social memory in the region. Some volumes published in this series address social memory in important institutions like the military (Hershberg & Agüero 2005), the Church (Cruz 2004), and education systems (Jelin & Lorenz 2004). Meanwhile, others parallel Pierre Nora's interests in commemorations, monuments, and state archives (da Silva Catela & Jelin 2002; Jelin & Langland 2003; Jelin 2002). From a temporal aspect, one focuses on images and writings prior to repression (Jelin & Longoni 2005), while another treats questions of local struggles in community and individual contexts (Del Pino & Jelin 2004). Through that project, Jelin has become a key figure in memory studies on the continent, and her book *State Repression and the Labors of Memory* (2003) is a valuable synthesis of lessons for researchers. She underscores the importance of treating memory as work, stressing the active participation of individuals and groups in defining and transforming their life circumstances. It is therefore no coincidence that this series pivots on memory as disputed terrain. It affirms that memory relates as equally to the Southern Cone dictatorships that quashed various revolutionary socialist movements, as to subsequent democratic administrations that have imposed neoliberal reforms upon the region's populations.

As trials of war criminals, truth commissions, and commemorations indicate, memory struggles in Latin America make for particularities that stand apart from the European experience. Most notably, the moral challenge prevalent in Holocaust scholarship "to remember the past, so as not to forget" does not involve memories that can be clearly relegated to the past. Debates over commemorative dates and the bringing to trial of human

rights violators do not concern acts of remembrance alone. This is because some commemorations, like those for military coups and the birthdays of former dictators (See Candina Polomer 2002; Lorenz 2002; González 2002; Carvalho & da Silva Catela 2002),[10] memorialize events and people responsible for exploitative and unjust circumstances that plague the present. In such contexts, the adage takes on new form: "to remember the past, so as to change the future." This is captured in the titles given to the *Nunca más*[11] (literally, "Never Again") reports that were published in the first years after return to democracy in numerous Latin American countries. Meanwhile, in communities where political violence has seen no real end or enduring return to social cohesion, it is difficult for many to have confidence that the future will be any more reliable than the past or the present. Competing memories of political violence not only sustain social ruptures, they may impede development efforts by governments and outside investors, who have material stakes in pacifying once hostile regions (See Villapolo Herrera 2003). Memory in this case may not amount to political consciousness or organization, but it nourishes distrust and caution that is at the heart of withdrawal from the public sphere.

The heavily philosophical tenor of French contributions to studies of memory resonates most in its emphasis on addressing the ethics that should guide our endeavours. In this vein, experiences in Latin America and Europe raise important concerns regarding the duty of memory, the complications of forgetting, and community desires for amnesty in place of amnesia (Ricoeur 2004: 456). Latin American and European experiences do not invalidate one another. Rather, together they stir questions of critical importance to a world that at times seems unable to learn from its collective mistakes.

Conclusion: Memory as Method

The archaeology of the concept of memory reveals that it is not easily categorized into a discrete typology that unproblematically maps the various domains of social life into which an ethnographer may delve. I am reminded of social theorist Michel Foucault's opening passage in his book *The Order of Things*, when he quotes a Jorge Luis Borges story about a Chinese encyclopaedia in which animals are grouped into a very absurd-seeming taxonomy. In the story, animals are categorized according to the absurd logic that they may: belong to the Emperor, be embalmed, be suckling pigs, be fabulous, be stray dogs, be innumerable, or they may have just broken the pitcher (Foucault 2002[1966]: xvi). Such would be the absurdity of a taxonomy of memory, if someone actually tried to compartmentalize it into mutually exclusive categories. It might look something like: a) memory and objects; b) commemorations; c) women's memories; d) bodily memories; e) the language of memory; f) memory as [political] practice; g) ethnicity as a post-modern art of memory; h) traumatic memory; i) transmitted memory; j) forgetting as the narrative loss of memory; k) childhood recollections; l) social habit memories; m) memory as modern anxiety; n) *ad infinitum*. What is certain, is that memory is social. If it is not framed, commemorated, disputed, or silenced by collectives, its individual obsession, suppression, and recovery happens within the realm of communities that—among many other things— ultimately confer or deny it meaning and purpose.

Literature about memory leaves us with useful lessons for documenting contemporary manifestations of the past in everyday life. From Borges, Hesiod, and Virgil

we might affirm the value of forgetting to human experience. From Aristotle and Augustine, we might pay attention to local conceptions of time, approaching history phenomenologically. From Portelli, we might watch for distortions, inconsistencies, and contradictions, asking why people do not always remember as they should, or at least according to the official record. From Goody and de Certeau, we recall that just because people can read history textbooks, does not mean that they transmit knowledge about the past with the cadence of detached text, or with the same attention to detail and order. From Rosaldo we learn that polyphony is to be expected in narratives about the past, that multiple perspectives on the realities we observe makes for rigourous analysis. From Halbwachs and his successors, we are reminded that to speak of collective or social memory, is to signal particular kinds of sharing the past that involve continued meaning-making within present frameworks. Finally, from Candau, Nora, and Todorov we may recognize that the uses of memory in public life today indicate modernity's weak relationship to the experience of history. Therefore, the recovery and reconstitution of memory in the modern era is inherently political, an act of contesting modern forms of power.

These scholars remind us that the relationship between what is remembered in a society and what is forgotten across generations is mediated by systems of communication. In addition to the spoken word, these systems transmit knowledge through cultural practices and other non-verbal signals. They are particular to social groups, such that transmissions of historical perspectives can be observed in gendered, generational, class, cultural, institutional, and geographically particular modes. However, as groups are neither homogeneous nor static, their boundaries and internal divisions expand, contract, and often

113

disappear. In this way, so too does the memory transmission that specific groups enable, as competing modes of communication permeate the multiple social spaces in which people carry out their lives. This means that memory transmission can never be linear or complete. It is penetrated and intersected by other, sometimes contradictory versions of memory that challenge individuals and groups to work through the conflicted past, to negotiate ideas about collective identities, and to assess the merits of competing historical perspectives. In this sense, Elizabeth Jelin (2003) and Norbert Lechner (2002) are correct in referring to memory as a form of cultural labour.

_____

Notes: Chapter 2

[1] Curiously, Montaigne's "De l'excercitation" is considered "one of the most densely layered sites of memory" in his *Essais* (Frisch 2006: 23). This treats his fall from a horse, an experience that inspired an elaborate effort of what he calls 'recordation' of observations gleaned from those who witnessed the event and its aftermath.

[2] Also referred to as the Ardeatine Cave.

[3] For the sake of brevity, I reserve judgment of his suggestion that myth implies falsity (See Leavitt 2005). As an oral historian, Portelli's attention for historiographic truth is more pronounced than an ethnographer's eye for causes of variation and the degree or constitution of forgetting across generations.

114

[4] For Portelli, false memories refer to discrepancies between memory and established historical fact.

[5] The controversy involved more than a critique of Western academics unfriendly to the genre of *testimonio*. It also involved debate over the establishment of truth and facts involving the military campaigns against indigenous Guatemalans.

[6] Among other *testimonio* genre authors, she cites Miguel Barnet (2003[1966]) and Elena Poniatowska (1980).

[7] My translation: "To remain in the index of the horrible, is not the near destruction of the entire population of a whole continent, of America during the sixteenth century, not unique? Is the massive reduction to slavery of the population of another continent, Africa, not unique? The emprisonment of fifteen million detainees in Stalin's camps, is that not unique?"

[8] My translation: "the past thereby becomes the guiding force for the present."

[9] Such taboos are common among other Amazonian peoples.

[10] Together with other articles, these are compiled in a book edited by Elizabeth Jelin called *Las conmemoraciones: las disputas en las fechas 'in-felices'* (2002) in her recent series dedicated to memories of repression in the Southern Cone of Latin America.

[11] Between 1984 and 1991 Argentina, Brazil, Chile, and Uruguay each published one of these reports (Marchesi cited in Hershberg & Aguero 2005). Foxen 2000 also mentions Guatemala's *Nunca más* report, one of two truth commissions carried out in that country.

Part II: A Place in the Nation

Chapter 3: Rural Southern Chile

…[A] esta juventud se la puede comparar con la del comienzo del siglo veinte en Chile. Obreros y trabajadores pauperizados agrupándose en pequeños núcleos… Puede ser útil observar lo que está ocurriendo y hacer un diálogo con las generaciones pasadas, con la memoria acumulada, en fin, con la Historia.

These youth compare to those at the start of the twentieth century in Chile. Impoverished labourers and workers gathering together in small units… It could be useful to observe that which is happening and to put it in dialogue with past generations, with accumulated memory, in short, with History.

-José Bengoa, *La Comunidad Reclamada* (2006: 145)

This chapter introduces Chile's rural and semi-urban South, elaborating on the ambiguous position that this part of the country holds in the national community. It begins with a review of colonial and later republican history as a means of mapping this region's position within the 'imagined community' of the nation. I treat the Chilean nation as imagined because, as political scientist Benedict Anderson observes, "members of even the smallest of nations will never know most of their fellow-members…yet in the minds of each lives the image of their communion" (Anderson 1983: 6). I am therefore referring to a sociological position within the nation, rather than a strictly geographic one. Drawing on popular culture, literature, and stereotypes embedded in nationalist history, I argue that not all members of the Chilean nation experience their membership as equals. Especially in the southern countryside, the structure of this 'unequal community' models the distribution of private property. In this context, ownership of land and resources translates not only into

greater social status, but also into the ability to control how others may live in the South and influence its collective future.

This discussion lays the foundation for observations in subsequent chapters, that Chilean national identity is a state project that corrals the horizons by which subordinated groups may imagine their participation as citizens. It also establishes a sociological and historical framework within which to situate contrasting memories discussed in Chapters 6 and 7. As some Mapuche scholars have suggested, for the indigenous population of the South the nation-state involves a colonization of minds that undermines struggles for liberation (Marimán et al. 2006). These remind us that not all who find themselves at the margins of the national community aspire for greater integration in it. In their view, scholars who neglect this reality and presume that greater well-being can only come with greater integration into Chilean society, are complicit with silencing voices that call for true self-determination.[1] I argue here that the interrogation of Chilean national identity as the product of a violent history of subordination offers keys to appreciating political subjectivity among diverse groups excluded from public decision-making. I first consider the material and historical conditions of subordination by tracing the consolidation of private property in rural southern Chile. The chapter concludes with a description of private property's accelerated form during the neoliberal era, and the particular impacts it has had in remote areas of the country.

The Country and the City

By "rural South," I refer as much to areas south of Santiago and Chile's agricultural Central Valley, as to an idea that plays an important role in Chilean national identity: the frontier. There are approximately 1,800 kilometres of Chilean countryside beyond the Araucanía and Rivers Regions, the hub of my research activities. Much of that is relatively isolated, as the continent breaks into an extensive archipelago and rugged coastline that eventually forms the extreme tip of South America's Magellan Strait. Many have found in southern Chile—with its millenarian forests, sparse pampas, rich farmland, and abundant lakes—the landscape of Western Europe's long-imagined Utopia. First published in 1719, Daniel Defoe's novel *Robinson Crusoe* (1994[1719]) was partly inspired by an actual eighteenth century Scotsman. Following an extended argument with his ship's captain, the sailor Alexander Selkirk was abandoned in the Juan Fernández Islands directly west of Chile's mainland. He spent four years there before eventually being picked up and returned to his homeland where his survival garnered fame. Throughout the colonial era, stories of everyday men like Selkirk surviving shipwreck and isolated island misadventures helped fuel European fascination with discovering and taming the distant, unknown wilderness. As literary scholar Marthes Robert (1972) observes in her reflections on the origin of the novel, such tales tell us less about the far reaches of the world, than about the modern origins of European identity.

In his treatise on *The Country and the City* (1973), cultural scholar Raymond Williams emphasizes that what is commonly designated as the countryside is done so by those who live and work outside of such areas (i.e. absentee estate owners, industrialists,

121

artists). Sociologist of memory Paul Connerton (2009) later took up this idea, noting that these actors generally see the countryside as uninhabited; theirs is thus a visual and not social imagination of the landscape. For such people, rural spaces are close to nature, sites of retreat and seclusion. This idealized point of view mystifies labour processes that happen in the so-called countryside, concealing social relationships with rural people upon whom distant metropoles depend. Connerton draws on Marxist scholars like Williams to relate this to modernity, much in the same vein as Candau (1996), Nora (1989[1984]), and Todorov (1998), mentioned in the last chapter, who address modernity's obsession with memory. Connerton argues that not only did 'the country' come into being by virtue of urban imaginations about rurality, but that the rise of industrialism has eroded patterns of mutual reciprocity that have long characterized communities who sustain themselves directly from the land they occupy. Hence, rural life occupies a special place in the modern imaginary; it is presumably closer to both the past and nature than life in cities, urban life being the centre of commerce and capital. Given all its impact on cultural understandings of time, place, and community, we might ask in what ways modernity has not only brought the 'countryside' into being, but transformed rural life.

Anthropologist Arturo Escobar's work on Afro-Colombian refugees in that country's Pacific region poses that modernity is a spatial-cultural project that requires "the continuous conquest of territories and peoples and their ecological and cultural transformation along the lines of a rational, logocentric order" (2003: 157). For Escobar, logocentrism aims to order the world in a predictable and controllable fashion, so as to more effectively extract from it material resources that foster productivity and progress. In his

view, displacement of rural communities is "an integral attribute of modernity" (2003: 162). The history of Chile's southern regions can therefore be read as the story of the modern nation-state's appropriation of the distant frontier for productive purposes. It is a story in which physical worlds are re-ordered to satisfy the needs of largely urban consumers, while social worlds are re-ordered so that modern citizens aspire for the nation's promises of improvement, security, and inclusion.

The South is therefore a spatial-cultural project of the Chilean nation-state. Spatially, it is a geographic area whose remote valleys, rivers, and coastlines are increasingly rendered productive for actors whose interests are aligned with those of the state and industry. Culturally, this project represents to members of the nation a sense of ownership over even the farthest of national territories, and a sense of kinship with the people who occupy these. José Bengoa reminds us that kinship is no accidental metaphor. He remarks that during Chile's colonial period, hacienda owners commonly referred to the social structure of their institutions in terms of family relations; their workers were treated as children to be protected and beaten, while the wives and daughters of workers proffered sexual favours even to the landlord (2006: 45). By developing on the model of the hacienda from as early as the sixteenth century, Chilean society has become a "community" only insofar as members respect their unequal place within it. Even though the southern territories were not annexed to the Chilean state until the latter half of the nineteenth century, the hacienda system would frame the state's penetration into and appropriation of the South. Through the establishment of commerce and industry in the region, the state determined that the value of land—and of the people who occupy it—be measured in modern productive terms alone.

National Heroes and State Enemies

The southern regions that were inhabited by ancestors of today's Mapuche society acquired a single name from the Spanish who referred to a diverse population in the South that shared a common language. Arauco originally denominated a region where, "from a hundred kilometres North of Santiago to the islands of Chiloé people spoke 'the tongue of the Earth' as it was called by the Spaniards"[2] (Bengoa 2009b: 120). In poet and Nobel laureate Pablo Neruda's *Canto General* (1950), the region appears solitary, silent, and inhospitable:

> En el fondo de América sin nombre
> estaba Arauco entre las aguas
> vertiginosas, apartado
> por todo el frío del planeta.
> Mirad el gran Sur solitario.
> …
> Todo es silencio de agua y viento.
>
> Pero en las hojas mira el guerrero.
> Entre los alerces un grito.
> Unos ojos de tigre en medio
> de las alturas de la nieve.
>
> Mira las lanzas descansando.
> Escucha el susurro del aire
> atravesado por las flechas.[3]

Much older literature also portrays Arauco as a space of simultaneous freedom and conquest. Francisco Núñez de Pineda y Bascuñán's chronicle *Cautiverio Feliz* depicts the region's original inhabitants, detailing the author's capture and seven month detainment by a native *cacique*[4] in the 1600s. While not published until the mid-nineteenth century, the chronicle has become elemental for historians of the nation. Among these is Diego Barros

124

Arana, who edited the first fragmented edition of *Cautiverio Feliz* in 1863, and who inferred in it a nationalistic critique of the Spanish Crown's *encomienda* system. Found throughout the Spanish empire during the early colonial period, this system involved the 'granting' of natives to conquerors who became formally responsible for the conversion and Spanish language education of subjects. In practice, it was largely a forcible means for extracting labour and goods in the colonies (Memoria Chilena 2004). For this early nationalist historian, Pineda y Bascuñán's text was an epic seen to respect the region's original inhabitants in ways that colonial Spain never did. Of course, Barros Arana overlooked the fact that only two years prior to his first edition of the chronicle, the Chilean government had begun to militarize the southern territory. For several hundred years, a substantial portion of the South had been subject to peace treaties between inhabitants and the Spanish Crown, impeding the development of the *encomienda* system in recognized indigenous territory. The occupation provoked fierce resistance among the native population which had remained largely autonomous in preceding centuries, but military campaigns nevertheless led to the Araucanía's annexation to the Chilean state by the early 1890s.[5]

Literary scholar Cedomil Goic (2002) suggests that *Cautiverio Feliz* has had many interpretations that keep it a fixture in the formation and reformation of contemporary national identity. Much like Alonso de Ercilla y Zuñiga's epic poem *La Araucana* (a three part piece published between 1569 and 1590), it assesses a violent historical encounter between civilizations, criticizing abuses towards the region's inhabitants, while also promoting the legitimacy of colonial rule. Through Ercilla y Zuñiga's saga, historical figures like the fallen *conquistador* Pedro de Valdivia and native warriors Lautaro,

Caupolicán, and Colocolo—who resisted invaders in the latter half of the sixteenth century—remain fixtures in the national imaginary. They are taught to contemporary schoolchildren as the embattled heroes at the nation's collective origins. Through these founding texts, national fascination with the southern frontier feeds dominant stereotypes that make of Arauco's native inhabitants a warring and rebellious people (Stuchlik 1985). For instance, Ercilla y Zuñiga describes what he calls the bloodiest battle for Arauco occurring upon the death of the cunning warrior Lautaro, when a Spanish ambush led by colonial hero Juan de Villagra surprised a Mapuche camp. The enraged Indians with whom Lautaro was staying are depicted as responding (1985: 38):

> sin celada, ni escudo y sin coraza
> comiezan la batalla peligrosa,
> cruda, fiera, reñida y sanguinosa.[6]

Even today, historiography that draws on such texts characterizes the Mapuche as blood-thirsty, fearless, and dangerous, perpetuating stereotypes about their supposedly warring nature. Observing representations of the Mapuche in the popular press today, anthropology and communications scholars Cristián Cabalin and Claudia Lagos (2009) have argued that mainstream media tend only to treat the indigenous people of the South in ways that reproduce hegemonic discourse. The effect is to reduce Mapuche news to a deceptively singular and apparently irrational "conflict" reflected in most media coverage. They find that among the terms most often appearing as keywords together with the word Mapuche are those relating to arson, police crackdowns, and the so-called Anti-Terrorist Law.[7] The authors also observe that very few testimonies by Mapuche individuals appear as news sources, while the voices of company executives, private property owners, and local

authorities are commonly cited. As one journalist from the critical newspaper *El Ciudadano* drew from that study, few media outlets today seem to treat the greater social and historical context framing the so-called "Mapuche conflict." Paraphrasing Cabalin and Lagos' concern, this includes widespread and persistent media silence regarding respect for indigenous culture, the denial of basic rights, the excessive use of police force, and the criminalization of Mapuche organizations (Pedreros Saá 2010). It also involves the absence of editorial reflection on the reasons why many Mapuche people today struggle for recognition as a nation and territorial autonomy. This atmosphere contributes to the continued application of Chile's Anti-Terrorist Law against indigenous actors, who are frequently cast as enemies of the state in their struggles to reconstitute ancestral land rights that have been dramatically usurped over the past century and a half (Aylwin 2010; Human Rights Watch and Observatorio de Derechos de los Pueblos Indígenas 2004). Issued during the Pinochet dictatorship, that law was designed to quash the clandestine activities of "communist" subversives, broadly meaning critics of the military regime. Since the 1990s, its principal targets have been Mapuche dissidents, whose struggles for territorial and cultural recovery contest the supposedly natural order of the Chilean nation-state.

Wallmapu

Notions about the South as distant frontier date to as far back as the early colonial period, shortly after Francisco Pizarro conquered the Inca capital of Cuzco in the mid-1530s. Hungry for gold, Spanish *conquistadores* travelled on one expedition after another going north and east into the Amazonian region, and south in search of the mythical *El*

127

Dorado. Some fantasized that beyond the richest of Inca mines, located in what is today central Chile at Marga Marga (Bengoa 2009b: 119), they would find the fabled kingdom of gold. Here as elsewhere, the colonial and later republican project of conquering remote frontiers was pursued with unforgiving force.

Several aboriginal groups occupied areas in the southern tip of the continent at the arrival of European explorers. The ancestors of modern Mapuche society were among these, forming the largest network of native inhabitants in the Southern Cone. Other groups were also encountered further to the south, including the Aónikenk, the Selk'nam, the Yagán, and the Kawésqar. By the turn of the twentieth century, state concessions of land in the far South had led to the near extermination of these peoples, much smaller in number than the Mapuche (Comisión de Verdad Histórica y Nuevo Trato 2008: 478). At the arrival of the Spaniards in the middle of the sixteenth century, approximately one million people lived west of the Andean cordillera between the Itata and Cruces Rivers (Bengoa 2000[1985]: 21-22). Pedro de Valdivia's expedition to conquer the south of the Americas set off from Peru in 1540 with more than a thousand natives and approximately one hundred and fifty Spaniards. It was the first to successfully cross modern Chile's vast northern desserts and arrive in the Mapocho Valley, where the future Chilean capital city of Santiago de la Nueva Extramadura was founded. In the novel *Inés del alma mía* (2006), Isabel Allende fictionalizes this journey through the voice of Pedro de Valdivia's mistress Inés Suarez, the expedition's sole female Spaniard. By 1552, forts at the sites of what would later become the southern cities of Concepción and Valdivia were founded, and a handful of other settlements throughout the region were established. These were erected on unwelcome

terrain. By the end of 1553, Pedro de Valdivia met a brutal death at the hands of native inhabitants, who were apparently angered by atrocities committed by the *conquistadores* throughout their penetration into the region.

Following decades of resistance by the area's original inhabitants, in 1599 the fifty-year old settlement near modern-day Valdivia was sacked and burned in coordinated native uprisings. At the time, a few hundred settlers and several thousand natives lived there. In her brief history of Valdivia, local historian Isabel Montt Pinto paints a slanted picture of the early morning raid that quickly lead to the young city's defeat (Montt Pinto 1971: 18):

> Las taes encendidas cayeron sobre la población, el barrio Carmenga fue arrasado, las iglesias sequeadas y profanadas y los religiosos degollados. Los españoles lucharon valientamente durante una hora, hasta entregar sus vidas. Los indios, dueños de la situación, se prepararon para celebrar la victoria y la venganza contra sus opresores. Bebieron hasta embriegarse y reuniendo 400 mujeres y 42 muchachos los desporajon de sus vestimentas y los sometieron a las mayores crueldades y vejámenes. Terminada la orgía, se repartieron los cautivos entre los caciques para venderlos como esclavos.[8]

By 1602, six other Spanish settlements south of the Biobío River were similarly demolished in an event historically known as the Destruction of the Seven Cities. For centuries to come, formal settlements were forced out of much of the indigenous territory, known in the Mapudungun language as *Wallmapu*. Thus, the ancestors of contemporary Mapuche society developed a reputation for being vengeful warriors. This frames their

representations by nationalist historians as fighters who, while resisting oppression, were also driven by base instincts to drink and violate women, to carry out sacrilege and slavery.

Nevertheless, as early as 1641 a series of parleys and truces between native leaders and the Spanish Crown began. These ensured a growing presence of European missionaries and merchants in the area, especially north of the Biobío River near the contemporary city of Concepción and south of the Calle Calle River which runs through Valdivia. Treaties not only established territorial autonomy between these rivers, they set minimal terms for trade, and in some later cases they established alliances against the increasingly organized population of creoles (Europeans born in the colony) who vied for independence from the Crown and control over prospective Chilean territories. They included the *Paces de Quilín*, and the *Parlamentos de Negrete* (1726, 1771, 1793, 1796, 1803) and *Tapihue* (1774, 1825, where only the latter occurred with leaders of the new Chilean state). Facing persistent hostility by native inhabitants who lacked the stratified social hierarchy that had facilitated the Inca conquest to the North, the Spanish Crown recognized areas south of the Biobío River and north of the Toltén River as autonomous indigenous territory (Bengoa 2000[1985]: 33-40). In spite of formal delineations that set the southern frontier thirty kilometres to the north, the contemporary communes of Mariquina and Panguipulli (host to my fieldwork activities) mark the southern line along which settlements did not penetrate until well after the formation of the Chilean state in 1810 (Comisión Verdad Histórica y Nuevo Trato 2008: 342, map 22). Needless to say, formal recognition did not stop periodic raids made into the territory via the northern frontier. Raids were generally made to kidnap slaves for labour on haciendas being established during the sixteenth and seventeenth

130

centuries in the Central Valley, where the native Pikumche population proved susceptible to European disease and had been quickly wiped out. As is the case today, during the colonial period no single Mapuche leader ever spoke for all of the population. This meant that treaties were essentially agreements made between specific networks in concentrated localities, never with the entire native population, which was scarcely united as a single ethnic group.

Today's Mapuche society is substantially different from that which existed in the area at the time of first contact with Europeans. Some groups quickly adapted to the horse and cattle husbandry, while emergent commerce with a small number of settlers and the increasing penetration of missionaries led to important transformations in traditional leadership and social organization. Anthropologist Guillaume Boccara has observed that the ethnic denomination of Mapuche did not itself emerge until recent centuries, where terms like Araucano and *Reche*[9] are prevalent in chronicles of the colonial period (Boccara 1998). This bears both sociological and territorial implications. As mentioned, forebears of Chile's Mapuche society occupied areas to the north of Santiago to as far south as the Reloncaví Sound, near the large island of Chiloé (Millanguir Neutopan 2007: 123). However, in Chile today, the Mapuche homeland is concentrated mainly in the Biobío, Araucanía, and Rivers Regions, which altogether encompass more than a thousand kilometres less than the *Wallmapu* once stretched from north to south. Between 1830 and 1883, more than 5.2 million hectares within the autonomous territory between the coast and cordillera became occupied by the Chilean state (Ibid, 126). These lands were distributed mainly by auction to Chilean settlers or immigrants, while Mapuche families were cornered onto indigenous

131

reserves that are still aptly known as *reducciones*. In Boccara's view, the common experience of colonial incursion over several hundred years served to unify a previously diverse set of related peoples under the single ethno-denomination of Mapuche.

The magnitude of the internal displacement of Mapuche society during the nineteenth century emerges in the proportion of the territory assigned indigenous title, in that time known as a *título de merced*. Approximately 9.3% of the original autonomous territory was titled to indigenous families by the end of the 1800s. In some parts of the Araucanía, the war left very few Mapuche to even claim title to land, as survivors moved elsewhere in search of more secure living conditions. In the Chilean census of 1907, fully a third of recognized Mapuche people remained without lands, roughly 30,000 of 110,000 people (Millanguir Neutopan 2007: 139). Forced assimilation and urbanization had already begun, especially for groups who remained hostile to the intruders.

Importantly, the most effective incursions into Mapuche territory have been through protracted and coordinated design by those who posed to benefit commercially from the expansion of colonial control in the region. As the establishment of state control could be secured by rendering land productive for urban and foreign markets, not all sectors of the former autonomous territory fell under state influence at the same time or in the same manner. Located thirty kilometres south of the Toltén River, Panguipulli formally lay beyond the southern frontier of the autonomous territory, meaning that its mountainous interior was one of the last areas to fall under the actual control of the Republic of Chile. Without even the meagre protections for indigenous lands that had been established throughout the occupation of the Auracanía, Panguipulli experienced a relatively unique

process for the establishment of private property, which did not occur in many of its sectors until the first decades of the twentieth century.

Manifest Destiny

When the Republic of Chile was formed in 1810, it did so north of the recognized indigenous territory, whose northern frontier followed the path of the Biobío. That river winds from the cordillera to the coastal city of Concepción, which meets the Pacific nearly three hundred kilometres to the north of Mariquina. Sixteen years later, the Provinces of Valdivia and Chiloé were created, claiming for the young republic jurisdiction over areas stretching from the autonomous territory's southern frontier another three hundred kilometres southward to the Reloncaví Sound. As mentioned already, the southern frontier at that time formally followed the path of the Toltén River, which begins at Lake Villarrica near the cordillera. It was not until 1852 that the Republic of Chile made the first of a series of legal declarations to submit the autonomous territory to Chilean administration (Pinto 2000). Until the outright militarization of the region in the late 1860s and early 1870s, which involved an aggressive and premeditated campaign to 'pacify' Arauco's native inhabitants, state leaders employed a commercial strategy to integrate the territory through the establishment of private property. Enlisting immigrant settlers, annexed lands soon became a productive resource to the state via taxes on exports.

In a multi-authored volume on *Manifest Destinies and Indigenous Peoples* (Maybury-Lewis et al. 2009) throughout the Americas, José Bengoa reminds us that "the policies applied to the indigenous population during [the] period (1881-1931) were debated

in the National Congress and legislated into law" (2009: 142 n. 35). However, the Chilean state's first calculated efforts to penetrate the region were not military campaigns during the nineteenth century, or the slow and inefficient work of the Indian settlement commission[10] in assigning land deeds to natives at the turn of the twentieth century. These were merely extensions of a much earlier project to defeat the South, which enlisted the unsuspecting diligence of mainly German immigrants whose recruitment was a means to transform accessible parts of the South beyond the autonomous territory into productive farmland. Settlers were swiftly granted lands in the Araucanía, once the military advanced into that region. In this fashion, commerce enabled the state to keep conquered territory out of the hands of indigenous inhabitants.

Pro-immigration policy which began in the period prior to the militarization of the Araucanía brought a wave of middle-class German families to settle southern lands via the new Province of Valdivia. Some 5,600 Germans are believed to have arrived in the South in the latter half of the nineteenth century. Limited contact with authorities in Santiago did not slow the industrious settlers, who in the span of half a century cut off from a land route to the capital developed steel production, shipyards, and agricultural industries near Valdivia (See Montt Pinto 1971; Pérez Rosales date unknown).

The delayed militarization of the Araucanía, which began over fifty years after Chile's Independence, also benefitted from the construction of a railroad between the capital and the northern frontier, as well as from the invention of the telegraph (See Bengoa 2000[1985]: 249-250). These technologies radically enhanced connections between central authorities and local administrators of a state plan to penetrate and defeat the region.

Bengoa has critiqued scholars who fuel common beliefs that at the time of the military campaigns, alcohol had already reduced the Mapuche to a shadow of their ancestors. In his words, "[p]asado glorioso y presente silenciado, ha sido la característica del tratamiento contemporáneo de la cuestión indígena"[11] (Ibid, 149). As the report of the *Comisión de la Verdad Histórica y Nuevo Trato con los Pueblos Indígenas*[12] affirms, historiography has generally treated this period that is erroneously known as the Pacification of the Araucanía, as a walk in the park for the Chilean Army (2008[2003]: 359-360). Historians of a nationalist tendency have fostered dominant misconceptions that upon the occupation, the Mapuche had already been largely acculturated. The authors of the report on historical truth draw on seldom cited descriptions by figures like Colonel Cornelio Saavedra to uncover a more likely scenario of the war. Colonel Saavedra was named the head of the Province of Arauco when it had yet to be colonized, and he would lead the military campaign into the territory. By his own admissions, the persistence of Mapuche inhabitants in defending their territory was not only costly and seemingly interminable for the Chilean Army, it was incredibly unpleasant and demoralizing for his soldiers. He wrote that in response to the ability of Mapuche fighters to effectively hide out of reach from the invading army, his men took to dirtier tactics, including burning homes, taking families, stealing livestock, and otherwise destroying what could not be snatched.

Meanwhile, the stateless area between the Biobío and Toltén Rivers was not unanimously seen by outsiders as a lawless land whose eventual conquest belonged to the Chilean republic. A curious chapter in the final years of the Mapuche territory's autonomy involved a Frenchman who declared himself monarch in 1860 over what he called the

Kingdom of the Auracanía and Patagonia. Within weeks of landing to the south of the autonomous territory, Orelie Antoine Tounens (who previously worked in his small hometown's Chamber of Commerce) dispatched news of his intended government. He was later declared a madman by the Chilean judiciary, leading to his return to France for what he considered to be his exile. He made three further attempts to enter the Araucanía and unite Mapuche leaders under his name. According to one anonymous publication on the Frenchman's Quixotic efforts to establish a kingdom in the South, the Constitution disseminated by Orelie Antoine I appears socially advanced for its period (Taller *denosotros* 2007: 11). Baptisms, marriage licenses, burials, and other sacraments would apparently be free to the people, and all social classes would enjoy funerary rites within the Catholic faith. Comedic as his efforts may seem today, Tounens apparently achieved what few other Europeans of his era even attempted: the consent of Mapuche leaders on both sides of the cordillera to represent them. Whether native leaders of the time fully appreciated the implications of Tounens' intentions as king is less interesting than their willingness to permit an outsider to represent their common concerns before foreign states. Tounens therefore offers us a window onto the times, where war against the Mapuche in both the Araucanía and the pampas to the east pressured native leaders to reformulate their socio-political and diplomatic organization.

Private Property and Political Participation

Nation-state formation has thus had a legacy of coercion and violence in the southern regions. The following sections describe how the consolidation of private property

through industry and commerce sustained this legacy throughout the twentieth century. They also present another dimension to conflict in the southern regions, which has not affected the indigenous population alone. With the global rise of socialism, Chile's agrarian sector became progressively mobilized around class identity, and rural residents increasingly pushed for land tenure reform.

Allegories of Extraction

José Bengoa's (2006) description of the settlement of Chile Chico reveals a lived history of other utopian projects that have inspired settlers in the southern regions. At the end of the nineteenth century, a caravan of migrants from the Central Valley arrived in Chile Chico's particularly ripe microclimate in today's Aysén Region of Patagonia. With animals in tow, they first traversed the Araucanía and the Argentinian pampas in search of a place to build a settlement on principles of cooperation and justice. They spent over a decade establishing their farms along the edge of what is today known as Lake General Carrera (Wellmann 2011), associating primarily with Argentinian society, as the rough Pacific waters complicated entry via the West. Eventually, however, the government in Santiago auctioned these lands to others (Bengoa 2006: 33):

> …entregó todas esas tierras a una sociedad anónima que se denominó "Sociedad Explotadora del Lago Baker". Ellos ingresaron por el lado del mar y al avanzar al medio de las selvas frías se encontraron con una próspera poblacíon que vivía en la felicidad de la comunidad utópica… Los declararon ilegales, como tantas veces en la Historia de Chile, "ocupantes sin permiso", invasores de propiedad ajena.[13]

137

Authorities in Santiago expected to expulse the inhabitants of Chile Chico by force. Local resistance turned into years of tribunals and legal debates, during which time lumber companies effectively clear-cut the area's forests. These developments coincided with a more infamous instance of repression in the same province. Striking farm labourers on large estates in the far South were suppressed in 1920, leading many to seek refuge in Argentina. Over the next two years, following the spread of worker strikes to that country, as many as 1,500 labourers (many Chilean) were massacred by the Argentinian Army, accused of anarchism and bolshevism. This crushed the uprising known as *Patagonia rebelde*. Fifty years after these events, historian and essayist Osvaldo Bayer (1972) would be exiled for publishing a series of essays on this period. His exile to Germany during the Argentinian *Proceso*[14] highlights the enduring silence that shrouds historiography of nation-state formation in the southern territories.

In the absence of well-developed historiography, southern Chilean lore has figured in literature of national and international importance, conveying harsh realities endured by southerners subservient to distant and abusive landlords. José Donoso's magical realist novel *El obsceno pájaro de la noche* (1970) evokes the myth of the *imbunche*, a monstrous creature whose eyes, mouth, and other orifices are sewn shut as a child. A human who was once kidnapped and converted into this monster, the *imbunche* guards the lairs of witches and warlocks. This dependent and pathetic creature derived from Chilote[15] folklore is deprived of social identity and agency. It serves as a disturbing allegory for southern society, distant from so-called civilization and yet denied its own existence by the remote

138

and coercive influence of an exploitative Other. Poetry and literature also underscore contradictions at the heart of the South, a place that for contemporary Chileans can stir simultaneous imaginations of calm and war, isolation and confrontation, refuge and exile. The theme of uneven relationships between the countryside and the metropolis reappears in recent literature on southern identity, to the extent that some literary scholars have dubbed this identity *suralidad*. This term suggests a cross between southern identity, rurality, and surrealism. It is the title for a recent blog generated through project funding from Chile's National Council for the Arts (FONDART) to examine the production of southern identity according to its own regional patterns, and not merely as an off-shoot of a supposedly more inclusive national identity (Arellano & Riedemann 2008; See for examples Bohle 2002; Huirimilla 2005; Rupailaf 2003).

While Southerners are the focus of the imagined birth of the nation, a perspective against which the notion of *suralidad* is articulated, in recent decades industrial encroachments on indigenous lands have forced the massive migration of Mapuche people out of the region, especially during the Pinochet dictatorship. Primarily rural in 1970, by the 1992 national census collected two years after the transition to democracy, nearly 80% of the country's Mapuche population lived in urban areas, mainly in the Santiago Metropolitan Region (Chihuailaf 2006). Even as this represents a rapid cityward shift in the concentration of Mapuche society, out-migration of able-bodied workers of all backgrounds has persisted for well over a century, dispersing southerners throughout the country. In spite of diverse backgrounds, southerners have built a reputation for being hard-working and usually cheap labourers first in the nitrate, and later in the copper and gold mines in the far North, in the

agricultural heartland of the Central Valley, as well as in the textile mills and wealthy homes of larger urban centres. Renowned Chilean artist Violeta Parra's folkloric song *Exiliada del sur* pays emblematic homage to the rural South as a distant and nostalgic homeland to the industrialized nation. The ballad sings of exile, distance, and the loss of portions of oneself in towns throughout the South. Another of her songs, *Arauco tiene una pena*, condemns Chilean abuses of its largest indigenous group, verse after verse calling out the surnames of Mapuche families to rise up against a campaign of ethnic extermination. While the military and commercial occupation of the Araucanía was realized during the nineteenth century, its socio-cultural colonization would endure the entire twentieth century and beyond.

Coercive Land Tenure: Nineteenth & Early Twentieth Centuries

As indicated earlier, large estates in the former autonomous territories, from the level of Mariquina and Panguipulli northwards to the Biobío River, were only established in the past century. Lived memories of expulsions, massacres, and other fraudulent appropriations of the territory remind us of the unstable history of private property in this part of the South, especially when compared to elsewhere in the country. While popular media throughout the twentieth century typically characterized peasant agitators as violent provocateurs, scholars have shown that elite landowners, government officials, and the military were responsible for prolonged violence against poor residents of the countryside, especially south of the Central Valley (See Bengoa 2006; Camacho Padilla 2004; Millanguir Neutopan 2007). Their aggression throughout the last century makes it clear that

the state has had "tenuous administrative and coercive control over its southern frontier, which comprised fully a third of Chile's national territory" (Klubock 2010: 122). Comparing land tenure in southern regions to the long-established hacienda system in the Central Valley, historian Thomas Miller Klubock observes that social relations in rural areas of the South displayed comparatively high levels of conflict in the early part of the twentieth century.

As Chile Chico illustrates, capitalist expansion into the South not only displaced indigenous families, but those of humble settler background as well. Significantly, rural violence in the South directed by or towards the non-indigenous poor did not begin with communist unrest of the 1960s or military repression during the 1970s and 1980s. It too, followed the militarization of the Araucanía in the latter half of the nineteenth century. Since that period, violence "lay at the core of landowners' precarious and often fraudulent control of their property" (Klubock 2010: 130). The volatile nature of hacienda constitution in the Araucanía, and the historical aggression of state and elite actors in this and other southern regions, underscore the contested legitimacy and unfinished institution of state authority in a substantial portion of the southern countryside. Disputes over landowner legitimacy are therefore heavily invested with local memories lived by elders and transmitted to younger generations. These memories reveal tense relations throughout the twentieth century with the capital, and with capital itself. What is more, such relationships were not restricted to the South. The agrarian sector north of the Mapuche homeland also saw increased agitation on the part of the rural poor during that period. That was at the turn of the twentieth century, when global political trends injected class consciousness into the

perspectives of rural labourers. In this manner, the origins of social tensions in rural Chile cannot be traced to the occupation of the Araucanía alone.

In historian Gabriel Salazar's moving essay *Ser niño 'huacho' en la historia de Chile*[16] *(siglo XIX)* (2006[1990]), we are reminded that the seeds of working class solidarity in Chile were sown in the hacienda system. He reconstructs the cultural dimensions of parental and societal abandonment of masses of children during the nineteenth century. In the countryside, parental abandonment was historically produced by exploitative labour conditions, in which the *inquilino*[17] (tenant labourer) was trapped in servitude. At the bottom of the hacienda hierarchy were the nameless children of *inquilinos*, pawned for next to nothing into further servitude. Not all labourers were considered tenants, as a class of unattached workers roamed the countryside. These were often youth who had set off to survive by their own means. These so-called bastard children who raised themselves would become a significant but silent segment of Chile's population. Salazar's narrative reveals the enduring historical significance of that system. He asks what must have become of these ragged and roaming children when they grew up. Could anyone have really stopped them from becoming the political rebels, socialists, anarchists, and revolutionaries of the twentieth century (Salazar 2006[1990]: 63)? In other words, could the structural violence that framed their lives produce anything other than resentment towards those responsible for their exclusion? Could it have led to any other fate than the rise of the Popular Unity?

Peasant Radicals and Agrarian Reform: Mid-Twentieth Century

By the middle of the twentieth century, decades of arrests, exile, and general surveillance of "peasant radicals" constrained political activity within the agrarian sector on a national scale to the point that it was effectively driven underground. Shortly after the 1973 coup d'état, sociologist Norma Stoltz Chinchilla observed that previous non-participation on the part of peasants in political decision-making could not be attributed to simple indifference. Accounting for relatively weak political tendencies (i.e. unionizing, voting) among the rural poor prior to the 1960s, she explains that (Stoltz Chinchilla 1974):

> …it was not the peasants' "inherent apathy" or "irrational fatalism" or simple contentment with paternalism that accounted for their relative political weakness but the lack of outside support for carrying on a sustained struggle against an entrenched landed elite. As the grip of the elite began to weaken in the 1950's and as voting procedures were changed in 1958 making it easier for ballots to be secret, the support of peasants for parties of the center and left began to be reflected in voting statistics.

Presumably, 'outside support' that reached Chile's agrarian sector by the 1960s came from international pro-democracy and socialist initiatives. In her view, this helped sustain political struggle on the part of poor rural actors. This coincided with the culmination of populist tendencies like socialism, communism, and *indigenismo* throughout Latin America (See de la Peña 2005; Vargas Llosa 1996; Winn 2005). It was a time of increased literacy rates throughout the continent, that saw the expansion of print journalism and public radio broadcasts (Capello 2008). Printing industries in countries like Argentina,

Mexico, and Chile flourished, benefiting from the presence of leftist intellectuals exiled by the Spanish Civil War in the 1940s (Pellegrino Soares 2007). Popular culture also grew a political conscience during that period, as the neo-folklore and later the *Nueva Canción Chilena* movements emerged, whose proponents sang of social inequalities and the lives of the rural poor. Numerous artists openly campaigned for Allende's 1970 election, supporting the mission of the Popular Unity coalition to inculcate critical social thought among the popular masses (Bowen Silva 2008).

It was also a time of political investment in the poor, which accelerated with former Chilean president Eduardo Frei Montalva (head of state from 1964 to1970). In part keen to build a broad base of support for his newly formed Christian Democratic Party, and in part benefiting from U.S. President Kennedy's *Alliance for Progress* aid for Latin America initiative, former Chilean president Frei Montalva sought to appease popular dissatisfaction among marginal sectors, which had been escalating since as early as the 1920s. During the 1960s, U.S. foreign policy prioritized development aid throughout Latin America as a means of strengthening pro-U.S. trade, as well as of creating economic conditions that were believed likely to reduce communist mobilization and anti-U.S. sentiment (See Taffet 2007). For the first time in Chile on a large scale, Frei Montalva's implementation of the Popular Promotion initiative saw the creation of neighbourhood associations, sports clubs, the National Commission on Culture, and the formal initiation of agrarian reform policies. However, his approach to effecting social justice was by no means revolutionary. Anthropologist Julia Paley notes that Popular Promotion was a policy intended to "satisfy some of the objectives of the popular sectors without changing either the dominant political

regime or the prevailing economic system" (Paley 2001a: 54). From the perspective of a lifelong communist in the southern countryside, efforts at agrarian reform during that period were largely symbolic. Returning to Don Tito, who was first discussed in the Introduction to this thesis for his views on a lost generation among Chilean youth:

> **Don Tito:** *Frei [Montalva] started the opening up of a space for peasants to begin waking up, to become educated, he was preoccupied with peasant organization… They [the Christian Democratic Party] knew through the Catholic Church that the people of the countryside lived in extremely poor conditions. But [Frei and his party] wanted land distribution that was really a very slow agrarian reform, which wouldn't touch certain people very much. That is, that the land would be given out with the consent of its owners. For example, if a person has ten estates, he may keep most and give away only two. When Allende came along, he said to the landowners: "if you have ten estates, then nine should be for the workers and you can keep one for yourself.* (Personal Communication, February 2008).

Much like Don Tito surmises, the triumph of the socialist Popular Unity coalition over Frei-Montalva's more centrist Christian Democrats towards the end of 1970 accelerated changes in the social fabric of the countryside, propelling the dismantling of the hacienda system. While such changes were already underway at a much slower pace, early efforts had focused on a structural level, and did not contest elite perceptions of their own entitlement to lead the nation. The Popular Unity's rise to power at the height of the Cold War inspired retaliation by large estate owners, investors, and entrepreneurs alarmed by the threat that the political left posed to private property. These powerful interest groups would find support in the Nixon administration in the United States (NACLA 1972), whose

infamous legacy of intervening in foreign political processes figured importantly in the collapse of what political scientist Katherine Hite calls Chile's socialist 'romance' (Hite 2000). In a matter of a decade, U.S. policy on social development in the region had done a complete about-face, as the ambitious *Alliance for Progress* initiative was cancelled and the criminalization of socialist organization intensified.

With the declassification of Washington documents from the era, the exact role played by the United States in the 1973 coup d'état has come to light. Prior to the coup, the CIA deliberately interfered in public perceptions of the Popular Unity's mission, directly sponsoring political parties in opposition to Allende, and indirectly financing public disruptions such as the *transportista*[18] strikes of October 1972 and July 1973. These effectively halted the delivery of goods to their destinations and frustrated urban households in satisfying basic needs. The infamous March of the Empty Pots and Pans in early December 1971 (Crummett 1977; Tinsman 2006) gathered tens of thousands of women in city streets to protest the Popular Unity as anti-feminist. It was led by wives of leaders of right-wing parties who accepted payments from the United States to pursue social unrest in the goal of destabilizing Allende's government (Power 2002).

Meanwhile, in the name of anti-communist counter-insurgency, the U.S. hosted the training facilities for state authorities later responsible for tortures and disappearances throughout Latin America.[19] In his study of the region during the Cold War, historian Greg Grandin (2004) has uncovered CIA documents in which agents strategically deployed a campaign to produce dissension and doubt as a means of weakening Allende's presidency. The author of one Agency memo identifies the strategic use of rumour as a means of

poisoning commitment to Allende's cause and of leading the public to accept that confrontation was inevitable. Quoting the Central Intelligence Agency itself, Grandin reveals that among its main goals in Chile was to create popular conviction that Allende must be stopped. Rumour was therefore a deliberate mechanism used to discredit any parliamentary solution as unworkable, and to lead the population to believe that the inevitable result of these confrontations would be a military coup (Grandin 2004: 191). In their barest form, these tactics were psychological warfare committed to excusing a coup d'état.

Neoliberal Reform: Late Twentieth Century

Forty years since the rise and fall of the Popular Unity, much has changed in the southern countryside. Much has also been made of Chile's democratic transition. A surging economy has in recent decades transformed this narrow country pinched between the Andes and the rough waters of the South Pacific into a "free-market miracle" (Collins & Lear 1995). Calling it an 'economic jaguar,' the globally-minded have likened it to the 'Asian tigers' of the Pacific Rim. Advertisers in its southern regions have played up its image as the Switzerland of South America (presumably a peace-loving and picturesque business haven), even though it is not the only country to claim this title. The problem with such discourse is that it deceptively distances Chile from the social and economic problems that plague other countries in the region today, and naturalizes its relative stability (Cooper 2010). It also distorts the historic record by passing over the elite political strategies that

orchestrated this so-called miracle, diverting attention away from those upon whom this stability most depends: poor people who work in export industries.

Critics have noted that Chile's recent economic transformation owes less to divine intervention or the invisible hand of the market, than to targeted interventions by the state into the organization of the working class (Cypher 2004). In 1982, economist Milton Friedman was among the first to call the economic policy of the Pinochet regime a miracle. An American economist, Nobel laureate, and professor at the University of Chicago, he had trained over a half a dozen economic advisors to the dictatorship, his former students becoming a group of influential free market reformers known as the Chicago Boys. For decades prior to the 1973 coup, labour unions had progressively grown in size and influence to the point where mining, manufacturing, and agricultural worker syndicates were key stakeholders during the Allende administration (Gaudichaud 2005).[20] Under the subsequent military regime, union and party leaders faced torture, disappearance and exile, while their organizations were largely banned. This reality was by no means confined to Chile. When left-wing governments throughout the continent fell to military regimes between the 1960s and 1980s (ironically on the heels of U.S. *Alliance for Progress* investment in democratization efforts), political persecution of leftist organizations added terms like *desaparecido* to the world's vocabulary (J. Taylor 1998: 16). While most countries returned to some model of democratic order prior to the introduction of structural adjustment policies in the 1980s, this was not before organized opposition was effectively disbanded by military *juntas*, through imprisonment, torture, exile, and forced disappearances.

Not merely interested in liberating the market from government and social controls, the Pinochet "dictatorship introduced a 'flexible' labor system that left workers with the formal right of individual contract, but stripped them of any right to organize and bargain collectively" (Cypher 2004: paragraph 6). The world financial crisis of the early 1980s prompted further liberalizing measures modelled on structural adjustment policies occurring globally, including the decentralization of the health care and education sectors, and the privatization of pensions and health insurance (Riveros 1995). Formal pronouncements of equal access to quality public services were undermined by the delegation of their provision to vastly unequal municipalities. Despite the fact that the military regime overthrew (and assassinated) a socialist president, the economic model laid out by the Chicago Boys endured long after the dictatorship ended. International lending schemes designed to correct the world financial crisis and trumpeted by the Reagan and Thatcher administrations in the United States and Britain, involved loans made by the World Bank and International Monetary Fund to most developing countries during the global recession of that decade. The loans were expressly directed to paying off existing state debts that were then defaulting as a result of sky-rocketing interest rates. These new loans came with strict conditions meant to radically shrink swelling state bureaucracies, which under the auspices of modernizing the "Third World" had encouraged decades of heavy state borrowing from international lenders. Structural adjustment posed a paradigm shift in economic and political philosophy, setting new conditions on international investments and opening the floodgates for today's neoliberal era.

Feminist ethnographer Patty Kelly (whose work on regulated prostitution in southern Mexico is discussed in Chapter 1) cites David Harvey's definition of neoliberalism as structural adjustment's guiding theory for political economic practices. Its ensuing ideology poses that human well-being be pursued "by liberating individual freedoms and skills within an institutional framework characterized by strong private property rights, free markets, and free trade" (Harvey 2005: 3, quoted in Kelly 2008: 3). She elaborates that (2008: 10-11):

> Among the conditions were reductions in government spending and in wages, removal of trade barriers and of restrictions on foreign investment in industrial production and financial services, and the privatization of state-owned industries and a loosening of government oversight of prices, wages, and protections in favor of the "free" market. During the 1980s, more than seventy Third World nations submitted to neoliberal structural adjustment, effectively putting their economies into the hands of bureaucrats in Washington, D.C. A new era of economic globalization (and what astute observers would call "recolonization" of the developing world) had begun.

Kelly is among many scholars working in Latin America who argue that, from a human and ethnographic angle, neoliberalism is much more than simply a theory of political and economic practices (See also Biehl & Eskerod 2007; Goldstein 2004; Nash 2001; Paley 2001a; Sawyer 2004; Striffler 2002; Winn 2004). It is lived on a daily basis as the household consequences of a drive towards export-oriented growth, privatization of major industries, cuts to social spending, and widespread "deregulation of prices, wages, and environmental protections" (Kelly 2008: 3). In Latin America, neoliberalism's cultural

consequences are perhaps most evidently manifested in a surge in advertising and consumerism, bolstered by nearly unrestricted access to high-interest credit.

Kelly documents the associated 'feminization' of wage labour, as women take up the lowest paid positions in manufacturing, service sector, and informal work throughout the developing world. She argues that it is no accident that the emergent regulation of prostitution in the province of Chiapas coincides with a move to liberalize Mexico's economy. State-run brothels function to 'sanitize' central urban areas of the otherwise alarming increase in poor, migrant women (often from the countryside or poorer Central American states) seeking to earn an income by what means they can. Many of these women have been displaced by the growth of large agro-businesses that challenge the sustainability of small-plot farming. This process has seen peasants turn to harvesting monocrops like corn, and to herbicide-resistant seeds to maximize monetary gains. This has also rendered those who have historically lived off the land even more vulnerable to global fluctuations in food prices and availability of plots on which to grow food for family consumption. Suffice it to say, neoliberalism is an emergent, aggressive form of capitalism with "grave and far-reaching consequences" (Kelly 2008: 3).

The Rivers Region

In southern Chile, neoliberalism was the driving philosophy behind the privatization of freshwater resources, which occurred with the introduction of Pinochet's Water Code in 1981. Permits to exploit freshwater resources were not immediately sold to multi-national interests. Some locals who became aware of the privatization initiative were able to gather

the funds to apply for small concessions to adjacent rivers in order to satisfy their own needs. However, as was the case in the Panguipulli interior, only a handful of settlers managed to do so. This can be explained by their greater literacy rates and mobility between the countryside and cities, which likely exposed them to news of the developments. With few restrictions on the commodification of freshwater in Chile, nearly anyone may now purchase water exploitation permits on an open market. Multi-national corporations tend to be those with the disposable funds and greatest interest in accumulating rights to exploit rivers in order to install industrial sized hydroelectric facilities, a means of fuelling mining and industrial growth in central and northern regions of the country. Considered a clean renewable energy source that is relatively under-exploited in Chile, hydroelectric generation has particular appeal to business analysts, many of whom argue that expanding this sector would render the country less dependent on imported fossil fuels that currently sustain the growing economy. In the past decade in particular, hydroelectricity has been touted by policy-makers as a promising means of reducing Chile's carbon footprint. Such arguments imply that the economy functions in the best interests of a coherent national community that is capable of achieving consensus over its collective future, including over the allocation of resources for the greater common good. Of course, policy-makers are not based in the South.

In 2008, the Rivers Region which was host to my fieldwork activities, was in its first year as one of Chile's two new regional formations.[21] On more than one occasion, leaders of local civic associations explained to me that its formation emerged from aims to bring greater representation and funds to their largely rural communes. Previously, it had

belonged to a vast jurisdiction then extending between parallels 39° to 43° South, encompassing the continent's oldest temperate rainforests, and some of the country's most productive dairy districts, fishing ports, as well as the ranch lands of northern Patagonia. In contrast to the dominant industries of agriculture and fishing in its former Lakes Region, this new jurisdiction depends more heavily on timber extraction, much like the Araucanía and Biobío Regions directly to the North. With approximately 360,000 inhabitants, the Rivers Region is modest in population in comparison to its neighbours to both the north and south, the Araucanía and Lakes Regions respectively have double that number. The new region's twelve communes are municipal hubs through which state services such as public education and various development programs are deployed. Except for the regional capital in Valdivia, these hubs average between 10,000-15,000 residents, many of whom have moved from the countryside in recent decades. Economically and socially speaking, hubs such as San José de la Mariquina and the city of Panguipulli are therefore neither wholly rural nor essentially urban, as they retain various agrarian traits. Farmers' markets, for example, indicate the proximity that many residents retain with the land and its produce, as they sell homemade jams, cheeses, apple cider vinegars, fresh eggs, and seasonal products from the forest. Some residents distinguish these small cities from regional capitals by referring to them as semi-urban, a term that suggests their in-between position connecting countryside to city.

During my fieldwork, resident perceptions of the efficacy of the administrative initiative of creating the Rivers Region became a curious topic of conversation, especially given that former President Eduardo Frei Ruiz-Tagle (1994-2000) was appointed the new

region's first senator. He is the son of the earlier former President Eduardo Frei Montalva, who pursued Popular Promotion policies in the 1960s. The more recent former President Frei is a civil engineer specialized in hydraulics with a controversial influence over the country's hydroelectric industry (Moraga 2001: 41-56). The fact that the younger Frei would be one of the leading candidates in the 2010 presidential elections was only part of the interest in his person. It seemed to some of my research collaborators at the very least ironic that this man who served as Chile's second leader following the 1990 transition to democracy (1994-2000) was the current President of the Senate.[22] He was appointed the first senator of a new region named for a primary resource he had well-documented interests in industrially exploiting: rivers (Namuncura 1999). In the late 1990s, he was a key figure who pushed through the construction of the controversial Ralco and Pangue dams on the upper Biobío River. In spite of steadfast opposition by indigenous and environmentalist groups, he dismissed the director of the newly formed National Corporation for Indigenous Development (CONADI) when the director opposed the forcible displacement of several hundred Mapuche-Pehuenche residents living on lands slated for reservoirs. Frei also dismissed officials of the National Commission on the Environment (CONAMA) who expressed opposition to the large dams that would be constructed nearly thirty kilometres apart. In the winter of 2006, citizen apprehensions about the dams were validated. Heavy rains forced the company Endesa to open the gates to the over-flowing reservoirs, leading to the sudden flooding of low-lying sectors along the river all the way to the city of Concepción. In addition to countless animals, buildings, and farming supplies that were washed away, twenty-two people lost their lives.

Unlike the leaders of civic associations hoping for greater representation in national politics, many other residents of the Rivers Region indicated to me less idealistic expectations of the new jurisdiction. Years of experience had taught them that little comes for free in rural southern Chile, least of all greater influence in national politics. Observing that a handful of families, among them the Freis, tend to occupy important positions within the national government generation after generation, some people spoke bitterly about what they termed Chile's "political caste."

Conclusion: Measures of Discontent

Currently, infamous cases of industrial impacts on local water supplies are occurring in the desert regions of Chile's far North. It is feared by some that the Tatio geysers of the Atacama Desert, among the country's greatest tourist attractions and a rich scientific laboratory for life in one of the driest places on Earth, may soon disappear. Companies working in the nearby Chuquicamata copper mine endanger these natural phenomena, which spray thermal water from the ground at 4,300 metres above the sea. The mining operations perforate deep into the reservoirs feeding the geysers, extracting source water to use in the production of geothermal electricity to power the mining. Another case not far to the south of Chuquicamata spans both sides of the Chilean-Argentinian frontier. Opponents fear that the Pascua-Lama open-pit venture of Canada's mining operator Barrick Gold is destroying nearly twenty hectares of glacier. In spite of company assurances to the contrary, critical media and independent researchers indicate that agriculture in the adjacent Huasco

Valley is vulnerable to the release of cyanide, sulphuric acid, mercury, and other heavy metals (See Becerra 2011; Fields 2006).

Yet another case is that of HidroAysén in the far South, a hydroelectric project that aims to install five dams on two of the world's fastest flowing rivers: the Baker and the Pascua. During my fieldwork in 2008 and 2009, that project was frequently celebrated in advertisements on Chile's main television networks for its ambitious mission to build the world's longest high-tension power line, to stretch from Patagonia 2,300 kilometres to Chile's major cities, and still further to the mines of the North. With a generation capacity of more then 2,700MW of electricity, that initiative not only poses to negatively impact the tourism industry that helps sustain Patagonia, it would involve the clear-cutting of a ninety metre wide corridor through hundreds of kilometres of officially protected temperate rainforest. The corridor would also cut through ancestral Mapuche territory in the Biobío, Araucanía, and Rivers Regions. In May 2011, this joint project between the companies Endesa (the majority stakeholder and currently a subsidiary of the Italian conglomerate ENEL) and Colbún S.A. was approved for construction. The approval occurred in spite of mounting public concerns about the negative impacts of hydroelectricity in Patagonia. It also added kindle to the fire of protests gathering storm nationally as part of a vibrant student strike that would last much of that year. However, in the region in which the projects are slated to occur, protests did not reach alarming proportions until the late summer of 2012, nearly ten months later. These were not triggered by the HidroAysén controversy, but rather by a call for the return of regional subsidies to alleviate the strain of rising fuel prices on households and local businesses. Nevertheless, among demands made

by protesters was that Patagonians be adequately consulted on all mega-projects planned for their region.

While activists and critical media highlight fundamentally anti-democratic features of the current political system, as mentioned in the Introduction, I propose looking at such concerns from a cultural rather than structural perspective. This approach problematizes the seeming complicity of many lower and middle class Chileans in perpetuating a political order that appears to undermine their own material interests. In this vein, the following chapters explore to what extent current industrial incursions in Mariquina and Panguipulli are experienced as the culmination of historical processes that I have described in this and preceding chapters.

Notes: Chapter 3

[1] Under the title *¡…Escucha Winka…!* (2006), the authors of four essays on Mapuche national history and an epilogue on the future conceive of true self-determination outside of the institutionality of Chile's state apparatus.

[2] In the Mapuche language, Mapudungun, its own name signifies the language of the land or Earth.

[3] My translation: "In the depth of nameless America, lay Arauco amid dizzying waters, isolated by all the cold of the planet. Look at the great solitary South… All is silence of water and wind. But in the leaves the warrior watches. Between the larch trees a cry. Tiger

eyes in the snowy heights. Spot the resting spears. Hear the rustle of arrows cutting through the air."

[4] The term *cacique* is still widely used in Chile to refer to indigenous chiefs of an earlier era. I heard contemporary elders refer to prestigious men of their parents' and grandparents' generations with this term, which also implied a Mapuche leader from earlier generations who took multiple wives, expanding his alliances through matrimonial ties.

[5] Arauco was the original term used by Europeans to denote a vast territory inhabited by ancestors of today's Mapuche society, while Araucanía is the name of a contemporary administrative region that encompasses substantially less territory than that originally occupied by Mapuche ancestors.

[6] My translation: "Without helmets, shields, or armour / they begin the dangerous battle / raw, wild, hard-fought and bloody."

[7] The law's formal name is the Law on Terrorist Conduct (*Ley de Conductas Terroristas*) No. 18.314.

[8] My translation: "The lit torches fell over the population, the Carmenga neighbourhood was wiped out, the churches sacked and profaned and the clergy slaughtered. The Spanish valiently struggled during an hour, until giving their lives. The Indians, who were in control, prepared to celebrate their victory and vengeance against their oppressors. They drank themselves drunk, and gathering together 400 women and 42 children, they stripped these of their clothes and submitted them to great cruelties and taunting. Once finished the orgy, they divided the captives among the headmen to sell as slaves."

[9] While the term Mapuche translates from the Mapudungun language to mean the "people of the land" (or Earth), the older ethno-denomination of Reche signalled the "true people" or the "pure people."

[10] Known paternalistically as the Commission of Indigenous Protectors (*Commisión de los Protectores Indígenas*).

[11] My translation: "glorious past and silenced present have been features of the contemporary treatment of the indigenous question."

[12] The Comission on Historical Truth and a New Deal with the Indigenous Peoples was created in 2001 to prepare a report that would bring to light historical relationships between

diverse indigenous peoples and the Chilean state. Among its main objectives was to enlist working groups and plenary discussions with affected populations to develop a plan for transformed relations in the future.

[13] My translation: "…it gave all the lands to an anonymous society named the "Baker Lake Extractive Society." They entered by way of the sea and advanced through the cold wildnerness, only to encounter a prosperous settlement that lived in the happiness of a utopian community…They were declared illegal, like so many other times in the History of Chile, "occupants without permit", trespassers of property not their own."

[14] A shortened way of saying the National Reorganization Process, this is the term used by Argentina's most recent military junta (1976-1983) to refer to its dictatorship.

[15] From the island of Chiloé.

[16] My translation: Being a Bastard Child in the History of Chile (XIX Century)

[17] Words relating to *inquilino* (i.e. *inquilinaje*, *inquilinato*) refer to tenant labour arrangements that were characteristic of the hacienda or latifundist system.

[18] These were mainly truckers and taxi drivers paid to not work.

[19] One in seven commanders of DINA (Chile's intelligence agency during the dictatorship and the principal authority behind human rights abuses) was a graduate of the CIA's Army School of the Americas formerly located in Panama http://www.derechos.org/soa/chile-not.html. For a brief summary of the facility, see Raymond Ker at http://www.mediamonitors.net/raymondker3.html. Both sites accessed 1 January 2010.

[20] As Franck Gaudichaud (2005) and others like María Angélica Illanes (2002) argue, it is important to not mistake the political involvement of labour unions for being a 'dangerous army of communists,' as the dictatorship later attempted to portray them.

[21] In the far North of the country the other newly formed Arica and Parinacota Region was formerly part of the Tarapacá Region.

[22] Until constitutional reforms of 2005, former presidents of the republic could choose serve as senators according to the 1980 Constitution. This right was withdrawn over concerns of its anti-democratic nature. Senator Frei is among those to have taken advantage of this opportunity.

Chapter 4: Labour & Landscape

El liberalismo en Chile fue señorial y, por tanto, incapaz de conjugar el concepto de libertad. El caballero de apellidos era liberal en lo económico y conservador en lo social, y transmitió esa herencia al Estado moderno.

Liberalism in Chile was feudal, and as such, was incapable of incorporating the concept of liberty. The noble gentleman was economically liberal but socially conservative, and he transmitted this legacy to the modern state.

-José Bengoa, *La Comunidad Reclamada* (2006: 46)

This chapter explores the extent to which rural southerners relate current industrial incursions that affect their homes and livelihoods, to macro-historical processes already described, such as colonialism, fascism, and neoliberalism. By keying into the uneven ability of southerners to have their pronunciations on the contested past heard, I identify elements of a dominant narrative about the role of the state in southern life. This narrative endorses the presence of a heavy-handed authority as protector of industry and commercial activities, but which otherwise does not meddle in local affairs. Dating as far back as the military occupation of the Araucanía, it is especially apparent in contrasting stories shared locally about the dispossession of Mapuche territory and motivations behind mid-twentieth century worker revolts in the countryside. While this narrative bears similarities with what some anthropologists call a 'frontier myth' structuring Native/non-Native relations in mid-western North America, it is also particular to Chile's class segregation. Rather than presenting a structural analysis of this narrative here, I relate it to feelings of displacement,

disorientation, and loss expressed by people affected by industrial interventions near their homes. While it can be seen to silence local memories of state repression and the abuse of power, I question the extent to which this narrative actually prohibits younger generations from developing critical perspectives on the contested past and on that past's impacts on civic life today. By identifying political subjectivity where it might otherwise seem absent, we glimpse the limits of oral history in answering questions about memory transmission.

I begin here by taking a closer look at people who neither openly support nor oppose industrial incursions, who appear indifferent to such developments in spite of evident reasons to be concerned about the future well-being of their families and local communities. As mentioned already, I am particularly interested in this broad group of people who have little in common except for a desire to "*not get involved*" in public life (*a no meterse*). I am not alone in this interest, as political scientists have observed rising political withdrawal in diminishing voter participation rates nationally (See Posner 1999). Meanwhile, other scholars have observed a general sense of malaise with democracy that is reflected in U.N. human development indicators (See Lechner 2002). However, few studies directly relate weakened interest in affirming electoral rights to the lived experiences of citizens who retract from civic concerns. An ethical conundrum emerges, in which scholars who study the social impacts of military repression and neoliberal reforms may unwittingly neglect to recognize agency among the apparently silent majority. If we do not engage seeming political indifference on the terms by which it is experienced, can we reasonably make empirical conclusions about it?

Symbolic Nature

In recent years, citizen organizations in the Rivers Region have publicly denounced corporate misconduct and state collusion with multi-national forestry plantations and hydroelectric generation in the region. Two groups that oppose industrial impacts in Mariquina and Panguipulli are the anti-contamination movement Action for the Swans (*Acción por los Cisnes*) based in Valdivia, and the newly re-established Koz Koz Parliament (*Parlamento de Koz Koz*) based in the city of Panguipulli. The former emerged following the Celco Valdivia pulp mill's start of operations in 2004, from which time the mill has dumped toxic waste into the Cruces River. The latter brings together Mapuche communities from throughout the commune of Panguipulli. Its name pays homage to a meeting that occurred in 1907, in which the forefathers of today's members participated to denounce colonial tactics for removing Mapuche people from their lands (See Díaz Meza 2007[1907]). At the time of my research, the number of residents affected by industrial interventions who did not attend events organized by these and similar citizen initiatives was substantially larger than those who did. While the lack of mobilization against industrial incursions among these people was generally interpreted by company and state officials as implied consent to corporate activities, I demonstrate here that this perspective simplifies the social landscape. Specifically, it masks an important element of the dominant narrative about the role of the state in southern life, a narrative rooted in a complex history of alliances and tensions between area residents, state agents, and private interests. I am referring to expectations among the national elite that rural southerners comply with

163

industrial projects for the greater common good of the nation, even though the South's inclusion in that imagined community has historically been on unequal terms.

Where Swans Lived

In January 2008, my brother-in-law Camilo began daily radiation therapy to reduce the size of malignant tumours engulfing his body. Since coming out of remission eight months earlier, he had been taking chemotherapy in the form of pills. Doctors were uncertain about a treatment plan, insisting that colon cancer at seventeen was something they had never seen. Not even the specialist from Santiago, who visited to learn of the case of a young man with an old man's disease, could give an informed prognosis. Tumours now lined his spine and were penetrating his lungs. This new stage of daily out-patient treatment took Camilo fifty kilometres away to Valdivia each day; on a crowded minibus this was more than an hour's drive from San José de la Mariquina. The small buses that shuttle between the town and city stop at dozens of unplanned junctions in between, loading and unloading passengers with all their ungainly cargo. If I did not drive him, Camilo would have ridden those minibuses alone every single day, scarcely able to walk between the hospital and bus terminal due to nausea and pain. Struggling to pay for his treatments, nobody in the family could take time off work to join him, and even affording the bus fare would have been difficult. On one of those unpleasant trips, as I slowed the vehicle at the two decaying bridges marked at Baden, my brother-in-law offered light conversation. Pointing to the wide basin over which the bridges cross an offshoot of the Valdivia River,

164

which is formed at the confluence of the Cruces and Calle Calle Rivers, he said: *"Before, swans used to swim here, this whole place was full of swans."*

Those were the thousands of black-necked swans (*Cygnus melancoryphus*)[1] described in Chapter 1, who in the span of a few short months in 2004 perished due to what scientists controversially attributed to the lack of edible algae. Their food supply had disappeared suddenly within weeks of the Celco Valdivia pulp mill's start of operations. That plant still releases its effluence into the Cruces River, although in supposedly more controlled concentration, at a location little more than ten kilometres upstream from San José de la Mariquina. The swans died the year before Camilo was diagnosed, at a time when he and his teenaged friends enjoyed jumping into the river as a summer pastime. I knew about the swans that he described tenderly, that overflowed in these wetlands not long before. In fact, I wondered about them almost obsessively, not just about what really happened to them, but why so few people in San José seemed to be wondering with me. At this timely mention of the swans, I ventured to ask, *"Before what?"* Normally our conversation was mechanical on those trips that would shrink his spinal tumours enough so that Camilo could walk for another year. We spoke about items for me to pick up for the house while he was in treatment, as if the daily trek could become more bearable if it felt like a casual errand. Instructions for where to find the tastiest country eggs and the special kind of nails needed for repairing the roof, were interrupted only by the unpleasant details of his growing physical discomfort.

Yet, I already knew Camilo's answer. *Before they disappeared.* The avoidable nature of their disappearance lingered in my anticipation that he would say something more

than marvel at their loss. If Camilo ever wondered, as I did, whether his cancer had anything to do with environmental contamination, he betrayed no sign of suspicion then or any time before he passed away two years later. Even on the odd occasion when I prodded him directly, he only paused before shrugging off my concern. What difference would it make to identify a man-made source of his misfortune, except perhaps to provoke more bitterness than that already festering? Like his illness, for him the dead swans were inexplicable. Camilo's disinterest in articulating a causal connection between cruel developments in his own life and broader socio-political developments impacting the health of the area in which he lived, does not mean that there were none. Nor does it mean that he was ignorant to the geo-political processes that made such connections possible in my mind, even though he had probably never heard of structural adjustment or neoliberalism. These macro-economic policies of recent decades ensured that without private insurance, Camilo had minimal public health benefits with which to fight his illness, a reality that had denied him chemotherapy the first time a baseball-sized tumour was extracted from his colon. They also promoted a vision common in his social milieu, that degradation of the natural environment may be merely the unfortunate but necessary price of progress.

Camilo was not oblivious to the fact that a military coup had led to a considerable reorganization of the social landscape in preceding decades, even though he seemed to only vaguely understand the nature of this rapid social change. I knew this because one morning at breakfast, he asked his parents to confirm the date of the military coup. He had debated this with friends the previous night, and had bet a buddy that it did not occur in the 1980s. Camilo's offhand clarification that the coup happened earlier than 1982 launched his

166

parents into descriptive accounts of nightly curfews and arbitrary intimidation by soldiers, endured throughout much of the 1970s and well into the 1980s. In the three months I had lived in their home, the greatest expression of anti-Pinochet sentiment I had yet encountered was a scribble that somebody had made on a calendar still hanging from the previous year, spelling out the name of Chile's then recently elected president, who was leader of the Socialist Party and the *Concertación* coalition government: B-A-C-H-E-L-E-T.

At the time, political observers wondered whether the 2006 election of Michelle Bachelet signalled Chile's emergent reckoning with its authoritarian past. This was because she was a returned exile and torture survivor, whose father had been the head of the Allende administration's Food Distribution Office. Her father perished during incarceration, after months of torture following the coup. From the kitchen table of Camilo's family home, I wondered whether her name on the calendar signalled anything more than Camilo's father's unquestioned commitment to the *Concertación*. On later occasions, a more obvious gesture of political affiliation emerged when, with each election, an oversized political placard was installed in front of the house. Camilo's older brother reasoned to me that bursts of party allegiance were inspired by their father's loyalty to that coalition's role in negotiating the democratic transition, and not by any reflection on campaign platforms. In the elder son's view, their father was on the *Concertación*'s mailing list, which meant that in years of election his greatest forms of civic engagement were to peg a political placard to the house and vote.

Upon Camilo's query about the year of the coup, his parents' memories of the military regime were initially directed to everyone gathered at the table. However, they

were swiftly channelled in my direction, as I remained the only person alert to this gush of political expression where it was normally absent. Camilo's attention and that of his siblings was quickly lost to a breakfast television show blasting at full volume from across the room. As his parents recalled life under the regime, Camilo periodically turned from the television to pipe in if he recognized a story heard before, or to briefly react to details being shared for the first time. Finally, as he rose from the table he confirmed with his mother that his buddy's family was known in town for being *Pinochetista*.[2] This detail seemed to him to be explanation enough for why someone could be unaware that 1973 marked the start of the Pinochet regime.

Even though Camilo had not been entirely sure about the year in which the former dictator led the Armed Forces in the takeover of a democratically elected government, he seemed proud to not be oblivious to this significant event experienced by older generations. He did win his bet, after all. However, it is intriguing that Camilo's peer group which had just graduated from high school, was so uncertain as to cast bets on the decade of the military coup. It is intriguing not only for what it communicates about formal historical and political education in the post-dictatorship period (discussed in Chapter 5), but for how distant the regime was felt to be by these youth who were born on the heels of the democratic transition. Their perspective commands us to consider how impacts of the military regime on southern life—and by association the penetration of state and capital into the region—*are* known locally.

Understatements & Understories

While Camilo lamented the swans' deaths, he did not denounce the most likely cause of the disaster. This made his views on industrial contamination of the environment relatively subdued compared to views held by other people impacted by the Celco Valdivia pulp mill's operations. His reluctance to align himself with any of the competing interests over the mill's presence reflects a curious dynamic, in which differing perspectives on industrial contamination were seen by many in his social circle to be mutually exclusive. In San José de la Mariquina, I often found that residents spoke about the social well-being that comes with having stable employment as somehow in conflict with the physical well-being that comes with living in an uncontaminated environment. Recall that San José is caught at the intersection between the benefits and hazards of the plantation industry. It is not only home to the pulp mill's principal workforce, but the centre of commercial activities that benefit from dozens of truckloads piled high with pine and eucalyptus logs that rumble through town daily, en route from properties throughout the commune to the mill. Men who do not work directly for Celco Valdivia benefit from the mill's presence through employment on contracted work teams dedicated to chopping lumber and readying it for loading onto trucks. Others come from throughout the region to work in road construction, and many women have secured financial autonomy by running small businesses out of their homes, such as convenience stores and boarding houses for out-of-town labourers. By no means wealthy, San José nonetheless offers economic opportunities lacking in many neighbouring towns, and the pulp mill plays a key role in the resulting social stability. Almost everyone I asked described to me the period prior to the plant's installation as a time

when their town was rife with social problems, a time when murders and violent crimes are remembered to have far exceeded rates today.

Curiously, San José is fifty kilometres closer to the site at which the mill's liquid waste enters the Cruces River than many of the plant's most vocal opponents, these being tourism operators, ecologists, and other concerned citizens based in the city of Valdivia. Mariquina's semi-urban hub is also twenty-five kilometres closer and more directly exposed to the toxic effluence, than the small-scale fishing and Mapuche communities near the coastal villages of Mehuín and Mississippi. These have long opposed the company's proposal to channel the plant's waste for dumping into the ocean. Beginning in the late-1990s, residents in communities affected by the proposed liquid waste duct prohibited access by scientists to sites necessary to collect technical data for elaborating an Environmental Impact Assessment. For over a decade, their vigilance prevented the company from soliciting regulatory approval for its original waste-disposal plan. In this fashion, Mariquina's coastal residents have staged one of southern Chile's longest opposition movements to industrial incursions.

At social gatherings that I attended in San José de la Mariquina between 2008 and 2010, contradictory understandings of environmental contamination were normally understated, permeating rather than disrupting everyday life. A conversation overheard at a New Year's barbecue began with a discussion about whether the mill's air or water pollution was more hazardous to one's health. Attention then turned to enthusiastic descriptions by young men who worked in the mill, as they raved about the dessert tray in its cafeteria. This was followed by someone recounting a rumour supposedly learned from a

170

friend's cousin. In the story, an unknown San Josino (as residents call themselves) had been picked up while hitch-hiking, and his driver happened to work as an engineer in the pulp mill. The engineer conceded to his passenger that only one of three budgeted filters for reducing the toxic waste dumped was actually installed in the Celco Valdivia plant. While I was scandalized by how much waste could have been so easily prevented from entering the river, my friends heard a different message. They inferred that middle-management had pocketed tens of thousands of dollars designated for two additional filters that had been anticipated by upper-management. In this interpretation, the root cause of contamination was local corruption, and not rather a systemic push by government and the business sector alike to accelerate Chile's industrial output at all costs, even while lacking regulatory approval to dump waste into the river. My friends' reaction to this story (which had taken on the form of urban legend), reveals that in spite of concerns over the mill's impacts on local health, residents of San José expected little from the state by way of enforcing compliance with environmental regulations. Their focus on the local scale (i.e. on greedy plant managers), suggests ample awareness of abuses of power in environmental regulating mechanisms, but also recognition that the rich and powerful are not alone in exploiting the system for their own gain.

Conversations of this sort between friends and neighbours indicate that at least during my time there, San Josinos were by no means uncritically complicit with the plantation industry. They wondered among themselves about the social implications of their rapidly changed landscape. Over a period of several years exploring such themes in their town, I never once encountered someone insistent on defending the company against all

171

criticism. Friends who worked in the mill routinely complained about the poor treatment of employees. In fact, praise of the dessert tray was the only positive judgment I can recall among workers. Nevertheless, much town talk was dedicated to the suspected misdeeds of municipal politicians, bosses, work colleagues, and neighbours, indicating widespread distrust not only of leadership at the local scale, but towards one another. In spite of appearances from a distance, we would be hard-pressed to call people like Camilo and his neighbours in San José indifferent to the risks of industrial developments near their homes. Nevertheless, compared to protesters in Valdivia and in coastal communities, this apparent withdrawal from debates invites a more nuanced consideration of interests caught up in industrial developments.

In a call for new approaches to understanding environmental conflicts, anthropologist Jake Kosek (2006) appeals to what he terms 'understories' for appreciating how diverse groups stake discursive claim to the physical landscape, fixing their social identities in the seeming permanence of nature. His work addresses heated clashes over forest resources in northern New Mexico, leading him to argue that competing stories about forests and the people who live near them, expose the material and symbolic 'natures' of race, class, and nation in the United States. Kosek's work is a useful model for exploring local responses to industrial incursions in Mariquina and Panguipulli. His example is especially pertinent for bringing together seemingly unrelated topics (i.e. heroin addiction, local disdain for Smokey Bear, and racist notions of conservation promoted by the U.S. Forestry Service). In so doing, he demonstrates how that which appears in conventional logic not to overlap, often co-exists in everyday life in surprisingly inter-related ways. From

172

this perspective, stories told about dead swans in a contaminated wetland, about potential causes of a teenager's terminal illness, or about a father's twenty-year commitment to a lagging political coalition, not to mention a bet over the decade of Chile's military coup, may indeed belong together. Similarly, stories about mouth-watering pastries, missing waste filters in a pulp mill, and the relative hazards of air versus water pollution, also convey interwoven perspectives on community well-being. They overlap not merely because they derive from members of a single family or peer group, but because they reveal local processes for making sense of a community's location in rapidly changing physical and social landscapes.

Disorientations

According to Kosek, paying attention to how people talk about the natural world can expose 'symbolic natures' of communities that compete for control over material spaces. He describes symbolic natures as cultural frameworks by which belonging to and exclusion from a given place are conceived and naturalized, shaping beliefs about and behaviour towards the physical world. They are evident in stories and statements about who belongs where. Most importantly, such symbolism about nature is inseparable from material life, as symbols may ultimately "legitimize injustices, constitute exclusion, and reproduce inequalities" (Kosek 2006: 23). For example, as environmentalists and forestry agents tell Kosek that New Mexico's Native American and Hispano communities have lost traditional ways of life, he finds that such perceptions are actually justifications for the state's removal of the ability to control grazing, game, and timber rights from locals.

In Mariquina, similar types of inequality confronted me one afternoon in the frustration of an elderly Mapuche man when I stopped to ask for directions. I was lost on a country road, on my way to a rural school near the wetland sanctuary. Some fifteen years before, on the heels of the democratic transition and encouraged by Chile's relatively favourable business environment, multi-national companies leased or purchased rural properties throughout the commune. Native forests were cleared and progressively replaced by the timber plantations that stretched out all around us.

-Fieldnotes Summary, near Iñipulli, Mariquina, November 2009

From atop his horse he looked about, agitated that he could barely tell which way he was headed anymore ("Ya, ni sé para donde voy"). His words communicated more than momentary disorientation. The landscape no longer offered what he understood it should bear, socially, physically, and metaphysically. Symbols of familiarity and direction in the form of paths and landmarks had been erased. In their place were symbols of private property and economic productivity in the form of barbed-wire fences that barred access and men with hard-hats who laboured on heavy machinery. Row upon row of towering eucaplyptus marked this new symbolic order, in which the geometric lines of foreign tree species let no sunlight reach the soil, and left no underbrush, no wildlife, no shortcuts behind plantation fences, and nothing to orient human interactions. Through his tears, he said there should be a hill nearby, and the school beyond that, but he could not even measure the direction to head in by following the sun's trajectory.

Without putting his critique into abstract arguments about colonialism or neoliberalism, the old man's exasperation nevertheless disputed a strictly economic and profit-driven vision

174

imposed upon this natural space. Unlike mainly urban activists who I often heard speak of this territory as stolen from the Mapuche people, invoking ancestral rights protected in international protocols,[3] the elderly man merely shuddered in bewilderment as he took in our surroundings.

I was familiar with Mapuche communities along the coast, to where the old man was headed when our paths crossed. At his frustration with going about life in an unrecognizable place, I understood that he wept less out of concern over not being able to help me, than by a generalized sense of loss. Friends living in indigenous communities in both Mariquina and Panguipulli had indicated to me the increasing scarcity of berries, wild mushrooms, and clean-burning firewood. Such forest products were integral to the survival of families at the margins of the national economy, through the direct sustenance they offer and because their sale can garner modest revenue. Meanwhile, birds and other wildlife had retreated into what biodiverse forest remained, bringing with them warning calls for strange visitors, announcements of weather changes, and a myriad of other meanings for human neighbours. Disorientation was therefore a compound experience, involving the loss of more than physical landmarks for knowing one's path on a road.

Relating the impacts of plantations on Mapuche communities in the Araucanian commune of Collipulli, environmental anthropologist Maria Isabel du Monceau describes accompanying Mapuche women as they pointed out *huallizadas* (a term denoting vestiges of native forest), places in which they picked herbs and other forest fruits (2008: 167). These women anticipated finding spring water in such areas, as well as plants, pollinators, and insects that indicate an ecosystem's health. In Mariquina, since the early 2000s native

175

forests have been largely reduced to Mapuche communities along the coast. An indigenous artisan who recently moved to San José to be nearer to her children who worked in town, brought me to her coastal home to harvest the fine *pil pil* vine[4] (*Campsidium valdivianum*), used in basket-making particular to sectors immediately north of Valdivia.

-Fieldnotes Summary, near Panguimeo, Mariquina, October 2008

> *Born in Santiago, Sra. Amelia spent most of her childhood orphaned in the capital, alternating between life on the street and domestic labour. In the mid-1960s, she married a southern man employed in the same sandwich shop as her. When he suffered an eye injury and lost his job, they sought help in his Mapuche-Lafkenche[5] community. She would live on a mountain overlooking the South Pacific for the next forty years. In Mariquina, also known as Mariküna and Mariküga in Mapudungun,[6] Sra. Amelia adapted to life among these 'people of the land,' for whom in the 1960s the most regular contact with Chilean society was precarious communication with a mission seven kilometres away. Upon arriving at the Mariquina train station, she and her husband travelled by foot into the coastal cordillera to a sector so isolated it took two days to arrive. In order to purchase small comforts that reminded her of city life, such as bread and milk that had not been mixed with fistfuls of salt in order to keep, she adapted traditional basket-weaving into artistic designs for sale in town.*

> *Mission nuns were among the few to circulate with any frequency between town and such remote sectors; taking pity on the poor city girl isolated among 'uncivilized Indians,' they brought her products to market. Today, weaving pil pil hands crafts for sale to tourists is an important means by which Sra. Amelia and her neighbours survive from the fruits of native forests. While it has not enabled her children to remain in the*

community, it has helped supplement their urban salaries, as she contributes money for her grandchildren's schooling in the city.

Today, Sra. Amelia is among community elders who dress modestly according to Mapuche values, and who can still speak Mapudungun, even though she learned it in her late teens. She has taught dozens of neighbours her techniques for shaping *pil pil* vine weavings into fish, swans, and miniature trees, even though *pil pil* was traditionally only used for making containers to store food and grain. Nowadays, such adaptations to traditional basket-weaving are considered characteristic of indigenous groups along Mariquina's coast, as these objects are more marketable to tourists than are plain baskets (See Saldivia 2011: 160-161). While the most popular innovations emerged from Sra. Amelia's particular life history, *pil pil* hands crafts depend on what scholars might call indigenous or traditional ecological knowledge (T.E.K. & I.K.), which is not unlike what anthropologists have variously called habit, cultural, sensory, and embodied memories (See Connerton 1989; Nazarea 2006; Seremetakis 1994; Stoller 1995). Marine resource expert Fikret Berkes offers a working definition of T.E.K. which emphasizes forms of knowledge that reinforce relationships between humans, other living beings, and the natural environment. In his words, it is "a cumulative body of knowledge, practice, and belief, evolving by adaptive processes and handed down through generations by cultural transmission" (Berkes 2008:7). We observe it in the daily practices by which people like Sra. Amelia relate to *huallizadas*. We might also recognize it in the words of the elderly man atop his horse, and of others stripped of social milieus fundamental to the transmission of cultural knowledge. For such people, symbolic dislocation from the natural landscape is

177

expressed not merely as physical disorientation, but sometimes confronted as an attack on one's very existence.

The Ancestral Territory

This attention for talk about natural landscapes finds a curious communion with anthropologists interested in storytelling among indigenous peoples. For example, Keith Basso's (1996) work on place-names among the Western Apache of Arizona treats landscape as inextricably connected to language. He argues that through stories about places and their names, those who dwell in the land apprehend their own relationships to geography, as well as their attachments to one another. Du Monceau (2008) reinforces this perspective as she observes social impacts of the massive displacement of Mapuche society out of rural areas in recent decades. Younger generations in particular have been deprived of lived relationships to the land, as well as milieus in which knowledge about how to survive directly from its fruits may foster transmission of the native language. This displacement contributes to poverty and family disintegration, as communities lose sustainable agricultural practices and enter cities at the bottom of labour and housing hierarchies (See Boccara & Seguel-Boccara 1999). For many, the ensuing loss of identity and of ability to reproduce one's social world undermines well-being. In du Monceau's view, a deficit of vocabulary and of stories connecting urban Mapuche youth to the land has created a sense of lost nature that fuels recent movements to reclaim Mapuche territory. Describing 'young leaders with old memories,' she argues that indigenous conceptualizations of nature have not themselves been lost among urban Mapuche, but that they have been relocated in a

process of re-narrating Mapuche history to confront the disturbing dispossession of territory and way of life.

To some extent, du Monceau's analysis coincides with Pierre Nora's argument (1989; mentioned in Chapter 2), that the loss of so-called peasant culture produces a corresponding loss of genuine environments, *milieux*, for memory transmission. He offers insight into how a decline in ritualized relationships to the land may provoke the active buttressing and even essentialization of indigenous identity, which has been observed among urban activists in recent decades to a greater extent than among rural Mapuche communities.[7] In this light, the emergence of political struggles for a Mapuche nation, especially since an indigenous resurgence throughout the Americas expanded during the early 1990s (See Bengoa 2000), is closely related to the rapid urbanization of indigenous society. Perhaps more precisely, it follows on the heels of the increased exposure of Mapuche people to mass culture and capitalist market exchange. In Nora's terms, with the rise of consumer society, the re-narration of a collective history described by du Monceau would involve the congealing of Mapuche identity in objects that come to embody a memorial consciousness, as a means of guarding against modernity's disregard for the particularity of local historical experiences. This is not a mere re-location of indigenous conceptualizations of nature, but their dynamic adaptation to transforming social and political frameworks that threaten to assimilate Mapuche identity into the Chilean nation.

An important object in which I would argue that the Mapuche political imaginary has been increasingly invested is the notion of the 'ancestral territory,' a pan-Mapuche concept of central importance to indigenous activists in reclamations of land and culture.[8]

179

By suggesting that the ancestral territory has become a *lieux de mémoire*, I am not denying that the historical home of the Mapuche people is a very real geographic space. Rather, I draw attention to an important relationship between migration toward cities, greater involvement in wage labour and commercial markets, and emergent forms for engaging in civic and political life. Urban spaces not only bring members of Mapuche society into greater physical proximity. In my own observations, the loss of traditional forms of socialization has inspired many urban Mapuche to attend NGO-hosted seminars on indigenous culture and language, as well as to participate in marches denouncing state repression, and to pursue legal proceedings for the recognition of treaty rights. Mapuche and some non-Mapuche participants in this study also engaged in spiritual ceremonies no longer observed in their home communities. For people physically removed from direct relationships to the land for sustenance, the idea of an ancestral homeland is not only an affective symbol of displacement, but a compelling invocation of a desired return.[9]

In this experience, the depletion of native forests by the plantation industry increasingly underscores concerns over the ecological integrity of Mapuche territory. An important sound bite for those struggling for recognition of the Mapuche nation, is that since the Araucanía's annexation, land in Mapuche hands has been reduced to only 500,000 of an original 10 million hectares once controlled by indigenous groups.[10] In this vision of the ancestral territory, the unit of social and political action is the Mapuche people, located in cities and the countryside throughout southern Chile, as well as in the capital of Santiago and internationally. In contrast, for Sra. Amelia the value of native forests was not as vestiges of ancestral territory reclaimed by urban activists, or as islands of biodiversity in a

growing sea of monocrop plantations, defended by ecologists and conservationists. In fact, neither 'ancestrality' nor 'biodiversity' figured in her vocabulary. For her, the unit of action was herself and her local community, for whom going about an indigenous way of life involved measures and corrective mechanisms for evaluating and nurturing forest health.[11] However, the degree to which this involved a political consciousness about industrial threats to native forests was debatable, becoming apparent during our trip to harvest *pil pil*, in comments on diminishing ground cover.

-Fieldnotes Summary, near Panguimeo, Mariquina, October 2008

> *Some vegetation, such as the colihüe (Chusquea culeou, a bamboo-like shrub common throughout the South), has ceased to grow near her coastal home in the past decade. She speculated that maybe a disease wiped it out. As we wound along the road back to San José, driving through towering eucalyptus plantations, Sra. Amelia explained that some things flourish and some things deteriorate only to return at a later time. In her acknowledgment that not everything thrives all at the same time, her words softened evidence before our eyes, of rapid degradation in flora and fauna caused by industrial encroachment on native forests. In this understated fashion, she neglected to relate the decline of colihüe to industrial processes transforming the landscape just beyond the perimeter of her community's reducción.*

> *Nevertheless, the progressive loss of ground cover preoccupied Sra. Amelia. The colihüe is part of vegetation that enables the soil to retain humidity essential for harvesting the pil pil. Ensuring conditions for vegetation to flourish in general serve at least two key functions for pil pil harvesting. First, humidity fostered by diverse species encourages the vine to grasp for sunlight by crawling along the forest floor and climbing the bases of tree trunks. Second, spring water, which thrives on humid earth,*

181

is essential for artisans who immerse the vine into a cold current for up to four months after picking. That process renders it flexible and firm enough for weaving.

Was Sra. Amelia's lack of political discourse about rapid transformations in forest landscapes merely the voice of traditional ecological knowledge, handed down across generations? Were her words about things not thriving all at the same time, some form of wisdom adapted to this environment? Something nagged at me about her reflections on the cycles of nature. As we wove through kilometres of eucalyptus-lined fields, her words seemed to dodge a more direct political statement, given that the plantation industry's impacts were apparent in adjacent forests and were preoccupying for people whose livelihoods depended on these natural spaces. I grappled with the risks of treating her knowledge about native forests as uniquely traditional or ecological, as if indigeneity itself were merely a vestige of past worlds. In spite of elaborate practices for conserving ground cover and protecting habitat for the *pil pil* vine, Sra. Amelia's knowledge at times seemed to run counter to Berkes' definition of T.E.K., as activities surrounding her weaving did not strictly reinforce relationships between humans, other living beings, and the natural environment. In fact, ever since Sra. Amelia was hired to provide state-funded workshops to teach her craft to members of neighbouring communities, she increasingly faced competitors who sold her designs as their own. The collective spirit of indigenous hands crafts was not immune to market forces.

At least two factors tempered Sra. Amelia's relationship to politics. First, like many in her rural community and Mapuche communities throughout southern Chile, she attended

an evangelical church that in weekly sermons discouraged members from becoming distracted in their faith by investing too much attention in activities that did not strengthen the Lord's work. Second, she believed that state and industry brought some benefits to isolated communities. Among these was the Minimum Employment Plan (1974-1988), a Pinochet-era initiative that once enticed poor peasants, Mapuche and settler alike, into dismally paid manual labour. Workers for that program built basic infrastructure in remote areas, such as breaking roads into isolated sectors like her own community, to which a bus now ventures three times a week. For many Mapuche people, what is known as *el Plan Mínimo*, was their first form of paid labour. It also contributed to many families abandoning the harvest of their own food during the military regime. Harvesting potatoes, beans, wheat, and other crops has proven exceptionally difficult to recover, as few families have the means to labour without pay in anticipation of a new yield. Evangelism and the occasional affirmation of *Pinochetismo* were common among elders in Sra. Amelia's social milieus, framing a disinclination to participate in public protests, and complicating any simple understanding of traditional knowledge or ancestral wisdom.

Nevertheless, when it came to specific threats to their community's well-being, Sra. Amelia and her neighbours were vocal. Her community was among those reliant on small-scale fishing mentioned already, that long impeded scientists from elaborating an E.I.A. for Celco Valdivia's proposed waste duct. On this matter, she indicated that Mapuche residents would always oppose what prevented them from carrying out their lives. This included the industrial fishing trawlers that often anchored just off the coast, depleting in a few days a resource on which local fishermen depend year round. In this case, local beliefs and

practices towards the physical landscape reveal agency to traditional ecological knowledge. Ethnoecologist Virginia Nazarea casts this cumulative and adaptive knowledge transmitted across generations, as implicitly political without being ideological. This is because intimate acts of caring for the land are themselves statements against modernity's progressively more mechanical treatment of natural spaces. She observes that (2006 327):

> Subsistence farmers, indigenous peoples, heirloom seedsavers, and women homegardeners nurture memory in private, more sovereign places such as sacred groves, tangled plots, and steaming kitchens. In these interior landscapes, cultural memory is not simply articulated or performed; it is materialized in "old timey" or archaic plants that persist, in seeds and stories that travel, in recipes that recall intimacies and comforts of the past and reinvigorate the present.

In Panguipulli, I observed that the types of sensuous recollections described by Nazarea were embodied by settlers and town residents who previously sustained their families in the southern countryside. Some of these people ventured seasonally into *reducciones* to pick *changle* (*Ramaria*), a spongy fungus that grows at the base of certain trees in the Autumn; to collect *dihueñes* (*Cytharia espinosae*), a spherical mushroom that grows on the branches of young trees in the Springtime; and to gather *nalca* (*Gunnera tinctoria*), a giant rhubarb harvested in late Spring. Their esteem for Mapuche forests was so commonplace that few who brought me on such expeditions could explain how intruding on Mapuche lands to collect seasonal delicacies had come about. Indigenous forests were simply believed to be better. For these people, rapid transformations in natural and social

184

landscapes were recognized during such excursions, but discussion seldom addressed the causes of such change.

Given that the penetration of the state and markets into southern communities is not itself a new phenomenon, what might memory of the region's older lumber industries teach us about the symbolic natures that compete over forestry plantations and water resources today? In the next section, I turn to the Panguipulli interior, where a mid-twentieth century timber industry cleared old growth forests in the province's pre-cordillera, where lumber workers staged one of the largest takeovers of rural property in Chilean history, and where control over land and natural resources remains contentious.

A Timber Complex

The Liquiñe valley is one of the most isolated areas in the Panguipulli interior, and among the last reaches of the *Wallmapu* in which land was partitioned to settlers. Not only were state sovereignty and private property established relatively recently there, but in the past century the valley has been host to infamous confrontations and unlikely alliances between those who survive off its resources in diverse ways. Twentieth century lumber barons, their tenant labourers, independent settlers, and indigenous residents evoke competing visions of how its natural spaces should be occupied. I turn here to Don Baltasar's vision of the landscape, as he offers a conveniently linear perspective on an industry that is considered favourably by many, to have modernized southern Chile. As a

185

mid-twentieth century administrator of a large estate in the interior, his perspectives strike a sharp contrast to more uncertain positions discussed in the last section.

The Great Raulí

When I first met Don Baltasar, he showed me a book published in Spain in 1919, which he considered to thoroughly detail the grades and dimensions of wood ideal for exportation. He stretched a measuring tape the length of the sofa, demonstrating cuts that were exported from the region throughout the mid-twentieth century. "*A tablera of wood, or you could call it a pulgada maderera, is 10 inches wide. That's 10 inches by one thick.*"[12] The raulí (*Nothofagus procera*, a southern beech tree) is what made this region prominent in the world of lumber; millenarian trees as thick as two metres and reaching fifty metres in height, were once abundant in these parts. He conceded that the industry that once thrived here has little future, mostly because the raulí's reddish wood so popular among foreign markets can no longer be cut in sizes that fetch a price worth the trouble of hauling it out of such remote sectors. Today, a *pulgada* of raulí sells for $20-$24 per plank,[13] for the best quality of exportation grade. Even the smallest imperfection will lead to its rejection at the border. A *pulgada* of good coigüe (*Nothofagus dombeyi*, another kind of beech) is worth $9-$10, and tepa (*Laureliopsis philippiana*, a laurel) is worth only $4. His knowledge of wood—how to cut it, at what time of year, at what point in a tree's life for the purposes to which the wood will be put—made Don Baltasar feel like a dying breed. When I asked to record our conversation, he was among a small few in Neltume who did not hesitate. He seemed heartened by the recognition of his expertise, confessing plans to one day write a

memoir. Throughout our conversation, he cited the recently self-published memoir of Luis Rencoret Orellana (2009), a retired sergeant major of the police forces who served fifteen years in Panguipulli between the early 1950s and mid-1960s. With each mention of the old Spanish book about wood for exportation and of the police sergeant's tales, Don Baltasar emphasized that he considered these to be more accurate representations of Valdivia's mid-twentieth century lumber industry, than the oral testimonies of other area residents, who he suspected I had interviewed.

In Don Baltasar's view, few people today recognize the ease and precision with which a tremendous raulí can be cut down. Today, rarely can one find a raulí that reaches half the size of the massive trunks that once blanketed hillsides in the pre-cordillera of the Province of Valdivia. He described how raulís that are centuries old are naturally hollowed at their base; a savvy lumberjack may cut two of its 'feet' and allow the towering specimen to be pulled to the ground by its own weight. His animated descriptions of cutting and preparing lumber betrayed that Don Baltasar is a man of industry. For him, to do right by the land is to do good business with its resources. To conduct commerce poorly is beyond his comprehension, evident in what he called the short-sightedness of the owners of the new Huilo Huilo tourism initiative. These wealthy entrepreneurs from Santiago purchased several estates in the interior in the past decade, and have built two five-star hotels in the re-generated forest, a project meant to convert Neltume into a major hub for international eco-tourists. Don Baltasar was baffled that *huaye*, or wood from young trees, was used to build the structures. To prove his point, he instructed me to ask the young men building infrastructure for the company what type of wood they were using.

Don Baltasar: *Tell them that it looks native, but that you don't know what type it is. Ask them, "Is it raulí or is it huaye?" They won't be able to lie to you. They will tell you that it is huaye of raulí. Do you know how long it lasts with the rain and the humidity here? In six years, if I go at it with an axe, maybe I'll knock the whole thing down in one blow...* (Personal communication, July 2010)

He told me that he would have made those constructions to last thirty to forty years by going deep into the forest where there is still large oak, from old trees that have fallen over. He would have used those for the bases: "*That's pellín, mature wood, of a tree older than 100 years. It's a Mapuche word, meaning something like hard, old, or firm.*"

In spite of insisting that Mapuche communities mostly keep to themselves, and that they did not use the forests that were logged by mid-twentieth century lumber companies, Don Baltasar's vocabulary is full of Mapuche terms. These indicate the grades, quality, and age of wood, but also other elements of the natural landscape. His language is shared with rural southerners of diverse backgrounds, betraying histories he does not recount, of collaborative contact between settlers and indigenous inhabitants. Silenced stories are signalled in common terminology for flora (i.e. *huaye* and *pellín*) and fauna (i.e. *chingue* for skunk; and *chucaw*, *keltewe*, *traile*, *traro*, and *buitre*, all common bird species). As Keith Basso might observe, through Don Baltasar's language, we glimpse that he apprehends his relationship to the landscape and to neighbours as an authority figure, as someone who knows best about the history of this place. Indeed, Don Baltasar once managed the Carranco estate, located in the mountains between Liquiñe, Neltume, and the Argentinian border. His

administration there ended when some seventy workers dislodged his young family with labour uprisings during the Popular Unity (See Bravo Aguilera 2012).

As he re-enacted conversations with his first boss and mentor, Don Baltasar's voice jumped fluidly into the Basque accent of the most prominent lumber baron in the early days of the commune, Juan Domingo Etchevarry (See Bernedo Pinto 1994). In 1970, when eight hundred lumber workers seized nearly two dozen estates in the pre-cordillera, including several owned by Etchevarry, the workers formed the Panguipulli Forestry and Timber Complex. Following the coup, the industry would fall under state control and be managed by Pinochet's former son-in-law until late in the military regime. At its peak, Panguipulli's Timber Complex encompassed more than 320,000 hectares and was Chile's largest forest-wood producer. It involved a plywood factory and two massive boilers for drying wood, located in the industry's centre in Neltume, as well as plans to develop a pulp mill (Klubock 2004: 346). Infrastructure was financed by the industry's early owners, to whom most of the estates would never be returned.

During the early decades of the lumber industry in Valdivia's pre-cordillera, man and nature were seen by administrators like Don Baltasar as existing in equilibrium. Millenarian timber was an abundant resource believed capable of sustaining a good life for all. Don Baltasar's perspectives are echoed in Luis Rencoret Orellana's memoir. Arranged into a series of short stories inspired from his police service, Rencoret Orellana's book conveys a narrative that is also dismissive of local accounts of hardship experienced by workers and abuses against Mapuche neighbours. Like Don Baltasar's descriptions, the memoir portrays Panguipulli's interior as a place where one might expect that workers

189

would never be compelled to overthrow their apparently generous bosses (Rencoret Orellana 2009: 34):

> Allí había existido siempre una sana y productiva actividad laboral hasta que los movimientos políticos de la década del 70 la inestabilizaron social y económicamente. El personal gozaba de muchas regalías: buena casa, luz elécrtica, leña la que desearan y retazos agrícolas para quienes desearan cultivarlos. Había espacio para todo y para todos. Se consideraba que la montaña daba para eso y mucho mas.[14]

The electricity was from hydroelectric plants installed by the private owners to run their factories, the facilities were located along the Fuy and Liquiñe Rivers near Neltume and Liquiñe respectively.[15] And indeed, firewood was abundant, so much so that current residents of Neltume laughed bitterly as they described to me having formerly burned mounds of thick scrap wood because they lacked any better purpose to which to put it. Today, trees in a nearby estate that the workers' union came to legally own following the democratic transition (only to sell off shortly thereafter), now fall within a UNESCO biosphere reserve solicited by the Huilo Huilo owners. The reserve prohibits the chopping of wood for sale even to heat local homes. For a higher price than what city residents pay, families in Neltume acquire the best firewood from the Neltume Lake Mapuche communities seven kilometres down the road.

Dispossession

For men like Don Baltasar and Rencoret Orellana, who held positions of authority during the early industry (one serving the state and the other the market), the apparent harmony of Valdivia's early lumber industry was ruptured by political movements of the 1970s. No direct mention of the Popular Unity government is made by either, but it is implied when they speak of 'outsiders' considered to have destabilized the zone both socially and economically. These claims have historical origins, as a group of university students and a few foreigners affiliated with the leftist revolutionary and the peasant revolutionary movements (MIR and MCR, respectively) ventured into the interior in the years preceding the estate seizures, developing solidarity with the lumber workers. Not many of these former students would survive the subsequent military repression. One Mapuche woman in Liquiñe described to me having watched the arrest of their leader, José Gregorio Liendo, known informally as Comandante Pepe. His solidarity with the lumber workers gave him a Che Guevara persona in the national press of that period. Liendo's capture happened in the days following the coup d'état and a subsequent confrontation he led against the Neltume police outpost. He was found in the hillsides and brought by helicopter to Liquiñe, where as a nine-year-old playing near the town's new military airstrip, Sra. Feña saw him transferred to a truck. Hands and feet were tied together behind his back as Liendo's still living body was tossed into the vehicle "*like a slaughtered animal on its way to market*" (Personal Communication, July 2008). She knew it was the man they called Comandante Pepe, because she had seen him visit her father's home with others said to be training as guerrillas in the hillsides. These would occasionally arrive asking for milk

or eggs. An influential Mapuche leader in the area, her father distrusted the activists because of their suggestion that if he did not join their cause, he could be among the first to lose his livestock in the event of the collectivization of production in the valley.

Near Liquiñe, I found that Mapuche men of Sra. Feña's father's generation often spoke of communism in very different terms than as a political ideology of the working poor. This poignantly surfaced on one occasion when a group of elderly men asked me whether I thought they should call for the re-nationalization of water as a part of their tactics for opposing hydroelectric interventions. I suggested that while a valid strategy, they should be prepared to face accusations in mainstream media that would attempt to discredit them as 'communist agitators.' To this, Don Humberto declared that, if anything, SN Power was communist "*for taking that which isn't theirs.*" He then described what he would tell "*that arrogant gringo*" if he ever met him, mistaking the company name of SN Power for the figure of an old estate-owner; that is, as Señor Power. These men certainly did not experience fascism, communism, or neoliberalism as the culmination of macro-historical processes described in textbooks; their memories reveal the importance of social location in shaping political subjectivity.

One MIR-MCR survivor's oral testimony that was compiled into a self-published booklet of poems and tales about Panguipulli's land seizures and guerrilla resistance indicates that a relatively strong workers' union preceded their arrival. The students from the Universidad Austral de Chile (UACH), in the city of Valdivia, arrived under the pretense that they were on a literacy campaign. Their motives were nevertheless political (Cardyn Degen 2006: 50):

> *Nos interesamos en sus problemas de trabajo, sus intereses como asalariados y nos dimos cuenta que había una gran conciencia de clase. Había buena semilla. Gran parte del sindicato lo manejaba el P.C. [Partido Comunista] y el P.S.[Partido Socialista].[16]*

These individuals are widely blamed by people like Don Baltasar for having encouraged workers to take more aggressive labour action, which according to elite actors would not otherwise have developed. Were it not for 'the political movements,' we are led to believe that workers in the interior might still enjoy the free electricity, firewood, and spaces to cultivate that they were once afforded. In this discourse, politics belong to forces external to the people residing in the interior, a population portrayed as passive and eventually as ungrateful recipients of a good life. In Don Baltasar's testimony, residents of Neltume today who receive monthly pensions as recognized 'political exonorees' are little more than crooks. Political exonorees are people who have been recognized by the Valech Commission to have unjustly endured abuse at the hands of the state during the military regime. Generally speaking, as recognized survivors of unlawful arrests and torture, they receive a pension paid out by the state. Don Baltasar could not reconcile the fact that those in Neltume who are considered 'exonerated' collect a monthly pension when throughout the dictatorship they were employed in the Timber Complex. Alluding to human rights abuses, he peered through the blinds in the front room of his house to several men repairing the road beyond the front steps. He identified three as being what he considered fraudulent exonorees, arguing that people who were forced from the area may have legitimate claim to compensation, but not those who remained.

Don Baltasar: *Right here in Neltume, in this very town, there are people who participated in taking over the more than twenty estates that were seized, that formed the Timber Complex. And those people, they never lacked work. Never did they go without work. All those people who started the Complex and who stayed here, they kept working for it, receiving their salaries. They never lacked anything.*

This esteem for the early lumber industry, and for what some lament as the decline of Panguipulli's Golden Era (See Bernedo Pinto 1994), reflects a discourse aligned with state interests. In this narrative, the land should not merely be inhabited, but rendered commercially productive; and its inhabitants should not expect more than industry offers them. It is a dominant narrative not merely because Don Baltasar and Rencoret Orellana worked in the countryside in managerial capacities, but because it holds together a vision of the world that reinforces the imagined community of the nation. Its thread unites state sovereignty with the virtues of commercial development (i.e. social improvement, prosperity, diligence), and justifies colonizing the farthest reaches of the South. Any notion of the state's obligation towards citizens is couched in the rhetoric of rejected generosity, implying that the poor refused what was offered to them. In this narrative, politics take on distinct meanings from liberal democratic notions of citizenship and justice grounded in individual rights. For people in Don Baltasar's family, 'being political' suggests disruptive behaviour, naïve illusions and lack of respect towards authorities. Meanwhile, their emphasis on written texts discounts the anticipated perspectives of others, specifically Mapuche communities dispossessed of their lands, and the hundreds of lumber workers

whose families were forcibly removed from the interior following the coup d'état. This masks elite interests to settle both the South and the contested past itself.

A Hacienda Myth

Don Baltasar is not so much classist as he is an industrialist. He does not support landowners unconditionally on prestige alone, but is guided by a particular morality of commerce, work, and productivity. Responding to his emphasis on working the land, or what he calls extracting profit from it (*sacandole provecho*), I wondered aloud why so much of it is today concentrated in the hands of so few. Since the late-1980s, most of the estates that were taken over by workers in the early 1970s and later managed by the state agency dedicated to productive development (the CORFO),[17] have wound up in the hands of half a dozen millionaires. It was not therefore surprising to Don Baltasar that, in spite of his denial that the usurpation of Mapuche lands occurred, I should persist with questions about land tenure and resource allocation. He soon launched into an explanation of the origins of private property in the interior that went back a century.

> **Don Baltasar:** *Let's start at the roots. Around the years 1916 or 1918, a gentleman named Don Fernando Camino arrived. He was French, if I'm not mistaken, of French descent anyway. He was a land surveyor.*

To begin at the root of things is, for Don Baltasar, to begin with a sequence of events that set in motion the state's legal partitioning of land in the southern cordillera. The protagonists of this story are the president of Chile, a minister sent to recruit immigrants from Europe (presumably Vicente Pérez Rosales, mentioned in Chapter 3), and people

195

expected to convert the wilderness into agriculturally productive territory. As a result, the first presence of Chile in the Panguipulli interior is believed by Don Baltasar to have been in the person of a land surveyor, followed by European immigrants to establish agricultural development. However, from Millanguir Neutopan's investigation (2007, mentioned in Chapter 3; see also Appendix D: Mapuche-Huilliche and Land Usurpations in Panguipulli), we know that during the early twentieth century, this land surveyor was by no means the only figure carving out private property for commercial gain in Panguipulli. The commune was host to especially ambitious settlers, some of whom were former soldiers seeking to appropriate themselves of territory as reward for their role in the conquest of the autonomous territory directly to the north. These soldiers who had participated in the occupation of the Araucanía and who had lost out in the partitioning of lands to the north of the Toltén, sought small and medium sized properties known as *hijuelas* in Panguipulli. The surveyor's technical methods were believed by Don Baltasar to have been ideal for assessing who best to occupy the land. The state in that period is therefore remembered in largely synonymous terms as the presence of commerce, and no mention is made of Mapuche families fleeing military incursions in the Araucanía or Argentinian pampas.

> **Don Baltasar:** *A lot of Swiss people immigrated around the 1880s, or earlier. They were the first to arrive in Chile, after the Spanish of course. The government recruited them… These people were called settlers (*"colonos"*). On top of giving them hijuelas, the government helped them with a little money, food, farm equipment, a pair of oxen and a plough, tools that one needed back then.*

As the story continues, attention turns to the Germans brought to Valdivia around the 1900s, a group judged more successful than their Swiss predecessors.

> **Don Baltasar:** *The Germans found that here in Chile, they didn't just have to live off of agriculture. They brought their customs and that way they have as really knowledgeable people in Europe, of mills, of making flour, of making shoes. Here there were a lot who dedicated themselves to other things, not just agriculture. They made beer, I can name the Kunstmann family for instance, who were brewers and millers…Others became navigators and dedicated themselves to ships, especially around Valdivia and in the coastal zone of Corral. Those people were a big source of money, they brought in a lot of resources. In Valdivia a man by the name of Anwandter was an important German navigator.*

In his description of German immigrants of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, Don Baltasar highlights names considered foundational to the region. German names remain etched into the landscape today, such as that of Carlos Anwandter, which is carried by the wetland sanctuary where the swans perished. Others remain prominent in commercial and political spheres. Kunstmann is today a trademark beer in southern Chile, and Ricardo Kunstmann Hott serves as one of six municipal councillors in Panguipulli. He is among three who descend from estate-owning German families in the commune, revealing that the association between property-ownership and political leadership endures today. Appealing to the industrial legacy of German migrants, Don Baltasar's lesson for me is that European families who once arrived as humble migrants to Chile only came to own vast estates as a result of hard work, diligence, and an astute eye for opportunity. For Don Baltasar, it was important that I realize that estates in Panguipulli were not granted for free,

nor were they stolen. Instead, Germans and Basques were seen to have accumulated wealth through commercial activities above and beyond agriculture. They may have kept a few workers or a son on their assigned parcels to not lose the plots to appropriation by squatters for non-use, but the immigrants otherwise focused on larger endeavours, leading to their eventual and presumably legitimate purchase of large estates.

This is a frontier story, echoed by the municipal councillor, who during a recent political campaign described the Kunstmann family's 1948 settlement in the zone. "*Mi padre fue uno de los primeros en llegar a Panguipulli cuando apenas habían 18 casas*" (Las Buenas Noticias 2012).[18] He neglects to mention that for decades before that, Mapuche communities had struggled for security on their lands, their homes sacked and burned, their livestock stolen or slaughtered, and their very mobility on the commune's numerous lakes prohibited (See Díaz Meza 2007[1907]; Millanguir Neutopan 2007). His words also neglect that lumber workers in mills in the interior, such as in Neltume and Quechumalal, had been clearing old growth forests for nearly two decades. The labour of those people and their families enabled the founding of the city of Panguipulli about which the councillor speaks, as a hub between the interior and distant markets. For a time, lumber was floated out of the interior across the commune's lakes and loaded for shipment on a now decommissioned railway line that began in that city.

Such stories of pioneers and noble men of industry are typical of a 'frontier myth,' a term I borrow from ethnographer Elizabeth Furniss' (1999) work on Native/non-Native relations in the interior British Columbian town of Williams Lake in Canada. To paraphrase Furniss, frontier myths evoke an historical epistemology that celebrates the supposed

198

discovery by non-Aboriginal explorers and settlers of a rich, presumably empty land, whose wilderness and Aboriginal residents should be subdued by benevolent conquerors. Furniss postulates that such myths guide inter-cultural behaviour, buttressing a 'frontier complex' that serves "as a founding concept by which non-Aboriginal people understand and legitimate their on-going relationships with Aboriginal peoples" (1999: 187). The difference with southern Chile, is that narratives legitimating on-going inequalities between diverse groups do not merely celebrate a subdued wilderness, but also the prosperity of industry unfettered by so-called 'social problems.' That phrase was offered as Don Baltasar's explanation to me for why, following the military coup, the Timber Complex was not immediately broken apart and returned to estate-owners from whom the properties had been seized. After all, the fact that the state retained control over the Complex and controlled rights to exploit the area's forests until the mid-1980s, runs curiously counter to the neoliberal predilection for privatizing natural resources. In Don Baltasar's words, "*it was that Don Augusto Pinochet knew that here, there was a social problem.*" The problem, in this view, was that the labouring class had sought involvement in political decision-making and economic processes.

In this vision of natural and social landscapes, Mapuche residents are not the only meant to graciously host economic development first brought by industrious migrants, and increasingly today brought by multi-national consortia. The working poor, who are the landless descendants of tenant labourers brought for twentieth century timber exploitation and for large-scale livestock and agricultural production throughout the region, are also expected to know their place. At times, this separation between labouring and managerial

classes appears feudal, making Don Baltasar's and Rencoret Orellana's accounts perhaps more evocative of a 'hacienda myth' transplanted into a frontier space. In the last chapter, we saw that during the early republican period, the hacienda system inspired the conversion of land to agricultural production following the conquest of southern territories. It was instrumental in subjecting remote reaches of the country to capitalist markets based in distant metropoles. Authority was vested in the distribution of private property, and political legitimacy corresponded to ownership of land and control over productive resources, rather than to any collective will of an imagined national community. In these accounts by Panguipulli's early men of industry and government, during the early and mid-twentieth century, this logic guided estate managers and police contingents upholding a social order that was economically liberal, and socially conservative. With the advent of the Popular Unity, Panguipulli's lumber workers would burst the illusion that, when the mountain was managed from the metropolis, it could provide for all.

Lessons from Southern Forests

During seventeen years of direct military presence in Panguipulli's interior, critical memory of the social legacy of Panguipulli's Forestry and Timber Complex was forced into private spaces, or what Nazarea (2005, mentioned earlier in this chapter) calls 'interior landscapes.' Intimidation was both direct and indirect, arriving with the installation of airstrips and military camps in both Neltume and Liquiñe, as well as the Caravan of Death which was responsible for the arrest, torture, assassination, and exile of dozens of local men in October 1973. However, intimidation also arrived by way of increasingly precarious

employment on contracted work teams (Peréz Guerra 1999). In recent decades, the recovery of public spaces in which to voice non-dominant versions of this history has involved commemorative efforts by groups such as Neltume's Memory Committee, which organizes annual treks to sites where guerrillas who had returned from exile in the early 1980s hid for nearly eighteen months and were eventually hunted down and massacred by the Army; the publication of a memoir of testimonies of the four surviving guerrillas; the installation of a monument for the Timber Complex' fallen members; and the elaboration of a museum (See Cardyn Degen 2006; Comité Memoria Neltume 2003; Rojas 1991).

Not unlike indigenous inhabitants of this place who came before its lumber workers, the right to choose what kind of society will survive off the fruits of southern forests has again been subjected to elite visions of the greater common good of the nation. And much the same as Mapuche families who have managed to endure in *reducciones*, memory of alternative ways of living in this landscape are communicated through much more than the spoken word alone. This returns us to a question with which I set out in this chapter: to what extent do rural southerners relate current industrial incursions that affect their homes, livelihoods, and well-being, to macro-historical processes? By extension, how might this impact the inter-generational transmission of memory of the contested past?

At the breakfast table the morning after the bet over the year of the military coup, Camilo's father continued with stories about the military regime in spite of having lost his son's attention. Animated by his own stories, Camilo's father described missing curfew one night and evading troops that patrolled Valdivia's streets. He spoke of hiding in parked cars, seeing others scuttle between the shadows, knocking softly on doors, and hoping that a

stranger might let him in. Then Camilo's father described for the first time to his family an experience of nearly being shot in the head by two drunken soldiers he once encountered in the countryside while walking home from work. Something registered over the din of the television blaring from across the room; Camilo turned his attention momentarily to ask how his father survived. "*After nearly an hour of taunting, the soldiers realized I was their children's schoolteacher and let me go.*" Any deeper message in the story about what the military regime felt like—about observing impunity among the Armed Forces, and a sense of impotence on the part of honest workers—seemed lost on Camilo. His father's message might have been that indignities were carried out in Mariquina by soldiers little older than Camilo. They were young men from humble origins suddenly earning twice an educated man's salary. Today, young policemen from poor rural families are widely distrusted for similar reasons. Having suddenly acquired status through police work, they are seen to revel in their first taste of power and to overstep their authority.

Perhaps Camilo's disinterest was a matter of personal taste, but ever since hearing middle-aged torture survivors call his a lost generation, I have long wondered how personal such taste could really be. The interaction between Camilo, his parents and his siblings calls to mind Pierre Nora's distinction between history and memory, in which the tension between the two is seen as the "conquest and eradication of memory by history" (Nora 1989: 8). For the French historian, what we call memory today is not really memory at all. This is because it is seen to lack in spontaneity and collective spirit (Ibid, 13). There seems to be some truth to this observation. Camilo's behaviour can be read as individualistic and focusing solely on historiographical detail; his attention only for the date of the coup and a

detail about how his father escaped the drunken soldiers, seems to dismiss the deeper messages available in the memories shared, favouring a strict progression of events. This corresponds to Nora's description of historiography as reconstructing the poorly remembered past, as a detached exercise that seeks to represent distant events in terms of temporal continuities, "for everyone and no one, whence its claim to universal authority" (Nora 1989: 9). Nora considers that the affectively charged and imperfect nature of memory concerns a past that is still present. The only problem, in his view, is the more that efforts to recover memory and commemorate the past become archival, deliberate, dutiful, and preoccupied with the materiality of traces (e.g. tape-recordings, images, memoirs), the more memory is indeed consumed by history's totalizing drive. In short, memory becomes settled by dominant narratives like Don Baltasar's and Luis Rencoret Orellana's, and by prevailing counter-narratives like those of the MIR-MCR guerrillas, reinforced by that which can be captured and circulated in the written word or commemorated in monuments and museums. Not unlike the fictional Ireneo Funes' meticulous memory, modern efforts to recover the past render memory equally inflexible, reducing it to a catalogue of perceptions that affirm truths and counter-truths for the nation, in turn becoming history of and for the nation.

If we apply Nora's proposition to Camilo's limited interest for his father's stories, then events at the breakfast table hardly involved memory transmission. Recall that Nora considers real environments of memory transmission, *milieux de mémoire*, to have retreated with the disappearance of peasant culture and the rise of industrial society. He goes so far as to argue that (Nora 1989: 13):

true memory… has taken refuge in gestures and habits, in skills passed down by unspoken traditions, in the body's inherent self-knowledge, in unstudied reflexes and ingrained memories…

However, Camilo displayed limited interest for books of any sort, least of all memoirs of earlier eras such as Luis Rencoret Orellana's. He also had little interest in museums and monuments. This leaves even more questions than answers about factors that inform historical consciousness and political subjectivity among his generation. The practicality and adaptability of Sra. Amelia to her adopted way of life, and of settlers and Mapuche communities displaced time and again in Panguipulli's interior, lead me to wonder whether Camilo's seeming disinterest to speak against state and industry might not have been an acquired habit. His father's stories were less studied than Luis Rencoret Orellana's, and more uncertain about the firm line of history affirmed by Don Baltasar, whose interview with me was practice for a memoir he hoped to one day publish. Could Camilo's form of relating to his father's memories not be a skill passed down from parents who have learned to live among suspicious neighbours? By focusing attention on a timely distraction, such as a television show, did his siblings not display an unstudied reflex provoked by the mention of stories seldom spoken? These questions cut to the heart of whether we recognize youth as struggling to find their place in history, or whether we dismiss them as already lost.

Conclusion: A Private Affair

A year before Camilo's December 2009 passing, his girlfriend's mother revealed a perspective on his illness that I had not previously encountered. He had recently graduated

from a technical high school located in a rural sector of Panguipulli. The school is dedicated to agricultural training and is run by the charitable corporation People Help People,[19] whose president is a municipal councillor and married into one of Panguipulli's most prestigious families, the Von Appens. Sra. Gladys told me that she once visited the rural school unannounced, back when her daughter studied there together with Camilo. Sra. Gladys was surprised to discover students working in the fields without protective equipment to guard against the herbicides they applied. Even her own father, a Mapuche farmer of humble means, masked his face, wore rubber gloves, and donned heavy boots when he used the same product. She believed that Camilo was not alone in having fallen ill from exposure to toxic chemicals at the school, and cited the unusual illnesses of two other classmates. Not only were students exposed all day in the fields, but they would return to share dorm rooms with half a dozen of their peers, where they aired out work clothes by hanging them along bunk beds. While the revelation rattled my understanding of contributing factors to Camilo's untimely death, the macro-political context which made a causal connection possible in my mind was understood by Sra. Gladys to be the same. I am referring to the plausibility that cruel developments in Camilo's life were the consequence of broader socio-political developments impacting the health of the area in which he lived.

With inadequate health insurance, Camilo's treatment quickly became palliative care, provided uniquely by family members, none of whom had energy to fight any other battle than the one for his life. This meant that no deeper truth about the industrial use and disposal of environmental contaminants would be uncovered. What struck people like Sra. Gladys and me as an unhappy bi-product of Chile's neoliberal 'economic miracle,' was in

the end lived as a private family affair. It is a bitter example of the extent to which industrial developments can pinch southerners between the material benefits and hazards of the rapid expansion of Chile's extractive industries, provoking uncertainty about the social and health impacts of such developments. Far from actual indifference to the well-being of families and local communities, their apparent withdrawal from issues of civic concern appears to be one symptom of a fractured relationship to macro-historical processes such as neoliberalism.

Neither recent industrial incursions, nor the forms of power and influence that accompany them, are new experiences for the people described in this chapter. Nevertheless, social location figures prominently in how southerners relate to the penetration of state and capital into the region, evident in talk about the natural landscape and who belongs in it. Social location also exposes the uneven ability to make pronunciations on the contested past, and to have these heard by younger generations, suggesting the active silencing of local memories of state repression and abuses of power. Perhaps more interesting than who orchestrates this silencing, is the fact that elements of a dominant 'hacienda myth' are affirmed by people well-removed from elite circles. This reflects a perplexing reality in which, among Chile's poorest and most vulnerable citizens, we find remarkably conservative political tendencies and some of Pinochet's most loyal supporters. It also raises an important question about political agency among the poor. Do conservative tendencies in the southern countryside reflect actual political opinion, or do they mark the region's unequal position within the nation?

While this question does not lend itself well to ethnographic analysis, via the inter-generational transmission of memory, we might examine Pierre Nora's observations on the apparent loss of peasant culture and inter-personal milieus long committed to the transmission of collective values (*milieux de mémoire*). Recall that for him, modernity has eroded the spontaneity and collective spirit characteristic of memory, rendering it more akin to history, which he considers to be an intellectual and secular representation of the past as "what is no longer" (1989: 8). By contrast, memory is seen to be perpetually evolving, "vulnerable to manipulation and appropriation, susceptible to being long dormant and periodically revived" (Ibid). This is fundamentally a distinction between who has political agency and who does not. Applied to southern Chile, we might ask whether people who are increasingly caught up in mass culture are truly able to transmit, manipulate, and appropriate local memories, or whether they merely reproduce fixed visions of the past that reinforce nationalist projects. One problem with approaching agency in this way is the presumption that some sort of non-modern 'peasant culture' can be lost at all. Ethnographic observations in this chapter reveal that this idea is founded on a belief that the national community is a homogeneous body and the state an *achievement*, and not rather a *project* of modern power to remake the world in the image of the West.

Unravelling the social construction of the national community and the state, for the remainder of this thesis I focus on power as a process of hegemonic struggle between unequal interests. In the next chapter, I turn to transformations in educational policy since the Pinochet regime. This offers a means of exploring mechanisms by which the state has sought to educate Chileans about the contested past, and by extension about their options

for political engagement. Then in Chapters 6 and 7, I focus on expressions of political sentiment among youth, questioning the extent to which state and private sector efforts to re-educate poor southerners about their political participation actually prohibit younger generations from developing critical perspectives on civic life today.

Notes: Chapter 4

[1] In this chapter, I indicate Latin names for a number of animal and plant species, as this allows for a specificity not permitted in English or Spanish. For instance, to call *dihueñes* (a word of Mapuche origin) a wild mushroom would miss that this particular fungus is appreciated as a seasonal delicacy in southern Chile and inspires stories specific to its emergence each Spring.

[2] While this term indicates supporters of Pinochet, more disparaging terms exist in colloquial language. These include *momio* for people of reactionary tendencies, and *facha* for people who are either far right-wing politically, or who display fascist values. Scholars have noted that *Pinochetismo* is a heterogeneous political current, and not restricted to elite sectors, having united several currents of the right. In the regime's early years, it offered a closed, maniquean cultural paradigm invested in conservative Catholic thought and expressed as nationalist ideology (Munizaga & Ochsenius 1983). However, its historical trajectory saw it become a movement whose social persuasion persists even decades after the end of the military government (Salinas Urrejola 2002).

[3] The most commonly referenced are the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, adopted by that body in 2006, and the International Labour Organization's Convention No. 169, which was first adopted in 1989, but not ratified by Chile until 2008.

[4] Also referred to as *voqui pil pil.*

[5] Lafkenche literally denominates Mapuche people living in close proximity to water. It is a term widely used to refer to coastal communities.

[6] See Du Monceau 2008: 170, n. 88; and Saldivia 2011.

[7] While I observed this in my own interactions in the countryside with urban activists allied with ancestral communities, scholars who have noted the role of migration and urban Mapuche identity in political mobilization, and have contrasted predominantly urban and rural political subjectivities are Aravena 2003; Chihuailaf 2006; Course 2011; Foerster & Vergara 2001; and Terwindt 2009.

[8] Ancestral land is a term that seems to have emerged from jurisprudence, as a means for demarcating territory inhabited by historically colonized communities who have occupied them over multiple generations (See for example norms for the Inter-American Court on Human Rights, which delimit the rights of indigenous and tribal peoples over 'ancestral lands' and natural resources, accessed November 15, 2012: http://cidh.org/countryrep/Indigenous-Lands09/Chap.VI.htm). From an anthropological perspective, tenuous recognition means that ancestrality is not something innate to indigenous peoples, but rather a relational identity that re-constructs the colonized Other as a citizen strategically positioned to contest the totalizing authority of the nation-state. What makes certain territories ancestral seems to depend on the means by which inhabitants instrumentalize claims to it.

[9] Du Monceau mentions this "return plan" (2008: 169) by drawing on intellectuals who have also taken to reclaiming certain place names by referring to them in Mapudungun.

[10] This figure often draws on José Bengoa's 2000[1985] work on the so-called pacification of the Araucanía and the resulting collective land grants known as *títulos de merced* that were assigned to Mapuche communities by the state between 1860-1920 (See for example Azócar et al. 2005).

[11] Noting that scientific approaches to biodiversity do little to clearly theorize this concept, Arturo Escobar (1998) has argued that the term itself is a means for assessing the loss of ecosystem functioning. Wondering why the word emerged with mobilizing force among technoscientific circles following the mid-1980s, he argues that "biodiversity does not exist in an absolute sense" (1998: 54), but has become a "master narrative of biological crisis" (Ibid, 55). It is a concept both for naming environmental threats and devising possible solutions.

[12] Don Baltasar described wood in Imperial measures.

[13] These are Canadian dollar approximations of figures he gave in pesos.

[14] My translation: "There was always healthy and productive labour activity there, until the political movements of the 1970s de-stabilized it socially and economically. Employees enjoyed many benefits: a good house, electric light, all the firewood they could desire and bits of agricultural land for those wishing to cultivate it. There was space for one and for all. The mountain was believed to provide for all of that and much more."

[15] With a combined power of nearly 400 MW, the Llallalca and Remeko plants along the Fuy River have been in operation since the 1940s. Their uneven current still services the factories in town, while most residents were converted to the central electricity grid in the 1990s, for the first time requiring payment for the service.

[16] My translation: *"We were interested in their work-related issues, their interests as wage labourers, and we realized that there was a significant class consciousness there. There was a good seed [with which to start]. A large part of the union was managed by the Communist Party and the Socialist Party."*

[17] Literally, *Corporación de Fomento de la Producción*.

[18] My translation: "My father was one of the first to arrive in Panguipulli when there were barely eighteen houses here."

[19] The formal name is the *Corporación de Beneficiencia People Help People*. According to its mission statement, it is dedicated to improving the education of children in under-privileged sectors through the construction and management of free boarding schools, as well as through primary health clinics in rural sectors. It has apparently invested more than $40 million US in educational and medical establishments in Panguipulli and its surrounding   area   (See http://www.eldiariopanguipulli.cl/notas/PHP%2008/php%20Griseldis%20Burose.htm).

Part III: Restorative Projects

Chapter 5: Political Education

La reconstrucción conservadora de los setenta y ochenta, y su continuidad en los noventa condujo… a clausurar los derechos ciudadanos de los pobres y a transformarlos en objetos de compasión, asistencia y caridad. La política hacia la pobreza dejó de ser un asunto de ejercicio de los derechos y pasó a transformarse en un asunto personal relacionado con la generosidad y la bondad de los ricos.

The conservative reconstruction during the 1970s and 1980s, and its contiuity into the 1990s led… to the closing down of citizen rights for the poor and the transformation of such people into objects of compassion, assistance, and charity. Policy towards poverty stopped being a matter of exercising rights and began to transform into a personal matter related to the generosity and kindness of the rich.

-José Bengoa, *La Comunidad Reclamada* (2006: 49)

Throughout 2011, Chilean youth were the principle force behind a student mobilization that staged extended stoppages in at least 600 secondary schools and seventeen major universities in the country. Over the entire academic year, students engaged in creative protests to pressure the government into genuine negotiation, and were often met with police aggression and scorn by prominent politicians. Between June and December, public support for the mobilization that demanded improved quality and access to education doubled to over 70% of popular opinion.[1] Major unions representing teachers, miners, and public servants, as well as a long list of community organizations backed the students' cause. More than any union since the 1990 democratic transition, this movement rattled a political establishment heavily structured by legislative conditions set forth by the Pinochet regime. Compelling as the 2011 student mobilizations were, these met with near refusal on

the part of state agents to seriously engage with demands to overhaul educational policy. Existing policy had been introduced by the military regime and only moderately modified in the decades since. While student protests suggest popular disapproval for state interventions (or lack thereof) into public education, they also signal a setback in attempts by recent administrations to overcome the contentious nature of Chile's political transition. In the midst of its retraction from basic public services like education, we glimpse the state's active role in configuring the post-dictatorship political landscape.

This chapter asks: in what ways does the state seek to educate Chileans about their options for political and citizen involvement? This chapter does not explicitly focus on social memory, even though the transmission of historical knowledge within the school system forms an important part of analysis. Instead, it follows on reflections in the last chapter, on the ways in which industrial incursions in the rural South are experienced as the culmination of macro-historical processes. On the one hand, the question at hand invites reflection on formal schooling, including elements in the curriculum and classroom dynamics that shape how Chileans come to imagine themselves as belonging to a society of governable subjects. On the other, it opens discussion about indirect ways that state policy in the post-dictatorship period shapes how Chileans may participate in civic decision-making processes. Unless otherwise indicated, all observations refer to knowledge acquired during participant observation while working in a municipal school throughout 2009, as well as interviews with colleagues in diverse positions within the system and with members of the eleven core families involved in this study. Therefore, episodes described in the past tense refer to specific events, and do not mean to suggest that the broader contexts in which

events occurred no longer exist. By relating the experiences of colleagues and pupils in primary and secondary schools in the southern countryside, I bring the concerns of student protesters to the fore. Attention paid to ways in which Pinochet era reforms to the educational system impact families, offers insight into why some youth have responded as they have to state reluctance to overhaul the system.

The first section outlines social impacts of reforms made to Chile's public education system during the Pinochet regime. I elaborate that formal instruction on history and civics are by no means the only aspects of public life in which lessons about appropriate political behaviour are conveyed. Meanwhile, youth are by no means the only target audience for such lessons. The second section assesses the involvement of corporate and other private sector actors in the schooling of poor southern children. To illustrate this involvement, I relay interactions that occurred in a town hall forum addressing the possibility for resident compensation for the company Endesa's hydroelectric dam, planned for installation near the town of Neltume. Education and the well-being of children were prominent themes in that and similar forums I attended, in which company agents sought to secure local compliance with plans to divert nearby rivers into underground turbines for energy production. I contrast statements and actions surrounding Neltume's town forum, as these reflect perceptions that locals and company officials expressed of one another. Having unravelled how state policies open the way for corporate sponsorship of childhood education, I conclude in the last section that the state's role in constraining citizen consultation processes is deliberate, well-orchestrated, and essential for the particularly aggressive form of capitalism that it espouses.

Educational Politics

In post-dictatorship Chile, education is among the few domains of the state capable of penetrating the daily lives of youth in order to compete with situated experiences of the contested past transmitted across generations within families and small community networks. Therefore, it is a key site in which governing interests might transmit a sense of citizenship appropriate for the productive order of the day, one in which working class Chileans do not self-identify as active subjects in history, but rather as compliant recipients of an already settled future. Anthropologist Tania Murray Li describes an effective system of power, namely an effective government, as "educating desires and configuring habits, aspirations and beliefs" (2007b: 275) among the governed. As I elaborate here, while state agents carry substantial weight in establishing official narratives about history and the organization of public life, state efforts to restrict the social frameworks of memory are only ever partial.

Policy Reform

Chile's Organic Constitutional Law on Teaching, known as the LOCE,[2] was hurriedly promulgated on March 7, 1990, three days before the end of General Augusto Pinochet's seventeen year military regime. Addressing elements in the Chilean Constitution relating to state responsibilities in the realm of education, including minimum conditions for all levels of schooling and guidelines for the credentialing of private establishments, the LOCE firmly entrenched into bureaucratic practice pro-market educational reforms carried

out by the military regime in preceding years (Cox 2003). While in subsequent decades reforms moved away from the heavy emphasis of the 1980s on decentralization and the increased privatization of educational services, the bulk of existing pro-market legislation was achieved under the military government. Until its replacement in 2009, the LOCE remained the ultimate mechanism structuring educational service provision in the country. According to recent student protesters, the LOCE's successor the General Education Law (LGE)[3] makes few improvements on the system's main weaknesses, especially relating to unequal access to quality education. This has been a point of contention for those largely excluded from Chile's so-called free-market economic miracle.

Educational reforms of the 1980s involved a number of transformations to schools and the teaching profession that remain troubling for many in public and private establishments today. These transformations reach well beyond the core demands of recent protesters, who follow on the heels of more than a decade of parallel protests by diverse affected groups. Notable among these was the shorter lived Penguin Revolution of 2006, led by secondary school students whose mobilization instigated talks to draft the new LGE in the first place. Arguably, many who participated in that earlier mobilization became university students behind the 2011 manifestations. Teachers have also staged strikes in the recent decade, disputing the impacts that early reforms have had on their salaries, job security, and credentials. In spite of regular public agitation against the now well-established 1980s reforms, and in spite of strong sympathies across interest groups, stoppages have until recently remained largely segmented. To appreciate why diverse actors (i.e. teachers, students, parents, and school administrators) have not generally taken up each

other's causes, an ethnographic perspective on daily relationships to schooling illuminates that long-term effects of the original reforms have fragmented relations between these groups.

Pedagogical scholar Cristián Cox's (2003) thematization of educational reforms made during the 1980s outlines eight main areas of pro-market re-structuring of the education system under the Pinochet dictatorship. While other reforms to educational policy occurred during the 1990s and 2000s, none fundamentally reversed those introduced in the 1980s. At that time, proponents reasoned that democratic schooling would be best achieved by freeing educational budgets to market forces, ensuring a future apparently unfettered by cumbersome bureaucracies or the demands of entitled unions. Consequences of such reforms are widespread in rural southern Chile, where education is viewed among many poor families to be one of the few attainable resources that promises upward social mobility. Anticipating improved living conditions by way of higher education for their children, many parents have come to depend heavily on credit or to strengthen relationships with private sector sponsors, expecting that such sacrifices will produce future returns for their children. To appreciate how Pinochet's educational policy reform helped revamp the political landscape, let us look more closely at long-term and grounded impacts of the state's retraction from education.

In addition to introduction of the LOCE, Cox notes that the 1980s reforms involved transformations to educational policy in the realms of funding, school administration, teacher regulation, and student evaluation. Some that are relevant to the discussion below are (Cox 2003: 6-12):

218

1. Transfer of management of primary and secondary establishments from ministerial to municipal control.
2. Change of financing system from directing money to schools on basis of historically-demonstrated need, to directing money on a per-student basis (adjusted to average monthly attendance rates).
3. Liberalization of the teaching profession, including removing from teachers their status as public servants, essentially deregulating their salaries. Also, elimination of universities as the sole institutions capable of credentialing teachers.
4. Introduction of a national system for evaluating educational quality.
5. Reduction in state spending on education, including a 27% drop relative to the state budget in that decade.

Cox indicates that initial proponents of the municipalization of education argued that decentralizing the system would lead to more effective management at the local level. He highlights the empty intentions behind this reasoning, given that in the 1980s municipalities were headed by mayors appointed by the Armed Forces, whose agents at the time were apprehensive about opening up education to control by local citizens. Contrary to increased democratic management of the system, municipalization wound up cutting off marginal sectors from ministerial safeguards. So while transfer of management was cast as inclusive and democratic, the fact that it occurred under rigid military control suggests that exclusive and anti-democratic formulations were cunningly at work. In 2011, student protesters argued that this put those studying in poorer schools at an unfair disadvantage for performing well enough on standardized exams to even reach higher education. These protesters opposed efforts by state representatives to blame the victims of this system for their own under-performance, and to fault municipal rather than federal authorities for the

mismanagement of public schools. Interestingly, given that student protesters were concentrated in urban high schools and public universities, the 2011 movement represented a relatively privileged group of Chile's overall student population. At the secondary level, without the support of school administrators, students from remote areas living in boarding houses for their high school studies would have risked eviction for protesting. Meanwhile, at the post-secondary level, poorer students are more likely to attend newer private institutions. This is because older public universities hold the greatest prestige and are thereby the most competitive to enter. Until the 2011 strike, nearly all of Chile's private universities prohibited students from unionizing. As none had even assigned money to student organizations, these students were not represented by the CONFECH (Students' Confederation of Chile),[4] which led the strikes. Protesting students therefore scarcely represented the system's most vulnerable.

The Consumption of Education

While the LOCE and LGE have both promised equal access to quality education for all, in municipalities whose residents can afford an entirely private educational route, this guarantee means little. However, in more marginal areas dependent on state funds, recent laws have reduced equality to equal funding assigned per registered student. One result of this system is that parents in Chile have increasingly become incentive-driven consumers of education, registering children in either public or private subsidized schools that compete for the same state funds. Equality cast in monetary terms alone overlooks costs in transportation, supplies, and infrastructural upkeep that more heavily affect schools in

outlying areas. In some places, new programs for the most marginal are meant to catch those who would otherwise fall through the cracks. In the school in which I worked, those officially classified as vulnerable and qualifying for additional state services comprised 83% of pupils. However, special programs for these are largely funded through the Ministry of Social Development. External to municipal budgets, they thereby allow municipalities to make educational funding decisions without preoccupation for whether and how to ensure service provision to the poorest students. One aspect of our school in which this played out was with heating, which neither the municipal authority nor external programs funded. In Neltume, temperatures can hover between -5 and 5 degrees Celcius for several months each winter, with snow covering the ground for weeks on end. Parent associations were responsible for pooling money together in order to purchase the firewood necessary to heat their children's classrooms. In classes with the greatest proportion of students living on scarce resources, sometimes money was not even pooled at all, as families without sufficient heating in their own homes could not contribute to such comforts for their children at school. While programs through the Ministry of Social Development ensured some nutritional standards for protecting vulnerable children, as well as limited health care and social assistance, they did not cover the breadth of needs that could arise in isolated localities.

Teachers and school administrators revealed to me diverse strategies for making the most of insufficient funds. In 2008, one teacher who had taught in a multi-grade, single classroom school in the Mariquina countryside for several decades bought a yellow school van to pick up his students on his way to work. For several months he foot the bill for fuel

and repairs, at a cost of nearly a quarter of his salary. He was set to retire the following year, and given that he was the only teacher in his school, he had long been classified as a principal. That year, the municipality withdrew funding for his pupils' transportation, in what he believed was a ploy within the municipality's educational division to encourage parents to transfer their children to a private subsidized school being set up independently nearby. He commented to me bitterly that the promise of free transportation for students was the competitive edge of the new school established in a rented country hall. That autumn, my colleague's school was shut down due to low enrollment, permitting the municipality to re-allocate the school's funds elsewhere. As it was the last year before his retirement, this demoted his pension to that of a substitute teacher, the position he occupied in his last months of work. The cost-cutting efficiency implied by the municipalization of public schooling, that is its management by municipal instead of ministerial authorities, has facilitated the erosion of basic educational and workplace standards.

The introduction of a national system for evaluation of educational quality may seem harmless on first glance. However, this too plays out in perverse ways in schools with precarious funding. Standardized testing conducted in all schools nationally became the total priority in ours in the last months of the academic year. While only two of eight[5] primary grades wrote the SIMCE[6] (short for the Measurement System of Educational Quality) exams, for six weeks no photocopies could be made for other courses. All resources were directed to forty students upon whom future funding depended, as high scores on the tests could earn financial rewards for the school. Teachers' jobs were also at stake. Poor performances on the memorization-based tests could lead to the further transfer

of pupils to the private subsidized Catholic school across the road, especially if parents came to perceive ours to be an inferior establishment. Our school's yearly strategy of funnelling resources to strong performances on standardized exams had debilitating effects on the externally-funded second language program that colleagues and I were trying to implement. In addition to restricted photocopy privileges, students conditioned to excel in passive learning (i.e. memorization and recall) had never developed the skills to express themselves in creative and interactive situations like those proposed in English oral communication classes.

Recent curriculum and textbook reforms have attempted to modify the approach to teaching, intending to render learning more active and inductive. Especially in English studies, this wound up reinforcing class inequality. In the public system, English is the first foreign language taught and is required for Chilean students as of the fifth grade. Before this, they may or may not be exposed to it in private schools with special funds to this end. However, the textbooks teachers are required to follow begin at a level far superior than basic English. Catering to an emergent philosophy of active learning, this design encourages making pupils more responsible for their own skills development. Consequences of this approach were apparent among high school students who had internalized as personal deficiency their inability to acquire even basic second language abilities. This encouraged a sense of failure for not comprehending school texts, which in high school included readings from Shakespeare (challenging material for even those whose first language is English). Textbooks far beyond learner abilities were compounded by content referring mainly to urban contexts and concerns unfamiliar to students, many of whom had never even travelled

to the nearest regional capital. Teachers told me that in other subjects, they routinely had to adapt examples to rural realities. Textbooks required students to imagine manoeuvring stop lights while driving in their own vehicles, luxuries that not even their parents enjoyed. Activities also referred to scenarios that undermined the retention of learner interest, particularly to privileged aspects of consumer life to which they had never been exposed. Examples shared with me by teachers were activities for purchasing clothing in a shopping mall or selecting between movies to view in the cinema. This was the uneven footing upon which the quality of schools would be evaluated nationally.

Textbooks transmitted more than a sense of personal inferiority to students, as learning resources were increasingly peppered with product placement that encouraged their self-identification as consumers. Shortly after completing my fieldwork, colleagues pursuing teacher training sent me an image from a new textbook containing an advertisement for a prominent orange juice company. It was accompanied by activities on whether it was more economical to buy a larger or several smaller containers of Watt's orange juice. Reduction in state funding for schooling has been accompanied by private sector investments with unambiguously profit-driven motives to educate the tastes and desires of young Chileans.

Historical Debt

Reforms from the 1980s impact different generations of teachers in distinct ways, forcing each into situations of financial precarity by different means. Those who practiced the profession during and prior to the 1980s are approaching retirement today, with

uncertain pensions exacerbated by inconsistent municipal management of payouts and benefits. Meanwhile, those who were trained in recent decades, often in newly established private institutes, have little possibility of paying off heavy student loans without severe restrictions on their mobility and employment options. This younger generation of teachers is more likely to work for lower wages in private subsidized schools, where they are precariously subject to termination shortly before reaching permanent employment status. Colleagues explained to me that, by law, teachers qualify for permanent health and pension benefits after five years with the same employer. Nevertheless, horror stories abounded among my younger peers, of people with whom they had done their teacher training who had been terminated from work in private schools shortly before benefits would have kicked in.

In the southern countryside, younger teachers working in public schools that are managed by municipalities have greater job security than peers in private subsidized schools. All the same, fear of losing pupils to nearby establishments impedes the ability of younger teachers to mobilize alongside older colleagues demanding restitution of what is widely referred to in Chile as the "historical debt." Older teachers claim that during the 1980s, when the profession was liberalized, salaries were cut by as much as 75%. At the time, a world recession was blamed. Educators were told that upon the return of national prosperity, their lost wages would be recovered. This trickle-down effect never happened. Salaries have since increased, but remain well below the wages of similar professionals who did not endure such drastic cuts. The pay of teachers today sits as much as 200% below what would be expected had cuts never occurred. By my deliberately conservative

225

assessment, affected public teachers each lost more than $50,000 in the form of lost wages and reduced pension contributions over more than two decades. It is for this reason that in recent years thousands have gone on strike annually, demanding among other things recognition of a debt that many believe is owed by the state to teachers who had their wages cut in the 1980s.

Both of 2010's presidential candidates denied the existence of the historical debt, leaving affected teachers particularly frustrated with their political options. During a month-long national strike while I worked as an elementary and high school teacher, our school administrators effectively pressured staff to continue working. It was argued that funding was endangered by the potential of frustrated parents transferring pupils to the town's other school, a state-subsidized private institution that was not on strike. Given that the school's funding directly depended on registered pupils, each student transferred out would represent real reductions in its monthly operating budget. In spite of expressed sympathy for their peers, younger colleagues who were not directly affected by the historical debt did not stand in solidarity with their striking colleagues in the same union. While teachers in urban areas proved less vulnerable to the consequences of work stoppages, and carried the movement for several weeks that year, in our rural school only four of twenty-one teachers went on strike.

Lingering irresolution of the historical debt causes frequent tension with parents and younger teachers who are weary of repetitive cycles of strikes. In my experience, while many of these individuals were not ideologically opposed to organized labour, they were vulnerable to the immediate impacts that extended yearly strikes had on household budgets.

226

By local accounts, over the past fifteen years, permissive financial lending to members of the lower and middle classes has been driven by a colossal expansion of pre-approved credit cards not only by banks, but by major department stores and grocery chains. Despite higher prices in large chain stores than in locally-owned food, clothing, and household supplies outlets, the option to purchase goods on multi-payment quotas encourages consumers to finance even the most basic commodities, including milk and bread. Scholars have noted that, on the heels of the democratic transition, this sudden consumer power initially signalled a promise of inclusion in the national community for many in the most marginal sectors of the population (See Stillerman 2004; Tinsman 2006). One no longer had to marvel at the washing machines, cellular telephones, and sofa sets on television, as the promise of credit came to present itself as a promise of a better, more democratic future, in which all could apparently participate. These scholars also observe important gender and family dimensions to the rapid proliferation of consumer culture in neoliberal Chile.

In 2010, social inclusion via credit-driven purchasing power was scarcely the reality I encountered. A case in point is the strain that the CMR card puts on families. This card is promoted by a bank belonging to and named after one of Chile's largest department stores, Falabella. As it is accepted in affiliated hardware and grocery stores, as well as in travel agencies and insurance companies, some families have taken to purchasing all their needs on this and similar cards, piling household debt onto the shoulders of card-holding family members. In one home in which I stayed, suggestion of paying for anything with the mother's CMR card routinely provoked resentful arguments. When Sra. Dolores' husband retired a year earlier, he decided that having financially supported her throughout his

working life, it was now her turn to support him. Cutting his wife off financially was partly driven by a teacher's pension that scarcely met his basic needs, and which compromised his ability to continue subsidizing his mistress' home. On several occasions, his wife discovered from neighbours that he had made household purchases in the local supermarket of items that never wound up in her home. While her informal labour of feeding lunch to construction workers and hosting boarders in her home brought in a modest income, it did not usually earn her enough to make minimum payments on her CMR card. So while her husband felt that he had supported her financially throughout the years, he continued to enjoy the convenience of items previously purchased in her name and for which she remained indebted, such as the washing machine with which she cleaned his clothes and the kitchen table on which he ate.

Permissive financial lending has also come with at least two conditions. First, while one pays for credit into an indefinite future, usually in minimum installments that invisibly inflate original costs, goods purchased are restricted to *present* needs and comforts. This became a predicament for one teacher I knew who, in spite of a recent cancer diagnosis that sent him on a year's sick leave, could purchase a flat screen television in twenty-four monthly installments on his CMR card. Meanwhile, he could no longer secure state credit for his son to complete university studies, to himself become a school teacher and potentially help with the burden of staggering household debt already frustrated by the cost of bi-monthly chemotherapy treatments. Many in much better circumstances are equally hard-pressed to take on the burden of student debt. With government subsidized student loans involving the highest interest rates in the country, leaders of the 2011 protests rallied

masses of supporters on the fact that it is actually cheaper to mortgage the family home to finance a child's post-secondary studies, than it is to take out student loans.

Systemic Silences

Most disturbing is the impact that the liberalization of the teaching profession has on the well-being of children. This does not mean that policy has not anticipated their well-being, but that the gap between policy and reality can be substantial. My colleague Don Erwin observed this in the Ministry of Education's emphasis on rights, in what he felt was its almost excessive insistence on the universal rights of the child. Referring to Ministry officials, he confided in me:

> **Don Erwin:** *Rarely have I heard them talk about the other R, that of responsibility. They have chewed away on the notion of rights, that the child has the right to not be harmed, neither psychologically nor physically. Meanwhile, never have they for example indicated that a child can't assault his peer, that he must respect others, that to be respected means to respect.* (Personal communication, June 2010)

For Don Erwin, today's curriculum undermines the teacher's ability to encourage social responsibility and to affirm the rights that are so eloquently guaranteed by the state. In his view, grand displays of democratizing education, of opening up schooling to the poorer classes, mean little without direct investment in citizenship education. Not only was instruction in civics (i.e. government structures, the electoral system, the role of the state in

contemporary society) removed from all levels of the public curriculum during the Pinochet regime, it has only been nominally reintroduced since (See Reyes Jedlicki 2004).

Absence of instruction in civics did not produce subjects that expected nothing of the state, but it did seem to amplify confusion about what to expect of it. I observed this on occasions when staff lacked the available means of affirming what they considered to be their own civic responsibilities. At one staff party, I overheard a conversation turn to the frequency of child sexual abuse in isolated rural sectors like the one in which we worked. Half of my high school students were young parents, and there were female students in the school known to have been prostituted by relatives. In a nearby sector, a community health official indicated to me that their agency tracked at least two hundred known cases of domestic abuse against children and incest among less than a thousand families. Shortly before our staff event, it had come to light that a young boy in our school was being sexually abused by an older cousin. The ensuing conversation among staff saw some speculate that unless the criminal were caught in the act, there was little use reporting them. A daycare worker described a toddler she once cared for who could not sit for pain in her groin, an area evidently bruised when they changed her diapers. Another vowed that at the clinic to which they take such cases, at most a report is written up. My colleagues were visibly distraught by the inability to ensure that authorities would intervene in cases of child sexual abuse. Their conversation recalled a lunch-lady in whom a child had once confided. The lunch-lady had gone to the police with the eight-year-old's confession. She went on to be harassed by relatives of the alleged victim for most of that year, enduring rocks thrown through the windows of her home and intimidation of her own children. No charges were

ever laid by the authorities. Experiences like this led staff to conclude that without bureaucratic will by way of consistent inter-agency coordination, formal guarantees to protect the rights of children amounted to lip-service for convincing the world that Chile is actually a developed country.

What can we glean by simply observing the concern among staff over inadequate coordination between the school, health authority, and police? First, an ineffective child protection system was seen to impede their ability to behave as responsible citizens, and this was attributed to state agencies not functioning at minimum levels promised in eloquent declarations about the rights of children. Second, discussion among staff about their reticence to affirm civic responsibilities in their role as service providers to children, was motivated by a sense similar to political withdrawal described in the previous chapter. They expressed that one person alone can do very little to change a system rigged against families of the working poor. This cynicism was amplified by distrust not in state structures alone, but also in neighbours and others in one's community. It openly extended to professionals in the health clinic up the road and to the police with whom one may be on a first name basis. In the eyes of staff, a person who sticks their neck out could not expect anyone to follow their lead. Even among colleagues, no one expected that anyone beyond one's own family would ever lend moral support in times of need, and among family there was still no guarantee. This perspective was driven home by one daycare worker in her mid-twenties who solemnly repeated that she took the lunch-lady's lesson to heart. She vowed several times that evening that, found in a similar situation, she would not get involved: *"No me meto, no me meto en esas cosas."*

Amidst a system that perpetuates class inequalities through its standardized curriculum, that discourages solidarity between educators and parents, and undermines the civic commitments of frontline workers responsible for child welfare protection, what possibilities exist for the critical instruction of historical factors that orchestrated this social fragmentation? What does this constrained social framework imply for the classroom transmission of knowledge about the recently conflictive past?

Teaching History

Curiously, greater job security in the public system means that a degree of discretion is afforded teachers and principals who work in state-managed schools, to broach historical events of a contentious nature in the classroom. While high school textbooks only summarily address the recently conflictive past, public sector teachers seem to have greater autonomy to insert their views into classroom dialogues and supplementary activities. For instance, a young colleague in his late-twenties told me that the state's tendency to refer to the Pinochet regime as the "military government" (the preferred term in assigned textbooks), had a confusing effect on students who had no critical exposure to that history in the home or in their broader community.[7] Gastón recounted that in his first year of teaching, to his surprise a high school pupil guessed that "the dictatorship" referenced the rule of former head of state Bernardo O'Higgins, one of the country's founding fathers who served as Supreme Director of Chile shortly after Independence in the early nineteenth century. While teacher and student were separated in age by only ten years, the former expressed to me a feeling that a deep chasm seemed to exist between their respective understandings of

recent national history. He recognized that his students were not oblivious to the nature of that history, but he reasoned that they lacked available explanations for how diverse traces of the past should fit together.

Gastón's approach was to not shy away from questions about the contested past that, as the school year wore on, he found students were increasingly comfortable with posing him. He sensed that they were often confirming knowledge already peripherally known but difficult to address directly in other social milieus. This knowledge most often pertained to local impacts of military repression, such as events surrounding the settlement of the Lolquellen neighbourhood in the city of Panguipulli, when hundreds of lumber workers and their families kicked out of the Panguipulli interior squatted on private property on the outskirts of town. He did not take liberties to throw the formal curriculum out the window, in spite of himself favouring a more working class vision of history. Rather, Gastón treated the classroom as a neutral space in which he could speak about aspects of the contested past with an openness to multiple points of view on concrete events. It is worth noting that he had a secure position working in an isolated municipal school for which it was difficult to recruit staff. By contrast, another young teacher who worked in a private school in the semi-urban hub of a neighbouring commune, told me that she could lose her job for "*being political,*" that is for too directly addressing with her students aspects of the contested past which may offend the sensibilities of parents or administrators. While she told me that she would not deflect student questions, unlike Gastón she was apprehensive that speaking too freely about her sympathies for the working poor could damage her chances of being re-hired in subsequent years.

All the same, I never gathered from colleagues in public schools that lessons in their establishments were any more critical of the prevailing system than those of private sector peers. Their explanations to me signal that restricted education of history involves more silences than those in curricular content decided at a ministerial level. Teachers wishing to insert a critical element into lessons indicated that they must do so with anticipated goals and strategies, so as to avoid being seen unfavourably as disrupting an established peace. They reveal that the state is not uniquely responsible for weak transmission of knowledge about the recently conflictive past within the classroom. Assigned textbooks and Ministry of Education approved course plans undoubtedly leave large segments of national history formally silent, especially regarding details surrounding the Popular Unity, the 1973 coup, and the pacted nature of the democratic transition. Nevertheless, teachers are also restricted in their treatment of certain episodes by the perceived desires of families, for whom the conflictive past may remain uncomfortable to broach. Accusations of "*being political*" appear to affect educators even in sectors once the site of strong leftist solidarity, such as in Neltume. Don Erwin explained to me that many from older generations in that town are not interested in transmitting to their children painful memories of repression, indignities, and hardship endured throughout the Pinochet regime. During the early 1980s, when guerrilla militants were discovered to have set up camps in the surrounding hillsides, grandmothers of many of his students were repeatedly interrogated by soldiers over the whereabouts of adult children who had fled into exile following the 1973 coup. If these people had not explained to youth why relatives in faraway cities like Brussels and Saskatoon were brutally removed from life in Neltume, who was he to begin this discussion?

234

Attentive to sentiments among the parents and grandparents of his students, Don Erwin's approach to the education of history and civics was to encourage self-reflection and to help students perceive contemporary social issues from multiple angles. Not unlike the philospher Tzvetan Todorov (mentioned in Chapter 2), Don Erwin found that one need not focus on the particularities of horrendous episodes in the past to draw lessons from them. For him, to teach uncomfortable aspects of Neltume's history was only worth it if one could help students divert attention away from the singularity of military kidnappings, massacres, and exile, or from a romanticized notion of guerrilla resistance. The teacher's task was therefore seen as generating empathy for diverse interests throughout society, as a means of avoiding the reproduction of social divisions rooted in the past. In this vision, the teacher's purpose is not so much to deal with historical truth, as to aspire for well-being and a recovered sense of community for future generations. Don Erwin described to me the attention he paid to complicating his students' relationships with mass media, so that they may confront dominant narratives that he believed keep Chileans distrusting of one another. In his view, these narratives prevalent in popular soap operas and the nightly news portray the poor as uneducated, prone to criminality, and as lacking in the expert knowledge to extricate themselves from hardship. Regarding mainstream news, he observed that:

> **Don Erwin:** *The press in general doesn't display that which is positive,*
> *such images are very scarce. It's always the negative, the dangerous. So*
> *the child is guided by an idea in which news is, say, 90% police news and*
> *10% social* (Personal communication, June 2010).

Don Erwin went on to describe media as deeply influenced by an idea of politics in which one opts for one side or the other, that is always binary and empty of personal reflection or investments. He saw his purpose in the classroom as helping students to see the social world in greater nuance than in binary oppositions between good and bad, poor and rich, left and right. Without naming it as such, he too advocated what Todorov calls the exemplary use of the past, as a means of learning how to live together and of transforming violent experiences into vehicles for social justice. In this social framework of memory, that which would not help accomplish this transformative goal is deliberately filtered out by those who guide transmission, be they families uninterested in speaking about the past or teachers respecting such silences. Ironically, in practice Don Erwin's focus on fostering critical thought towards contemporary society still largely relegates the transmission of formal historical knowledge to a school curriculum that places national history in the distant past, as a series of events that ended sometime in the 1960s.

This section has exposed how classroom lessons on history and civics are by no means the only, or even the most prominent aspects of formal schooling in which Chileans learn about options for political and citizen involvement. As parents are rendered incentive-driven consumers of education, and as the ability of unions to bargain collectively is undermined by precarious employment conditions, the education system reveals the broader social context in which the working poor increasingly appear complicit with their own withdrawal from civic affairs. Michel Foucault's notion of government involving an art of social control that he names the conduct of conduct, or *la conduite des conduites* (Foucault

1975 & 1994[1982]), can help us appreciate impacts of lingering Pinochet era reforms. It is to this logic of governance that Tania Murray Li, mentioned in the opening of this chapter, refers when she calls a system of power effective for educating desires and configuring habits, aspirations, and beliefs among the governed.[8] By treating liberal democratic governance as a set of practices that guide the behaviour and even preferences of citizens, we may appreciate forms of power exercised through engagement with the other, rather than through outright confrontation between state and discomforming subjects. In this fashion, educational policy reforms have reinforced for rural southerners a message that Pinochet largely communicated via force: that the Chilean nation is a community of unequals in which all must know their place.

Gifts with Strings Attached

Shifting from the grounded perspective of daily experiences in schools, the remainder of this chapter approaches the state's teaching of Chileans about options for political and citizen involvement in spaces well removed from the classroom. In this section, I explore motives behind the increase in private sponsors of education in recent decades, turning attention to parties responsible for filling in the gaps when state funding of social services is withdrawn. I argue that development programs financed by private sponsors are not merely cost-saving initiatives compelled by top-down austerity measures. They emerge from a revamped political landscape, in which widespread processes to privatize social services, liberalize trade, deregulate economies, and decentralize public administration have, as ethnographer Suzana Sawyer describes of Ecuador, progressively

"release[d] the state from its role of championing the social development and betterment of its people" (2004: 14). I observe that, when social services formerly provided by the state arrive in the form of gifts instead of as citizen rights, they entice recipients into relationships of reciprocity with donors, whereby gifts entail expectations for return favours. What do poor residents of Chile's southern countryside have to offer in return for charity, as counter-gifts to the generosity of corporate donors? In the contexts discussed here, they have little else to proffer but their consent to the multi-national extraction of natural resources that surround them and on which they have historically depended for their own well-being.

Economies of Incentive

Since the democratic transition, in Chile donations by the wealthy to the poor have been encouraged by 1990 tax reforms that introduced what is widely known as the Valdés Law (See Author & Date Unknown; Faúndez 2008).[9] This stipulates that corporate and individual donors to artistic and cultural projects may receive a 50% tax break on moneys donated, up to 2% of earnings. It is such a lucrative prospect for some donors, that private foundations set up by affluent families and corporations are not uncommon beneficiaries towards which the very wealthy may direct their reduced tax contributions for a percentage of income. The Huilo Huilo Foundation, for whom I worked in 2009 to elaborate an English Second Language program in Neltume, is one such case. It has a mission to promote environmental conservation and the transfer of labour skills of area residents from lumber to tourism industries. The foundation is particularly dedicated to helping townspeople acquire skills to host high-paying tourists, as well as to sell locally-produced hands crafts to visitors.

238

These come to the area to snowboard or trek on the volcano's glacier, to enjoy South America's longest zip line, to appreciate several crashing waterfalls and to hike along botanical paths in former lumber estates now cast as pristine temperate rainforest.

The Huilo Huilo tourism initiative successfully campaigned to have a 60,000 hectare space to the south of Neltume, principally the former Pilmaiquén estate, declared a World Biosphere Reserve by UNESCO in 2007. Interest in this designation was not purely ecological, as it was an important step in re-branding this town built on timber extraction as a lucrative adventure getaway to Chile's southern wilderness. The Huilo Huilo Tourism Corporation pursues an ambitious goal; I have personally heard its owners aspire to put Neltume in the same category as other Chilean tourist meccas, such as San Pedro de Atacama and Puerto Natales. Technically speaking, the Huilo Huilo Foundation is an autonomous project, even though it is administrated by members of the same family who installed and manage Huilo Huilo Tourism's five-star Baobab and Magic Mountain hotels five kilometres east of town. Both became functioning hotels in the mid-2000s, their unusual structures—one shaped as a giant tree house and the other as a volcano—attracting international media attention rating them among the most exotic hotels in the world. In light of the owners' considerable economic investment in the area, motivations behind the affiliated charitable foundation are not purely philanthropic. Family members behind the Huilo Huilo initiative, who are based in Santiago, also own several plastics and manufacturing companies, including since the early 2000s Neltume's lumber factory. Installing a charitable foundation in town has therefore offered a means of using otherwise taxable income to invest in the resident population as a labour pool whose future skills

could benefit Huilo Huilo business operations (See Appendix E: The Huilo Huilo Initiative in Neltume).

The Valdés law similarly benefits members of the *Corporación de Adelanto Amigos de Panguipulli* (mentioned in Chapter 1), as this group was formed by wealthy property-owners in the commune to coordinate their respective benevolent projects. Compared to neighbouring communes, Panguipulli has more than its fair share of patron foundations, owing in no small part to the persistence of large estates, a form of property distribution reminiscent of the hacienda era. The president of the People Help People[10] Corporation, which is run by the Von Appen family with historical ties to the commune, is currently serving as a municipal councillor. That organization sponsors three technical high schools, one elementary school, and a nursery school in Panguipulli, and has also built a health clinic and teachers' houses. However, while tax benefits in recent decades have dramatically bolstered the incentive of private sponsors to donate to social and cultural projects, legislation is but one mechanism for stimulating private sector involvement in social development. This is evident in the publicity that corporate sponsors in particular seek to generate through donations, where fostering good public relations is incentive enough for large companies to finance social and cultural projects. Corporate gifts to residents affected by industrial incursions are what interest me most here. Nevertheless, I would argue that the conclusions drawn about the de-politicizing effects of relations of patronage in the countryside may also be applied to wealthy donors of diverse forms, including to my former employer.[11] As I elaborate below, charity de-politicizes the public sphere because its very nature implies that affluent donors are those who decide what social projects are funded,

with what degree of commitment, and most importantly, who are the most deserving recipients.

In localities affected by pending industrial projects, corporate actors seeking to intervene in the natural landscape typically offer gifts to local schools in the form of scholarships, transportation grants, and basic supplies. Donations are often accompanied by carefully orchestrated photo opportunities, in which company representatives are snapped in sharp-looking field jackets kneeling with smiling children. In glossy self-published newsletters and in Valdivia's regional newspaper the *Diario Austral*, Celco, Endesa, and SN Power have all appeared celebrating their role as harbingers of development and social improvement.[12] During her fieldwork in the 1990s, Suzana Sawyer observed similar patterns among companies seeking to extract petroleum in the Ecuadorian Amazon. Gifts and development projects "ranged from candies to tin roofing, from school supplies to a new schoolhouse, from airplane rides to high school scholarships" (2004: 9). As her depiction indicates, schooling is not the sole aspect of local life to which privately-sponsored development funds may be directed, but it is an important one. Its prevalence in donor initiatives suggests the prominence of formal education in the lives of the poor, or at least its role as a beacon of social inclusion.

In rural southern Chile, apart from health clinics and firefighter associations, schools are among the few local institutions that directly impact a large cross-section of a local population. Signs of corporate interests in the education of poor children are abundant in Mariquina and Panguipulli. During my time there, every pupil in Neltume used scribblers with Endesa's brand name on the cover. Meanwhile, in San José sports teams having

adopted the name *Forestales* (as in Forestry Companies) wore jerseys with pine tree logos.[13] In one Mapuche community whose ceremonial field posed to be flooded by a hydroelectric facility, company-sponsored cultural seminars saw indigenous educators shuttled in from Temuco to teach about traditional foods, games, and legends. And in Reyehueico and Pirehueico, small junctions near Liquiñe and Neltume, SN Power and Endesa respectively celebrated in public announcements that they had donated brand new wood-burning combustion units to heat remote schools.

This economy of gift-giving invites questions about the motivations of those who give, especially their interests in giving to certain groups of people and not others. Marcel Mauss' (1990[1922]) thesis on the sociology of the gift is relevant here, as he observes that no gift is ever entirely for free. Anthropologist Nancy Scheper-Hughes describes the 'tyranny of the gift' in contexts of extreme socio-economic disparity between giver and recipient, whereby receivers become coercively bound to their benefactors. Drawing on Mauss in her work on living organ donor transplants, she argues that pure altruism is an illusion. In words fit for the apparent concern that I saw SN Power, Endesa, and Celco representatives display for education, she argues that gifts "inevitably come with strings, making the recipient beholden in crucial ways" (2007: 508). What might be expected in return for corporate patronage of underfunded southern schools? Certainly it is not ownership of natural resources for extraction, as privatized subsoil and water exploitation rights have ensured that local residents have minimal claim to these. Nor can it be to secure the good opinion of youth, who are nowhere near the age to vote or formally participate in civic debates. Interactions that I observed in one town hall forum on the subject of

242

compensation for a planned hydroelectric facility, uncover dynamics that seldom appear in mainstream press or company brochures regarding private sector donations to social projects. A close analysis of that event highlights corporate interests in orchestrating negotiations over compensation.

Community & Consensus

In my observations, the reception of corporate gifts is normally uneventful. Delivered scribblers were not turned away, but in the school in which I worked, nor were the companies behind these donations widely praised by staff or parents for the gestures. While teachers and students appeared in company brochures disseminating news of the delivery of larger gifts, such as the $400 heating units, the degree of gratitude among recipients was difficult to measure. Much like appreciating the nature of political withdrawal, the visible absence of gratitude invites an assessment of how the arrival and lingering presence of corporations seeking to develop industrial projects is experienced locally. Signs of local judgments can be observed in a number of contexts, such as the great difficulty that companies often encounter in recruiting affected residents to be corporate advocates. They are also evident in the frequent use of Special Forces agents to apparently guard the peace at public forums, as well as the lengths to which companies may go to refashion community leadership structures. Finally, the perception among affected residents that gifts offered are minor operational costs for the corporations involved, is perhaps most telling of local judgments on corporate activities in rural areas.

When I attended an August 2009 town meeting led by a group that referred to itself as the Neltume Sector Working Roundtable (*Mesa de trabajo sector Neltume*),[14] Endesa's local preparations for a hydroelectric installation that would divert the adjacent Fuy River were already two years in the making. The company had yet to submit its Environmental Impact Assessment to the regional commission on the environment, but was expected to do so within the coming six months. Dubbed by the hosts as a forum, this meeting was held in the gym of Neltume's only private subsidized school. The meeting could have hosted several times the two hundred people who showed up. Colleagues with whom I attended, who were also teachers in the public school across the road, indicated that even a modest representation of a third of town adults would require three times the number present.

-Fieldnotes Summary from Neltume's Town Forum, August 2009

Perhaps hoping that more residents would arrive, the hosts delayed starting for an hour after the announced 7:00 p.m. gathering. During that time, half a dozen Roundtable members bustled about behind a long table at the head of the gym that was arranged with microphones and documents. This was a small group of town residents who considered negotiation with Endesa to be in Neltume's best interest. In the absence of the town's formal leadership having taken charge of such an effort, these individuals had taken it upon themselves to engage in dialogue invited by the company.

The professional ambiance aspired to by the hosts was uncharacteristic of this mountain town, in which working men commonly walk around in rubber boots, reflective construction vests, hard hats, with chain saws in hand. The contrast between the projected expertise of Roundtable members, and an audience keen to head home after a cold workday, was signalled in the tired faces of those in attendance who

244

*waited quietly as Andean flute music played on loudspeakers. The crowd had arrived in pairs and small groups, and waited largely in silence, bundled up in the open-air facility that was exposed to the humid winter night. At the meeting's opening, approximately one hundred and forty adults sat on bleachers along the sides of the gym, with sixty sitting in chairs arranged on the floor facing the head table. Having promptly arrived with my public school colleagues and their spouses, I sat in a middle row of the floor section. Elected authorities such as Panguipulli's municipal councillors and the mayor were conspicuously absent from that town forum, but the state's presence was made known in the form of nearly two dozen Special Forces agents who roamed about in pairs in the darkness outside. They must have travelled several hundred kilometres to attend, as no Special Forces unit was based in the entire commune of Panguipulli. Without prior conflict having transpired in Neltume over Endesa's proposed installation, my colleagues reasoned that these armed commandos known as the GOPE (*Grupo de Operaciones Policiales Especiales*), *must have been invited and remunerated by none other than the company.*

This event would prove subdued compared to those occurring over similar industrial incursions advancing elsewhere in the commune. Not unlike the mood in a town meeting with SN Power in Liqiuñe over two years earlier, Neltume's August 2009 Roundtable forum was saturated with unspoken tensions. The earlier forum hosted in Liquiñe's fire hall had turned so rowdy that I was later told that it ended with almost everybody being accused by one neighbour or another of having sold out to the company. Several young men had even spray-painted the back of a company executive's jacket.

Despite the calamitous outfall of its meeting with residents of Liquiñe, SN Power would claim for several years on its webpage, that it had held consultation meetings with as many as 250 affected residents at a time. Except for that initial meeting, which was followed up six months later with one in ancestral territories on the outskirts of town (in which executives were formally expelled from the area's Mapuche communities), no other gathering that addressed the hydroelectrics attracted so many attendees. Being able to meet with residents affected by their projects, regardless of the actual nature of such meetings, was a public relations advantage for the company. The media use to which SN Power put having gathered a significant amount of residents affected by its projects paid no heed to the opinion that those congregated held of the company. This suggests that no matter how sincere the hope was among Neltume's Roundtable members that more people would attend their meeting, for Endesa the August 2009 gathering may ultimately have had little to do with building consensus in favour of the hydroelectric project. Endesa benefitted either way from being able to claim in regional and national media to be a leader in participatory democracy. After all, it could now point out that it had held large meetings attended by hundreds of affected residents to negotiate compensation agreements. In a mediatic sleight of hand, announcements proclaiming the success of such meetings could overshadow more spontaneous and self-organized gatherings of affected residents. Nearly all of those gatherings expressed discontent with corporate incursions, but they involved behaviour outside of the kind of participation that the corporation—and implicitly the state—desired of citizens. Therefore, local Roundtables that negotiate with companies outside of established leadership structures, offer corporations a means for creating the semblance of

democracy when local consent for industrial activities is actually lacking. This helps explain why the Roundtables I observed went to great lengths to establish their legitimacy and professionalism.

-Fieldnotes Summary from Neltume's Town Forum, August 2009 (continued)

All Roundtable members were known residents of Neltume, yet they repeatedly referred to one another by executive positions on their self-styled committee. In chuckles shared by those with whom I sat, the problem was that they were president, vice president, treasurer, secretary, and so forth of an unspecified body of voters. As a self-appointed committee of locals whose intentions were to negotiate with Endesa, the Roundtable reflected neither the town's elected nor appointed representatives, namely the heads of the Residents' Board,[15] Potable Water Committee, volunteer firefighters' association, and schools. Prior to this event, Roundtable members had mostly gone about their activities by consulting smaller interest groups on a case-by-case basis. Until recently, this approach had helped them dodge accusations that they had no legitimate authority to negotiate with the company as representatives of local residents.

To further establish legitimacy, the summary of the Roundtable's work began with a list of meetings to date.[16] While many of the listed meetings were with political leaders and elected representatives in the commune of Panguipulli, none had been with actual residents or institutions from Neltume. The list was concluded with mention of having also carried out "many benevolent activities not detailed here." An example of unspecified acts of kindness was recounted in a story about Roundtable members having brought a wood-burning stove to a school in a nearby frontier village. This was presented as an initiative of pure compassion, "as we all know how important it is to keep the kids warm."

The chilly evening made it difficult to assess whether the lack of applause among more than half of the audience upon the conclusion of this list was an expression of disapproval for the Roundtable's generous deeds, or rather a sign of fatigue given the harsh weather. Dissatisfaction would emerge in public comments yet to come.

Frequent mention by Roundtable members of the meeting's function as a 'neutral space' spoke to what was on the minds of many in attendance. Several formal town committees were already fractured from disagreements over whether and how to engage with Endesa's efforts at negotiating an impact-benefit agreement. Some of these institutions could not properly carry out their duties, as elected leaders resigned in frustration and others were accused of ineptitude.

In Neltume, several aspects of Endesa's manner for engaging residents parallel Suzana Sawyer's (2004) description of multinational investors in Ecuador. In Sawyer's analysis, company agents argue that each resident has the right to participate in the negotiation process, yet the corporation pursues alliances with only those willing to permit well sites on their properties. This undermines the long-term influence of regional indigenous organizations that represent tens of thousands more people than the several dozen willing to negotiate with the company. Sawyer argues that this is a creative re-alignment of institutions and bodies, in order to create new identities in territories affected by industrial development. Specifically, these new identities are disposed to corporate and state objectives for accelerated petroleum extraction. Not unlike Sawyer's observations in Ecuador, in Neltume we see that legislative reforms to privatize water, and institutional restructuring to expand needs for social service provision, lay the groundwork by which

market forces may more effectively appeal to residents impacted by industrial incursions. These processes also prompt some individuals to negotiate for fear that they may otherwise lose out on an opportunity for social improvement, creating new civic organizations based not on vested community relations, but on self-interest.

Education in Entrepreneurship

SN Power and Endesa's officials also commonly expressed concern that their development projects help empower locals with their own social development. However, such ambitions had an ambiguous track record. Among Mapuche leaders in the Neltume Lake Mapuche communities located seven kilometres down the road, I had heard that company officials insisted that no long-term benefit would come to recipients of aid if locals became dependent on the company's patronage. On one occasion, I attended a meeting of a dozen leaders from those indigenous communities affected by the same hydroelectric project. The leaders described how one Endesa-funded initiative to build several dozen sheds for livestock and tools near the homes of diverse community members had proven divisive. Shed materials had been unevenly distributed, and in some cases the materials were entirely lacking. In that meeting with Neltume Lake indigenous leaders, it emerged that my invitation to discuss the matter with them was in hopes that I could help draft future development proposals to present to the company.

The Neltume Lake leaders were dealing with frustrated communities, and yet they had been blamed by company officials for not adequately anticipating the execution of the sheds project. As a caveat to future funding, they were told that the company's willingness

to compensate locals for its hydroelectric plant required that communities wishing to negotiate have a clearer idea about what development projects to pursue and how to realize them. No cash payment was available as compensation, even though a number of homes close to the lakeside and a ceremonial field would be flooded should the Fuy River be diverted into the lake, as planned. In efforts to convince me that I would not need to collaborate with the company directly if I helped them with designing development projects, these leaders explained that 'people like me' were already prohibited from arriving with Mapuche leaders to meetings with Endesa representatives. People like me who were prohibited from accompanying community members to meetings with company officials were three classes of professionals: 1) lawyers, 2) notary publics, and 3) anthropologists. All of these would be particularly well-positioned to dispute Endesa's tactics for guiding the negotiation process.

-Fieldnotes Summary from Neltume's Town Forum, August 2009 (continued)

Neltume's Roundtable president had briefly been a student in one of my evening English classes for adults. Taking the microphone, Sra. Patricia explained that their committee had formed on December 27, 2007 with twenty-eight people attending a similar public forum in the same gym.[17] Among their group's first activities following that meeting was to run a $12,000 competitive fund "to directly benefit the people of Neltume." In accordance with the suggestions of the fund's patron, Endesa, the money would go to supporting small business endeavours that appealed to the budding tourism industry. This fund was eventually increased to $16,000, and proposals were evaluated by the Roundtable itself (See Appendix F: Endesa's Competitive Funds in Neltume). Ever since that initial public gathering was attended two years earlier by a

dismal twenty-eight of some 3,000 town residents, Endesa had not ventured to host residents in another public dialogue event. August 2009's was the first local meeting that publicly broached the theme of an impact-benefit agreement for the hydroelectric project, and if we were to take the insistence of Roundtable members to heart, Endesa was not our host.

The Roundtable listed that, with the help of Endesa, developments in town could include improvements to the health clinic, plaza, gym, museum, riverfront, signage and roads. It could also involve an Internet centre, and the establishment of a cemetery nearer than the one seventeen kilometres away, as well as grants for transport and micro-entrepreneurship. As opposed to regular entrepreneurship, this was meant to foster small business endeavours at the household level, such as making artisanal products for sale to tourists. This fit a logic of helping locals to help themselves. I had observed it in Endesa's sponsorship of development projects in other communities. The company seemed careful to fund only portions of projects, often helping communities to access available government grants to cover the remainder of costs. In fact, Endesa was so insistent in helping locals access development funds from sources other than its own, that a social assistant who was eventually hired by the company once cornered me at a folkloric party he had helped to sponsor in Neltume. He hoped to pick my brain on development grants from Canadian sources to which he might help locals apply, even soliciting me to strike up an international alliance of firefighters so that a crew in Canada might finance the other half of repairs that Endesa was offering to make to the fire hall. Partially sponsoring development initiatives was therefore defended as a viable means of guiding locals in the arts of "micro-entrepreneurship."

Other proposals by Neltume's Roundtable included enhancing an area for residents to enjoy the riverfront, with public bathrooms to be

built, as well as the installation of camping facilities, running water, and a pool. At this, the woman in front of me mouthed to her daughter "a riverfront without a river?" It was quickly noted that improvements to the gym would only involve repairs to the roof of the current municipally-owned facility, as a new building would not be constructed. That decrepit structure long neglected by the municipal authority was deemed unsafe for large meetings, leading to the current meeting's location in the Catholic school gym instead. It was also proposed that Endesa could cover 50% of repairs to the current volunteer firefighters' hall, as well as a similar percentage of costs for paving the twenty kilometre stretch of road on either side of Neltume, which had not been paved in Public Works projects implemented the previous year by the regional government. In addition to these, Endesa offered another $32,000 in competitive funds. This money would be divided into two areas to which town residents could apply: 1) training[18] and micro-entrepreneurship, and 2) housing improvements, specifically for material and labour to improve the façades (and only the façades) of some 600 houses in Neltume.

Endesa's special intentions for schooling comprised merit-based and transportation scholarships for five years.[19] No timeline was indicated for when these would begin or how they would be dispensed. Finally, a charitable foundation would apparently be established that would focus on education. Once again, the company's enthusiasm for training residents in the arts of entrepreneurship framed the compensation offered, as that foundation would be dedicated to teaching the people of Neltume to help themselves. In the week following the announcement of scholarships, parents appeared in the public school asking administrators how much money they could expect to receive and how soon. The prospect

of scholarships spelled financial assistance for families affected by the ever-impending closure of the lumber factory, compelling their outstretched hands. Many seemed unaware that Endesa's offer was limited to financing school as opposed to household expenses, or that scholarships first depended on town residents ratifying a compensation agreement. The offer of merit-based awards also left it unclear whether recipients would be judged on financial need or academic performance.

-Fieldnotes Summary from Neltume's Town Forum, August 2009 (continued)

No matter how much the hosts insisted that Neltume's August 2009 town meeting was the autonomous initiative of Roundtable members, few attendees seemed to actually believe that its driving force was not Endesa. This resonated in banter whispered among the audience throughout the meeting, and shared in kitchens and school staff rooms afterwards. Banter was hushed, but persistent. Its light-hearted nature cut through what felt like collective cynicism pulled uncomfortably tight over those gathered. When the audience was invited to engage in discussion, the first microphone did not initially work. At this, a colleague sitting behind me leaned into my ear and muttered that Endesa had probably neglected to insert batteries on purpose. As anticipation grew for someone to break the silence and begin a response to the Roundtable's proposal, a man sitting two rows ahead of me crashed to the ground. Splayed wide on the floor were the metal legs of his flimsy school chair which had given way under his weight. Nobody ran to his aid, nor was a chuckle heard or friendly gesture of support extended. Camaraderie was clearly concentrated in small pockets throughout the hall, and any generalized expression of community among townspeople was fleeting at best.

At least in town gossip, the Neltume Sector Working Roundtable appeared to lack all credibility and representativity. Early emphasis in the meeting on negotiating a proposal with Endesa ensured that subsequent discussion focused exclusively on the nature and size of compensation. When attention very briefly turned to whether town residents in disagreement with the installation could oppose the project, Endesa's highest official present interceded to chastise attendees for presuming that they even had bargaining power. Upon critical examination, the behaviour of both corporate and state agents appear carefully managed, in the very least to come across as unorchestrated encounters with locals who had yet to be enlisted as supporters of industrial development. However, the casual front betrayed its fabrication when attendees began to behave in a fashion that Endesa officials considered unbecoming of gift recipients.

Threat of Force

When discussion opened to the audience, the first to respond was the principal of the Catholic school in whose gym we were gathered, who was also the only person to uncritically express gratitude for Endesa's benevolence. The nun observed that all forms of progress bear their costs, insisting that most important for the people of Neltume was the ability to work. The same colleague sitting behind me whispered ironically in my ear: "*And for these gifts, we give thanks.*" The principal's words echoed a dominant narrative about well-being in Panguipulli's interior, that a good life is an industrious one. First the town was blessed with the hotels, then with the paving of roads most of the way into the interior, and finally with more work coming by way of Endesa. The scene reminded me of my first

meeting with the principal of the public school, when Sra. Mildred had joked that she should don a nun's habit to come across as more compliant and sympathetic to wealthy sponsors, as she too sought donations for her school in order to make ends meet. Subsequent audience comments departed sharply from this discourse, and the response of company officials suggested that the floor for dialogue was by no means open to all.

-Fieldnotes Summary from Neltume's Town Forum, August 2009 (continued)

> *Some attendees who lined up to a microphone proceeded to question the five year commitment for compensation, believing that Endesa would profit from the area's natural resources for at least forty years to come. Others observed absurdities in the Roundtable's proposal. For instance, riverfront improvement seemed of dubious relevance without water in the Fuy River. In preceding years, it had run dry during summer months, making Endesa's promise that 8.5 cubic metres of water/second would always flow past the town of Neltume seem bizarre.[20] Most incendiary was the response of a young mother who broached the issue of housing. Also a former evening student of mine who had been pressured to abandon classes to care for small children and elderly relatives, Cintia was perplexed that the company would offer facelifts to houses when many residents barely had acceptable plumbing or electrical setups in their homes. She wondered why elder care figured nowhere in discussions, as compensation seemed directed only at superficial improvements to the town's appearance to outsiders.*
>
> *Endesa's communications officer and highest representative present, Álvaro Riffo, stood and turned to the crowd to offer a response. First, he reminded the audience that the E.I.A. process had not yet been approved by the government, that nothing in the future was certain and that nobody should rely on such negotiations for the future of their*

255

families. Endesa's intentions with improving the façades of town homes were apparently to help make residents "look upon their community more brightly in the face of tourism." Together with Víctor Petermann, the owner of the Huilo Huilo hotels, Endesa had decided that Neltume had great potential to mirror the Argentinian town of San Martín de los Andes, a tourist hub just across the border. A facelift was believed by these urban businessmen to be the most effective means of encouraging locals to aspire for a similar future. The uncertainty of the hydroelectric project's fate was also invoked, as he suggested that it would be silly to negotiate more than five years ahead if the project was not yet even approved. Other sectors in negotiation with the company, specifically the village of Puerto Fuy to the east and the Mapuche communities in Neltume Lake to the west, were described as primary sites affected by the hydroelectric project. As the facility would actually bypass Neltume through underground tunnels and "only" divert the adjacent river, he implied that Neltume was hardly even affected at all, as tunnels would be invisible. At any rate, he said that the Roundtable's proposal had already been passed on to Endesa's parent company in Europe, meaning that small changes could be made to the overall proposal, but the total amount of compensation offered remained fixed. Suddenly, the Roundtable's prior insistence that its proposal was not set in stone came with a caveat, summed up in Riffo's words: "We can't be changing numbers and costs all the time." Finally, he reminded the audience that the world was plunged into an economic crisis and that audience members should keep austerity in mind.

The Roundtable's diligence in establishing an orderly meeting struck a nerve for many of those in attendance who felt this was a mishmash of town opportunists who had no

representative authority. Riffo's speech only exacerbated irritation. Eyes had rolled between the mother and her adult daughter sitting directly in front of me, when introductions declared that Roundtable members were volunteers committed to Neltume's sustainable development. Implying what most with whom I had spoken believed, that Endesa paid a salary to these professed volunteers, the mother had whispered "*So committed that they all left their jobs to take on this charity.*" Several of those in attendance complained to me later that they felt tricked from the beginning of the meeting, as only "*executive*" members of the Roundtable were permitted to speak in the first portion of the meeting. Others wondered why the Special Forces had been in town. Sra. Blanca had sat along the bleachers in the back with her husband. In her kitchen later that evening, after we had both left the meeting prior to its prolonged conclusion, she speculated about the effect that the Special Forces agents must have had on older attendees: "*Just imagine how terrified they must have been, and how many people must have turned to head home before they even entered the gym.*" She was referring to members of the many families in town who faced repeated intimidation by military forces throughout the Pinochet regime, for involvement in the lumber union.

Most disappointing for Sra. Blanca was how the Endesa official kept suggesting that the behaviour of attendees was getting out of line, especially since so many people were concerned about future employment options. While eighty to one hundred people would find long-term technical employment for the construction of the plant, he did not mention that technical employment for construction workers on such projects usually requires a high school diploma, which most adults directly affected had not obtained. This led to the vice principal of the public school heatedly declaring that the company was acting as if it were

"*doing Neltume a favour.*" Turning business language back to the Endesa representative, she declared: "*You are buyers, and we are those who may sell, and therefore we choose our asking price.*" She calculated that adequate compensation would be about $100,000 per family. A long, fervent applause from the audience ensued. The reality was that thanks to the 1982 Water Code that privatized freshwater flows, Endesa technically owned the rights to exploit the Fuy River. In fact, it could be forced to cede those rights if it did not do so. Even though residents were not exactly sellers, it did not alter local belief that control over the river, whose crashing current can be heard throughout town in winter months, belongs to Neltume.

Once again Riffo addressed the audience, only this time he suggested that he felt intimidated, finishing with: "*And we all know how assemblies can evolve, we should remember to keep respect.*" His expressed concern over the climate of the meeting implied that it could quickly turn hostile, which was why he was now considering disbanding the meeting. He urged restraint among attendees, reminding the audience of a previous meeting in the city of Panguipulli. Few people in Neltume's forum would have known that after the event to which he referred, relating to the San Pedro River hydroelectric project (mentioned in Chapter 1) in conjunction with the company Colbún S. A., Endesa had ceased local negotiations altogether. Curiously, the hostility which he perceived in Neltume amounted to progressively longer and louder applauses among attendees for neighbours who took to the microphone to critique the Roundtable's compensation model. It was nothing near the scandal that had transpired with SN Power in Liquiñe, or the confrontations occurring over the San Pedro hydroelectric project near the city of Panguipulli. In fact, Riffo's declaration

seemed almost comical, were it not for the Special Forces agents outside, capable of disbanding the meeting on his say so.

This exchange of financial or political autonomy in return for the promise of social development, fosters the seemingly voluntary withdrawal of poor Chileans from attempting to influence the wider social and economic system. As the pressure to pay private debts and to express gratitude to charitable sponsors individualizes the experience of living on precarious means, it simultaneously discourages recipients from recognizing systemic factors that produce their so-called poverty (i.e. state terror, exploitation by employers, and territorial dispossession). Specifically, rural southerners who lack large properties are led to perceive their relative poverty as social deficiency, rather than to recognize historical causes that frame their daily experiences of hardship.

Conclusion: Entrapment by Participatory Democracy

The state's retraction from social programs does not merely penalize poor children for their low social status. As we see in Mariquina and Panguipulli, when the state fails by design to provide adequately for poor students, it intensifies local needs for services previously provided by the government, leaving in its wake a dearth of social programs that may then be charitably financed by private interests. One consequence is that those with few material resources find their basic rights to education and political choice exposed to a new sponsorship regime. An undertaking of the wealthy classes, charity in this scenario is inherently coercive, because those financing the social services have vested interests in guiding the political behaviour of recipients. As relations of patronage between the wealthy

259

and the poor replace citizen rights to basic services, lower and middle class Chileans are taught that their political and civic involvement is out of place and risks destabilizing the democratic order. The ensuing situation is reminiscent of anthropologist Michael Herzfeld's observation that often "the *image* of participatory democracy serves to entrap citizens in the reproduction of their own subservience to a narrow range of state and elite interests" (2008: 150, emphasis added). Structurally akin to a landlord-serf relationship, in which the poor are fed, clothed, and formally educated at the goodwill of the rich, this social order is hardly novel.

It would seem that, for recipients of corporate gifts, compliance with industrial incursions near one's home involves accepting a marginal place within the nation. As such, educational policy reforms belong to a range of legislative legacies that linger from the Pinochet regime, that have contributed to the hidden restoration of a segmented society. Recall José Bengoa's (2006) argument that this restorative project, which remains ongoing, was an important motivation behind Pinochet's overthrow of the Popular Unity. However, much like dominant narratives about the role of natural resource extraction in building the Chilean nation, this education invariably competes with local experiences of place and community. This invites new questions about supposedly lost generations, including the extent to which youth actually believe in promises made by the elite, that through accelerated resource extraction, the nation's strengthened economy will bear social development and improvement for all.

Notes: Chapter 5

[1] Due to the politicized nature of information surrounding Chile's student protests, reliable sources are those open to public debate, accessed November 15, 2012: http://es.wikipedia.org/wiki/Movilización_estudiantil_en_Chile_de_2011.

[2] This Spanish acronym corresponds to the *Ley Orgánica Constitucional de Enseñanza*.

[3] This Spanish acronym corresponds to the *Ley General de Educación.*

[4] Literally, *Confederación de Estudiantes de Chile.*

[5] Part of the new LGE is to return elementary schooling to six years and render secondary six years, these are currently eight and four respectively.

[6] This stands for *Sistema de Medición de Calidad de la Educación*, a system for measuring educational quality.

[7] In January 2012, the current right-wing administration stirred controversy by deciding to expunge the term "dictatorship" in reference to the Pinochet regime from school textbooks, using instead "military government" (Webber 2012).

[8] Working in Latin America, ethnographers Daniel Goldstein (2004) and Suzana Sawyer (2004) have noted this concept's utility for observing how, through mechanisms like charity, neoliberal development schemes pose to modify the behaviour of target populations.

[9] It is officially named the Cultural Donations Law 19.721.

[10] Its name is originally in English.

[11] In no way do I mean to disparage the efforts of such foundations, especially the Huilo Huilo Foundation which generously supported an English Second Language pilot project that I pursued with colleagues in 2009. Rather, this critique is directed at systemic consequences of entrenched relations of patronage, as these reinforce certain forms of sociability that restrict the participation of diverse non-elite actors in their own apparent social development. In fact, I believe that sponsors could benefit from greater recognition of this class tension as a means of appreciating the often lukewarm reception or breakdown of their projects as signalling lack of local involvement in all stages of project planning and

execution. Most information describing the Huilo Huilo initiative here is easily available in conversation with locals, online, and in official documents.

[12] Endesa periodically publishes a newsletter about its benevolent activities called *Entorno*. Its *Energy for Education* program is frequently outlined in these pages, accessed November 15, 2012: http://www.endesa.cl/newsletter/072010/t_5.html.

[13] Along with eucalyptus, pine is a foreign species in Chile whose rapid growth rate makes it popular for forestry plantations. Many locals lament that it is like a plague, as it dries out the land on which it grows, making the recovery of indigenous species difficult.

[14] Suzana Sawyer's *Crude Chronicles* (2004) is an insightful ethnography into the liberal democratic principles that undergird citizen roundtables such as the one I describe here.

[15] Translating the *Junta de Vecinos* as "Neighbourhood Committee" is awkward for town's like Neltume, since planned neighbourhoods hardly exist in this former company town, in which residents only became owners of their homes and plots in the 1990s.

[16] Four had occurred with Panguipulli's current mayor (one of these in the town of Neltume), two with a mayoral candidate who would soon be elected, two with the director of Public Works in Panguipulli, and three with leaders of different organizations in Neltume. Another had taken place with an elected Residents' Board and an environmentalist group in the neighbouring town of Choshuenco (seventeen kilometres away). Members had also made two field visits with Endesa personnel, which were presumably to sites for the hydroelectric plant. There had been thirty-three formal meetings with Endesa, one with the company's general manager at the inauguration of Endesa's "Training House" in town, but there had also been twelve meetings of Roundtable members without Endesa officials present.

[17] In Endesa documents, I have encountered claims that this committee formed earlier than December 2007. I interpret this as one among many inconsistencies between the company's public relations efforts and actual experiences of what its officials call participatory democracy in the area.

[18] Thanks in large part to companies like Endesa in their pursuit of Corporate Social Responsibility, *centros de capacitación* have popped up in communities affected by industrial activities throughout the country. While they are technically informal training

facilities offering classes in everything from accounting, to English lessons, to baking (sometimes bringing in teachers from accredited institutions), the term capacitation has a particularly paternalistic ring to it, as the word *descapacidad* translates to disability or handicap. In this sense, a critical observer might note that the type of training offered gives the impression of correcting deficiencies among those being taught.

[19] The merit-based scholarships included two hundred for elementary school students and fifty for high school students, each worth $440 annually. A further twenty grants per year for five years were offered for higher education, worth $660 each.

[20] In a meeting a month earlier, with representatives of town institutions, the company had even contemplated using machines to bring water to the riverbed artificially.

Chapter 6: Contested Fields

Los únicos que se movilizan con fuerza, los mapuches, lo hacen de una manera diferente ya que expresan las nuevas formas de integración en la diversidad, no necesariamente relacionadas con la unidad del Estado y la homogeneidad de la Nación.	The only who mobilize with any force, the Mapuche, do so in a different manner as they express new forms of integration within diversity, but not necessarily related to the unit of the State or the homogeneity of the Nation.

-José Bengoa, *La Comunidad Reclamada* (2006: 160)

This chapter recounts interactions between participants at a land seizure that I attended in November 2008, in which people of diverse class and ethno-cultural backgrounds gathered to denounce the continued usurpation of Mapuche territory. In that event, disagreements over who could legitimately participate in the land seizure, and over how to behave at it, reveal that class and ethno-cultural background are by no means the only social positions significantly guiding civic engagement, as generation and geographic location also shape political subjectivities. By highlighting the politics of difference underlining interactions at this event, I explore how distinct civic identities are articulated through situated understandings of social struggle. Keying into seemingly incommensurable worldviews among several Mapuche and non-indigenous participants, I explore discourse surrounding what some anthropologists have called 'radical alterity' (Poirier 2008; Povinelli 2001). Specifically, I propose that rigid affirmations of cultural difference made by young, urban Mapuche activists offer unexpected insight into the relative withdrawal from civic life

observed among many of their contemporaries, especially youth who live in greater proximity to the southern countryside, whether of settler or indigenous origin.

Machi Sara's *Toma*

In November 2008, I attended *machi*[1] Sara's land seizure as a gesture of solidarity with a Mapuche shaman with whom I had no previous acquaintance. While for the most part it went smoothly, tensions emerged between attendees who affirmed the resurgence of indigenous identity, and those who hoped to recover class solidarity following military repression. Less obvious tensions also simmered between attendees who lived in urban versus rural areas, as well as between those from different generations, ranging in age from late-teens to late-seventies. This Mapuche shaman's land seizure was unusual not only because she held a deed to the field upon which she was squatting, but because the event was attended mainly by people who had never before carried out a property seizure of any kind (also commonly referred to as a *toma*[2]). This lack of experience meant that *machi* Sara's was modeled on a mishmash of imaginations about how participants should behave, what objectives might be pursued, and who should legitimately attend. I encountered similar tensions on multiple occasions among residents affected by industrial incursions in Mariquina and Panguipulli, expressed in disagreements over who should be consulted for social impact assessments and over strategies for mounting effective opposition movements. However, I have chosen to elaborate here on an event that occurred outside of these communes for ethical reasons; i.e., in order to avoid exposing tensions within and between communities already identified in this study. The *toma* occurred in a rural sector of the

southern Araucanian province of Cautín, in a commune adjacent to Panguipulli. In spite of geographic proximity, it was not easily accessed from Panguipulli, from where I arrived, as the two communes are separated by the three volcanoes Villarrica, Quetrupillán, and Lanín.

Background to a Land Seizure

Tomas are often last-ditch efforts by people whose previous attempts to influence their immediate circumstances have been stonewalled by authorities. The worker takeovers of lumber estates in Panguipulli during the Popular Unity were particularly ambitious examples of *tomas*, as workers aimed to manage the industry (Bravo Aguilera 2012). Nevertheless, especially in the Internet age, it is important to recognize that *tomas* are by no means political instruments of the poor and dispossessed alone. *Machi* Sara's is a case in point; participants were not a coherent group of peasant protesters; biographic profiles crossed gender, generational, geographic, class, ethno-cultural, and even national boundaries.[3]

It was a cool and dry spring when *machi* Sara decided to stage her own land *toma*. With the help of a woman who worked in the local SERNAM[4] office (a government agency that provides assistance to women), she rallied together the necessary resources to mount her protest. Originally from Temuco, Francisca was new to the local SERNAM office. It was through a friend of hers that I was invited. *Machi* Sara's *toma* was on land that was already technically her own. She was 'occupying' a field adjacent to her home that, until only a few weeks earlier, she had no idea was ever contested. That was when she spotted a small group of strangers insistently trudging around her field. This was a piece of land the

approximate size of a half-acre, from which she extracted many of the herbs used in the remedies made in her work as a Mapuche shaman. Upon heading out to introduce herself and enquire about their activities, she was scandalized to learn that these strangers mucking about in her field were construction contractors who worked for people who actually considered themselves to be the owners. They were planning to build half a dozen cabins on the field to rent to tourists.

When the unwelcome intruders first showed up, she expected the situation to be resolved once she presented the *título de merced*, a document dating to the early 1920s that attested to the land's indigenous registration in the name of her late father's community. However, the situation did not soon disappear, because a land deed was presented to her by the new owners from Santiago. They had documentation proving the property's purchase in recent years, and they planned to take advantage of high demand for cabin accommodations close to nature, a market fuelled by the nearby tourist hub of Pucón. As she consulted with various ministries and agencies, *machi* Sara came to learn of the Indigenous Land Division Laws of 1978 and 1979. Those had been introduced during the military regime with the double intent of accelerating the liquidation of indigenous communities, and of putting an end to the legal status of indigenous peoples (Boccara & Seguel-Boccara 1999: para. 58-60).[5] Properties divided from previously recognized indigenous lands would cease to be considered indigenous, and owners of these would no longer have recourse to such status.

The 1980s were a time when increasingly desperate living conditions in the southern countryside drove many Mapuche women like *machi* Sara to Santiago in search of salaried work in order to support families in the South (See Bello 2007). From what she could learn,

it would seem that while she was working in Santiago in the 1980s, a now-estranged relative who was looking after her home registered the adjacent field in his own name, eventually selling it off without her knowledge. Only when the contractors arrived in 2008, did she learn of the details and consequences of the Indigenous Land Division Laws. As *machi* Sara explained to me about these men planning to build cottages to rent to tourists, she struggled to understand how anyone else could also have title to land for which she had documentation issued by the state itself, and that she had never given permission to sell. There was some recourse through the state corporation for indigenous development, the CONADI.[6] However, the CONADI's recommendations to *machi* Sara were based on the assumption that the territory under question was already lost as the consequence of events in the distant past, and that other land could replace it. Furthermore, a land claim had to be made by a formally recognized indigenous community; relations with her own were fractured, a factor that would complicate state assistance.[7] Given the limited time to prevent the construction of the cabins, the CONADI bureaucracy proved exceptionally cumbersome.

The state indigenous development agency was formed following the October 1993 promulgation of Chile's first Indigenous Law 19.253, a result of negotiations for the democratic transition in which a New Treaty with indigenous peoples would be elaborated. The public institution's mandate being to promote, coordinate, and execute indigenous public policy, today it offers various programs to assist in the social development of Mapuche individuals and communities. Potentially helpful to people in *machi* Sara's position are the CONADI's programs for legal defence, a general archive of indigenous

records dating back a century and a half, a public registry of indigenous territories, and a fund to help with the acquisition—not recuperation—by indigenous people of land and access to water. Through the Land Fund, Mapuche communities that lost territories over the past century have been able to request subsidies that enable the purchase of new land for expanded living space. Implicit in this effort is the collective recovery of some of the 500,000 hectares of Mapuche territory usurped since Chile's 1893 annexation of the Araucanía. However, the selection of individuals and communities qualifying for this subsidy is not related to lost territories, but based on modest savings that the potential beneficiary will contribute to the purchase of land, as well as demonstrated need (i.e. poverty, crowding in current living spaces, and the number of people who depend on the principal applicant). Almost invariably, when land is acquired, it involves a process that can take between two and three years, and it is rarely (if ever) the same originally lost.

Especially for residents in outlying areas, access to most of the CONADI's programs depends on the help of professionals commonly called *asesores*. These social consultants help many Mapuche communities seeking to avail themselves of CONADI services to navigate rules, complete forms, and assemble the basic requirements to benefit from state programs and grants. *Asesores* may be trained in diverse fields and be of Mapuche or Chilean background. Many underemployed youth with undergraduate degrees in anthropology and related disciplines find work in this area, earning payment from those they assist by extracting a percentage of the value of awarded projects, or by working in CONADI divisions of local municipalities. In the Spring of 2008, with neither an *asesor* nor the available time for administrative wrangling, the CONADI was of little use to *machi*

Sara. Contractors planned to move ahead with the cabin construction in the coming weeks, and her struggle to prevent the loss of a sacred field only seemed further silenced by bureaucratic manoeuvring requiring her energies almost three hours by bus away in the nearest capital city of Temuco. For the first time in her life, *machi* Sara marched into the nearest town's SERNAM office, a government organism formed following the democratic transition to foster greater equality between men and women. There she encountered Francisca, a middle-aged non-Mapuche divorcee from Temuco who also became incensed by the affair. Between the two women, the *toma* was organized in a matter of weeks.

Ceremony

The *toma* would last an entire weekend, beyond which *machi* Sara could not depend on supporters to remain to permanently occupy the field. The important thing was to mount a visible protest that would leave its traces in the media and rally public sympathy for her cause. It would be formally initiated on the first morning with a *rogativa*, a ceremony that I refer to by its Spanish name because that was how *machi* Sara called it. This term carries the suggestion of a prayer of appeal, which was its stated objective: to gather forces and believers in support of her work as a shaman. It was also hoped that the ceremony would raise media attention about one Mapuche woman's battle against unclear adversaries denying her historical claim to the land. As complex and particular as *machi* Sara's property dispute was, perhaps even more curious were events that transpired during the *toma* itself. This was due to the eclectic mix of participants that it attracted, owing mainly to Francisca's efforts to publicize it.

271

Whether it was the quantity of non-Mapuche attendees, or the empty box of wine that lay to the side of the bonfire, somehow the four Mapuche youth recently arrived from Temuco decided that they would only observe and not participate in the ceremony. Machi Sara pleaded that one or another of the young men participate by taking in hand the sleigh bells or a pifilca (a single-holed wooden flute). She hoped they would help her call spirits and other ancestral forces in the landscape to her aid. The youth refused. They quietly told her that there were too many Wingka [non-Mapuche people] present. After insisting for several minutes, the elderly shaman shrugged impatiently and began.

While, the *toma* was not a product of state assistance, a state agent (Francisca), was a key player in who ultimately learned of it and could travel the distance to attend. The dissemination of information about the *toma* had been limited by Francisca's lack of familiarity with Mapuche networks of information sharing and political action.[8] Instead, she had depended on her own sense of social solidarity to gather supporters. In the end, this brought together mainly non-indigenous, urban Chileans sympathetic to the political struggles of Mapuche communities, rather than Mapuche people working to recover ancestral lands. We glimpse inter-cultural alliances in preparations for the event, as well as in the demand for *machi* Sara's shamanic services.

-Fieldnotes Summary, rural sector in Cautín, November 2008 (continued)

I arrived early Friday evening from Panguipulli, together with Francisca's friend. A shelter covered with thick branches and leaves had already been erected in the field. Another of Francisca's friends and two

anthropology students from Temuco who were invited by a neighbour had spent the afternoon building the structure. Large homemade signs of black words painted onto white cotton sheets were pegged into the ground. They protested the continued usurpation of Mapuche territory. Meanwhile, a deep pot of cazuela[9] was being prepared to welcome visitors. In front of the east-facing shelter, four benches were arranged in a half moon shape around the preparations of a bonfire. On the eastern side of this stood a rehue [a Mapuche altar]. It was a carved wooden trunk fixed into the ground with three steps. Its anthropomorphic head also faced eastward, anticipating the rising sun. The rogativa would take place the following dawn at this rehue, which stood adorned with foye[10] and laurel branches.

Escorting us to her house behind a fence on the far side of the field, machi Sara spoke mischievously about the herbs growing in this field and how they play tricks by hiding from those who do not understand their value. Her work and life calling as a shaman were intimately connected to this particular field. Inside her home, a large common room was warmed by a fire burning below a chimney in the centre. This was her reception room for clients, built to answer to the expectations of the mainly non-Mapuche women from cities who pay machi Sara to treat their ills, and who approach her consultations much like a doctor's visit. The only other room in the house dedicated to clients was the bathroom, with a shower area made of stone and mortar, in which clients could bathe in curative waters brewed to alleviate ailments related to conditions like arthritis and pregnancy.

Machi Sara received us with cazuela spiced with fresh merkén, a smoked chili powder traditional to Mapuche cuisine and popular throughout Chile. When times get tough, she told me, such as during a particularly harsh winter when clients cannot travel the distance for consultations, and when snow covers grass in the field (preventing her

animals from grazing), she bags this precious condiment and sells it door-
to-door in the nearest town. It is a means of buying feed. Her merkén, like
the remedies she makes and the animals who graze in her field, are what
sustain machi Sara in her advanced years.

We arrived at the same time as a Chilean geographer who had spent the past two decades living in California and was newly acquainting himself with his home country. Other people already there were Francisca and a friend, who seemed to have taken on the logistics of preparing the night we would spend seated around the fire, with blankets to keep warm, tarps in case of rain, and *hierba maté* to share. Apart from *machi* Sara's quiet male cousin and an adult daughter who was nine-months pregnant, there were the daughter's non-Mapuche husband from Santiago and their twelve-year old daughter. There was also an assorted congregation of non-Mapuche supporters like myself. As the evening turned into night, and *machi* Sara's supporters gathered by the bonfire, she secluded herself in the house with her daughter and granddaughter in preparation for dawn's ceremony. On several occasions as she readied herself before retreating, I overheard her say that most important of all about this *toma* was that her young granddaughter remember how Grandmother fought for their land. The future memories of her family were what mattered most.

We began the night around the fire as only a half dozen supporters. At one point, a friend of Francisca's went to town to buy a box of red wine to share. Not long past midnight, an elderly couple who were neighbours arrived with food to share, and throughout the night others arrived. One young drunken man walking across the field on his way home from town approached our circle curious by the bonfire. He sat down to rest at

274

the offer of a snack. As someone explained to him the reason for our congregation, he stammered with regret at not appreciating the work of *machi* Sara more, admitting that Mapuche families in his sector are generally divided. In his stupour, he declared a tearful desire for more cohesion and pride among his people. Hours later, after the ceremony that was still to come, and after he had sobered up substantially, this young man would tell me of his work in the neighbouring valley of Liquiñe. He was happy to be recently hired by a construction firm contracted by a Norwegian hydroelectric company to improve a road cutting through a Mapuche community, to the site of a proposed reservoir.

Members of the community about which *machi* Sara's young neighbour spoke were known to me to be largely opposed to the presence of heavy machinery and equipment on their land, as well as to the proposed damming of nearby rivers that would displace several homes (See Schönenberger & Silva 2009). The community had kicked out surveyors who had helicoptered machinery into the *reducción* without permission. This led to an invitation extended to the company's foreign executives to attend a meeting hosted by communities affected by its hydroelectric projects. During that January 2008 event, which I also attended, officials and contractors for SN Power and its subsidiary Trayenko SA were formally banned from ancestral territories in the Liquiñe Valley. Still attempting to sway locals in the area months later, the company hired a *machi* from outside the valley to perform a *rogativa* on heavy machinery that kept breaking down on the road that the company still attempted to improve. A video clip of that ritual was posted on SN Power's website with a caption celebrating the support by ancestral authorities for apparent development brought by industry, as though having paid a *machi* for the service amounted to local consent to

hydroelectric development. In this casual encounter at *machi* Sara's *toma*, I realized by what means SN Power had been able to claim in mainstream news outlets and in information brochures that it employed Mapuche people in its projects. Through contractors, it was transporting these workers every day a distance of over 145 kilometres by road from a sector still unaffected by large industrial developments, and in which many youth without property or crops of their own were in desperate need of work. What the company considered to be local support for its activities was certainly not local in terms understood by the affected communities.

-Fieldnotes Summary, rural sector in Cautín, November 2008 (continued)

> *At dusk, the rustling of bodies awoke me to machi Sara's ceremonial observation of the sun rising to the east above the tree-covered mountain that cast its shadow over the valley. She was now dressed in the scarves and black robe that would attract the spirits she would call upon. She sang, lit fire, carried the wheat drink mushay,[11] beans, and macaroni noodles in clay bowls as we followed her from the house to the rehue, now casting its shadow over the fading bonfire. As the sun rose, she was anxious to begin, but hesitated because a journalist from the city had promised to come. It was important for machi Sara that this event be videotaped, written about, and known beyond the group of twenty neighbours and total strangers who sympathized with her struggle. We waited nearly three quarters of an hour as she hesitated to begin the ceremony, balancing her desire for a journalist with the importance of observing the ritual at the earliest sign of the sun.*
>
> *Eventually, machi Sara entrusted the geographer from California with videotaping the event. She also indicated that this replacement journalist could walk in front of her as she faced eastward, in order to get*

276

a front-facing shot of all the people in attendance arranged behind her. During the ceremony, this would trouble the anthropology students who had arrived before me, who appeared not to have been informed of the request made to the geographer to film the ceremony. Body language indicated that they considered it taboo that anyone should intercede between the rising sun and machi Sara in her trance.

Shortly before our host finally decided to begin, and an hour after the sun had begun to rise, a car carrying four young Mapuche men from Temuco arrived.

Censure

The new arrivals, who appeared to be in their mid-twenties, spoke intensely among themselves from their car for several minutes before approaching our group, which still awaited the commencement of the ceremony. At *machi* Sara's effort to welcome the youth with an invitation that they play traditional instruments during her trance, they expressed dismay that there were so many non-Mapuche attendees, quietly rebuffing her insistence. The ceremony began with the four youth standing behind *machi* Sara, removed from other participants. I can only suppose that the youth from Temuco meant to communicate a gesture of solidarity and community to *machi* Sara, having heard of the event online, no doubt thanks to Francisca.

Apprehensions about the presence of instruments of colonial exploitation seem to have made the Mapuche youth uneasy about reinvigorating their cultural roots at *machi* Sara's land seizure. A number of such instruments were evident at the gathering before the

277

rehue, including a video recording device for documenting cultural alterity, alcohol in the form of an empty wine container, and well-intentioned but naïve outsiders (i.e. sympathetic neighbours, tourists, anthropology students preparing thesis projects). By refusing to actively participate, the youth asserted a political consciousness committed to decolonizing Mapuche society. Yet *machi* Sara was also intimately familiar with the long history of encroachment, daily forms of abuse, and outright violence that Chilean society has directed towards her people. Her struggle was nevertheless an immediate one for her field, and the goal of her *toma* was not necessarily to transform political possibilities for Mapuche society more generally. She expressed this by insisting that she would accept what genuine energies supported her in her fight, Mapuche or otherwise.

-Fieldnotes Summary, rural sector in Cautín, November 2008 (continued)

Machi Sara pounded her kultrún,[12] sang, and poured mushay on the soil at her feet before taking a sip herself and sharing it among those around her. She and her assistant (the elderly woman who had arrived in the night with snacks) began to smoke cigarettes as they stood with their backs erect, facing the sun rising above the eastward hill. They lit foye branches full of leaves that they draped over the weakened bonfire, wafting the sweet-smelling smoke over their bodies. Francisca and her two middle-aged Chilean friends copied the machi's actions when she gestured for them to do so. Later, these urban women would marvel aloud at the apparent health of a life lived so synchronized to the cycles of the land.

After the ceremony, machi Sara's cousin carried out the vat of cazuela and a tray of tortillas to share among guests. To the side of the rehue, machi Sara could be overheard debating with the four Mapuche youth from Temuco, together with the geographer and some others

278

congregated in interest. She explained calmly that she would be wrong to turn away non-Mapuche supporters and clients, when few of her own neighbours showed support. I overheard the youth speak of how things should have been done differently. Machi Sara pointed out that the rogativa should have begun at dawn, and that normally participants would congregate throughout the night, but she excused the late arrival as a limitation of travelling such a long distance from the city.

Eventually, those gathered to debate came to an agreement that many segments of Mapuche society should value indigenous culture more, but *machi* Sara would not concede that a stricter observance of collective spirituality might have been achieved in the absence of *Wingka*. I use this term cautiously, as the less charged reference of non-Mapuche people does not capture the underlying critique of dominant society evident in the youth's choice of words. While *Wingka* is commonly used by Mapuche people to refer to Chileans of Spanish descent, it can have a particularly negative connotation in some contexts, as it is widely believed to derive from a Mapuche term for theft or usurpation.[13]

The potential for the symbolic charge of a strategic display of indigenous culture before audiences unfamiliar with Mapuche spirituality, preoccupied *machi* Sara and the four youth in significantly different ways. For the elderly shaman, the possibility of having her struggle recorded and written about led her to invoke symbolic forms of authority, as a shaman, as a Mapuche elder, as a mother and grandmother, and as someone who possessed a documented land deed. This symbolism contested legislative and bureaucratic mechanisms that naturalize the contested past as distant, impersonal, and beyond the purview of current governance. While *machi* Sara's *toma* involved a moment of Mapuche

279

spirituality that posed immediate consequences for her well-being, as it was a struggle against the potential loss of her field, livelihood, and a sacred space, it was also an instance in which beliefs in a sentient landscape were exposed to a number of good-intentioned, but very possibly disbelieving outsiders. With little control over how non-Mapuche strangers participating in the ritual might come to understand the ceremony, there was a risk that any one of us might go on to portray Mapuche cosmology stereotypically in journalistic or academic writings. Herein lay a dilemma confronting the four Mapuche youth, for whom the ceremony seems to have initially offered an opportunity for ritual renewal among the mutually oppressed. When the event ceased to offer the form of renewal anticipated, it appears that the youth became reluctant to partake in a spectacle of unknown symbolic consequences. Such concern is not restricted to Mapuche society. Anthropologist Sylvie Poirier has observed similar withdrawal among Aboriginals in Australia and Québec (2008: 83):

> In their co-existence with a dominant society and in dealings with the state—for example, in the lengthy and arduous processes of political and territorial claims and negotiations—indigenous peoples have learned to conceal those aspects [of cultural difference] that are considered, from the point of view of modernist (and Cartesian) ontology and epistemology, as a radical alterity, those that are not taken seriously and at face value.

Therefore, far from a form of reverse racism that Francisca and her friends later attributed to these youth, the choice to not participate in the ceremony can be seen as a conscious break from a cycle of occidental appropriations and misrepresentations of Mapuche culture. This raises questions about factors framing divergent positions on the

presence of so many *Wingka*. How did *machi* Sara believe the spirits would work to help her? Could answers to that question explain why she was not preoccupied that her audience *believe* in her communication with Mapuche spirits unfamiliar to non-Mapuche guests? And, why did she not seem bothered by instruments of colonial exploitation, such as the wine, video-recorder, and unacquainted anthropology students?

One answer, although an incomplete one, is that *machi* Sara also sought allies beyond forces in the physical landscape, human ones with the capacity to translate her struggle into a critique meaningful to members of dominant society. By translating her struggle into the language of occidental power—into banners denouncing the continued usurpation of Mapuche territory and photographs of concerned supporters—such allies could help her contend within the realm of political and economic influence that excluded her. In this fashion, the generally middle class non-Mapuche attendees from the city enabled *machi* Sara to build tactical alliances for bridging an abyss between her apparently traditional worldview, and the supposedly modern rationalism of her *Wingka* guests. With that said, the *rogativa* was not merely a spectacle for the uninitiated. I understood that intimate aspects of the ceremony were addressed in the shaman's nighttime retreat with her daughter and granddaughter, and during the ceremony itself with her elderly neighbour and cousin. Her attribution of intentionality to the herbs in her field (they make themselves unseen to those who do not appreciate their value), was evidence of faith that her land and its non-human inhabitants were or would soon become allies. Nevertheless, the ability to blend seemingly contradictory beliefs and practices—*machi* Sara's syncretic approach to

inter-cultural exchange—was crucial to her personal autonomy and enabled her resistance to state and market forces posing to appropriate her land.

An American Orientalism

Discord over the proper treatment of Mapuche spirituality at *machi* Sara's land *toma* brings to the fore another abyss between worldviews that, at least for *machi* Sara, was more difficult to bridge than a cultural one between indigenous and Euro-Western cosmologies. It divided Mapuche people over relationships to the land, and more specifically over who was perceived to behave sufficiently Mapuche on it. This division had gendered and generational features, as the nature of tradition and the limits of compromising it were sanctioned by young, male guests who policed the authenticity of their elderly, female host. As they questioned her decisions as a spiritual authority, the urban youth's expectations for how rural Mapuche people should interact with dominant, Chilean society appear to be at least partly a consequence of the geographic location in which those youth were socialized.

Awkward Allies

Recall that rapid urbanization in the latter half of the twentieth century means that today, 80% of people who affirm Mapuche identity now live in cities. That proportion was manifested by indigenous youth at the *toma*, as those who arrived from the city outnumbered *machi* Sara's young neighbour four to one. In Chapter 4 I discussed a decline in ritualized relationships to the land resulting from urbanization. That decline transformed

the means by which Mapuche youth, who now more than ever before live in cities, acquire historical and cultural knowledge. In that chapter, I argue that it has also framed the political tactics of urban activists in recent decades, provoking strategic affirmations of cultural essentialism—similar to what Pierre Nora (1989) calls the buttressing of indigenous identities—as a means of protecting Mapuche culture from modernity's homogenizing potential.[14] In this light, at the heart of the disagreement between *machi* Sara and the four youth was whether accepting assistance from non-indigenous allies further entrenches social relations that deterritorialize Mapuche society.

Drawing on elements in *machi* Sara's land dispute, a reasonable case can be made for the caution expressed by the four youth from Temuco. First, the CONADI's available assistance proved inadequate for dealing with a pressing land dispute. The very nature of the bureaucracy meant that accessing its services required the help of experts, a situation that risked producing the opposite effect than what was desired by *machi* Sara. This is because resorting to *asesores* to process her claim would invariably heighten *machi* Sara's dependence on others, rather than secure her autonomy. Had she accepted that the state's indigenous development agency was the only effective means for dealing with her land dispute, she may well have been swallowed into what anthropologist James Ferguson calls the international development industry's 'anti-politics machine' (1994). Focusing on the small, land-locked African country of Lesotho, he questions what exactly aid programs do *besides* systematically fail to achieve their objectives of helping the poor. This leads Ferguson, together with colleague Larry Lohmann who is a social justice and environmental activist, to argue that an important and understated function of development agencies is to

expand and fortify bureaucratic state power. The logic of development uses the idea of poverty as "a point of entry and justification [for] launching interventions that may have no effect on the poverty" but have concrete effects nonetheless (Ferguson & Lohmann 1994: paragraph 52). Not unlike the case of development in Lesotho, while the CONADI's projects and programs were designed to render people like *machi* Sara more self-sufficient, the agency inadvertently functioned to produce the very dependence that it also aimed to correct.[15]

Second, Francisca's diffusion efforts neglected to tap into Mapuche networks of information sharing, thereby diminishing *machi* Sara's chances of encountering others who faced dilemmas related to the outfall of the Land Division Laws of 1978 and 1979. Francisca also neglected to seek legal advice for *machi* Sara, even though it was likely available within NGO networks in Temuco that are dedicated to supporting indigenous and citizen rights. These oversights rendered *machi* Sara's land seizure a simulacrum of sorts. This is because it reproduced what participants imagined was a reality of indigenous political horizons, with limited involvement of people actually engaged in indigenous political mobilizations.[16] It drew heavily on symbolism of Mapuche protest prevalent in popular media, with banners denouncing land usurpations, a shaman pounding a drum, solemn people of dark complexion dressed in traditional clothing, and haggard-looking supporters. In place of an articulate critique of the historical and bureaucratic factors that negated *machi* Sara's claim to her field, and in the absence of genuine community support both locally and regionally, these images stood for a united and resilient people unbending in the face of neo-colonial forces. Again, the world of well-intentioned *Wingka* restricted

available avenues of action, this time to the ceremonial occupation of a contested field for the duration of a weekend.

Finally, some non-Mapuche participants of the *toma* proved oblivious to the struggle for indigenous well-being that was before us, conflating colonialism with other systemic violations designed by the state. As we ate the *cazuela* and tortillas following the departure of the four youth, one of Francisca's friends expressed dismay that what she called 'her society' was so fractured. Addressing herself to Mapuche hosts and non-Mapuche guests alike, Cecilia lamented to those who sat around what remained of the previous night's bonfire: *"Why, when we are all mestizo, can we not all get along?"* Especially in recently settled regions of Latin America, such as southern Chile, discourse on *mestizaje*[17] carries a nationalistic subtext.[18] By wondering aloud why 'her *mestizo* society' remained so divided, Cecilia implied that Chileans were all children of colonial Latin America, equally carrying the marks of a long and violent, but also often collaborative encounter between native and European cultures and their descendants.

Unaware of her own paternalism, Cecilia's discourse contributed to undermining the claims of Chile's colonized minorities, denying them both particularity of historical perspective and the right to self-identify as they choose. Cecilia was well-read, reflecting the structural as opposed to merely local racism in which her understanding of social and cultural difference was embedded. She was a former schoolteacher exiled to Argentina following two years spent hiding with her mother and sister in a wealthy uncle's cellar in the 1970s. Extended family members who worked in local government at that time knew she was on a 'seize without witnesses' list, persecuted for prior involvement in *la Jota* (the

285

Communist Youth). Cecilia's background in organized social protest suggests that her words were informed by intellectual currents that have long treated the Mapuche, formerly referred to in the literature as Araucanos, as a disappearing people (LeBonniec 2003: 10).

Historian Florencia Mallon argues that in Chile, invocations of *mestizaje* often dismiss the existence of cultural pluralism within the national community, denying the possibility of nationhood to Mapuche people who claim it (Mallon 2005: 243-244).[19] Mallon's oral history of one Mapuche community's experience of a land seizure and subsequent *asentamiento*[20] during the Popular Unity evokes this dynamic. During that period, Mapuche territorial claims were folded into those of the peasantry more generally. Agrarian Reform policies under the Allende, Frei Montalva, and Alessandri administrations between 1962-1973, variously used the economic productivity of properties and not ancestral claims to the land, to evaluate which estates should be taken over from wealthy landowners for re-distribution among the rural poor (See also Garrido Rojas et al. 1988). Therefore, non-Mapuche allies largely ignored the widespread usurpations of indigenous territory that had occurred in preceding decades. The effect was to silence memories of displacement and ignore desires to recover lost lands that motivated many Mapuche actors who aligned themselves with the Popular Unity's accelerated Agrarian Reform initiative.

Radically Other

With reasonable cause to be apprehensive about the good intentions of *Wingka* allies, we might ask why *machi* Sara endorsed the clumsy efforts at solidarity made by her non-Mapuche guests. No doubt with reasons of her own, I would argue that no shaman in

her position, especially one who had herself lived several years in the city, could be unaware of the polemics surrounding non-Mapuche allies. So, why not concede to the four youth's critique? Why not correct Cecilia's tactless comment or compel a young neighbour to abandon his exploitative job or to not squander his wages on alcohol? I find insight into her understanding of Mapuche identity in anthropologist Julie Cruikshank's (2001; 2005) work among Native Yukon elders. Cruikshank argues that what is commonly called traditional or local knowledge by Western scholars and activists is a product—as opposed to a discovery—of colonial encounters. A critical historical approach to local knowledge highlights the on-going production of indigenous identity, as well as the politics behind treating tradition as an artifact to be salvaged, protected, and controlled. Similar to Jake Kosek's reflections (discussed in Chapter 4), on things that in conventional logic seem not to overlap, Cruikshank encourages us to dig beneath the surface of apparently radical cultural differences to uncover in intersecting narratives, surprisingly entangled identities. Narratives that intersected at *machi* Sara's *toma* claimed dignity for the dispossessed.

As unrelated as Cruikshank's descriptions of competing views on climate change may seem to exchanges at *machi* Sara's land seizure, parallels emerge in questions over the protection of what indigenous actors consider to be sentient landscapes. Cruikshank contrasts indigenous oral traditions with representations of glaciers in travellers' chronicles, as well as with the views of geophysical scientists and of contemporary environmental activists. In Tlingit and Athapaskan oral histories, glaciers are meaningful and animate aspects of the landscape that are responsive to human behaviour and, in particular, they punish hubris. Meanwhile, in accounts by climate experts, she finds that the same glaciers

described in oral traditions are portrayed as vulnerable to rising global temperatures and to the unchecked burning of fossil fuels. Therefore, in scientific discourse the hubris of humanity is also punished by the natural world, through its limits for enduring the impacts of unrestricted industrial growth. On first glance, indigenous and scientific perspectives seem in competition with one another over defining the nature of physical spaces, over whether a sentient landscape is inhabited by non-human and non-animal forces, or whether the environment is merely a terrain composed of myriad natural resources. However, ethnography conveys that in both perspectives, discourse surrounding glaciers interprets human responsibilities towards Nature. As with Cruikshank's observations in the Yukon, I find that what initially appears to be incommensurable worldviews, embedded in *machi* Sara's local knowledge and the presumably Euro-Western rationalism of Chilean guests, are actually co-produced.

The co-production of prototypically indigenous and Western worldviews is especially evident in processes of political awakening among urban Mapuche youth, as emergent strategies are deployed to confront modes of territorial dispossession particular to their generation. Anthropologist Alcida Rita Ramos observes what she calls strategic essentialism on the part of indigenous actors, when in spite of their constrained agency, they use "Western thinking about the Other, to further their cause for ethnic recognition and self-determination" (Ramos 1998: 7). She describes this through scenes conveying a simultaneous fascination and repulsion with the idea of the Indian[21] in Brazil, arguing for a new conceptualization of Indigenism as a form of 'American Orientalism.' In this sense, Indigenism can be read as (Ramos 2003: 356):

an ideological apparatus which includes not only state policies but especially the vast repertoire of images, attitudes, and actions that both non-Indians and Indians have produced along the history of the country's interethnic front.

Following Ramos, we might observe that not only the four youth from Temuco, but also *machi* Sara and her *Wingka* guests find in ideas about what is 'Mapuche culture,' salvation from their respective grievances with modernity. For instance, when the four youth from Temuco proposed that only Mapuche people should observe traditional spirituality, they reclaimed practices, language, and a sense of community that urban life erodes and that systemic racism suppresses. When *machi* Sara posed before cameras and her supporters as a shamanic authority, she reclaimed dominion over her field. And when Francisca's friends marvelled at a life lived so synchronized to the cycles of the land, they enjoyed momentary relief from the alienation endured as modern, working divorcees in a *machista*[22] society. Therefore, beliefs that indigenous identity is essentially[23] different from dominant, capitalist society, serves functional ends. Upon deeper consideration, what is Mapuche, *mestizo*, feminist, or even communist, is not radically Other to so-called *Wingka* histories, but integrally part of the formation of national identities and associated struggles over inequalities reinforced by these.

For Mapuche people who struggle to keep traditional ways of life in the countryside, the rapid penetration of extractive industries and commercial goods into the South challenges the retention of cultural knowledge such as traditional healing practices. First,

ever-smaller plots reduce cultivatable space as families expand and limited land is partitioned among new generations. Then, when increasingly limited living space proves too small to support those who live in *reducciones*, many are pressured into seeking wage labour in cities. This leads to fewer extended kin living permanently in the countryside, which translates into fewer support networks upon which people like *machi* Sara may depend in times of need. Here, the adaptation of traditional ways of life to an increasingly cash economy produces an apparent contradiction between conventional imaginations of tradition and modernity.[24] With the sale of Mapuche products to members of dominant society (i.e. eggs, wool, cheese, meat, honey, firewood, herbs, basket-weavings and medicinal services), inter-cultural exchanges at the local level become integral to the retention of Mapuche heritage in the countryside.

Conclusion: Cultural Labour

Despite comprising some of the most impoverished segments of Chile's population, the Araucanía Region is among the most electorally conservative in the country. Until the *Concertación*'s 2010 defeat, it was the only region in all of Chile to consistently oppose the governing centre-left coalition in each national election since the 1990 transition, routinely endorsing far right-wing candidates (Heath 2007). Skirting the Araucanía's southern border, Mariquina and Panguipulli display similar electoral patterns. Even so, interactions at *machi* Sara's land seizure suggest that statistical data about southern conservatism are deceptively simple. Political awakening among indigenous groups to strategies for contending with the modern state apparatus, involves social processes that reach well beyond casting ballots

every few years. Indeed, the politics of ethno-cultural difference do not conform to clear-cut, pre-existing identities. Nor are they modelled on the current party establishment, in which the left represents class-based interests in an imagined national community largely blind to pluralism.

Perhaps most interesting is that seeming paradoxes between political sentiment and electoral patterns expose a Gramscian dynamic that is not unique to political mobilization among indigenous groups. Early twentieth century Italian linguist and political thinker Antonio Gramsci wondered why the exploited working classes of Europe failed to coherently revolt against their own exploitation (See Crehan 2002). To paraphrase anthropologist William Roseberry (1996: 82), who draws on Gramsci's work, state hegemony is never static, nor totally established. More accurately, it is a *project* that compels dominated groups to identify their own well-being with that of the dominant, whereby the social values of the elite often become common sense values shared by the masses. As we have seen in previous chapters, in early twenty-first century Chile, hegemony appears in the widespread appeal of consumerism, as purchasing power is experienced by many to be a sign of social inclusion. In that context, poor families increasingly pushed out of the countryside in search of stable employment enjoy the short-term gratification of modern conveniences. However, such conveniences are in exchange for long-term dependence on the good graces of the banks and large department store chains that first extended these people unharnessed credit.

Grim as circumstances may seem for the poor, political sentiment is never so simple. This is because, even though certain people have greater access to wealth, mobility, and

political influence, those who have less do not naturally or uniformly share consciousness about inequality. Nor is their compliance to this social order—at least from the perspective of the state—most effectively achieved through brute force or political coercion, but rather though culture itself. Herein is what the four youth from Temuco, *machi* Sara, and Cecilia have in common with people who appear to withdraw from civic and political life. For people who position themselves as radically Other to national publics, and for those who seem apathetic to political issues, meaningful change seems most effectively pursued in the cultural, as opposed to the electoral domain.

In the *Wallmapu*, class-based and indigenous struggles for dignity and security contest distinct experiences of exclusion from Chile's national community. While such struggles have developed according to discrete historical trajectories, it seems analytically relevant to note that their fates cross paths. The military regime's assault on the organization of civil society dealt a debilitating blow to community organization in both realms. While the long-term effects of this repression are evident among Chileans of diverse backgrounds, the learning of political beliefs, values, and practices by those who did not personally experience Pinochet's nearly seventeen year dictatorship is especially intriguing within family contexts. This is because, at the local scale of family and small community networks, we can observe inter-generational relationships that are sustained through time. The memory dynamics stirred by these relationships contrast with interactions at *machi* Sara's *toma*, where for the most part attendees did not have prior relationships with one another. While that scenario permitted the identification of broad differences in political subjectivities among Mapuche and non-indigenous actors, its spontaneous nature prevented

any deeper discussion about the role of situated historical knowledge in shaping political sentiment. In the next chapter, attention for the intimate space of family homes calls for a means of appreciating political critique that is not uniquely concerned with the modern state apparatus.

Notes: Chapter 6

[1] A *machi* is a Mapuche shaman.

[2] *Toma* literally means 'to take,' and as a political act generally refers to seizing control of a disputed domain. Not unlike the estate takeovers in Panguipulli, *machi* Sara's was a land seizure, but *tomas* may also be made of other infrastructure or institutions (i.e. radio stations, factories, schools, highways, houses).

[3] Scholars addressing impacts of the historical submission of Mapuche society to a foreign state have focused on issues of social exclusion via institutional and informal racism (See Bengoa 2000[1985]; Boccara 1998; Boccara & Seguel-Boccara 2002; Pinto Vallejos 2000), as well as on a corresponding rejection by Mapuche society of colonial incursions (See Le Bonniec 2003; Marimán et al. 2006; Richards 2004). Analyses into resulting transformations in Mapuche society (See Aravena 2003; Bacigalupo 2007), remind us that local knowledge does not exist in isolation.

[4] The National Women's Service—*Servicio Nacional de la Mujer.*

[5] In Liquiñe, I encountered many Mapuche families that did not know that these deeds were designed to remove indigenous status from their holders. The associated privatization of freshwater and sub-soil exploitation rights, further fragmented dominion over ancestral territories. This was key in opening the legislative flood gates for multi-national corporations to pursue industrial mega-projects relatively unfettered by bureaucratic obstacles. However, many in Liquiñe did not learn about the commodification of the flow of area rivers for decades, until as recently as 2006 when airplanes began to skirt about at low

range, and when foreigners claiming to be engineers trudging about in local fields, speaking vaguely to those who approached them about development and improved living conditions.

[6] The National Corporation for Indigenous Development—*Corporación Nacional de Desarrollo Indígena.*

[7] Anthropologist Ana Mariella Bacigalupo has observed that *machi* frequently have tense relations with their own communities (Bacigalupo 1995 & 2004). For more on spirituality, ritual, and social relations among *machi*, see Bacigalupo 2007.

[8] Important alternative outlets are Mapuche news bulletins Mapuexpress, AZkintuwe, and Meli Wixan Mapu. See: http://www.mapuexpress.net/?act=news&id=5366; http://www.azkintuwe.org/reportaje_56.htm;
http://meli.mapuches.org/spip.php?page=recherche

[9] *Cazuela* is a typical dish throughout Chile, a chicken soup with potatoes, corn and other vegetables cooked in the meat's stock.

[10] The scientific term for this tree is *drimys winteri*, known in English as winter cinnamon or winter's bark. Ana Mariella Bacigalupo's *Shaman's of the Foye Tree* (2007) is a valuable resource on *machi* relationships to this plant.

[11] A traditional drink made of fermented wheat or corn, also commonly known as *muday*.

[12] Shamanic drum.

[13] Swiss anthropologist Anne Lavanchy (2007) dedicates a chapter of her doctoral thesis elaborating on identity dynamics embedded in terms like *Wingka* and *gringo*. Unlike in other parts of Latin America, in Chile the latter refers to people of North American and European origins.

[14] As indicated in Chapter 4, this strategic cultural essentialism appears more common in cities than among rural Mapuche communities. Again, scholars who have noted the role of migration and urban Mapuche identity in political mobilization, and have contrasted predominantly urban and rural political subjectivities are Aravena 2003; Chihuailaf 2006; Course 2011; Foerster & Vergara 2001; and Terwindt 2009.

[15] The price tag for such services is not cheap. For the CONADI's *Orígenes* program alone, which targets rural families in regions of high concentration of indigenous inhabitants, $80

million were borrowed by the state from the Inter-American Development Bank (Le Bonniec 2003: footnote 35).

[16] I refer loosely to simulacra in the sense that French sociologist Jean Baudrillard (1995) uses the term, as the image of a simulation of reality, which is destroyed and replaced by its very simulation. We can read the *toma* as the image of 400 years of a united Mapuche resistance to colonial incursions, which is a simulation of reality. It is distorted by memory to replace the more complex reality that internal divisions and compromise with Spanish and later Chilean interlopers have been typical of colonial experiences.

[17] In English *mestizaje* is often called miscegenation or inter-ethnic mixity.

[18] Similar nationalistic subtext is encountered by Blacks in societies that claim to be *mestizo* but in fact operate with a racial hierarchy.

[19] Mallon cites as an example Saavedra Peláez 2002.

[20] Literally meaning a settlement, *asentamiento* was the name used to refer to collective farms set up during the Popular Unity's Agrarian Reform.

[21] Ramos notes that unlike in other parts of the Americas, in Brazil the term Indian has passed through both denigration and regeneration over several phases, infusing a once stigmatized word with political agency.

[22] Stereotypes about Latin American male chauvinism, often called *machismo*, are poignantly deconstructed and contextualized in Matthew Gutmann's (1996) ethnography on gender relations, fatherhood, and sexuality in Mexico City.

[23] In the sense intended here, essential refers to the existence of an unchanging essence to the identity.

[24] Ana Mariella Bacigalupo's *La Voz del Kultrún en la Modernidad* (2001), as well as her other work already noted, are important sources deconstructing such seeming contradictions emerging from colonial encounters.

Chapter 7: Storied Bodies

Este modelo cultural, quizá propio de una época traumatizada, está profundamente arraigado e implica íntimamente ausencia de sentidos colectivos, de solidaridades y, por tanto, del encierro o refugio en el espacio individual de cada uno.	This cultural model, perhaps belonging to a traumatized era, is deep-seated and closely related to the absence of collective sentiments, of solidarity and, therefore, implies a turning inward or refuge within individual spaces.

-José Bengoa, *La Comunidad Reclamada* (2006: 155)

Like most municipal schools in Chile, Neltume's is a designated polling station for elections. In January 2010, in this bright yellow building set against a reforested hillside, a small portion of the Chilean electorate gave right-wing financier Sebastian Piñera a narrow presidential victory—51.6%. This tiny margin is about as much as anyone ever wins in Chile, where majority governments are less representative of social consensus than they are of run-off elections and a coalition-prone binominal system. The victory was called historic, because that year, for the first time since negotiating the 1990 democratic transition, the centre-left *Concertación* coalition lost its mandate. Piñera took to the stage for his acceptance speech to dramatic chants of "*¡General Pinochet, este triunfo es por usted!… ¡Viva Chile y Pinochet!*"[1] However, one could not help but notice the very small number of dedicated supporters Piñera, and the election overall, were able to claim.

Raúl's post-voting grin told a fuller story of political subjectivities. "*I voted for a Transformer*," he told me. Candidates had campaigned on exaggerated platforms of change.

The Transformers joke veiled sentiments that are common among twentysomethings with whom I spoke, that, like the Hollywood sequel widely pirated at the time, elections were considered the expensive fantasies of an influential few. Raúl was in the minority of his generation to have even voted; among Chileans under thirty who in 2008 were registered to vote, only 23% cast ballots, a figure that reached 7% in particularly poor sectors of the rural South (Barrionuevo 2009).[2] His humour signals the significance of what is not directly spoken about views on civic participation, but which is nevertheless expressed by other means. That is to say, meaningful change in the state's relationship with society is desired, few believe it will come from the electoral realm, and latent consent to Pinochet's legacy lingers among the electorate. By exploring processes of civic awakening among Chile's youngest political generation, this final analytical chapter turns attention to beliefs, values, and practices surrounding citizenship that circulate in family and small community networks. Recalling a reference to Norbert Lechner (2002: 119) made in the Introduction to this thesis, I approach local understandings of citizenship in broad terms, as they appear in stories about the emergent awareness among youth of belonging to a society of governable subjects.

The first half of this chapter examines processes of memory transmission in one family home, allowing us to seriously engage with Don Tito's perspective (expressed in the citation at the beginning of this thesis); namely, that the gravest impact of the Pinochet regime on Chilean society took the form of a repression in the stomachs of people. The case of this household reveals that wider implications of transformations in family life in recent decades are poorly recognized in literature on memory in post-dictatorship Chile. More

importantly, misrecognition of local social processes inhibits a deeper understanding of political subjectivity among youth today, and commands memory scholars to find a new vocabulary for addressing non-autobiographical memory among youth. In the second half, I return to another point raised briefly in the thesis Introduction, that historical perspectives among youth are charged terrain upon which the interests and preoccupations of older generations struggle for influence over the future of the Chilean nation. This point challenges us to recognize the type of future envisioned for Chile by its governing elite, and to ask who else benefits from the prevailing system.

Survival Stories

While *machi* Sara's land *toma* was attended mainly by people who struggle for class consciousness and the recovery of well-being for indigenous communities, the stakes of disagreements between attendees were enhanced by the likelihood that most participants were frustrated in their daily lives by friends, neighbours, and family members who actively withdraw from such struggles. Evidence of this appeared in drunken tears about *machi* Sara's distrusting neighbours, in Cecilia's discouraged words about a divided society, in Francisca's inexperience with mounting a protest, and when the four youth from Temuco implied that there are right and wrong ways of being Mapuche. In this last chapter, I interpret such signs of social fragmentation in terms pronounced by Don Tito and discussed in Chapter 1, when he observed that the military regime's most effective form of repression occurred "*in the stomachs of people.*" Both literally and figuratively, his words suggest that

state terror in the form of arrests, torture, and exile was not the most effective assault on what in the decade prior to the coup had become Chile's relatively vibrant civic fabric.

Nearly twenty years after the democratic transition, it is curious that as a survivor of all of those forms of terror and of the forced disappearance of family members and friends, Don Tito perceived that the regime's most enduring marks on society were left where no obvious physical wounds had been inflicted. For him, it seemed reasonable that some people would be unable to put troubling experiences into words. He nonetheless found no straightforward answer for why many thousands of people who never directly experienced repression but witnessed it all the same, would be unable or unwilling to speak out for the sake of future generations. We find motivations for such silences in what youth actually know about the contested past, and how they perceive that they know it.

Sons and Soldiers

David was twenty-four when, during a holiday trip home from his graphic design studies in Valdivia, he asked his parents about military repression in Neltume, wondering why they had never broached the topic with him. As a teenager, he had learned from friends about the former guerrilla camp named after a famous sixteenth century Mapuche warrior, *Toqui Lautaro*. In the early 1980s, guerrillas who had returned from exile had hidden for nearly eighteen months in caves and dug-outs in nearby sectors, and were clandestinely ferried supplies by some area residents (See Comité Memoria Neltume 2003; González 2002; Pascal Allende 1981).[3] The bronze monument installed in 2001 at the entrance to town, of a bare-chested worker with outstretched arms, stood less than two hundred metres

from David's childhood home. He knew that it was installed to commemorate the seventy-one men from Panguipulli's Forestry and Timber Complex who were mostly assassinated in the weeks following the coup. However, he was less familiar with what those men and their families had struggled to accomplish prior to military repression, or why some survivors would become guerrillas. He was even less certain about events that precipitated an uncle's move to a faraway city called Saskatoon, from which neither the uncle nor his family had ever returned. David had not known about the Air Force bombing of the presidential palace, *La Moneda*, on the morning of September 11, 1973. Nor had he realized that it was an assault on an elected government, or the scale on which non-combatant civilians were targeted for arrest, leading to the forced disappearance of thousands through exile or death. Finally, he had been unaware that the military camp installed at the entrance to Neltume during his early childhood was an extension of that assault.

While pursuing post-secondary studies, he had seen documentary film-maker Patricio Guzmán's *La Batalla de Chile* (1975, 1976, 1979),[4] a film series that exposes the increasing social tensions that plagued civil society in the months prior to the September 1973 coup. Guzmán's original footage did not premiere in Chile until 1996. It was an event for which the film-maker recorded reactions during viewings among university students who had grown up under the dictatorship, arranging these into another documentary titled *Chile, la memoria obstinada* (1997).[5] It would be another ten years before David would discover Guzmán's documentaries. However, not unlike students in the later film, he found the original footage to depict historical events much differently than he had been led to believe they had unfolded.[6] This was not merely an effect of a decentralized and

301

increasingly privatized education system (the subject of analysis in Chapter 5). Social activist and investigative journalist Naomi Klein (2007) notes that, from its very inception the 1973 coup was designed to appear as a war, apparently justifying what was fundamentally a well-orchestrated bid on the part of the national and international elite to restructure the economy.[7] In spite of its proven historical inaccuracy, discourse persists today that the coup was an intervention by the Armed Forces in what was escalating into a civil war. Upon seeing the films, David recognized the interests of the current leadership to mollify the masses by relegating the contested past to historical textbooks, but he wondered nonetheless why his parents, who had experienced that period, had not exposed him to more critical perspectives. Why had they not contextualized for him the apparent silences in his public school education, or corrected errors in popular media coverage of that history?

Recalling when David first told her about the films, his mother explained to me that she had never deliberately avoided speaking about the topic with her children. Indeed, the regime had involved experiences that Sra. Ilda hoped her sons would never endure, but she did not intentionally hide information from them. My questions about this gap in memory transmission launched her into reflections on how she reasoned that similar horrors might be avoided today. Like other mothers to whom I had asked about the transmission to their children of knowledge about state terror, her narrative was heavily inflected with the responsibilities of parenthood. It began with stories about being pregnant with David's older brother in the early 1980s. That was when the Armed Forces actively intimidated residents of Neltume, seeking to extract information about the location of guerrillas then suspected to be hiding in the hillsides. Her mother-in-law had been repeatedly visited by police, who

insisted that family members knew that an exiled relative was not in fact in Canada, but back in Panguipulli and hiding as a subversive.

The interrogations would have largely elicited false confessions through the intimidation of local families, those who remained behind when dozens of area residents escaped the country for political reasons in the mid-1970s. Only five of thirteen participants of the Neltume guerrilla encampment who were eventually assassinated were exiles originally from Panguipulli.[8] Sra. Ilda chuckled incredulously as she recalled relentless attempts by authorities to extract fabricated confessions from her husband's family.

> **Sra. Ilda:** *A picture of Javier's mother appeared in the newspapers, as though she were up to no good. In 1981, there was the problem of Operación Retorno,[9] where MIRistas had returned and were trying to take over something, I have no idea what. So the soldiers punished relatives of exiles. Javier's mother had a lot of patience and courage to put up with those men breathing down her neck all the time, when she hadn't seen her son in nearly a decade.* (Personal communication, June 2010)

Interrogations aside, Sra. Ilda had empathized with the soldiers. They were young men like her sons would one day become, nearly sixty of them that she imagined had mothers not unlike her. As she described the youth to me, she pointed out her window towards a now empty field where the military camp was once set up nearby, where those youth had suffered before her eyes, malnourished and cold. Another mother once described it to me as like watching on helplessly, as young horses destined to become service animals for abusive owners were broken.

> **Sra. Ilda:** *It was traumatizing for me to watch those boys in that camp. I was pregnant then, and I can remember eating here inside my kitchen and watching them run—taca taca taca taca—in the dead of winter, me with my hot cup of soup and them running like animals in the rain. It hurt to see them, as I had a little son and I imagined that he might have to endure the same one day.*

Back then, when Sra. Ilda's house was broken into by soldiers, all that was ever discovered stolen was bread. Only the bald ones would rob, she explained, and it was only ever out of hunger. Bare heads signalled the young conscripts completing mandatory service.

Sra. Ilda's early fears for her own sons' prospects were not without basis. Even though the Chilean Armed Forces moved towards a more voluntary recruiting system following the democratic transition, to this day when an annual quota of recruits is not filled voluntarily (usually by those of humble origin hoping to build military careers), men between 18 and 24 years of age are randomly called to duty. Only a medical certificate or proof of continuing studies may exempt one from service (Olivares Cofré 2012: paragraph 7). Several young men of David's age with whom I spoke had completed a year of service under such circumstances. Rafael, one of David's childhood peers, described to me having robbed potatoes and chickens from peasants while desperate to survive long campaigns, often buried in snow for which the soldiers were ill-equipped. That was in 2004, around the time that others with whom I spoke permanently contracted foot fungi as adequate boots were scarce and frequently stolen between comrades. A year earlier, another former conscript I met had contracted tuberculosis during military service, ruining his employability, as he could no longer work in manual labour during winter months. He told

me wryly that while an early death is the fate of many soldiers, his would come without ever having seen a battle.

During my 2009 evening English classes in Neltume, which were well-attended by middle-aged women like Sra. Ilda, I once overheard mothers shudder when casual conversation turned to the possibility of sons completing military training. Their dread persisted throughout the second decade following the democratic transition, a time when the Armed Forces was still adapting to a globalized, post-Cold War world (Muzzopappa 2005: 111). This became especially apparent following the 2005 Tragedy of Antuco, when forty-four new recruits perished while marching through a snowstorm in -20°C temperatures.[10] More troubling to those mothers than a son being called to duty was that the promise of stable employment might entice one to volunteer. The mothers reasoned that if a son made it to post-secondary studies, or if he learned a trade or English to build a decent career, he might escape such a dehumanizing life.

War Crimes

As Sra. Ilda recounted to me stories about raising her sons in close proximity to the barracks, her husband watched the evening news from the sofa across the room. She had previously explained to me that he was reluctant to speak to a researcher out of apprehension that I might pry too directly into "*political themes*." Over the course of the evening, I would learn that he felt that social researchers interested in Neltume only pay attention to its history of labour struggle and repression. He nevertheless interrupted periodically to add to Sra. Ilda's stories. At first, when she described the encampment that

had been installed at the edge of town during the 1970s and 1980s, she recalled routinely hearing children in the school playground across the road crying out, distraught at the sight of soldiers being beaten before them. To this, Don Javier added that mothers even complained to officials in the encampment. Meanwhile, as she described the nighttime vigilance required to cover her baby's ears from the sound of a firing range next door, he corrected her choice of words, engaging the political themes he was so reluctant to discuss.

> **Sra. Ilda:** *All of a sudden you would hear—pah pah pah pah pah. Grenades, ta ta ta ta ta. Just outside the house, training in the middle of the night. I had to be constantly alert.*
>
> **Don Javier:** *It wasn't training. There's a special word for it… [Thoughtful pause]…It's called psychological-environmental torture, or something like that; the simulations were so that people would know they were here.*

In spite of avoiding what he considered to be political themes, Don Javier betrayed critical knowledge on the regime's tactics against civilian populations. This suggests that his evasion of researchers was not simply to avoid expressing political views or to silence dissenting opinions on the contested past, but inspired by a sense that some of Neltume's stories escape the direct, unambiguous language that formal interviews invite. As Sra. Ilda and I sat at the kitchen table in conversation, he increasingly piped in from the sofa across the room, adding to her descriptions of local judgments about the military presence in town.

> **Rita:** *Did people talk among themselves about what they thought of the camp?*
>
> **Sra. Ilda:** *Thinking out loud, for example, people in town would say: "Why are they here? Why don't they get lost?"*

Don Javier: *"Why aren't they a bit out of town? Why do they have to be right here in this spot, where little kids can see them?"*
Sra. Ilda: *"...Where we can all hear their shooting practice at night, where we hear the officers holler that at the count of three all those skinny soldiers have to jump in the frigid river to bathe?"*

Not unlike these neighbours described to me as complaining indirectly about the military's former installation on the edge of town, Sra. Ilda and Don Javier were equally indirect in expressing their views to me; something which David pointed out was the case with him as well. Why did these parents not transmit to their children judgments about the military's presence during the 1970s and 1980s? Compared to other families with whom I collaborated, theirs had been the most directly impacted by military repression, since they lived beside the military barracks and had close family members who had fled into exile. Nevertheless, like every other family in this study, the parents could give no single, deliberate answer when asked why their children never learned about experiences endured by family members during the regime.

What members of Don Javier's family endured is a matter of relatively public record, though David and possibly the rest of his family were unaware of this. Don Javier's brother had been involved in the lumber union's leadership, which led to his persecution by the Armed Forces and eventual re-settlement in Canada following the coup. It was information I knew mainly from documentary sources. I discovered mention of his activities in a rare copy of an independent human rights report accessible on reading room loan in the national library in Santiago (Rojas et al. 1991), as well as in an independent publication sold

in Panguipulli kiosks during my time in the commune (Cardyn Degen 2006). While neither text refers to Don Javier's brother's testimony, much like many others who left Neltume to never return, his name appeared in accounts shared by people outside the family. Perhaps less intriguing than learning from a book that Don Javier's brother was processed by court-martial (that is, according to military law even though he was a civilian), was that the Caravan of Death operation may have been responsible for carrying out the late-September and early October 1973 arrests in Valdivia's pre-cordillera (Ahumada et al. 1989: 344; Escalante Hidalgo 2000; Rojas et al. 1991: 82; Stern 97). That operation is the only case for which Pinochet was ever indicted, and is not formally confirmed to have reached as far South as Valdivia.

Whatever the operation, the Armed Forces effectively deployed counter-insurgency tactics throughout the Panguipulli Forestry and Timber Complex. This is especially apparent in stories surrounding an incident at the Neltume police outpost on the night following the coup, when some ninety people lead by MIR and union leaders surrounded the building located at the entrance to town. A shot was fired into the air by someone in the gathered crowd and in a loud voice the police were called to help defend the Popular Unity government. By 6:00 a.m., the four police officers inside were joined by four reinforcements. While Molotov cocktails had apparently been made, none were thrown at the building, and in the words of witnesses, not even a window was broken. However, this event paraphrased here from a report by an independent human rights group (Rojas et al. 1991: 45-49), was distorted by authorities to support death sentences of several men soon arrested in town. The morning after the confrontation between workers and Neltume's

police, five hundred soldiers arrived and began raiding homes of people whose names appeared on their lists. Soldiers were followed by helicopters that pursued fugitives into the forests, and the Air Force had the collaboration of Argentine authorities who reported anyone caught escaping via the frontier. One Mapuche farmer in the Neltume Lake community told me that the helicopters seemed to shoot indiscriminately at anyone detected on the ground. By the end of September 1973—within three weeks of the coup—regional and national newspapers reported that extremists in the southern pre-cordillera had been defeated. Sensationalist stories about the fanaticism of people in the interior circulated. For instance, those who were not incriminated for participating in the confrontation outside the police outpost were convicted by court-martial of carrying out evil plots (i.e. a doctor was accused of poisoning bottle nipples of the children of military agents).

Published a year and a half after the transition to democracy, the report that I cite here not only reconstructs events surrounding the arrival of Armed Forces in Neltume, it also poses that the province of Valdivia was among the first regions outside of Santiago where war operations were carried out following the September 11, 1973 coup. As Don Javier indicated with his reference to 'psychological-environmental torture,' counter-insurgency tactics involved multiple mechanisms that functioned as psychological warfare. These tactics included the economic destabilization of families, the manipulation of information through its fabrication or control, and the internalization of fear (Rojas et al. 1991: 176). Immediately following the regime, the enduring effects of these were identified among families and especially children. Towards the end of that report's discussion of repression in Neltume, fourteen children are identified as having lost their fathers following

the coup (Rojas et al. 1991: 87). They were teased at school, reinforcing the isolation and shame experienced by families of the disappeared. Among survivors, the dead were often never named by parents and siblings, but evoked only in silence between close kin. In one example, a father's surname was not assigned to his son, as his disappearance was a secret kept from the child until he was nearly an adult. His mother had moved with her son to Argentina for five years, and only told him about his father's violent death upon returning to Chile to live with her parents in the southern Araucanian city of Villarrica. She feared that at seventeen, he might discover the truth from others.

Some families of victims escaped the constant vigilance directed by the military towards residents of Neltume by moving to Santiago or seeking asylum in Italy, Holland, Belgium, England, Canada, Sweden, and Cuba. One mother who remained is said to have locked herself inside her home to never again come out. Meanwhile, for some the horror has only festered as death certificates were long withheld and several bodies were never returned. Others were returned in sealed, blood-stained coffins that relatives were not permitted to open prior to burial. In the case of José Gregorio Liendo, the MIR leader known locally as Comandante Pepe, the coffin did not even correspond to his stature, leaving doubts as to whether the remains were even his own (Ibid, 83). Authors of that report conclude by deploring the fact that on the heels of the democratic transition, justice for crimes during the dictatorship did not seem a priority among authorities. Observations throughout this thesis suggest that, twenty years later, those authors have not encountered resolution to concerns that indifference and social anomie prevail in Chile (Ibid, 176). However, as I sat in 2010 at Sra. Ilda's kitchen table while David moved about preparing

310

for the following day's trekking expedition and as Don Javier hollered asides between segments on the evening news, silence on human rights abuses and horrors once endured in Neltume communicated neither indifference, nor anomie. Memory seemed very much alive, just not the kind of memory encountered in the national library.

Taste of Sweet Things

As Sra. Ilda described to me how life had changed in Neltume since she first arrived there in the early 1970s, our conversation turned to food. The end of the *pulpería* (company store) system had been eased with the military's improvement of the road to town, leading to greater mobility for families to acquire goods needed from the city. While fridges and washing machines were purchased by some, the irregular electric current available from the factory's hydroelectric plants was liable to damage these. This meant that until the town switched to the central grid in the 1990s, many families went without major appliances. In 2009, some of my high school students could themselves remember the period when washing machines began to arrive, dramatically reducing the workload of women who, regardless of seasons, had long laundered clothes in communal wash-houses in the open air set up throughout town.

At this point in our discussion, Don Javier was becoming increasingly animated, interrupting with recollections about the town's changed geography and the gastronomy of his youth. I would eventually leave their home that evening with a map he drew of Neltume from the early days of the lumber industry, showing the route of the steam train that transported lumber through different stages of processing, and the raised aqueduct system

that was built on logs to bring running water to town homes before most people in Chile enjoyed such a luxury. On a stack of napkins, he also drew diagrams of the cookware once used for preparing special foods, of the flow of air through a wood-burning stove, and the elaborate structure of his father's smokehouse. Positioning himself at the dining table where Sra. Ilda and I sat nibbling on snacks, he glanced at my audio-recorder and joked that I would have to give him a cut of the royalties from my book.[11]

During Don Javier's childhood, the whole family pitched in to make dishes which he called "*poor men's food*." With this introduction, he proceeded to describe sneaking dried meat from the woodshed, which doubled as a smokehouse, in this fashion conveying an elaborate social structure in which each flavour was once the product of a family's collaborative labour.

> **Don Javier:** *Do you know when we ate meat? Only in the winter. I'd go into the leñera when my dad was working, to steal a piece of charqui. It was nice and salty, all day sitting there in the smoke next to a giant fire. We tossed humid sawdust on the flames for the smoke to swell. In one part was a big hole in the roof, so the smoke could get out, and below another part was the fire pit. Wood was stacked along an opposite wall, and from the rafters hung garlic and onions, everything stored together...* (Personal communication, June 2010)

In Don Javier's childhood in the 1950s, Neltume was little more than a large saw mill on an estate owned by the Etchevarry family. Of Basque origin, the Etchevarrys acquired it from the Kenhry family, also absentee landowners. Don Javier explained that Etchevarry Sr. allotted several hectares of field located out of town in the sector of Pirihuil,

312

so that workers could plant potatoes. The boss would lend trucks each year to pick up as many as eighty bags of potatoes produced by workers' families, delivering these to homes in town. Even though their union would eventually expel him with the estate takeovers during the Popular Unity, several people in Neltume described to me that Juan Domingo Etchevarry was as much part of building that place as their own fathers and grandfathers. Such insistence betrayed a complexity to worker-landowner relations of earlier periods.

Don Javier's father would cut *chicharrones* (cubes of pork fat), and his mother prepared a list of finer products to make from the pig. *"We also made sausages and lard, only the bones would remain."* His father seemed to plant everything: parsley, cilantro, oregano, beans, peas, corn, potatoes, chard, cabbage, lettuce, and carrots. The worst cabbage was fed to the pigs, four or five animals kept to feed the family throughout the year. Finer quality cabbage was chopped and thrown into a barrel with heaps of salt. That began after the springtime and continued well into the fall: "*We would have sauerkraut all winter long.*" It was an elaborate production line that followed the rhythm of seasons. As Don Javier continued, absorbed by the sequence of activities attached to memories of the smokehouse, he described the special care taken so that food would not freeze during winter months, when temperatures dropped below 0° Celsius and snow covered the ground. Bags of sawdust from the plywood factory, one of two factories around which barn-like homes were built, were layered between bags of potatoes. These were then lined up near the open-pit fire. The pigs lived just outside of the woodshed, and in the summer a small garden was grown. With no cows back then in the forested pre-cordillera, nobody consumed milk,

cheese, yogurt, or butter. Pig's lard mixed with hot spice passed for butter, while sugar burned on a spoon and mixed into hot water passed as both coffee and remedy for a fever.

What was not acquired in the *pulpería* or grown by the family was often obtained through trade with a Mapuche woman from the Neltume Lake *reducción* (the nearest Mapuche community), whom his mother had befriended. Sra. Eva would arrive with wool, apples, plums, and other fruit, to trade with his mother for lard, salt, sugar, *hierba maté*, and sometimes old clothing. Neltume's children played barefoot with distended bellies, which Sra. Ilda speculated were swollen from parasites and malnutrition. Yet, she also supposed that whatever the hardship endured by the children of lumber workers, those in the *reducción* had it worse, as their parents walked long distances in cruel weather for trade.

Don Javier's hands gave motion to childhood memories that engrossed him with remembered savours of once-cherished dishes. Imaginary bits of bread were tossed piece-by-piece into a pretend saucepan filled with oregano, garlic, lard, salt, and crushed hot peppers. That made *pankrut*. David, who had by then joined us at the table, asked his mom if she could make such foods, wondering what they tasted like. She shrugged, supposing she could. Dishes like *mayo de papa*, *chuncho*, and *callana* were so simple that people did not bother to make them anymore, since meat and pastries had become more available. Herein were historical perspectives about life in Neltume shared in this family home, offered by parents and received by children. Innocuous and even apolitical as they seemed, these stories were nonetheless rich with lessons about surviving in this isolated place. They were survival stories on the one hand, about how to live on modest means, and on the other hand about how to adapt to constraints beyond one's control.

Peasant Diplomacy

In Don Javier's view, for many people who have lived their entire lives in Neltume, or who like him were born and raised in even more remote saw mills in the interior, unpleasant memories about military repression, the massacre of guerrillas returned from exile, and persistent intimidation of local families by authorities, colonized the history of his beloved home. In his enthusiasm for talking about "*poor men's food*" and his father's woodshed, he implied that worker solidarity and subsequent state repression are not the only things that make Neltume memorable. For him, this was where a timber industry had been forged by the labour of families like his, who before their arrival had no place called home or even the remote possibility that their children could attend school. People from this mountain town built an elaborate aqueduct system on hollowed-out trunks, and they hauled steamships rolled on logs one metre at a time along the winding banks of shallow rivers. Those vessels, such as the much-loved *Enco* which now sits deserted on a beach in the nearby town of Choshuenco, would eventually ferry settlers into remote valleys via the commune's abundant lakes. Describing these stories, Don Javier insisted that outsiders seem to ask only about Neltume's subversive past. A traffic cop had recently pulled him over on the highway, and upon seeing Don Javier's address, the policeman enquired whether it was true that guerrillas had been in Neltume. "*I'm from Huilo Huilo, Neltume,*" he now answers while travelling outside Panguipulli, so that people might associate the town with the new five-star hotels instead (See Appendix E: The Huilo Huilo Initiative in Neltume). The Neltume he intended for his children was where a good life is still possible,

if you know how to reconcile its past with its present. In large part, he figured that the Huilo Huilo tourism initiative was to thank for this.

> **Don Javier:** *The hotels generated a consciousness among the people that we are capable of not simply working for the boss for a wage at the end of the month. Artisans have emerged; people have started embroidering, selling wood carvings, making cabins to rent. Carpenters have begun to specialize, and youth today study eco-tourism, mountaineering... And what tourists look for is that people here are authentic, committed to our customs, that's what they emphasize in the hotels...Never would I have imagined that my kids could one day go to university as both do now. My father worked in lumber, his father too, and one's son always followed the same path, never having a chance at anything else.*

Sra. Ilda continued, pointing out that nobody in town ever imagined that foreigners might find a paradise there, or that anyone would pay more than the value of the forest's timber to walk among its trees still standing in the ground. In less than a decade, the tourism industry brought the possibility that her children might actually have a future there, that Neltume might not become a ghost town, and that she might be able to live near her future grandchildren, as her children now had employment opportunities near home. In her view, what was crucial to survival there today was a re-education of residents to Neltume's natural beauty.

While Sra. Ilda and Don Javier described a growing sense of autonomy and new possibilities in town, neither expressed much opinion when I asked how they felt regarding the owner of the Huilo Huilo tourism initiative's support for Endesa's hydroelectric project. She answered by indicating her love for the river, trees, and wood-peckers just outside her

door, that she hoped the facility would not endanger the area's enchantment, but that she did not really know about that sort of thing. He indicated that there were already two such plants on the Fuy River, the Remeco and the Llallalca not five kilometres down river, with a combined industrial output of 400 MW. They had been functioning for nearly sixty years and were tucked well out of sight of tourists, hiding an inauthentic blemish on the natural beauty of the area's reforested hills. Don Javier also supposed that as an entrepreneur with significant investments in the area, Huilo Huilo's owner Víctor Petermann must have known what he was doing. As I turned to invite David's input on the hydroelectric project, their son shrugged and asked what else could one do if a "*political decision*" had already been made. By this, he implied that if distant leaders in the nation's capital were determined to bring the project to fruition, then one should be at the table for negotiations, instead of being left out of the process entirely. In this family's apparent withdrawal from debates brewing around the proposed dam, we glimpse the contradictory nature of the town's re-education towards the tourist industry. On the one hand, opportunities for residents to develop occupations independent of an imperious landlord were celebrated, and on the other compliance with distant authorities persisted.

It is within this context that David's limited knowledge about repression in Neltume makes the most sense. When he asked his parents why they had never discussed military repression at home, like me, he was met with uncertain stories about what kind of people they had long hoped their children would become. By struggling to ensure for their sons the possibility of studies in the city, Sra. Ilda and Don Javier aimed to transmit a more fulfilling future than what had long been available to families in the interior. Hardly an apologist for

317

Pinochet, his father emphasized that democratization was a long process, with costs of its own, and that opportunities for youth today far exceed those of earlier generations. He emphasized that survival is achieved through accommodation to constrained circumstances, a narrative that Don Javier drove home with an historical example about the Toledo estate, and why he believed it was the only in all the surrounding area to never be seized by workers. Indeed, it remained in the hands of the same man throughout both the Popular Unity and military regime.

> **Don Javier:** *They never seized the estate because the owner made great barbecues for the workers. Pablo Gonzalez grilled a lot of animals for people, and gave them to anyone regardless of political stripes, even to the government. He made buddies, I mean in quotation marks "buddies," with the men from the U.P [Popular Unity]. He would call them comrades, buy them wine, give them an animal, some meat, and they would drink. He must have killed lots of animals for those parties, maybe 20, 30, or 100. But he always gave them a barbecue, and his estate always remained his. Toledo was the only in the Panguipulli cordillera never seized by workers or the state. It was the only [among some two dozen] that was ever properly sold.*

Don Javier's ethics of accommodation was not therefore apolitical, but reflected a form of diplomacy uncharacteristic of Chile's prevailing model of polarized partisanship. It answered Sra. Ilda's fears that her sons might one day have become soldiers, in that it transmitted a message to youth to not become pawns for the political projects of others. Through accommodating to uncomfortable realities, they hoped to maximize the social milieus in which their children might be successful. In turn, this would minimize prospects

318

for unforgiving manual labour, be it as lumber workers or soldiers. This involved the inadvertent transmission of cautionary views on social criticism, evident in the open refusal by Don Javier to talk about "*political themes*," but contradicted in his willingness to dig into them so long as conversation did not seem to follow ideological lines. In this fashion, David's parents avoided a perhaps more troubling prospect than underemployment or military service for their children. It was the prospect that like uncles before them, sons might become revolutionaries, or even worse, join the ranks of the disappeared. While dismayed that a brother was exiled to Canada, Don Javier explained that to remain behind implies a deliberate will to overcome social fragmentation.

> **Don Javier:** *With all that happened, the family stopped being what it was, socially, in terms of friendships. I'm not in contact with my brother, and they're not interested in coming here either… Here in town, divisions simmer. If you choose to quietly go about your things, and to be at peace with the past, then rumours circulate: "How does he get away with it? He must be paid off, or be in cahoots with someone." It boils down to taking life day by day, and not getting involved with anyone, trying to respect others so they will respect you.*

Don Javier's relationship to remembering offers critical insight into memory scholarship on the continent. First, he turns on its head reasoning behind the moral imperative to bring past atrocities to light, so that they may "never again" occur.[12] While he does not dismiss human rights reports, he sees no use in further rehashing experiences of the military regime. That would involve focusing selectively on certain unpleasant aspects of the past for unlikely judicial, therapeutic, or pedagogical gain, and it would transmit few

319

skills to his sons for surviving an unjust world. Second, he demonstrates that so-called indigenous historicities are not as novel as they may at first seem. We observe this in parallels to the Guajá and other Amazonian groups who systematically transform their dead into paradigms of sociological foreignness (mentioned in Chapter 2), actively decolonizing their historical consciousness by avoiding speaking about the dead or by simply not viewing those from outside their group as moral actors within a shared universe (Cormier 2003; Taylor 1993). Don Javier actively controls how he engages with memories of an evidently contested nature, removing from his attention that which prohibits his ability to go about daily life. He also dismisses perceived outsiders who seek to pronounce on Neltume's divisive past as though it were their own, finding those who focus solely on human rights violations to be more preoccupied with their own arguably modernist agendas—in that they seek to uncover immutable truths—than with the development and well-being of those in town today. Not unlike the mortal souls of Ancient Greece, who gather in the underworld along the River Lethe to drink from its waters and lose the memory of what they have done and suffered, oblivion appears here as a means of purification, so that they may live again.

Interestingly, even though David eventually discovered aspects of the military regime that his parents had long neglected to discuss, his awakening to a wider political reality did not seem to significantly change how he related to the imagined community of the nation. This became evident in his disinterest in taking up a struggle against Endesa's hydroelectric project, even though that intervention was largely possible due to the company's prior status as a government corporation that was privatized following the

Pinochet regime.[13] David's lingering disinterest in becoming civically engaged suggests that non-narrative knowledge about the contested past remained the deciding framework shaping his political subjectivity. Given that his withdrawal largely reinforced dominant interests that lower and middle class Chileans remain removed from political processes, it seems that in spite of the will to not get involved, seeming indifference is invariably politicized. In Don Javier and Sra. Ilda's hopes for their children, which were expressed in a similar fashion by other parents in this study, to become "*political*" might endanger a fragile future.

The Promise of Inclusion

Don Javier's avoidance of "*political themes*" indicates that historical perspectives generally, and among youth in particular, are charged terrain. As we saw in Chapter 6, this is because diverse groups contend to define the past and present as a means of shaping how the future of the Chilean nation is imagined and acted upon. In this last section, I ask: from observations in this thesis, what can we deduce of the future anticipated by national leaders in Chile? One answer that I explore here lays in the actuarial tendency by policy-makers to equate economic growth with social improvement. We observed this in Chapter 4, as the benefits and hazards of industrial development pinch many southerners between competing notions of well-being, in which the degradation of natural spaces and the loss of indigenous ways of life are accepted by many to be necessary trade-offs for industrial growth, and presumably, social improvement. Through the illustration of increasingly privatized education and community consultation processes for industrial interventions in Chapter 5, we learned that the future is full of promise, or more specifically, promises. For

321

predominantly poor residents of the rural South, these promises boil down to one in particular: namely, current sacrifices will inevitably generate future returns. Meanwhile, discussions of political subjectivity among indigenous youth in Chapter 6, reveal that while meaningful social change is desired by people of diverse backgrounds, social solidarity is dogged by situated understandings of the contested past. Engaging different historical elements, these observations relate to current efforts to shape what is arguably modernity's newest frontier: the future.

The Flourishing Future

Medical anthropologist Vincanne Adams, with colleagues Michelle Murphy and Adele Clarke (2009), has observed temporal dimensions of neoliberal power, describing governance by 'anticipatory regime' as an increasingly common reality globally. They argue that an international shift in public policy marks this particular moment of modernity, characterized not only by the state's conquest of distant frontiers, but of time itself. The anticipatory era in which we now live is said to have emerged as speculative finance came to dominate capital accumulation in recent decades, re-ordering social worlds in anticipation of controlling uncertain futures. The impacts of this modernity are seen to evict whole sectors of a population from public life (Adams et al. 2009: 259), not unlike the effects of neoliberal reforms carried out by the Chicago Boys economists, who it would seem summoned this era to Chile.[14]

The contours of this anticipated future are perhaps most evident in Chile's status as South America's only Organization for Economic Development and Co-operation

(O.E.C.D.) country, whose strong GDP is bolstered by competitive primary resource extraction and fuelled by efficient energy production. Since its 2009 admission to the O.E.C.D., Chile has been the only country in the region to partake in this network dedicated to promoting economic growth as a means of ensuring social stability. Throughout statements made by representatives of member states upon Chile's accession, then President Michelle Bachelet was repeatedly congratulated for having helped the country develop strong policies for "democratic consolidation and sound economic growth" (O.E.C.D. 2009: 5). Chile was lauded for reducing poverty in the past two decades, from 40% to 13%, as well as for efforts to curb corporate and government corruption.

Elements in O.E.C.D. forecasting equate the Chilean state with a homogeneous national community, glossing over competing interests within. The present is treated as a mere staging ground for a harmonious future, and the past beyond the democratic transition goes entirely unmentioned. This anticipatory framework resonates in the Swiss statement on Chile's accession to the O.E.C.D., which implied that members states would "compete on an equal footing throughout the landscape of international organizations…leaving old privileges behind once our level of development allows us to do so" (O.E.C.D. 2009: 11). This outlook is anticipatory in that it recasts the present in terms expected of the future. That is, if certain social and economic measures are taken today—e.g. to strengthen foreign business investments through free trade agreements, and to enforce a stable environment for extractive industries—the future should unfold as calculated. It is a regime in that this future is acted upon as a *fait accompli*, excluding input from the very actors who are supposed to keenly collaborate in its realization. These are Chile's working poor whose consent through

cheap and flexible labour is key to economic growth. This also includes thousands of indigenous people whose departure from ancestral communities due to loss of crops and precarious land tenure has put them and their children at the bottom of the labour hierarchy.

Notably absent from this vision for Chile's future, expressed by representatives of fellow member states, is a model of a democratic system that is accountable to its citizens as to the circumstances by which current policies came into being. In this light, recent student and indigenous protests challenge an anticipated future presumed by national leaders to be inevitable and collective, in a country where the political exclusion of large segments of the population was accomplished via military repression. The limitations of this anticipatory regime are showcased in recent student protests. As the children of the urban working classes who grew up in the years following the transition to democracy come of age, they bring to civic life expectations cultivated in Chile's post-dictatorship climate of illusory choice-making and greater participation in consumer culture. They have long been promised that inclusion is the fruit of the democratic order for which their parents' generation struggled in the 1980s.

As described elsewhere in this thesis, the current educational system and limited employment prospects confront adolescents and twentysomethings today with forms of socio-economic exclusion that frustrate their expectations of freely participating in civic life. It is not, therefore, very surprising that among 2011's post-secondary protesters, those who took to the streets hardly represented those most excluded by the system. Rather, protesters represented a society that had long awaited economic security as the promise of democracy. Therefore, at stake in continued student protests is not merely the quality of

education or equal access to it, but widespread complicity with a state project that keeps the attention of Chileans focused on the flourishing future. This helps explain why, at the height of 2011 manifestations, the government avoided candidly negotiating with student groups. Instead of engaging with the protesters' concerns, authorities opted to wait out the marches with water cannons and plain clothes police infiltrators, some of whom were discovered to have deliberately stirred up confrontations to excuse subsequent police intervention (See Appendix G: 2011 Student Protests). The tactics proved moderately effective at dissolving the movement into its own factions, but demands remain unresolved. Observations made in this thesis, to the effect that social policy following the democratic transition has favoured elite imaginations of Chilean society's 'natural order,' are exemplified in government responses to the protesters. As argued previously, the origins of this social order lay in the hacienda system, which lingers as a cultural model guiding contemporary authority and creeps into political life in remarkably subtle ways.

Disbanding the Pack

When 2011's student leaders were asked by authorities how they proposed to finance the free public education they were demanding, they proposed that natural resources be re-nationalized to inject important funds into public coffers. Authorities dismissed the proposal as unreasonable, arguing that questions about the economy were outside the purview of education and that students should leave important social planning decisions to the experts. The perception that young adults are illegitimate participants in political processes was captured in statements by police officials and bureaucrats, who routinely

inferred that the disruption of public order through predominantly peaceful spectacles amounted to criminal misconduct. In the fourth month of the movement, a comment posted in social media by the government's Executive Secretary of the Council for Books and Reading was leaked to the public, becoming a rather crude example of this intolerance. Her words referred to then president of the Universidad de Chile's student body, Camila Vallejo, a woman in her early twenties who seemed to stir as much media attention for her pretty face as for her unrelenting opposition to privatized education. The Executive Secretary's words were to the effect of "*killing the bitch to disband the pack.*"[15] This was a phrase used by Augusto Pinochet to refer to the presumed necessity of assassinating former President Salvador Allende to protect the public order.

Geographer and director of Chile's Centre for the Study of Women's Development Ximena Valdés swiftly published a response to the bureaucrat's Twitter post, elaborating that the phrase has a particular history in Chile carried forward from the hacienda era. In those times, unmarried women in the countryside were seen to distract men from their work, much like female dogs in heat attract male interest. Removing the female dog was seen to calm male instincts and disperse the marauding packs. Valdés denounced a deep-seated authoritarian culture among leaders, especially on the right of the political spectrum (2011: paragraph 3):

> Que una funcionaria de este régimen extraiga de la vieja doble moral hacendal, este principio autoritario propio de las lógicas de dominación del viejo Chile tradicional para referirse a Camila Vallejos [sic], constituye una pieza muestra vergonzante de la agazapada cultura autoritaria que hoy emerge con fuerza bajo las derechas en poder.[16]

In spite of their impressive momentum, it is significant to recall that 2011's student protests represented a small, relatively comfortable, and particularly urban segment of youth in Chile. The vast majority of students, despite seeming to widely agree with calls for more accessible education, could not participate in forcing school closures. Most youth from the rural South who were lucky enough to complete secondary studies and be able to pursue further education, belonged to more than 60% of the post-secondary population that attends private establishments (Uribe & Salamanca 2007: 8), none of which were formally represented by 2011 protesters. Having attended substandard schooling throughout their childhood, many such students had already experienced the difficulty of succeeding on national exams, impeding their admission to the most reputable public universities, whose professors and administrators happened to be most supportive to student protesters. During his February 2012 tour of Canada, former president of the Universidad de Santiago de Chile Camilo Ballesteros conceded to me that his student body had been at a relative advantage to mobilize. During Ballesteros' 2011 tenure as president, the dean of his public establishment doubled the Students' Union's annual budget in solidarity with the movement. Recognizing that student demands challenge something more systemic than educational policy reform alone, Ballesteros focused efforts in 2012 on broadening mobilization to push for the dismantling of lingering Pinochet era legislation. In anticipation of the October 2012 municipal elections held nationally, he pursued this by running as a mayoral candidate for the Santiago commune of Estación Central.

In Ballesteros' decision to run for office as a Communist Party candidate, I am reminded of another former member of *la Jota* (the Communist Youth) who runs as a mayoral candidate for the same party in Mariquina every four years. Don Tito, whose words on the dismembered family opened this thesis, once described to me his teacher training during the Popular Unity era, in which he was taught to feel responsible for society. In his view, youth today are taught that they need to go out and generate revenue. He lamented: "*For that reason they want to be doctors and engineers, to earn money, not for any social reason*" (Personal Communication, February 2008). Don Tito did not mean to admonish youth, but rather to criticize a social model in which the value of education is to obtain a better salary, not to improve society. In a manner of speaking, he forecast that 2011 protests would face a struggle far greater than policy reform. In his view, the greatest challenge of political mobilization today is of a cultural nature; that is, to transform what the public has been led to believe, value, and ultimately practice regarding its own citizenship and collective future. Don Javier and Sra. Ilda described earlier in this chapter, as well as attendees at *machi* Sara's land seizure in the previous chapter, reveal that political culture is intimately connected to memory of the contested past. However, the connection between memory and politics is not always accounted for by scholarly work on memory.

Non-Autobiographical Horizons

So-called 'memory literature'[17] on Chile, has tended to focus on the documentation of autobiographical experiences of state repression. In this vein, we find publications resulting from the Rettig and Valech Truth Commissions (Comisión Chilena de Derechos

Humanos 1999; Comisión Valech 2004), as well as from citizen-driven human rights initiatives to consolidate information that may expose perpetrators of political crimes.[18] We also encounter poetry and memoirs by prominent writers (See for examples Arce 1993; Dorfman 1992 & 1998; Eltit 1989; Timerman 1987), and literary analyses of these (See Díaz-Cid 2007; Howe 2011). For the rest, one finds studies of attempted reforms to institutionalized memory and struggles over commemorative projects (See Frazier 2007; Muzzopappa 2005; Reyes Jedlicki 2004). Quoted throughout this thesis, José Bengoa's *La Comunidad Reclamada* (2006) is the second book in his bicentenary trilogy which also includes *La Comunidad Perdida* (1996) and *La Comunidad Fragmentada* (2009b). The trilogy is among the few works in the social sciences that broaches the subject of non-autobiographical memory among youth, albeit indirectly. The most recent in the series presents young Mapuche political prisoners in southern prisons, as well as company workers hired to sow divisions among small-scale fishermen in sectors near Mehuín, where local communities have long opposed the construction by Celco Valdivia of a duct to dump toxic waste in the sea (See Guerra & Skewes 2004).

While perspectives among younger generations are discussed intermittently throughout Bengoa's trilogy, youth are not its principal focus. In this light, memory scholarship on Chile still offers few tools for assessing inter-generational dynamics and perspectives on the contested past acquired by generations that did not personally experience the regime. Of course, there is some hyperbole to this statement. For instance, earlier I note that youth are invoked at the end of analyses of human rights abuses in Neltume (Rojas 1991), to some extent as a means of emphasizing the duty to remember.

329

However, that study was conducted over twenty years ago, at a time when the long-term impacts of repression on younger generations could not yet be evaluated. Much as memory literature on the Holocaust was transformed as successive generations of survivors came of age, it would seem that, so too will Chile's, as Bengoa has to some extent forecast. Anticipating that memory literature on state repression in Chile will open onto new analytical horizons in coming years, we might draw some lessons from current approaches. In particular, how has an apparent blindspot as to non-autobiographical memory already limited our general appreciation of the contested past's lingering impacts on contemporary Chilean society? Close consideration of one prominent study in the social sciences sheds some light on this oversight. The study to which I am referring is an important English-language oeuvre on Chilean experiences of terror and recovery written by historian Steve Stern. It is also a three-book series, the trilogy titled *The Memory Box of Pinochet's Chile*, and analyzes the impacts of military repression on civil society following the democratic transition (Stern 2004, 2006 & 2010).

Each of Stern's books in *The Memory Box* series addresses a unique temporal period that frames what the author calls memory struggles during and following the Pinochet dictatorship.[19] Stern's depictions of a society struggling with conflicting memories are insightful, even though his research participants do not represent a broad spectrum of experiences of the Pinochet regime. Not unlike human rights literature that focuses on testimonies volunteered by victims and survivors, he conceptualizes memory struggles as belonging primarily to individuals who experienced highly contested events, though not uniquely as victims; i.e. military officials, indigenous peasants troubled by Marxist

developments in the countryside during the UP, people struggling for solidarity through pro-peace committees like the *Vicaría de la Solidaridad*.[20] His metaphor of the memory box is meant to evoke selective and competing remembrances of a national community devastated by military repression. What he describes as 'loose memories,' are evident in things like stray photos, and are said to evade 'larger scripts.' Stern further categorizes as 'dissident' and 'heroic,' memories that convey senses of rupture, persecution, and salvation that many Chileans attach to experiences of social upheaval. Stern's analytical oversight is also detected by political scientist and sociologist Patricio Navia (2008), who notes that by focusing on people for whom memory is very important as a means of understanding the importance of memory, Stern commits "selection by independent variable" (2008: 256).[21] I would add that, by focusing largely on statements by these individuals, Stern constrains the potential for analysis into military repression's long-term impacts on social relationships to that which is consciously and deliberately spoken in the context of a historiographical investigation.

Furthermore, in less urban or cosmopolitan communes like Mariquina and Panguipulli, it seems presumptuous to fold local memories into a national 'memory box,' as this implies that a committed sense of belonging to the national community widely preceded the dictatorship. This overlooks the possibility that a sense of national belonging has been a key product of fascism in the South. For a time, this was certainly the case in parts the Liquiñe valley, where members of several Mapuche families told me that they had long celebrated Pinochet for ridding their hillsides of guerrillas and for having given them deeds to their lands. These were seen by the farmers as gestures of inclusion after decades of

isolation. Only when agents for the hydroelectric company began circulating in 2006, did these farmers learn that area rivers and subsoil mineral rights had been removed from their dominion as part of the 1978 and 1979 laws that divided indigenous lands (described in Chapter 6). To some extent these perspectives correspond to Stern's four "fundamental frameworks of memory and meaning that linked the personal and the collective, and shaped politicocultural alliance and division" (Stern 2006: 382) throughout the first half of the dictatorship. He argues that those lingered well into the 1980s and 1990s, in the form of the following broad categories:

> Memory as salvation from ruin and slaughter by leftists, memory as the "open wound" of cruel and unending rupture inflicted by the state, memory as experience and witness of persecution and awakening, [and] memory as mindful closure of the dangerous and dirty box of the past.

While historically significant, these and subsequent frameworks that the author argues developed later in the dictatorship, around memory as a form of truth and as a weapon against forgetting, seem too rigid and even arbitrary categorizations for ethnographic data. This is especially true when we recognize that, not unlike perspectives among youth described in the previous chapter, memory does not merely shape politics, but is also shaped by politics.

This leads us to another problem with the memory box metaphor, which is an under-theorization of the action itself of remembering. Emphasis on the spoken word risks reifying memory, treating 'memories' as thing-like, as if they are not also conditioned habits and in many ways akin to culture. One result of such an approach is to leave what many people

unconsciously keep silent about the contested past largely unexplored, and therefore to overlook what youth might acquire through regular and conditioned exposure. While Stern focuses on antagonistic historical perspectives, his treatment of memory is deceptively simple for the goal of accessing the "'hearts and minds' aspect of the dictatorship experience" (Stern 2004: xx). Since he suggests that memory plays an important role in shaping social movements and political activism, by "hearts and minds" Stern presumably means the lived dimensions of history and its attendant impacts on local forms of sociability. In principle, I agree with his argument that oral history is a method for complicating deceptively clear historical narratives. Nevertheless, for someone aiming to access the subjective dimensions of state violence and the limited realization of democracy since the political transition, he slips from the precepts of oral history (a past-oriented endeavour) into the realm of memory (about the on-going presencing of past experiences).

The kind of memory described in the previous chapter, that is transmitted to youth primarily in family and small community networks through spooky stories, idiomatic expressions, and bodily knowledge about life in the South, contrasts with social scientific studies of memory that are used for applied ends. I am referring here to the use by modern experts of this very fluid and enigmatic human process of identity-formation, for juridical, psychiatric, and pedagogical interventions. Testimonies for court hearings, the therapeutic talking through of traumas, and the transformation of the past into curricular plans, involve valuable but nevertheless incomplete understandings of how memory shapes social life, and vice versa. These modern applications of memory return us to historian Pierre Nora's comment, mentioned in Chapter 4, that a lack of spontaneity and collective spirit observed

in contemporary memory practices indicates its conquest and eradication by modern historiography (1989: 9). However, as anthropologists of storytelling like Julie Cruikshank (2005) and Jake Kosek (2006) remind us, modernity's conquest of local knowledge is never total, a fact evident in intersecting narratives about landscapes inhabited and claimed by diverse groups (See also Bender 2002). Meanwhile, as literary scholars like Norman Saadi Nikro observe (2001: 8), the informal circulation of stories about places inhabited by their narrators signals the persistence of genuine environments for memory transmission, *milieux de mémoire*, generated among communal, cultural, and even popular networks.

Finally, ethnoecologist Virginia Nazarea's descriptions of local knowledge about inhabited landscapes in Ecuador and elsewhere reveal that memory is embedded in cultural practices surrounding activities like food preparation. In this fashion, she illustrates forms of remembering that are much more subtle than those depicted by Stern. Describing sacred groves and steaming kitchens as 'interior landscapes' that are close to the heart, she argues that in such "secret recesses close to the heart, strength and hope emanate from invisible depths of connection to the past" (2006: 327). These are familiar landscapes in which "[s]ensuous recollection in marginal niches and sovereign spaces that people carve out of uniformity and predictability constantly replenishes what modernity drains" (Ibid, 320). From these words, we might infer that the transmission of perspectives of seemingly little political relevance may very well be a discrete act of resistance, whereby local knowledge in places at the periphery of national publics teach youth how to live in and adapt to rapidly changing worlds.

The Body that Knows

Throughout the course of my interactions with families in Mariquina and Panguipulli, time and again I found disinterest on the part of older and younger generations alike, in addressing topics of an overtly political nature. Nevertheless, I heard rich stories about political awakening among younger generations, indicating that emergent awareness about belonging to a society of governable subjects is a significant lesson learned in family homes. Damian realized the toll that the military regime had taken on his family while watching a concert on television one summer evening in February 1992. His parents had never spoken one way or another about Pinochet's departure from the government two years earlier. The concert was by the neo-folkloric Andean musical group Illapu, whose 1992 appearance at the Viña del Mar International Song Festival involved the performance of the song *Vuelvo*, a composition about returning to live in one's country and to be whole once again.[22] Not unlike numerous other neo-folkloric groups, the band had been exiled for much of the 1980s for its commitment to social justice. As the performance was broadcast live on television, Damian watched with his family, noticing tears flowing from his parents' eyes. As I would ask Damian about his views on society and hopes for the future, he often resorted to explanations inspired by neo-folkloric songs, with lyrics, rhythms, and even dialects inspired by life in the countryside.

Meanwhile, Chascón came to have a more critical outlook on governance, in spite of his mother's right-wing political commitments. He explained to me that she keenly followed the evening news in order to track the economy's strength. She interpreted news of Chile's economic resilience as a sign of security for her small convenience store in the front

of her house located on a humble street in San José de la Mariquina. Meanwhile, Chascón watched the history channel on her cable subscription, acquiring a more critical sense of the causes and consequences of well-being through documentaries about the Second World War in Europe and stories about life in North America and other supposedly developed countries. Like other young adults with whom I spoke, his experiences confirm that the family home is an important milieu for memory transmission, even though youth seldom reproduce wholesale the perspectives intended for them by members of older generations. While Elizabeth Jelin (2003) and Norbert Lechner (2002) describe memory as cultural labour, this is not always obvious for people whose absence of personal experiences of state repression render memory akin to culture. Therefore, the home is an important domain in which to observe processes by which the contested past is discovered by members of younger generations to unsettle the present, compelling youth to work through repression's impacts on their tastes and habits surrounding civic involvement. It is also among the few domains where we may recognize that memory struggles persist even in the absence of spoken narrative.

Such observations benefit from memory scholarship on the aging of Holocaust survivors. For example, Primo Levi, who survived the German *Lager*,[23] spent an entire generation writing about and speaking against his experiences in Nazi concentration camps.[24] In an interview he was once asked how, having survived the deportation of Italian Jews, one teaches their own children about such experiences differently than those having never experienced such an ordeal. To this, Levi commented that neither of his children ever wanted to address the subject with him: "pendant quinze ans, tous les deux, à neuf ans de

distance, ont fait une réaction de rejet. Mais je crois qu'ils ont refusé de m'entendre parce qu'ils avaient déjà tout perçu" (Levi 1995: 41).[25] In his view, their home was full of the *Lager*, with books, pictures, and conversations overheard, all contributing to his children in some part receiving the narratives he spent his career transmitting professionally. While his daughter became a dedicated anti-fascist, Levi expressed doubts as to whether her political engagement came from him. Not recalling ever having given his children what he called 'the lesson of democracy,' he suggested that they more likely absorbed their views from their generation's largely anti-fascist environment. Recent observations from Chile seem to parallel Levi's opinion, that the overlap between public and private domains is not straightforward.

We are left with an apparently incomplete portrait of the role played by family in the inter-generational transmission of political subjectivity. On one hand, perspectives in the home contend with state and private sector efforts to re-educate the poor into occupying a passive position within the nation. On the other hand, life in the home is by no means autonomous from elite projects. As the families in this study are neither heroes of a valiant resistance to capitalist expansion, nor victims of their low social status, it seems necessary that social analysis best serves the politically withdrawn by moving beyond statements alone by such people about memory and political sentiment. Sociologist of memory Paul Connerton argues that there is an inertia to social structures that intrudes into even the most intimate of spaces (1989: 5). For him, this inertia is inadequately theorized in the social sciences, stifling analysis into how, via "the cultivation of habit, it is *our body which*

337

'understands'" (Ibid, 95) what the mind might not. In a similar vein, sociologist Avery Gordon argues that power can (Gordon 1997: 3):

> reach you by the baton of the police, it can speak the language of your thoughts and desires…It is dense and superficial, it can cause bodily injury, and it can harm you without seeming ever to touch you…We can and must call it by recognizable names, but so too we need to remember that power arrives in forms that can range from blatant white supremacy and state terror to "furniture without memories."

Gordon borrows this last phrase from the novelist Toni Morrison to evoke that, not unlike when we sit on and feel the untold memories of a 'sad and sunken couch,' we can appreciate the weight of the past through the impressions that it leaves on social worlds. Impressions are buried in conditioned reactions to bodily senses, be it a feeling of comfort at the smell of home-cooked bread, or terror at an unexpected nighttime knock on the door. They appear in stories inspired by the senses, about what life was once like in a given place, how it has changed or why it seems to have stayed the same. These stories may indeed name the past according to what Gordon calls conceptual signposts for moving within the 'monumental social architecture' of our world (1997: 4). For instance, they may identify the militarization of the Araucanía as a colonial project, the Timber Complex as Marxist, or the Pinochet regime as fascist. Experiences of colonialism, revolutionary socialism, fascism, and neoliberalism for that matter, shape life possibilities whether or not the social structures that these produce are recognized by these names. However, while these words help us to understand the shape of power relations that are embedded in human history, they do not usually convey the density or inner workings of these relations. Unlike the assertions of

truth that preoccupy dominant historical texts, storied knowledge inspired by the senses centres on varied and on-going experiences of place and community, both perpetually under interpretation. Perhaps most pertinent is that by relegating conceptual signposts to the periphery, stories about lived experiences in specific localities displace the centrality of the national community as it appears in macro-historical accounts. To borrow the title phrase of historian Prasenjit Duara's work on national narratives in China (1995), local stories 'rescue history from the nation.'[26]

Writing on the heels of the Second World War, novelist J.R.R. Tolkien defended the importance of fairy-stories, which are not unlike many spooky stories that families shared with me and with one another throughout my time in southern Chile. I routinely heard stories of devil babies, ghostly bodies hanging in trees, untimely disappearances, and family curses that might easily escape critical analysis into Chile's neoliberal order. However, I echo Michael Taussig's (1980 & 1987) suggestion that such stories indicate local idioms for talking about marginalization, civilization, progress, and domination. These stories indicate new horizons for understanding processes of remembering, as they highlight sites of convergence between the social sciences and literary analysis. This is evoked in the notion of *suralidad*, mentioned in Chapter 3, which is cast as a poetic anthropology of southern Chile (Arellano & Riedemann 2008). Insisting that stories about fairies are not provocative allegories that symbolize an underlying, rational modernity, Tolkien argues that they convey enchanted experiences that are never entirely or perfectly known to us. In his view, the surreal uncovers occulted aspects about us—perhaps buried by modernity—that prevent humans from seeing our own reflection with fresh attention. Such stories offer moral

lessons for surviving a world in which all things, nature and human energy included, may be purchased (1965[1964]: 52):

> [T]riteness is the penalty of 'appropriation': the things that are trite, or (in a bad sense) familiar, are the things that we have appropriated, legally or mentally. We say we know them. They have become like the things which once attracted us by their glitter, or their colour, or their shape, and we laid hands on them, and then locked them in our hoard, acquired them, and acquiring ceased to look at them.

In a sense, once appropriated for modern ends, memory itself risks becoming a vehicle of forgetting. Once we feel we know it, legally and mentally, memory may lead us to forget that once upon a time we were neither subjects of nation-states, nor soldiers in reserve armies of labour. The effect of modernist memory projects, to know the past so as to change the future, is then a mixed blessing. Not unlike the souls who drink from the River Lethe so that they may live again, oblivion takes from them the tools by which future generations may learn from past errors.

Conclusion: Dismemory

Through the analysis of poetry and memoirs produced following Lebanon's civil war (1975-1990), literary scholar Norman Saadi Nikro (2011) has argued that the current inter-disciplinary field of memory studies presumes that the recovery of past events serves as a potentially stabilizing experience. He observes this in the tendency of memory scholars to focus primarily on processes of collective memory (i.e. commemorations, monuments),

and on narrating the past for working through traumatic experiences. He argues that this 'presentist approach' does not adequately portray an important aspect of memory in post-war Lebanon, which is its fragmenting force. Drawing on the novelist Toni Morrison, he calls institutionalized forms of forgetting *dismemory*, and argues that while its production is experienced as intensely personal, it structures "a formal politics of deliberate, convenient forgetfulness" (Ibid, 4).

However, the degree to which practiced amnesia is negative is by no means as clear as certain modernist memory projects would have us believe. Saadi Nikro suggests that truth commissions involve an 'art of government' in the Foucauldian sense of governmentality, as targeted populations are subject to the judgments embedded in technical reports. He also notes René Girard's work on violence and the sacred (1979), to observe that curative procedures "are designed not merely to identify perpetrators, but to placate victims" (Ibid). The evidence of dismemory expressed by Don Javier and Sra. Ilda, and against which everyone at *machi* Sara's *toma* struggled, suggests a fundamental ambivalence to memory. Anthropologist of memory Joël Candau summarizes this ambivalence when he observes that the only thing that members of a group or a society ever truly share is what they have forgotten of their common pasts, "la société se trouve donc rassemblée moins par ses souvenirs que par ses oublis" (1996: 64).

Notes: Chapter 7

[1] My translation: *"General Pinochet, this triumph is for you! Long live Chile and Pinochet!"*

[2] With the political coming-of-age of those born at the time of the democratic transition, newly eligible voters were unlikely to volunteer for a registry that would render participation obligatory and penalize with heavy fines those who in subsequent elections may want to abstain. Beginning in the municipal elections held nationally on October 28, 2012, reforms to the electoral registry will remove this obligation.

[3] In recent years, efforts to commemorate that history have become more organized among a group of residents affiliated with Neltume's Memory Museum, with processions heading to the site of former guerrilla camps in the month of February. However, the memory remains delicate. One organizer of that procession, who did not herself live in Neltume until the 1990s, told me that when one exile had returned to participate in a commemoration, a bullet was shot through the front window of the host's home. Meanwhile, she told me that owner of the Huilo Huilo tourism initiative Víctor Petermann, who also owns the estate on which a commemorative plaque was installed by the local group, was considering building a cabin nearby so that tourists could encounter Neltume's MIR heritage.

[4] Translated as the *Battle of Chile*, the three parts of the film are subtitled in English *The Insurrection of the Bourgeoisie* (1975), *The Coup d'état* (1976), and *Popular Power* (1979). A translated version of the film was released in 1998 in English, called *Chile, Obstinate Memory*.

[5] For a critical discussion of the reception of these documentaries in Chile following the democratic transition, see Klubock 2003.

[6] Another critical film to which he was exposed while studying in the city was *Calle Santa Fe* (Castillo 2007), which narrates the politics and eventual disappearance of Miguel Enríquez, who in 1965 played an important role in the foundation of Chile's Leftist Revolutionary Movement (MIR).

342

[7] Responding to the Rettig Commission's report on Truth and Reconciliation, Pinochet argued that a civil war was being mounted during the Popular Unity by "un ejército paralelo y clandestino con colaboración cubana" (Rojas et al. 1991: 176). He justified military campaigns in the province of Valdivia following the coup by posing that the Allende administration had armed thousands of extremists in hidden guerrilla networks. However, in the heart of the pre-cordillera at the time of the coup, no Cuban was found. In fact, among five foreigners in Neltume in September 1973, there were three Swedes among a volunteer group (two technical consultants and a road engineer), a Belgian-Chilean doctor who now lives in the city of Panguipulli, and an Ecuadorian who is said to have disappeared (Ibid, 46).

[8] Less than a half dozen men survived to tell their story, some of whose reflections on their guerrilla experiences are published as a *testimonio* (Comité Memoria Neltume 2003). While I knew one of these men, he did not form part of this study, as I have chosen to focus on people who have been more withdrawn from civic life.

[9] The Neltume guerrilla detachment was one of several planned by exiles to infiltrate Chile via Argentina along the length of the cordillera. Most units deployed as part of *Operación Retorno* (or Operation Return) did not manage to establish camps. Neltume's was distinctive for having evaded detection and capture for so long, possibly thanks to the clandestine support of locals, suggesting that military suspicion of local families was not entirely unfounded.

[10] It took more than a month to locate all those who went missing at the base of the Antuco Volcano in the southern Biobío Region, as some were buried under as much as four metres of snow.

[11] I neglected to mention how unprofitable theses usually are.

[12] Recall that many Latin American truth and reconciliation commissions have taken this phrase, *nunca más*, as their titles. These include reports produced in Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Uruguay, and Guatemala.

[13] Endesa's acquisition of water exploitation rights in Panguipulli's pre-cordillera (as in other parts of the country), is suspicious not merely because the company now owns 80% of the country's water rights. Many of these rights were acquired in the last 90 days of the

Pinochet regime, and the 1997 sale of the newly privatized company to a Spanish multi-national dramatically exposed institutional corruption following the democratic transition (Pfeffer Urquiaga 2008).

[14] Anthropologist Jane Guyer (2007) observes a cultural decline in the 'near future' in popular conceptions of time since the post-war period. She notes parallels between the public rhetorics of macroeconomics and the rise of evangelism since the 1970s, and specifically its views of prophetic time.

[15] On August 4, 2011, Tatiana Acuña posted on Twitter: "*Se mata a la perra y se acaba la leva*".

[16] My translation: "That a bureaucrat of this regime should extract from the old, two-faced morality of the hacienda, this authoritarian principle that belongs to the logic of domination of the old, traditional Chile in order to refer to Camila Vallejos [sic], constitutes an embarassing showcase of the crouching authoritarian culture that is today emerging with force from beneath the ruling right".

[17] Generally speaking, this is an inter-disciplinary category that includes non-academic works that either have memory or remembering in their title, or in some manner focus on the question of memory as contested knowledge about the past.

[18] Noteworthy human rights initiatives are the digital archives maintained by *Memoria Viva* (http://www.memoriaviva.com/); archival records and studies by the Archbishop of Santiago's *Fundación Documentaión y Archivo de la Vicaría de la Solidaridad*, (http://www.vicariadelasolidaridad.cl/); the *Centro de Estudios Miguel Enríquez*, dedicated to the historical documentation of social and political struggle in Latin America, (http://www.archivochile.com/); the *Observatorio Ciudadano* (http://www.observatorio.cl/), which documents, researches and offers legal advice regarding human rights to southern communities; and the *Corporación de Promoción y Defensa de los Derechos del Pueblo—CODEPU* (http://www.codepu.cl/), which in addition to elaborating documentation, assists victims of human rights abuse and their relatives.

[19] These focus on oral testimonies in the years just prior to Pinochet's London 1998 arrest (Stern 2004), struggles to define collective memory of the regime between 1973-1988

(Stern 2006), and efforts by diverse elements of the national public to come to terms with the regime following the transition, from 1989-2006 (Stern 2010).

[20] Between 1976 and 1992, this branch of the Catholic Church helped families of victims during the military regime. It now boasts one of the most complete archives on human rights abuses during that period.

[21] Navia observes that "the 1973 coup was a dramatic and violent way to topple a government, but despite widespread human rights violations after the coup, it is probably safe to say that a majority of Chileans were much less traumatized by the unfolding of events than were the people interviewed by Stern" (2008: 256).

[22] Hosted annually in a prodominantly upper middle-class coastal enclave near Valparaíso, the festival is one of the most important musical events in Latin America.

[23] This is the German word that Levi uses to refer to the concentration camps.

[24] He was held at Monowitz, one among a number of Nazi concentration camps collectively known as Auschwitz.

[25] My translation: "During fifteen years, both of them separated by nine years in age, reacted with rejection. But, I believe that they refused to listen to me because they already perceived everything."

[26] Echoing a phrase coined by the historian Prasenjit Duara (1995), anthropologist and historian of Chile's Tarapacá Region Lessie Jo Frazier suggests that comparative historiography and memory studies may help 'rescue history from the nation' by "making explicit the ways in which the nation-state is constructed from the stories told about it" (Frazier 2007: 4).

Conclusion

[E]n Chile se transitó a esa modernidad (no a la modernidad, en general) por medio del terror… Hoy en día la importancia de la familia por la sociedad chilena, es consecuencia de que es la única institución que ha quedado en pie entre el mercado y el Estado.	Chile transitioned to this modernity (not to modernity, in general) by way of terror… Today the importance of the family for Chilean society is a consequence of it being the only institution between the market and the State that is left standing.

<div align="right">

-José Bengoa, *La Comunidad Reclamada* (2006: 157-159)

</div>

When Bengoa (2006) describes the hidden restoration of a segmented society as an important function of the Pinochet regime, he interrogates the quality of a democracy modeled on privileged and ostensibly feudal notions of political authority. As we have seen, this restorative project is in part sustained through state structures. However, in a global era, the quality of any democracy is not only a matter of national concern. In this concluding chapter, I move beyond what the inter-generational transmission of social memory conveys about political horizons in rural southern Chile today, extending attention internationally. I also explore the implications that this study may have for political ethnography among oppressed groups and for memory research in post-repression contexts.

I began this thesis by asking what processes led to a diminished motivation among Chile's youngest political generation to fulfill a hard-fought citizen right, to vote, that so effectively mobilized preceding generations little more than twenty years ago. As my early discussions about fieldwork (Chapter 1) and my efforts to elaborate a critical methodology

for assessing inter-generational memory transmissions (Chapter 2) reveal, there are many ways that I might have gone about answering that question. However, inspired by communities in rural southern Chile impacted by industrial interventions in nearby rivers (Chapter 3), a major premise of this thesis has been to recognize that seeming withdrawal from civic concerns does not necessarily equate to political apathy or indifference to the future well-being of one's community. This invites reflection on how people in rural southern communities experience the contested past (Chapter 4), and what local modes for remembering might convey about broader political efforts to shape what is widely accepted to be true about state repression and the current social and economic order (Chapter 5).

While schools and popular media play a significant role in what younger generations ultimately learn about the contested past, the ethnographic analysis of schooling offered here reminds us that state structures are rarely as unified and coherent as authorities would like to believe. Similarly, opposition movements involve complex relationships between citizens whose social positions are by no means determined by class and ethno-cultural background alone (Chapter 6), reminding us that the inter-generational transmission of memory is shaped as much by past events as by access to transportation and communication technologies in the present. Finally, we may recognize among those who avoid influencing the state or engaging in opposition movements in any meaningful way, that far from ignorance to political affairs, a degree of diplomacy is needed to rebuild a society divided by radically incommensurable political agendas (Chapter 7).

A Foreign Affair

Unwittingly, many Canadians have become key stakeholders in debates raised by Chile's student protesters, specifically in the proposal that free post-secondary education be financed by re-nationalizing natural resources. The Chilean government's acquiescence to demands could bear substantial threats to international investments. Political scientists Alex Latta and Kari Williams (2012) point out that while few Canadian companies pursue hydroelectric production in Chile, there are significant Canadian interests wrapped up in that industry. The authors note that companies like Barrick Gold, Goldcorp, and Kinross play a major role in Chile's gold mining sector, making Canada that country's largest foreign investor in mineral extraction. Public sector investors like the Ontario Teachers' Pension Plan and the British Columbia Investment Management Corporation hold hundreds of millions of dollars' worth of shares in these companies, thus helping drive the demand for greater energy production.

Latta and Williams identify Canadian interests in hundreds of more firms, noting that by 2009 loans from Export Development Canada[1] totalling more than a billion dollars went to Canadian operations concentrated in Chile's mining sector (Latta and Williams 2012: 23). These coincide with frenzied efforts by the Chilean government and policy-makers in recent years to drum up public support for the installation of numerous geo-thermal electricity facilities and hydroelectric dams in southern rivers. The electricity slated for production in the far South is not primarily intended for local or regional consumption, as the plan is to transmit a high tension current more than 2,000 kilometres north before injection into the central grid near Santiago (Ibid, 7). Furthermore, Latta and Williams

observe that Canadian mining interests do not merely drive the demand for greater energy supply in Chile. The only company operating in the country that is capable of linking future Patagonian dams with the central system is owned by a Canadian consortium with partnerships from several public sector investors.

From a global perspective, it would appear that a new penetration into Chile's southern frontier is well underway, driven by those posed to benefit commercially from an enhanced private property regime. In recent decades, rights to exploit freshwater flows and sub-surface soils have expanded the tenure of resources destined for commercial production. Once again, this conquest of the *Wallmapu* is reinforced by non-state actors recruited to industrialize the landscape. In a sense, this scenario permits corporate agents today to wash their hands of responsibility for the displacement of resident populations, not unlike when Swiss and German immigrants were recruited to homestead over a century ago. Cloaked in the formal language of social development, economic growth, and democratization, international free trade does not change this reality. Shareholders in Canadian companies operating in Chile have a vested interest that natural resources remain privatized, and that outward signs of consensus over a fundamentally contentious political and economic order endure. Neoliberalism's attendant ideology that 'free markets make free people' is a lucrative cultural model that facilitates modernity's ever more effective conquest of distant frontiers. Through mechanisms like private sector donations to isolated communities set to be impacted by industrial incursions, affected residents face a re-education intended for them by speculative commercial interests in distant metropoles. As

long as the rural poor accept that their political and citizen involvement is symbolic, they may be the legitimate beneficiaries of social improvement, but even this is not guaranteed.

World Anthropologies Disunited

As I discovered during research for this thesis, Mapuche political horizons convey social tensions in post-dictatorship Chile that are often more difficult to perceive in non-Mapuche circles, but that are nonetheless present. One problem with such a discovery is that it does little to underscore the particularity of Mapuche struggles against institutional racism or the loss of the Mapudungun language, concerns important to Mapuche participants in this study. While I will save engagement with these dilemmas for other projects, these limitations offer lessons for how social researchers might learn from the errors of our predecessors.

In just over a decade, Linda Tuhiwai Smith's book *Decolonizing Methodologies* (1999) has become an essential text for scholars working among indigenous peoples. Written for aboriginal researchers working within aboriginal contexts, Smith observes that "research is not an innocent or distant academic exercise but an activity that has something at stake and that occurs in a set of political and social conditions" (Smith 1999: 5). While not dismissive of non-indigenous researchers working among indigenous communities, she critiques academia's problematic negation of non-Western ways of knowing, as a means of Western knowledge having the final say on truth. Hundreds of years of data collection by journalists, amateur travel writers, and scientists mean that the legacy of anthropologists in today's indigenous reality has long been that of "inquisitive and acquisitive strangers" (Ibid,

3). In light of this legacy, critical inquiry is not simply about answering questions regarding who owns research, whose interests it serves, and where results are ultimately disseminated. It also involves a serious interrogation of why scientific research on certain peoples matters at all. In this section, I argue that while Smith's critique has played an important role in transforming research by and for indigenous peoples, it also offers tools for elaborating ethnography in inter-cultural milieus and in post-repression contexts more generally.

In her doctoral dissertation *Comment rester Mapuche au Chili?*, defended at the Université de Neuchâtel, anthropologist Anne Lavanchy points out that fieldwork in southern Chile, especially among Mapuche communities, is often limited to short visits on the part of researchers based in cities (Lavanchy 2007: 63). She wonders about the implications that reduced involvement on the part of ethnographers in the day-to-day activities and rhythms of rural life may have on the ethnographic method. Limited funding opportunities and the relatively high personal cost of post-secondary education are evident factors that restrict anthropological endeavours in Chile. In my own observations, when hydroelectric companies hire undergraduate students to compile social impact assessments, research methods are limited to short visits to affected communities. Technical reports are then based on interviews with whichever local residents the students manage to engage in conversation, and the studies lack even the most minimal standards for establishing informed consent. Without participant observation, this approach invariably takes the spoken word at face value, and misrecognizes the silences and contradictions expressed by residents who are often distrusting of these 'inquisitive and acquisitive strangers.' Lavanchy's discussion of her own relationships with Chilean scholars implicitly addresses

issues that relate to a recent critique within the discipline of anthropology. This critique involves concerns raised by proponents of the World Anthropologies Network, such as Gustavo Lins Ribeiro (2006), who advocate diversity of ideas within the discipline and the equal exchange of knowledge between colleagues globally.

Early during my time in the field, I wrote an email to urban acquaintances who had introduced me to leaders in opposition to industrial interventions in the Panguipulli interior. My email indicated that I was in contact with both indigenous Mapuche and settler communities, a core feature of my doctoral project's design. Without my consent, modified excerpts from the email were soon in hands of local politicians, and rumours circulated that I had F.A.R.C. affiliations (as in the Revolutionary Armed Forces of Colombia).[2] The email's distribution traced back to an undergraduate anthropology student conducting weekend interviews with one of several Mapuche leaders in the area. It would seem that cross-cultural collaborations disturbed the political sensibilities of that leader, who considered it her responsibility to control the meddling of anthropologists in local affairs. While the episode originally felt like a fieldwork disaster, it presented unexpected opportunities when locals who were previously distrusting of me, sought alliances out of our common persecution by the same person. The intentions of the student who circulated my email remain unknown to me, as I chose not to confront her directly; further communication could have exposed the people with whom I was already collaborating to unknown networks of influence. These alliances appeared suddenly where I had not before perceived them, colluding to restrict access by outside observers to people affected by industrial developments in the area. However, a number of indications as to the motivations

353

issues that relate to a recent critique within the discipline of anthropology. This critique involves concerns raised by proponents of the World Anthropologies Network, such as Gustavo Lins Ribeiro (2006), who advocate diversity of ideas within the discipline and the equal exchange of knowledge between colleagues globally.

Early during my time in the field, I wrote an email to urban acquaintances who had introduced me to leaders in opposition to industrial interventions in the Panguipulli interior. My email indicated that I was in contact with both indigenous Mapuche and settler communities, a core feature of my doctoral project's design. Without my consent, modified excerpts from the email were soon in hands of local politicians, and rumours circulated that I had F.A.R.C. affiliations (as in the Revolutionary Armed Forces of Colombia).[2] The email's distribution traced back to an undergraduate anthropology student conducting weekend interviews with one of several Mapuche leaders in the area. It would seem that cross-cultural collaborations disturbed the political sensibilities of that leader, who considered it her responsibility to control the meddling of anthropologists in local affairs. While the episode originally felt like a fieldwork disaster, it presented unexpected opportunities when locals who were previously distrusting of me, sought alliances out of our common persecution by the same person. The intentions of the student who circulated my email remain unknown to me, as I chose not to confront her directly; further communication could have exposed the people with whom I was already collaborating to unknown networks of influence. These alliances appeared suddenly where I had not before perceived them, colluding to restrict access by outside observers to people affected by industrial developments in the area. However, a number of indications as to the motivations

353

behind that student's actions suggest dynamics raised by proponents of the World Anthropologies Network (WAN).

I was not the first person accused by the Mapuche leader behind my email fiasco, of disrespecting what she called ancestral authorities. In the Panguipulli interior, such authorities involved a group of five elderly Mapuche men from several communities spread twenty kilometres apart in sectors largely inaccessible by road and telecommunication technologies. I would later be told that ever since this leader's uncle, who was among these men, had requested she speak on their behalf in public meetings relating to SN Power's activities in the area, she considered herself to be the appointed representative of Mapuche residents to all outsiders interacting with communities in the interior. Her appointment as a spokesperson had initially been a strategy for avoiding the company's misappropriation of the voices of traditional leadership in the valley, as none of the elders spoke Spanish as his first language. Recently returned from living ten years in the national capital, this leader also had greater know-how than her elders to keep abreast of communications with allied NGOs and other affected residents. I certainly had no desire to undermine ancestral authorities.

Facing my apparent demise by email, I nearly withdrew from researching public life altogether, hoping to avoid further controversy by focusing solely on dynamics among families affected by the industrial interventions. Nevertheless, I continued to receive emails and phone calls from those who I had inadvertently exposed, as they inquired about when I would interview members of their communities. Some of these argued to me that they too were in contact with Mapuche elders, and that I was a welcome presence. In the words of

another Mapuche leader, if I did not stick out the scandal, my critic would have chased away everyone who attempted to understand their point of view. This was in reference to an allied NGO that had recently been pressured to reduce its involvement due to similar distrust propagated by the same individual.

Anthropologist Gustavo Lins Ribeiro (2006) calls the uneven knowledge about one another between anthropologists from centres and peripheries of knowledge production 'asymmetrical ignorance.' His observations are relevant to the student who circulated my email, because her actions were framed by a perspective she had previously expressed to me, as well as to a Dutch researcher also working with communities affected by SN Power's projects. I am referring to the student's belief that foreign anthropologists steal the work of local colleagues. Upon first encountering this perspective, I wondered how anyone else's field notes could be as useful as my own. I would later discover that the perspective was not uncommon among scholars from diverse professional backgrounds, who argue that foreigners publish as their own—often in more prestigious international journals—the ideas of domestic scholars who publish primarily in Spanish. Given that the student was conducting her first field investigation, and in light of the wide currency of this idea, I surmise that she did not acquire it through experience, but that it was taught to her in the classroom, or at least in university corridors. The scenario confronted me with a dilemma that had little to do with me personally and yet everything to do with my presence as a foreign researcher. The constrained climate of anthropological knowledge in the region means that most Chileans who pursue graduate education in this field must do so abroad, often in Mexico City, in Madrid, elsewhere in Europe, or in the United States. Himself

355

Brazilian, Ribeiro earned his Ph.D. at the City University of New York. The World Anthropologies critique manifests what he calls provincial cosmopolitanism, which is the knowledge that anthropologists from non-hegemonic centres display of the discipline's presumed centres in the United States and Europe, knowledge that he argues is seldom reciprocated.

In the hands of an undergraduate student doing her first fieldwork, this critique seemed to pit national and international anthropologists on opposing poles. It proposes that community 'insiders' and 'outsiders' coincided with national identities, as if these determine the social responsibilities and political commitments of researchers. It mattered little what my personal attachments to Chile were, that thousands of Chileans exiled to Canada in the 1970s feel that they live at the margins of their home society and my own, or that Canadian companies are key stakeholders in extracting resources at unprecedented rates from remote regions throughout South America. Nor did it matter that my home province of Alberta began to privatize surface water flows in 2006, referring to Chile as a model for the corporate management of this resource (See Schmidt 2011). Water protection under treaty agreements with First Nations in Canada would suggest that the provincial government's decision to allow its partition and sale is unconstitutional. Recognizing the illusory success of the Chilean model for water management has implications well beyond that country's borders, especially as jurisdictions around the world deliberate introducing water markets. Not being Latin American put me on the wrong side of a clumsy, albeit very real divide, in which the measure of a good anthropologist was one's national proximity to those studied. This is not what I understand the World Anthropologies Network to advocate.

The World Anthropology critique has guided my own efforts to recognize the work of Chilean colleagues as a means of seriously engaging with the proposition that a "discipline that praises plurality and diversity needs to foster these standpoints within its own milieu" (Ribeiro 2006: 380). Nevertheless, in retrospect it leaves more questions than answers. Should I have affiliated more with colleagues based in Santiago, Temuco, and Valdivia, even though these were a good distance from my field sites? Did I undermine ancestral authorities by not withdrawing from the Liquiñe valley? By writing this thesis in English, have I denied the ability of potential Chilean critics to voice concerns? One answer to these questions is that this thesis is hardly a final product, but rather the fruit of on-going collaborations and commitments.

Peripheral Vision Revisited

A development in early September 2012 reinforced the dilemma of uneven flows of information within global networks of knowledge production about Mapuche society. It occurred when Armando Marileo, a professor of Mapuche philosophy at the Universidad Católica de Temuco, circulated a letter critiquing British anthropologist Magnus Course for his 2011 book *Becoming Mapuche: Person and Ritual in Indigenous Chile*. Marileo had recently read a Spanish translation of the book, which led him to accuse Course of extracting sacred knowledge from ceremonies without the permission of spiritual or community leaders, as well as of manipulating information and presenting as informants "people who are really authors of this knowledge" (See Appendix H: Marileo-Calbucura Critique of Magnus Course and the Anthropologist's Response). The critique drew on

357

Marileo's claim to being the *ngenpin* (a spiritual authority) who presides over some forty-five communities in the coastal sector of the Araucanía. Course has been involved with research with two of those communities for sixteen years, and he lived permanently among these between 2000 and 2003. It was troubling to Marileo that Course had not contacted the urban-based Mapuche leader in person, nor cited any of his publications on Mapuche cosmology or ceremony for the book. In an email response, Course disputed Marileo's claims to both political and spiritual leadership. He argued that contact with the Mapuche intellectual had been sought, but that community elders had advised against complying with Marileo's insistence that his permission was necessary to carry out research in the communities.

An early premise for Course's inquiry into rural Mapuche personhood began, not unlike my own initial interest in the political withdrawal of rural southerners, with a sense that a gulf existed between rural Mapuche experiences and those of urban Mapuche intellectuals, activists, and researchers (Course 2011: 7). However, this premise for carrying out research on rural society has been understood by some to be a claim that Mapuche communities in the countryside are apolitical. Mapuche sociologist Jorge Calbucura leant his support to Armando Marileo's critique (See Appendix H), denouncing Course for suggesting that people in the two communities host to the anthropologist's fieldwork do not participate in the broader Mapuche movement. The sociologist noted that the head of one of these recently declared support for neighbouring Mapuche communities in territorial disputes with large landowners and the Chilean state, some of which have escalated into armed confrontations in recent years (See Aylwin 2010; Human Rights Watch and

Observatorio de Derechos de los Pueblos Indígenas 2004). For Calbucura, "muchos investigadores han demostrado que las comunidades rurales mapuches están vinculadas a la política de los originarios y participan en la política nacional chilena" (2012, See Appendix H).[3]

In his response, Course indicated that his book is not itself about politics, which are only mentioned briefly in its conclusion. However, within it he wonders why many in the communities of Piedra Alta and Isla Huapi seemed relatively uninterested in the wider Mapuche movement (See Appendix H). Clarifying that he never meant to insinuate that no one in those sectors participates in wider political movements, he conceded that politics of knowledge were indeed at play. However, in Course's view, Marileo played an imperialist role in this as well, by seeking to monopolize the intellectual engagement of rural communities with researchers. Parallels between Course's work and my own observations of seeming political indifference in the rural South, lead me to wonder whether even the most critical anthropological enterprise is fundamentally at odds with indigenous resurgence in Latin American politics.

In light of serious concerns raised by Marileo and Calbucura, that Course's actions were colonialist and unethical, at least two aspects of contemporary ethnography seem particularly discordant with an indigenous resurgence in political affairs. First, even when researchers make efforts to historically situate analyses, conclusions risk being interpreted as referring to the ethnographic present, as if a study pronounces something permanent about the people represented. Certainly political horizons in southern Chile were to some degree different in the early 2000s, when Magnus Course conducted much of his research.

In the past decade, indigenous movements throughout the continent have opened important avenues for establishing pluri-national states, and for appealing to international legislation that protects the rights of aboriginal peoples. Both Course and Calbucura could very well be correct in divergent observations about rural involvement in primarily urban Mapuche movements. This becomes more complex with Course's insistence on following the advice of his closest research participants to "leave out the bad things and write down only the good things" about Mapuche society (Course 2011: 11). An important premise of his book is that Mapuche sociality is fundamentally contextual, evident in the ways that "Mapuche people speak of themselves as entering freely into social relations as autonomous agents free of a priori relations" (Ibid, 3). My caution following this critique, which raises an important point about a researcher's responsibilities to cite the work of local intellectuals and scholars, has little to do with either Marileo's or Course's positions.

Fascinating assessments of social domination and resistance in rural societies remind us that political behaviour is on-going, contextual, and liable to change. In my own observations, seeming indifference to the civic sphere became only more relevant as, over the course of our collaborations, some participants in this study developed a greater sense of political and citizen involvement, while others still have not. Indeed, residents of San José de la Mariquina may one day unite in opposition to the pulp mill that continues to contaminate the river adjacent to their homes. Should such a development occur, it would not negate observations made here that, for many years now those in town who are openly opposed to the mill have been few and far between. Meanwhile, since my involvement with members of the Neltume Lake Mapuche communities, it would seem that opposition to

360

Endesa's proposed hydroelectric plant has become more organized, and I am told that this is the same for the town of Neltume. To pretend that affected residents were always predominantly opposed to that hydroelectric installation would ignore the very real impact that economic speculation has on communities surviving on precarious means. It would also neglect the fact that politics involves the construction of social ties that permit people to experience and imagine themselves as a society of governable subjects, a process described by Norbert Lechner as 'cultural labour' (2002: 119, mentioned in the Introduction and in Chapter 7). By treating civic culture as a complex social process, rather than as a pre-existing condition of the national body, I have tried to identify how beliefs, values, and practices surrounding the involvement of rural southerners in political affairs are shaped by memories of state repression, as well as by memories of lost forms of solidarity.

This leads to the second aspect of political ethnography that appears to be in tension with emergent forms of indigenous mobilization. In this case, I am referring to the Euro-Western presumption that the liberal subject is the primary unit of political action. How are we to determine whether Marileo's authority over the spiritual experiences of participants in Course's study requires the Mapuche leader's permission? By collaborating with willing individuals or families without the apparent permission of persons who consider themselves to be community leaders or cultural experts, to what extent may political anthropologists undermine ancestral authorities in much the same way as when corporations seek to negotiate with residents affected by their projects? There is no unambiguous answer to these questions, except perhaps that unlike corporations, ethnographers offer limited material compensation for collaborating in our research. This means that participation in our studies

may actually derive from genuine hope that one's marginal point of view could be shared with unknown audiences, and that it could potentially lead to greater understanding of the intimate impacts of colonialism and state repression.

Magnus Course indicates in his book that as he began research, elites within Mapuche society discouraged his attention for people at its periphery. He writes that his own interest in living among rural Mapuche people perplexed one Mapuche scholar based in Temuco, who was mystified that the ethnographer would be interested in learning firsthand from those in the countryside about what Course describes as "Mapuche people's own perspectives on their lives" (2007: 7). This attention for centres and peripheries of power within Mapuche society reminds me of June Nash's argument (described in Chapter 1), that ethnography can be a means of tracing out "the peripheral phenomena of everyday life" (2001: 15) to identify the lived impacts of values and decisions made in distant centres of power. It also highlights a further point about the errant email, which was troubling for yet another reason.

Public Secrecy Revisited

Given that the email revealed collusion between unexpectedly connected people who restricted access by independent observers to those affected by industrial developments in isolated areas, its unexpected circulation meant that I had tripped upon social networks that were meant to be invisible, between seemingly isolated peasants and Panguipulli's political elite. Tacitly known to most residents, they betrayed a complex history of alliances between some Mapuche residents and wealthy estate owners in Panguipulli. Area residents began to

explain to me that certain neighbours were known to them to have alliances that ran counter to proclaimed opposition to colonial incursions. This knowledge models Nancy Scheper-Hughes' definition of a public secret, as "something known by all but unstated because of the extreme fragility of the social situation" (2007: 508). Another public secret that the email exposed was that some Mapuche families in the Panguipulli interior, who had fled genocidal violence in the Argentinian pampas and the military occupation of the Araucanía, arrived there not long before non-indigenous settlers. These are descendants of displaced people of the nineteenth century, complicating contemporary declarations by leaders of some communities today, that their families have occupied the Panguipulli interior since time immemorial. Interestingly, such declarations appeal to dominant expectations that the Mapuche be different enough from mainstream society, and that they be ethnically and culturally pure enough to merit special ancestral rights, protected in international jurisprudence directed at the rights of tribal peoples.

In a climate where risks are posed by revealing truths about the uneven historical development and social construction of indigenous political identities, I have long hesitated to broach secrets of this nature in my work. After all, suggestions that the Mapuche are already acculturated are routinely invoked in dominant discourse, by people like Don Baltasar and Luis Rencoret Orellana (described in Chapter 4), to dismiss the reclamation of usurped territories. Anthropologists who study environmental policy have observed similar accusations in North America and Africa (See Igoe 2004; Kosek 2006), where conservationists validate the removal of indigenous control over natural spaces on grounds that such groups no longer practice traditional relationships to the land. I disagree with this

discourse, which misplaces attention from the actions of colonizers to the perceived deficiencies of the colonized. Bacigalupo's (2007) observations on this matter (discussed in Chapter 1), are relevant once again. For her, public secrets challenge anthropologists to balance the pressure to remain silent, with the risk that those about whom we write will become further misconstrued. That argument has been a touchstone for my own effort to work through these questions.

Marileo's critique resonates in Linda Tuhiwai Smith's reflections that the history of research has seen even the most unwitting scholars serve imperialist interests, to the continued subjugation of colonized peoples. This history has been so angering to many indigenous students that they withdraw from ever doing research (Smith 1999: 16), recognizing that colonialism implies more than the objective occupation of lands. Through the classification and systematization of knowledge about social and cultural alterity, the distant subjects of European empires have long since become 'fields of knowledge,' the objects of research problems and designs. For indigenous peoples today, imperialism exists as much in our minds as it exists in disputes over natural resources, in development agencies, and in statistics that calculate well-being according to poverty and unemployment indices. This is not to suggest that measuring poverty or unemployment are always mistaken endeavours, but that they subscribe to a scientific way of knowing that has systematically fragmented indigenous worlds. Still, Smith observes that in light of their educational background and skills, her aboriginal students often find themselves writing project proposals and evaluations. Therefore, they engage in activities that involve the collection and arrangement of socio-cultural data performed under the titles of "project workers,

community activists or consultants, anything but 'researchers'" (Smith 1999: 17). These students demonstrate that escaping research about indigenous people does not stop the collection and synthesis of knowledge about worlds increasingly subject to modernity's expansive grip. I remind myself of dilemmas faced by these students when I wrestle uncomfortably with what a future of increasingly scarce research funding and growing requirements for public-private partnerships, means for ethnography.

Lost Generations Revisited

While I have focused here on youth in Chile who grapple with fragmented perspectives on the contested past, another set of youth in entirely different circumstances remind me of the importance of ethnography for uncovering relationships between memory of state repression in Latin America, and forms of political subjectivity that emerge from collective trauma. Like youth in Chile, the children of exiled families in Canada and internationally struggle to come to terms with unsettling pasts by working through memories transmitted across generations. For the children of Chilean exiles of the 1970s and 1980s, this has only just begun. A flurry of attention that this recently garnered on Canada's public radio network for a memoir of a revolutionary childhood highlights this process.

In early 2012, during C.B.C. Radio's *Canada Reads* book competition, a Quebec lawyer and television personality criticized two authors of memoirs under consideration for the prize (See Nemat 2012), both of whom were exiles from their home countries. Iranian Marina Nemat (2008) was accused of lying about her political incarceration, and Chilean

Carmen Aguirre (2011) of being a terrorist for her contributions to the underground resistance to the Pinochet regime. Anne-France Goldwater suggested that Aguirre, who eventually won the competition, should never have been permitted to stay in Canada. Aguirre's mother is from Valdivia, and the memoir *Something Fierce* (2011) evokes a youth spent defending Chile's socialist cause, including border experiences in southern regions described in this thesis. The beliefs and values of people in Aguirre's social networks sharply contrast with many of those I have described here, who have been more uncertain than her in criticizing Pinochet's legacy. As I have argued, uncertainty is not merely a product of the fear of retribution, nor is it always meant to defend military interventions in civic life. Often silence results from the lack of a meaningful vocabulary to thread together complex and often contradictory experiences into a coherent narrative. Other times it is the result of a will to release troubled pasts, inspired by the hope that ruptured social bodies may heal among younger generations. Therefore, terms that appear throughout *Something Fierce*, such as neoliberalism, the Chicago Boys, and structural adjustment, mark Aguirre as someone who experienced the regime among intellectuals mobilized against it, who knew firsthand of disappearances and the personal risks involved with participating in the resistance, but who also had the social and cultural capital to escape.

I currently teach undergraduate courses surveying ethnographic perspectives on Latin America in a Canadian university. Most students begin the term with limited knowledge of the region, their views framed at best by economic theory acquired in International Relations courses. However, a small number of students each semester drive home for me the transformative potential of ethnography. These are the sons and daughters

of exiles from diverse Latin American countries who had immigrated during early childhood, or who were born in Canada. As young adults in university, they often hope to make sense of their own intimate perspectives on circumstances that precipitated their families' displacement. In touching discussions inspired by weekly readings, I have learned of a sense of exclusion from Canadian society experienced by many, and of yearnings to return to distant, often unfamiliar relatives. I have also perceived resentment of parents who seem to have either cut all ties with their Latin American heritage, or whose struggles with domestic violence and substance abuse suggest that traumas at the root of exile are ongoing family experiences.

Upon reading from Elizabeth Jelin's *State Repression and the Labors of Memory* (2003) and Julie Taylor's *Paper Tangos* (1998), one student told me that for the first time she managed to engage with her mother's experiences of torture. It was a chilling revelation for this student to discover that she might have become one of approximately 500 children stolen from parents who were forcibly disappeared during Argentina's Dirty War (See Gandsman 2009). Ethnography offered a bridge for engaging with her mother's stories, to guide questions about blindfolding during imprisonment and how they managed to leave the country without consent from the child's father. Meanwhile, another student long heard stories about his family's escape from Guatemala, which followed one soldier's rare opportunity to set a prisoner free. The soldier's words for my student's father were that his action was for the man's children to know what happened to their people. This student came to me after reading an article by Patricia Foxen (2000), relating a syncretic narrative of one K'iche Maya man's post-war migration to New England. The student appreciated the

ethnographer's recognition of the role that evangelical Christianity played in fostering a sense of recovery for an otherwise broken man and his battered people. Through Foxen's account, that student found validation in his father's religious fervour, where faith became a means for surviving terror. As these second generation Canadian youth reveal, ethnography too can serve as a resource in the type of restorative projects described in the previous chapter, in this case for the children of exiles struggling to reconstruct fragmented family biographies in the absence of coherent historical, political, or local community narratives.

Avery Gordon opens her book *Ghostly Matters* (1997) with a statement that is both banal and profound: life is complicated. With these words, she implies that linear, unambiguous historical narratives do not generally convey how history is experienced in everyday life, or how history shapes tastes, values, and habits among those who inherit it. For her, people may feel the very real impacts of history without identifying them as such, and we would be remiss to neglect this rich terrain for social analysis. Discussions in this thesis suggest one last lesson for social researchers: power is just as invisible as it is obvious. To take this lesson seriously involves paying critical attention to perspectives with which, as researchers, we may well disagree. How do we avoid blaming the seeming absence of concern for environmental contamination, for example, on false consciousness, ignorance, or coercion, especially when the systemic injustices we condemn may be openly embraced by the people who are most exploited by them? Gordon suggests that the workings of power be identified in places where it seems not to be, in which it is felt and known even in its apparent absence. In this fashion, power is not treated as belonging only to social structures. That is to say, the influence of the neoliberal state can be observed in

many more sites than where it is most publicly opposed. It is as present on the sofa in front of the evening news, as it is in the mainstream news coverage of student protesters barricading schools and Mapuche youth participating in land *tomas*. This is part of what makes life so complicated, producing anthropological 'fields' in which researchers and research participants may believe very different things about governing authorities and history itself. We may at least begin to appreciate this complexity when we recognize that the influence wielded by marginalized citizens is discernible in many more contexts than merely when the oppressed take to the streets. This makes an inquiry-based commitment to social justice not only a challenge of determining who we choose to study, but what we allow them to communicate to us.

Rather than pursuing any presumed authenticity for cultural, class, or national communities, today ethnography's strengths lie in a unique capacity to reveal the processes by which communities come into being, are reproduced, contested, and eventually transformed. Its contributions to knowledge about the diversity of human experiences make it a valuable educational tool for promoting respect and peaceful co-existence within plural societies. In this manner, it is an important device for countering the turning inward, or refuge within individual spaces, that happens when the family is among the few institutions left standing between the market and the state. It also reveals that what on the surface seems to be unrelated phenomena, such as polarized political subjectivities among marginalized youth (i.e. anarchism, apparent withdrawal from the civic sphere), are in all likelihood entangled just below the surface of daily life, the common effects of systemic exclusion.

A Strange Shipwreck

Jose Bengoa's words at the start of each chapter in this thesis indicate that among the most significant transformations to occur in Chilean society during the 1980s, was the dismantling of a class sentiment that structured political life. He relates that a strong sense of class solidarity had persisted since the incomplete rupture of the conservative *inquilino* (estate labour) system, which went into decline nationally between the 1920s and 1960s. For him, following the Pinochet regime, forms of solidarity characteristic of the mid-twentieth century dissolved into 'masses of individuals,' of 'consumer citizens' acting only in self-interest. We see this today in a society in which freedom is not based in universal rights, but rather in liberty to access material goods (Bengoa 2005: 157). For one, impediments to union organizing have contributed to a weakened civil society, in which the workplace is progressively less the source of solidarity it was throughout much of the twentieth century, as a milieu that reinforced social consciousness and identity. For the working classes, this has reduced labour to merely a means for generating income to fuel individual participation in market exchanges (Bengoa 2006: 159). While creating the appearance of greater social inclusion, this process has strengthened rather than bridged class disparities. It stands in sharp contrast to experiences of many from older generations for whom schools, labour unions, clubs, and squatter settlements were once critical milieus for political socialization.

Drawing on philosopher Hans Blumenberg's essay "Shipwreck with Spectator" (1947), Norbert Lechner describes Chileans for whom military repression did not inflict visible wounds in the form of torture, detainment, or disappearance, as spectators of a

strange shipwreck (2002: 72). For him, painful experiences and daily fears that became routine aspects of public life during the 1970s and 1980s, injured society in apparently imperceptible, but nonetheless significant ways. For many, it was once hoped that the devastation of state terror would subside as time passed, not unlike a shipwreck retreating into the depths of a distant ocean, eventually lost except for in the memories of survivors. This metaphor resonates still. Today, the disaster repeats itself in masses of people pulled under by the overwhelming current of consumerism, pre-approved credit, and staggering costs of education for youth whose parents hope their children will escape this destiny. As though life-jackets went down with the ship, poor wages, dismal employment opportunities, and the impossibility of returning to the land to live directly off its fruits, batter those who stay afloat. Meanwhile, in a bid for self-preservation, those among the lower and so-called middle classes lucky enough to be able to scrape out a living are like neighbours, friends, and family members watching on from the security of life boats. Quietly grieving their drowning comrades, they dismiss as "*political*" anything that might rock the boat or plunge them as well into the frigid waters.

In this scene, Chile's youngest political generations are like the occupants of fleets of life boats sent adrift by elders. At one point those elders hoped that with distance from the ruins of their sunken vessel, youth might be rescued from the cruel reality that befell their society. Today, as though still lost at sea, many youth search for firm identities on which to grab hold, and by which to recover a sense of common destiny. While they emerge disoriented from the fog as a vision of lost generations struggling to reach safe shores, youth are oriented by transmitted memories about where they come from and where they might

371

find home. Many adolescents and young adults in the South, as elsewhere in the country, lack a linear or objectified vision of the contested past. Nonetheless, in spite of lacking a clear understanding of what sent them adrift in the first place, they offer rich perspectives on how life has changed for their families in recent decades. These perspectives, acquired through family stories, habits, hesitations, and silences, convey a sense that the Pinochet regime is but one event within a much longer history of elite interventions in the lives of poor southerners.

Notes: Conclusion

[1] This is a financially self-sufficient export credit agency that does not rely on government funds.

[2] This is the type of mediatic scare tactic that often discredits Mapuche people as 'communist agitators' or as a volatile, rebellious people (See Cabalin & Lagos 2009).

[3] My translation: "Many researchers have demonstrated that rural Mapuche communities are linked to the politics of urban indigenous people and participate in national Chilean politics."

Bibliography

Abrams, Philip
    1988. Notes on the Difficulty of Studying the State. *Journal of Historical Sociology* 1(1) March, pp. 58-89.

Adams, Vincanne, with Michelle Murphy and Adele Clarke
    2009. Anticipation: Technoscience, Life, Affect, Temporality. *Subjectivity* 28, pp. 246-265.

Aguirre, Carmen
    2011. *Something Fierce: Memoirs of a Revolutionary Daughter*. Vancouver & Toronto: Douglas & MacIntyre.

Ahumada, Eugenio with Rodrigo Atria, Javier Luis Egaña, Augusto Góngora, Carmen Quesney, Gustavo Saball, and Gustavo Villalobos
    1989. *Chile la memoria prohibida: las violaciones a los derechos humanos 1973-1983*. Volumes 1-3. Santiago: Pehuén.

Allende, Isabel
    2006. *Inés del alma mía*. Buenos Aires: Sudamericana.

Amorós, Mario
    2004. *Después de la lluvia: Chile, la memoria herida*. Santiago: Editorial Cuarto Propio.

Anderson, Benedict
    1983. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. London: Verso.

Antze, Paul with Michael Lambek
    1996. *Tense Past: Cultural Essays in Trauma and Memory*. New York: Routledge.

Aravena, Andrea
    2003. Los mapuche-warriache procesos migratorios contemporáneos e identidad mapuche urbana en el siglo XX. *Mestizaje e Identidad en las Americas*. Guillaume Boccara, ed. Lima: Iquitos Instituto Francés de Estudios Andinos Abya-Ayala.

Arce, Luz
      1993. *El infierno*. Santiago: Planeta.

Arellano, Claudia with Clemente Riedemann
      2008. *Suralidad: Antropología poética del sur de Chile*. Accessed November 15, 2012: http://suralidad.blogspot.ca/.

Arías, Arturo (ed.)
      2001. *The Rigoberta Menchú Controversy*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Ash, Juliet
      1996. Memory and Objects. *The Gendered Object*. Pat Kirkham, ed. Manchester: Manchester University Press, pp. 219-224.

Assman, Jan
      1995. Collective Memory and Cultural Identity. *New German Critique* 65, pp. 125-33.

Author Unknown.
      Date unknown. *Manual de uso Ley de Donaciones Culturales*. Accessed November 15, 2012: http://www.uach.cl/direccion/finanzas/docs/Manual%20de%20Donaciones%20Culturales.pdf.

Aylwin, José
      2010. Informe en Derecho: Ley Antiterrorista y Derechos Humanos. Posted online August 2010, accessed November 15, 2012: http://observatorio.cl.pampa.avnam.net/sites/default/files/biblioteca/informe_en_derecho_ley_antiterrorista_y_derechos_humanos_rev.pdf.

Azócar, Gerardo with Rodrigo Sanhueza, Mauricio Aguayo, Hugo Romero, and María Muñoz
      2005. Conflicts for Control of Mapuche-Pehuenche Land and Natural Resources in the Biobío Highlands, Chile. *Journal of Latin American Geography* 2(5), pp. 57-76.

Bacigalupo, Ana Mariella
      1995. Renouncing Shamanistic Practice: The Conflict of Individual and Culture Experienced by a Mapuche Machi. *Anthropology of Consciousness* 6(3), pp. 1-16.

      2001. *La voz del kultrún en la modernidad: Tradición y cambio en la terapéutica de siete machi mapuche.* Santiago: Ediciones Universidad Católica de Chile.

2004. The Mapuche Man Who Became a Woman Shaman: Selfhood, Gender Transgression, and Competing Cultural Norms. *American Ethnologist* 31(3), pp. 440-457.

2007. *Shamans of the Foye Tree: Gender, Power, and Healing among Chilean Mapuche*. Austin TX: University of Texas Press.

Baddeley, Alan
1990. *Human Memory: Theory and Practice*. London: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Barnet, Miguel
2003[1966]. *Biography of a Runaway Slave*. Willimantic CT: Curbstone Press.

Barrionuevo, Alexei
2009. Chile's 'Children of Democracy' Sitting Out Presidential Election. *New York Times*, 12 December: A8.

Barthes, Roland
1957. *Mythologies*. Paris: Seuil.

Basso, Keith.
1996. *Wisdom Sits in Places: Landscape and Language among the Western Apache*. Albuquerque NM: UNM Press.

Bastide, Roger
1970. Mémoire collective et sociologie du bricolage. *L'année sociologique* 21:65-108.

1978. Problems of Collective Memory. *The African Religions of Brazil: Toward a Sociology of Interpenetration of Civilizations*, pp. 240-59.

Baudrillard, Jean
1995. *Simulacra and Simulation*. Sheila Glaser, translator. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.

Bayer, Osvaldo
1972. *La Patagonia rebelde.* Volumes 1-2. Buenos Aires: Editorial Galerna.

Becerra, Mauricio
2011. Las huellas de Pascua Lama en la cordillera del Huasco. *El Ciudadano*, 9 November. Accessed November 15, 2012: http://www.elciudadano.cl/2011/11/09/43782/las-huellas-de-pascua-lama-se-hacen-sentir-en-la-cordillera-del-huasco/.

Becker, Marc

    2011. Correa, Indigenous Movements, and the Writing of a New Constitution in Ecuador. *Latin American Perspectives* 38, pp. 47-62.

Behar, Ruth, with Deborah Gordon

    1995. *Women Writing Culture*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Bello, Álvaro

    2007. Indigenous Migration in Chile: Trends and Processes. *Indigenous Affairs* 3(07), pp. 6-17

Bender, Barbara

    2002. Time and Landscape. *Current Anthropology* 43 August-October, pp. S103-S112.

Bengoa, José

    1996. *La comunidad perdida. Ensayos sobre identidad y cultura: los desafíos de la modernización en Chile*. Santiago: Ediciones SUR.

    2000[1985]. *Historia del pueblo mapuche*. Santiago: LOM Ediciones.

    2000. *La emergencia indígena en América Latina.* Santiago: Fondo de Cultura Económica.

    2006. *La comunidad reclamada. Identidades, utopías y memorias en la sociedad chilena actual*. Santiago: Catalonia.

    2009a. *La comunidad fragmentada. Nación y desigualdad en Chile.* Santiago: Catalonia.

    2009b. Chile Mestizo, Chile Indígena. *Manifest Destinies and Indigenous Peoples*. David Maybury-Lewis, Theodore Macdonald and Biorn Maybury-Lewis, eds. Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press, pp. 119-144.

Berkes, Fikret

    2008. *Sacred Ecology*. New York: Routledge.

Berliner, David

    2005. The Abuses of Memory: Reflections on the Memory Boom in Anthropology. *Anthropological Quarterly* 78(1) Winter, pp. 197-211.

Bernedo Pinto, Patricio

    1994. *Panguipulli: historia de cuatro tiempos*. Santiago: Hans Storandt Editorial.

Bhabha, Homi
    1990. *Nation and Narration*. London: Routledge.

    1994. *The Location of Culture*. London: Routledge.

Biblioteca del Congreso Nacional de Chile
    2012. *Reporte estadístico comunal 2012: Mariquina-población.* Accessed November 15, 2012: http://reportescomunales.bcn.cl/index.php?title=Especial:PdfPrint&page=Mariquina/Población.

Biehl, João with Torben Eskerod (photographer)
    2007. *Will to Live: AIDS Therapies and the Politics of Survival*. Princeton NJ: Princeton University Press.

Bloch, Maurice
    1996. Internal and External Memory: Different Ways of Being in History. *Tense Past: Cultural Essays in Trauma and Memory*. Paul Antze and Michael Lambek, eds. London & New York: Routledge, pp. 215-233.

    1998. *How We Think They Think: Anthropological Studies in Cognition, Memory and Literacy*. Boulder CO: Westview.

Blumenberg, Hans
    1947. *Shipwreck with Spectator: Paradigm of a Metaphor for Existence.* Steven Rendall, translator. London & Cambridge MA: MIT Press.

Boccara, Guillaume
    1998. Guerre et ethnogenèse mapuche dans le Chili colonial. L'invention du soi. Paris: L'Harmattan, France.

    2002. The Mapuche People in Post-Dictatorship Chile. *Études rurales* 3-4 (163-164): 283-303.

Boccara, Guillaume with Ingrid Seguel-Boccara
    1999. Políticas indígenas en Chile (siglos xix y xx) de la asimilación al pluralismo - El Caso Mapuche-. *Revista de indias* LIX(217), pp. 741-774.

Bohle, Marlene
    2002. *Raigambre*. Santiago: Imprenta de Carabineros de Chile.

Borges, Jorge Luis
    1998[1944]. *Collected Fictions*. New York: Viking Penguin.

Bowen Silva, Martín

 2008. El proyecto sociocultural de la izquierda chilena durante la Unidad Popular. Crítica, verdad e inmunología política. *Nuevo Mundo Mundos Nuevos*. Accessed November 15, 2012: http://nuevomundo.revues.org/13732.

Bravo Aguilera, Jose Manuel

 2012. *De Carranco a Carrán: Las tomas que cambiaron la historia*. Santiago: LOM Ediciones.

Brinkmann, Beatriz

 1999. *Itinerario de la impunidad: Chile 1973-1999. Un desafío a la dignidad.* Santiago: LOM Ediciones.

Briones, Claudia

 2003. Remembering the Dis-membered: Drama about Mapuche and Anthropological Production in Three Acts (4th Edition). *Journal of Latin American Anthropology* 8(3), pp. 31-58.

Burgos, Elisabeth

 1985. *Me llamo Rigoberta Menchú y así me nació la conciencia*. México: Siglo XXI Editores.

 1999. The Story of a Testimonio. *Latin American Perspectives* 26(6), pp. 53-63.

Cabalin, Cristián with Claudia Lagos

 2009. La comunicación intercultural y el 'conflicto' mapuche en Chile. En busca de territorios compartidos. *Diálogos de la comunicación* 78.

Camacho Padilla, Fernando

 2004. Historia reciente del pueblo mapuche (1970-2003): presencia y protagonismo en la vida política de Chile. *Pensamiento crítico: Revista electrónica de historia* 4.

Candau, Joël

 1996. *Anthropologie de la mémoire*. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.

 1998. *Mémoire et identité*. Paris: Presses universitaires de France.

Cardyn Degen, Pedro

 2006. *Pisadas de riomonte. Estampas de la cordillera y del complejo maderero de Panguipulli: Historias, poemas, relatos de tomas y recuerdos guerrilleros en tono de ranchera.* Panguipulli: self-published.

Castillo, Carmen
    2007. *Calle Santa Fe.* Parox, Les films d'ici, Les Films de la passerelle, INA, Love Streams.

Centro de Estudios Miguel Enríquez
    2003. *GARCIA GUZMAN, Luis Osvaldo: Civil-empresario hotelero*. Accessed November 15, 2012: http://www.archivochile.com/Derechos_humanos/linquine/hh_dd_liquine0006.pdf.

Chihuailaf, Arauco
    2006. Migraciones mapuche en el siglo XX. *Amérique latine histoire et mémoire. Les Cahiers ALHIM* 12. Accessed November 15, 2012: http://alhim.revues.org/index1212.html.

Clifford, James with George E. Marcus.
    1986. *Writing Culture: the Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*. Berkeley & Los Angeles: University of California Press.

Climo, Jacob with Maria Cattell
    2002. *Social Memory and History: Anthropological Perspectives.* Walnut Creek, CA: Altamira Press.

Coassin, Flavia
    2000. The Function of Lethe. *Dante Colloquia in Australia: 1982-1999*. Margaret Baker and Diana Glenn. Adelaide: Australian Humanities Press, pp. 95-102.

Collins, Joseph and John Lear
    1995. *Chile's Free Market Miracle: A Second Look*. Oakland CA: Food First (Institute for Food and Development Policy).

Comisión Chilena de Derechos Humanos
    1999. *Nunca más en Chile: síntesis corregida y actualizada del Informe Rettig*. Santiago: LOM Ediciones.

Comisión Valech
    2004. *Informe de la Comisión nacional sobre prisión política y tortura*. Fundación pro-Derechos Humanos. Accessed November 15, 2012: http://www.derechoshumanos.net/paises/America/derechos-humanos-Chile/informes-comisiones/comision-nacional-prision-politica-y-tortura.htm

Comisión Verdad Histórica y Nuevo Trato
    2008. *Informe de la Comisión Verdad Histórica y Nuevo Trato con los Pueblos Indígenas*. Santiago: Colorama SA.

Comité Memoria Neltume
    2003. *Guerrilla en Neltume: una historia de lucha y resistencia en el sur chileno*. Santiago: LOM.

Connerton, Paul
    1989. *How Societies Remember*. Cambridge/New York: Cambridge University Press.

    2009. *How Modernity Forgets*. Cambridge/New York: Cambridge University Press.

Constable, Pamela with Arturo Valenzuela
    1991. *A Nation of Enemies: Chile under Pinochet*. New Yrok: WW Norton.

Cooper, Marc
    2010. Chile Shaking. *The Nation* 29 March. Accessed November 15, 2012: http://www.thenation.com/article/chile-shaking.

Cormier, Loretta
    2003. Decolonizing History: Ritual Transformation of the Past among the Guajá of Eastern Amazonia. *Histories and Historicities in Amazonia*. Neil Whitehead, ed. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press.

Course, Magnus
    2011. *Becoming Mapuche: Person and Ritual in Indigenous Chile*. Champaigne IL: University of Illinois Press

Coser, Lewis
    1992[1977]. *Masters of Sociological Thought: Ideas in Historical and Social Context.* New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.

Cox, Cristián
    2003. *Políticas educacionales en el cambio de siglo. La reforma del sistema escolar de Chile*. Cristián Cox, ed. Santiago: Editorial Universitaria.

Crapanzano, Vincent
    1980. *Tuhami, Portrait of a Moroccan*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Crehan, Kate.
    2002. *Gramsci, Culture and Anthropology*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Cruikshank, Julie
    1990. *Life Lived like a Story: Life of Three Yukon Native Elders*. Lincoln NE: University of Nebraska Press.

2001. Glaciers and Climate Change: Perspectives from Oral Traditions. *Arctic* 54(4) December, pp. 377-393.

2005. *Do Glaciers Listen? Local Knowledge, Colonial Encounters, and Social Imagination.* Vancouver: UBC Press.

Crummett, Maria de los Angeles
1977. El poder femenino: the Mobilization of Women Against Socialism in Chile. *Latin American Perspectives* 4, pp. 103-113.

Cruz, María Angélica
2004. *Iglesia, represión y memoria. El caso chileno*. Madrid: Siglo XXI.

da Silva Catela, Ludmila with Elizabeth Jelin
2002. *Los archivos de la represión: documentos, memoria y verdad*. Madrid: Siglo XXI.

de Certeau, Michel
1983. History, Ethics, Science, and Fiction. *Social Science as Moral Inquiry*. Norma Haan, Robert Bellah, Paul Rabinow, and William Sullivan, eds. New York: Columbia University Press, pp. 125-52.

Defoe, Daniel.
1994[1917]. *Robinson Crusoe*. London: Penguin Books.

de la Maza, Francisca
2008. La Educación Intercultural Bilingüe: representaciones y prácticas sociales de la otredad. *Encounters on Education* 9, pp. 109-120.

de la Peña, Guillermo
2005. Social and Cultural Policies toward Indigenous Peoples: Perspectives from Latin America. *Annual Review of Anthropology* 34, pp. 717-739.

del Pino, Ponciano with Elizabeth Jelin
2004. *Luchas locales, comunidades e identitades*. Madrid: Siglo XXI.

Derrida, Jacques
1967. *L'écriture et la différence*. Paris: Seuil.

Díaz-Cid, César
2007. El discurso testimonial y su análisis literario en Chile. *Documentos lingüísticos y literarios*. Accessed November 15, 2012: www.humanidades.uach.cl/documentos_linguisticos/document.php?id=1354

Díaz Meza, Aurelio

    2007[1907]. *Parlamento de Coz-Coz: Breve relación del parlamento mapuche de Coz-Coz. 18 de enero de 1907*. Valdivia: Serindigena Ediciones.

Donoso, José

    1970. *El obsceno pájaro de la noche*. Barcelona: Editorial Seix Barral.

Dorfman, Ariel

    1992. *Death and the Maiden*. New York: Penguin Books.

    1998. *Heading South, Looking North: A Bilingual Journey*. New York: Farrar, Straus, and Giroux.

Duara, Prasenjit

    1995. *Rescuring History from the Nation: Questioning Narratives of Modern Chine*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Du Monceau, Maria Isabel

    2008. *The Political Ecology of Indigenous Movements and Tree Plantations in Chile: The Role of Political Strategies of Mapuche Communities in Shaping their Social and Natural Livelihoods*. Doctoral dissertation, Resource Management and Environmental Studies, University of British Columbia, Vancouver.

Elias, Norbert with John L. Scotson

    1994[1965]. *The Established and the Outsiders: A Sociological Enquiry into Community Problems*. Oxford: Sage Publications.

Eltit, Diamela

    1989. *El padre mío*. Santiago: Francisco Zegers.

Ensalaco, Mark with Jesús Izquierdo Martín

    2002. *Chile bajo Pinochet: la recuperación de la verdad*. Madrid: Alianza Editorial.

Escalante Hidalgo, Jorge

    2000. *La misión era matar: el juicio a la caravana Pinochet-Arellano*. Santiago: LOM Ediciones.

Escobar, Arturo

    1998. Does Biodiversity Exist? *Journal of Political Ecology* 5, pp. 54-56.

    2003. Displacement, Development, and Modernity in the Colombian Pacific. *International Social Science Journal* 55(174) March, pp. 157-167.

Fabian, Johannes

1983. *Time and the Other*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Faúndez, Cristián Antoine
2008. ¿Réquiem para las donaciones privadas a la cultura en Chile? La Ley Valdés y el régimen chileno de donaciones con fines culturales. *Quantum* 3(2) December, pp. 86-102.

Fentress, James with Chris Wickham
1992. *Social Memory: New Perspectives on the Past*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Ferguson, James
1994. *The Anti-Politics Machine: Development, Depoliticization, and Bureaucratic Power in Lesotho*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Ferguson, James with Larry Lohmann
1994. The Anti-Politics Machine: 'Development' and Bureaucratic Power in Lesotho. *Ecologist* 24(5), pp. 176-181.

Fields, Scott
2006. The Price of Gold in Chile. *Environmental Health Perspectives* 114(9) September, pp. 536-539.

Foerster, Rolf with Jorge Iván Vergara
2001. Algunas transformaciones de la política mapuche en la década de los noventa. *Anales de la Universidad de Chile. VI serie* 13.

Foucault, Michel
1975. *Surveiller et punir*. Paris, Gallimard.

1994 [1982]. La technologie politique des individus. *Dits et écrits 1954-1988, volume IV*. Daniel Defert and François Ewald, eds. Paris: Éditions Gallimard, pp. 813-828.

Fouron, Georges with Nina Glick-Schiller
2001. *Georges Woke Up Laughing: Long-Distance Nationalism and the Search for Home*. Durham NC: Duke University Press.

Foxen, Patricia
2000. Cacophony of Voices: A K'iche' Mayan Narrative of Remembrance and Forgetting. *Transcultural Psychiatry* 37, pp. 355-81.

Frazier, Lessie Jo
    2007. *Salt in the Sand: Memory, Violence, and the Nation-State in Chile, 1890 to the Present*. Durham NC: Duke University Press.

Frisch, Andrea
    2006. Montaigne and the Ethics of Memory. *L'Esprit créateur* 46, pp. 23-31.

Furniss, Elizabeth
    1999. *The Burden of History: Colonialism and the Frontier Myth in a Rural Canadian Community*. Vancouver: UBC Press.

Gandsman, Ari
    2009. "Do you know who you are?" Radical Existential Doubt and Scientific Certainty in the Search for the Kidnapped Children of the Disappeared in Argentina. *Ethos* 37(4), pp. 441-465.

Garrido Rojas, José with Cristián Guerrero Yoacham and María Soledad Valdés
    1988. *Historia de la reforma agraria en Chile*. Santiago: Editorial Universitaria.

Gaudichaud, Franck
    2005. Construyendo 'Poder Popular': El movimiento sindical, la CUT y las luchas obreras en el periodo de la Unidad Popular. *Cuando hicimos historia: La experiencia de la Unidad Popular*. Julio Pinto Vallejos, ed. Santiago: LOM Ediciones, pp. 81-105.

Geertz, Clifford
    1973. *The Interpretation of Cultures: Selected Essays*. New York: Basic Books.

    1998. Deep Hanging Out. *The New York Review of Books.* 45(16), n. 3. Accessed online November 15, 2012: http://hypergeertz.jku.at/GeertzTexts/Deep_Hanging.htm.

    2000. *Available Light: Anthropological Reflections on Philosophical Topics*. Princeton NJ: Princeton University Press.

Ghosh, Amitav
    1998. The March of the Novel through History: The Testimony of My Grandfather's Bookcase. *Kenyon Review* 20(2), pp. 23-24.

    1992. *In an Antique Land*. London: Granta.

Gillis, John

    1994. Memory and Identity: The History of a Relationship. John Gillis, ed. *Commemorations: The Politics of National Identity*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, pp. 3-27.

Girard, René

    1979. *Violence and the Sacred.* Patrick Gregory, translator. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.

Goic, Cedomil

    2002. Edición crítica de *Cautiverio feliz. Anales de literatura chilena* 3, pp. 123-126.

Goldstein, Daniel M.

    2004. *The Spectacular City: Violence and Performance in Urban Bolivia*. Durham & London: Duke University Press.

González, Rúben

    2002. *Neltume: el vuelo quebrado*. Santiago: Pentagrama Editores.

Goody, Jack

    1995. *The Expansive Moment: The Rise of Social Anthropology in Britain and Africa*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

    1998[1970]. Memory and Oral Tradition. *Memory*. Patricia Fara and Karalyn Patterson, eds. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Gordillo, Gastón with Silvia Hirsch

    2003. Indigenous Struggles and Contested Identities in Argentina: Histories of Invisibilization and Reemergence. *The Journal of Latin American Anthropology* 8(3), pp. 4-30.

Gordon, Avery

    1997. *Ghostly Matters: Haunting and the Sociological Imagination*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Gough, Kathleen

    2002[1968]. New Proposals for Anthropologists. *Anthropology of Politics: A Reader in Ethnography*. Joan Vincent, ed. New York: Blackwell.

Grandin, Greg

    2004. *The Last Colonial Massacre: Latin America in the Cold War*. Chicago & London: University of Chicago Press.

Gross, Manuel

2008. Documental 'Ciudad de papel' relate las iniquidades de CELCO. 25 October blog on *Pensamiento imaginactivo*. Accessed November 15, 2012: http://manuelgross.bligoo.com/content/view/306654/Documental-Ciudad-de-Papel-relata-las-iniquidades-de-CELCO.html.

Guerra, Debbie with Juan Carlos Skewes

2004. Science, Religion and Worldview in the Protection and Construction of Social and Cultural Rights in Southern Chile. American Anthropological Association Committee for Human Rights.

Gutiérrez, Hugo

2002. The Appeals Court Ruling is Negotiated Out for Pinochet: Interview with Attorney Hugo Gutiérrez. *Memoria y Justicia*. Accessed November 15, 2012: http://www.memoriayjusticia.cl/english/en_issues-gutierrez.html.

Gutmann, Matthew

1996. *The Meanings of Macho: Being a Man in Mexico City.* Berkeley: University of California Press.

Guyer, Jane

2007. Prophecy and the Near Future: Thoughts on Macroeconomic, Evangelical, and Punctuated Time. *American Ethnologist* 34(3) August, pp. 409-421.

Guzmán, Patricio

1975. *La batalla de Chile: la lucha de un pueblo sin armas – Parte I la insuracción de la burguesía*. Equipo Tercer Año.

1976. *La batalla de Chile: la lucha de un pueblo sin armas – Parte II el golpe de estado.* Equipo Tercer Año.

1979. *La batalla de Chile: la lucha de un pueblo sin armas – Parte III el poder popular.* Equipo Tercer Año.

1997. *Chile, la memoria obstinada.* Les Films D'Ici ONF.

Halbwachs, Maurice

1941. *La topographie légendaire des évangiles en terre sainte: étude de mémoire collective*. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.

1976[1925]. *Les cadres sociaux de la mémoire*. Paris: Mouton.

1980[1950]. *The Collective Memory*. New York: Harper.

Hamilton, Edith
     1940. *Mythology: Timeless Tales of Gods and Heroes*. Boston: Mentor Books.

Hayner, Priscilla
     2001. *Unspeakable Truths: Confronting State Terror and Atrocity*. New York: Routledge.

Hecht, Tobias
     1998. *At Home in the Street: Street Children of Northeast Brazil*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Hershberg, Eric with Felipe Agüero
     2005. *Memorias militares sobre la represión en el Cono Sur: Visiones en disputa en dictadura y democracia*. Madrid: Siglo XXI.

Herzfeld, Michael
     2008. Mere Symbols. *Anthropologica* 50, pp. 141-155

Hite, Katherine
     2000. *When the Romance Ended: Leaders of the Chilean Left, 1968-1998*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Howe, Alexis Lynne
     2011. Rethinking Disappearance in Chilean Post-Coup Narratives. Doctoral dissertation, University of Minnesota. Accessed November 15, 2012: http://conservancy.umn.edu/bitstream/107914/1/Howe_umn_0130E_11889.pdf

Huirimilla, Juan Pablo
     2005. *Palimpsesto.* Santiago: LOM Ediciones.

Human Rights Watch and Observatorio de Derechos de los Pueblos Indígenas
     2004. Indebido proceso: Los juicios antiterroristas, los tribunales militares y los mapuche en el sur de chile. Posted 1 October 2004. Accessed November 15, 2012: http://www.observatorio.cl/p_informes

Huneeus, Carlos
     2003. *El régimen de Pinochet*. Santiago: Editorial Sudamericana.

Igoe, Jim
     2004. *Conservation and Globalization: A Study of National Parks and Indigenous Communities from East Africa to South Dakota.* Belmont CA: Wadsworth/Thomson Learning.

Illanes, María Angélica
    2002. *La batalla de la memoria. Ensayos históricos de nuestro siglo. Chile, 1900-2000*. Santiago: Planeta/Ariel.

Jelin, Elizabeth
    2002. *Las conmemoraciones: las disputas en las fechas 'in-felices'*. Madrid and Buenos Aires: Siglo XXI de España Editores/Siglo XXI de Argentina Editores.

    2003. *State Repression and the Labors of Memory*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Jelin, Elizabeth with Victoria Langland
    2003. *Monumentos, memoriales y marcas territoriales*. Madrid and Buenos Aires: Siglo XXI de España Editores/Siglo XXI de Argentina Editores.

Jelin, Elizabeth with Ana Longoni
    2005. *Escrituras, imágenes y escenarios ante la represión*. Madrid: Siglo XXI.

Jelin, Elizabeth with Federico Guillermo Lorenz
    2004. *Educación y memoria: la escuela elabora el pasado*. Madrid: Siglo XXI.

    2005. *Memorias militares sobre la represión en el Cono Sur: visiones en disputa en dictadura y democracia*. Madrid: Siglo XXI.

Kahn, Joel S.
    1989. Culture: Demise or Resurrection? *Critique of Anthropology* 9, pp. 5-25.

Kane, Eileen
    2010. *Trickster: An Anthropological Memoir*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Kelly, Patty
    2008. *Lydia's Open Door: Inside Mexico's Most Modern Brothel*. Berkeley & Los Angeles: University of California Press.

Klein, Naomi
    2007. *The Shock Doctrine: The Rise of Disaster Capitalism*. New York: Metropolitan Books/Henry Holt.

Klubock, Thomas Miller
    2003. History and Memory in Neoliberal Chile: Patricio Guzmán's Obstinate Memory and The Battle of Chile. *Radical History Review* 85, pp. 272-281.

    2004. Labor, Land, and Environmental Change in the Forestry Sector in Chile: 1973-1998. *Victims of the Chilean Miracle: Workers and Neoliberalism in the*

Pinochet Era, 1973-2002. Peter Winn, ed. Durham NC: Duke University Press, pp. 337-387.

2010. Ránquil: Violence and Peasant Politics in Chile's Southern Frontier. *A Century of Revolution: Insurgent and Counterinsurgent Violence during Latin America's Long Cold War*. Greg Grandin and Gilbert M. Joseph, eds. Durham NC: Duke University Press, pp. 121-159.

Kosek, Jake
2006. *Understories: The Political Life of Forests in Northern New Mexico*. Durham NC: Duke University Press.

LaNacion.cl
2008. *Venganza sin uniforme.* 7 September. Accessed November 15, 2012: http://www.lanacion.cl/prontus_noticias_v2/site/artic/20080906/pags/200809062204 16.html.

Las Buenas Noticias
2012. *Protagonistas del municipio: Ricardo Kunstmann Hott*. Accessed 16 August 2012: http://www.lbnpanguipulli.cl/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=372 &catid=2&Itemid=238

Latta, Alex with Kari Williams
2012. *Chilean Patagonia in the Balance: Dams, Mines and the Canadian Connection*. The Council of Canadians - Acting for Social Justice.

Lavanchy, Anne
2007. *Comment rester Mapuche au Chili? Autochtonie, genre et transmission culturelle.* Doctoral Dissertation, Institut d'ethnologie, Université de Neuchâtel.

Leavitt, John
1996. Meaning and Feeling in the Anthropology of Emotions. *American Ethnologist* 23, pp. 514-539.

2005. Le mythe aujourd'hui. *Anthropologie et Sociétés* 29, pp. 7-20.

Le Bonniec, Fabien
2003. Etat de droit et droits indigènes dans le contexte d'une post-dictature: portrait de la criminalisation du mouvement mapuche dans un Chili démocratique. *@mnis: Revue de Civilisation Contemporaine de l'Université de Bretagne Occidentale* 3.

Lechner, Norbert
    2002. *Las sombras del mañana: la dimensión subjectiva de la política*. Santiago: LOM Ediciones.

Leiva, Ibar
    2001. Neltume, Chile: Memorial a las victimas de la dictadura en el complejo forestal y maderero de Panguipulli. Accessed November 15, 2012: http://www.memoriamir.cl/pagina/neltume.htm.

Levi, Primo
    1995. *Le devoir de mémoire: entretien avec Anna Bravo et Federico Careja*. Turin: Éditions Mille et une nuits.

Lévi-Strauss, Claude
    1974[1962]. *The Savage Mind*. London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson.

Leydesdorff, Selma with Luisa Passerini and Paul Thompson
    1996. *Gender and Memory*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Mallon, Florencia
    2005. *Courage Tastes of Blood: The Mapuche Community of Nicolás Ailío and the Chilean State, 1906-2001*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.

Marcus, George E.
    1998. *Ethnography through Thick & Thin*. Princeton NJ: Princeton University Press.

Marimán, Pablo with Sergio Caniuqueo, José Millalén, and Rodrigo Levil
    2006. *¡...Escucha, winka...! Cuatro ensayos de historia nacional mapuche y un epílogo sobre el futuro*. Santiago: LOM Ediciones.

Mauss, Marcel
    1990[1922]. *The Gift: Forms and Functions of Exchange in Archaic Societies*. London: Routledge.

Maybury-Lewis, David with Theodore Macdonald and Biorn Maybury-Lewis
    2009. *Manifest Destinies and Indigenous Peoples*. Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press.

Megill, Allan
    1998. History, Memory, Identity. *History of the Human Sciences* 11, pp. 37-62

Meintel, Deirdre

    1998. Récits d'exil et mémoire sociale des réfugiés. In *Récit et connaissance*. François Laplantine, Joseph Lévy, Jean-Baptiste Martin, and Alexis Nouss, eds. Montfort et Villeroy: Presses Universitaires de Lyon, pp. 55-73.

Memoria Chilena. 2004. *La encomienda*. Accessed November 15, 2012: http://www.memoriachilena.cl/temas/index.asp?id_ut=laencomienda.siglosxvi-xviii

Millanguir Neutopan, Doris

    2007. *Panguipulli: Historia y territorio 1850-1946*. Valdivia: Imprenta Austral.

Montt Pinto, Isabel

    1971. *Breve historia de Valdivia.* Buenos Aires: Editorial Francisco de Aguirre.

Moraga, Jorge

    2001. *Aguas turbias: La central hidroelectrica Ralco en el Alto Bio Bio*: Observatorio Latinoamericano de Conflictos Ambientales.

Moulian, Tomás

    1997. *Chile actual: Anatomía de un mito*. Santiago: LOM Ediciones.

Munizaga, Giselle with Carlos Ochsenius

    1983. *El discurso público de Pinochet (1973-1978)*. Buenos Aires: Consejo Latinoamericano de Ciencias Sociales.

Murray Li, Tania

    2007a. *The Will to Govern: Governmentality, Development, and the Practice of Politics*. Durhan NC: Duke University Press.

    2007b. Governmentality. *Anthropologica* 49, pp. 275-281.

Muzzopappa, María Eva

    2005. Savia nueva de un árbol eterno: ejército, jóvenes y memoria en la Escuela Militar (Chile, 1971-2002). *Memorias militares sobre la represión en el cono sur: Visiones en disputa en dictadura y democracia*. Eric Hershberg and Federico Guillermo Agüero, eds. Madrid: Siglo XXI, pp. 107-142

NACLA

    1973a. Chile Facing the Blockade. *NACLA Latin American and Empire Report* 007.

    1973b. The Money Behind Nixon...From Wall Street to Watergate. *NACLA Latin American and Empire Report* 007.

1974a. US Counter-Revolutionary Apparatus: The Chilean Offensive. *NACLA Latin American and Empire Report* 008.

1974b. The CIA: White-Collar Terrorism. *NACLA Latin American and Empire Report* 008.

Nash, June
2001. Globalization and the Cultivation of Peripheral Vision. *Anthropology Today* 14(4) August, pp. 15-22

Navia, Patricio
2008. Pinochet: the Father of Contemporary Chile. *Latin American Research Review* 43, pp. 250-258.

Nazarea, Virginia
2006. Local Knowledge and Memory in Biodiversity Conservation. *Annual Review of Anthropology* 35, pp. 317-335.

Nemat, Marina
2008. *Prisoner of Tehran: A Memoir*. Toronto: Penguin Canada.

2012. Marina Nemat: I live to testify. *The Globe and Mail*. 8 February. Accessed November 15, 2012: http://www.theglobeandmail.com/arts/books-and-media/marina-nemat-on-canada-reads-controversy-i-live-to-testify/article544736/

Neruda, Pablo
1950. I.VI. Los hombres. *Canto general*. Accessed November 15, 2012 at: http://www.neruda.uchile.cl/obra/cantogeneral.htm.

Nigro, Georgia with Ulric Neisser
1983. Point of View in Personal Memory. *Cognitive Psychology* 15, pp. 467-482

Nikro, Norman Saadi
2011. Disrupting Dismemory: The Memoir of Jean Said Makdisi. *ZMO Working Papers Series* 3, pp. 1-11. Accessed 15 October 2012: http://www.zmo.de/publikationen/workingpapers/nikro_2011.pdf

Nora, Pierre
1984-1992. *Les lieux de mémoire*. Paris: Gallimard.

1989[1984]. Between Memory and History: Les lieux de mémoire. *Representations* 26, pp. 7-24.

Ochs, Elinor with Lisa Capps
    1996. Narrating the Self. *Annual Review of Anthropology* 25, pp. 19-43.

O.E.C.D.
    2009. Declarations by OECD Member States on the Accession of the Republic of Chile. *Meeting of the OECD Council,* 15 December 2009.

Olick, Jeffrey with Joyce Robbins
    1998. Social Memory Studies: From 'Collective Memory' to Historical Sociology of Mnemonic Practices. *Annual Review of Sociology* 24, pp. 105-40

Olivares Cofré, Emilia
    2012. ¿Por qué continua siendo obligatorio el servicio militar en Chile? *Biblioteca del Congreso Nacional de Chile-BCN Blog Legal*. Accessed November 15, 2012: http://bloglegal.bcn.cl/por-que-continua-siendo-obligatorio-el-servicio-militar-en-chile

Paley, Julia
    2001a. *Marketing Democracy: Power and Social Movements in Post-Dictatorship Chile*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

    2001b. Making Democracy Count: Opinion Polls and Market Surveys in the Chilean Political Transition. *Cultural Anthropology* 16, pp. 135-164.

Pascal Allende, Andrés
    1981. Neltume es un paso, el objectivo: Guerrilla permanente en los campos. Interview with Secretary General of the MIR Andrés Pascal Allende in hiding in Chile. Available in the Biblioteca Nacional in Santiago.

Passerini, Luisa
    2007. *Memory and Utopia: The Primacy of Intersubjectivity*. London: Equinox.

Paxson, Margaret
    2005. *Solovyovo: The Story of Memory in a Russian Village.* Washington DC: Woodrow Wilson Center Press.

Pedreros Saá, Claudia
    2010. El tratamiento de la prensa en el conflicto chileno-mapuche: ¿Parcialidad o desinformación? *El Ciudadano*, 3 September. Accessed November 15, 2012: http://www.elciudadano.cl/2010/09/03/26275/el-tratamiento-de-la-prensa-en-el-conflicto-chileno-mapuche-¿parcialidad-o-desinformacion/.

Pellegrino Soares, Gabriela

2007. Novos meridianos da produçao editorial em castelhano: o papel de espanhóis exilados pela Guerra Civil na Argentina e no México. *Varia historia* 23, pp. 386-398.

Pérez Rosales, Vicente
date unknown. Capítulos XIX, XX, XXI y XXII Sobre la colonización alemana en Valdivia y sus alrededores. *Recuerdos del pasado (fragmento)*. Valdivia: Taller *denosotros* Ex Libris

Pfeffer Urquiaga, Francisco
2008. Conflicto de intereses entre los privados y protección de minorías accionarias. El Caso Chispas. *Transparency and Public Integrity: Latin American Case Studies*. José Zalaquett, Alex Muñoz, eds. Foundation Open Society Institute. Accessed online November 15, 2012:
http://www.pfeffer.cl/publicaciones/doc/conflictoprivados.pdf

Pinto Vallejos, Julio
2000. *De la inclusión a la exclusión. La formación del estado, la nación, y el pueblo Mapuche*. Santiago: Instituto de Estudios Avanzados (IDEA)

2005. *Cuando hicimos historia: la experiencia de la Unidad Popular*. Santiago: LOM Ediciones.

Piscitelli, Adriana
1996. "Love and Ambition: Gender, Memory, and Stories from Brazilian Coffee Plantation Families," in *Gender and Memory*. Edited by L. Leyesdorff, L. Passerini, and P. Thompson, pp. 89-103. Vancouver: UBC Press.

PNUD
1998. *Desarrollo humano en Chile 1998. Las paradojas de la modernización*. Naciones Unidas.

2000. *Desarollo humano en Chile 2000. Más sociedad para gobernar el futuro*. Naciones Unidas.

2002. *Desarollo humano en Chile 2002. Nosotros los chilenos: un desafío cultural*. Naciones Unidas.

Poirier, Sylvie
2008. Reflections on Indigenous Cosmopolitics-Poetics. *Anthropologica* 50, pp. 75-86.

Poniatowska, Elena
1980. *La noche de Tlatelolco*. Mexico: Era Ediciones.

Popular Memory Group.
    1982. Popular Memory: Theory, Politics, Method. *Making Histories: Studies in History-Writing and Politics.* Richard Johnson, et al, eds. London: Hutchinson, pp. 205-252.

Portelli, Alessandro
    1991. *The Death of Luigi Trastulli, and Other Stories: Form and Meaning in Oral History*. Albany NY: State University of New York Press.

    2003. *The Order Has Been Carried Out: History, Memory, and Meaning of a Nazi Massacre in Rome*. New York NY: Palgrave MacMillan.

    2006. The Massacre at the Fosse Ardeatine: History, Myth, Ritual, and Symbol. *Memory, History, Nation: Contested Pasts*. Katharine Hodgkin and Susannah Radstone, eds. New Brunswick NJ: Routledge, p. 29

Posner, Paul
    1999. Popular Representation and Political Dissatisfaction in Chile's New Democracy. *Journal of Interamerican Studies and World Affairs* 41, pp. 59-85.

Povinelli, Elizabeth
    2001. Radical Worlds: the Anthropology of Incommensurability and Inconceivability. *Annual Review of Anthropology* 30, pp. 319-334.

Pratt, Mary-Louise
    2001. I, Rigoberta Menchu and the 'Culture Wars. *The Rigoberta Menchu Controversy.* Arturo Arias, ed. Minneapolis, Minn: University of Minnesota Press, pp. 29-48

Proust, Marcel
    1954. *À la recherche du temps perdu*. Paris: Gallimard.

Rabinow, Paul
    1977. *Reflections on Fieldwork in Morocco*. Berkeley & Los Angeles: University of California Press.

Ramos, Alcida Rita
    1998. *Indigenism: Ethnic Politics in Brazil*. Madison WI: University of Wisconsin Press.

    2003. Pulp Fictions of Indigenism. *Race, Nature, and the Politics of Difference.* Donald S. Moore, Jake Kosek, and Anand Pandian, eds. Durham NC: Duke University Press, pp. 356-379.

Raymont, Peter
    2007. A Promise to the Dead: The Exile Journey of Ariel Dorfman. Canada: White Pine Pictures.

Rencoret Orellana, Luis
    2009. *De Panguipulli…pa entro (Personajes pinterescos de la región)*. Valdivia: Imprenta Gráfica Sur.

Rettig Commission
    1991. Rettig Report: Report of the Chilean National Commission on Truth and Reconciliation. United States Institute of Peace.

Reyes Jedlicki, Leonora
    2004. Actores, conflicto y memoria: Reforma curricular de historia y ciencias sociales en Chile, 1990-2003. *Educación y memoria: la escuela elabora el pasado.* Elizabeth Jelin and Federico Guillermo Lorenz, eds. Madrid: Siglo XXI.

Ribeiro, Gustavo Lins
    2006. World Anthropologies: Cosmopolitics for a New Global Scenario in Anthropology. *Critique of Anthropology* 26, pp. 363-386.

Richards, Patricia
    2004. *Pobladoras, Indígenas, and the State: Conflicts over Women's Rights in Chile*. New Brunswick NJ: Rutgers University Press.

Ricoeur, Paul
    1965. *De l'interprétation: essai sur Freud*. Paris: Editions du Seuil

    1975. *Les cultures et le temps*. Paris: Payot

    1983. Temps de l'âme et temps du monde. *Temps et récits III*. Paris: Seuil, pp. 19-36.

    2004. Part III The Historical Condition: Chapter 3 Forgetting. *Memory, History, Forgetting*, pp. 412-56 Chicago, London: University of Chicago Press

Riffo, José Luis with Andrea Bustos
    2008. Electorado chileno envejece cada día. *Biblioteca del Congreso Nacional de Chile*. Accessed November 15, 2012: http://www.bcn.cl/carpeta_temas_profundidad/envejece-padron-electoral/.

Riveros, Luis A.

1995. *Chile's Structural Adjustment: Relevant Policy Lessons for Latin America*. Toronto: University of Toronto Centre for International Studies.

Robert, Marthes
    1972. *Roman des origines et origines du roman*. Paris: Bernard Grasset.

Rojas, Paz with CODEPU and Equipo de Salud Mental-DITT
    1991. *Chile, recuerdos de la guerra: Valdivia, Neltume, Chihuío, Liquiñe*. Serie Verdad y Justicia, volume 2. Santiago: Corporación de Promoción y Defensa de los Derechos del Pueblo (CODEPU).

Rosaldo, Renato
    1989. *Culture & Truth: The Remaking of Social Analysis*. Boston: Beacon Press

Roseberry, William
    1994. Hegemony and the Language of Contention. *Everyday Forms of State Formation: Revolution and the Negotiation of Rule in Modern Mexico*. Gilbert M. Joseph and Daniel Nugent, eds. Durham NC: Duke University Press, pp. 355-366.

    1996. Hegemony, Power, and Languages of Contention. *The Politics of Difference: Ethnic Promises in a World of Power*. Edwin Wilmsen and Patrick McAllister, eds. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, pp. 71-84.

Rupailaf, Roxana Miranda
    2003. *Las tentaciones de Eva*. Collección de Premios Luis Oyarzún, Secretaria Minesterial de Educación. Región de los Lagos, Puerto Montt.

Saavedra Peláez, Alejandro
    2002. *Los mapuche en la sociedad chilena actual*. Santiago: LOM Ediciones.

Said, Edward
    1978. *Orientalism*. New York: Vintage Books.

Salazar, Gabriel
    2006[1990]. *Ser niño "huacho" en la historia de Chile (siglo XIX)*, 2ª ed. Santiago: LOM Ediciones.

Saldivia Donicke, Salustio
    2011. *Mariküga: Entre historia y memoria*. Valdivia: Imprenta América.

Salinas Urrejola, Isidora
    2002. Pinochetismo y memoria social: apuntes para la construcción de una historia del 'otro.' *Estudios politico militares* 2, pp. 79-102.

Sawyer, Suzana
     2004. *Crude Chronicles: Indigenous Politics, Multinational Oil, and Neoliberalism in Ecuador*. Durham NC: Duke University Press.

Scheper-Hughes
     2007. The Tyranny of the Gift: Sacrificial Violence in Living Donor Transplants. *American Journal of Transplantation* 7, pp. 507-411.

Schild, Veronica
     1994. Recasting "Popular" Movements: Gender and Political Learning in Neighborhood Organizations in Chile. *Latin American Perspectives* 21, pp. 59-80.

     2000. Neo-liberalism's New Gendered Market Citizens: the 'civilizing' dimension of social programmes in Chile. *Citizenship Studies* 4, pp. 275-305.

Schmidt, Jeremy
     2011. *Alternative Water Futures in Alberta*. December. Edmonton: Parkland Institute, University of Alberta.

Schönenberger, Silvia with Hernando Silva
     2009. *Los proyectos hidroeléctricos de SN Power en el valle Liquiñe comuna de Panguipulli*. Working Paper No. 78. Temuco: Observatorio Ciudadano

Semprún, Jorge
     1994. *L'écriture ou la vie.* Paris: Gallimard.

Sepúlveda, Claudia with Jorge Garrido Barros
     2008. *Ciudad de papel*. Documentary. Valdivia: Jirafa.

Seremetakis, Nadia
     1994. *The Senses Still: Perception and Memory as Material Culture in Modernity*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Sider, Gerald with Gavin Smith.
     1997. *Between History and Histories: The Production of Silences and Commemorations*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Skewes, Juan Carlos with María Eugenia Solari, Debbie Guerra, and Daniela Jalabert
     2012. *Los paisajes del agua: naturaleza e identidad en la cuenca del Río Valdivia*. Chungara, Revista de antropología chilena 4(2), pp. 290-312.

Smith, Linda Tuhiwai

1999. *Decolonizing Methodologies: Research and Indigenous Peoples*. New York & London: Zed Books.

Starn, Orin
    1991. Missing the Revolution: Anthropologists and the War in Peru. *Cultural Anthropology* 6, pp. 63-91.

Stern, Steve J.
    2004. *Remembering Pinochet's Chile: On the Eve of London 1998*. Book I of Trilogy The Memory Box of Pinochet's Chile. Durham: Duke University Press.

    2006. *Battling for Hearts and Minds: Memory Struggles in Pinochet's Chile, 1973-1988*. Book II of Trilogy The Memory Box of Pinochet's Chile. Durham: Duke University Press.

    2010. *Reckoning with Pinochet's Chile: The Memory Question in Democratic Chile, 1989-2006*. Book III of Trilogy The Memory Box of Pinochet's Chile. Durham: Duke University Press.

Stillerman, Joel
    2004. Gender, Class and Generational Contexts for Consumption in Contemporary Chile. *Journal of Consumer Culture* 4, pp. 1469-5405.

Stoll, David
    1999. *Rigoberta Menchú and the Story of All Poor Guatemalans*. Boulder: Westview Press.

Stoller, Paul
    1995. *Embodying Colonial Memories: Spirit Possession, Power and the Hauka in West Africa*. New York & London: Routledge.

Stoltz Chinchilla, Norma
    1974. The Agrarian Reform and Campesino Consciousness. *Latin American Perspectives* 1:106-128.

Striffler, Steve
    2002. *In the Shadows of State and Capital:The United Fruit Company, popular struggle, and agrarian restructuring in Ecuador, 1900-1995*. Durham NC: Duke University Press.

Stuchlik, Milan
    1985. Las políticas indígenas en Chile y la imagen de los mapuches. *Cultura, hombre, sociedad (CUHSO)* 2, pp. 160-193.

Taffet, Jeffrey
>2007. *Foreign Aid as Foreign Policy: The Alliance for Progress in Latin America*. New York: Routledge.

Taller *denosotros*.
>2007. *El reino imaginario de Araucanía y Patagonia: Historia del sueño de Orelie Antoine.* Valdivia: *denosotros* Ex Libris.

Taussig, Michael
>1980. *The Devil and Commodity Fetishism in South America*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.

>1987. *Shamanism, Colonialism, and the Wild Man: A Study in Terror and Healing*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Taylor, Christine Anne
>1993. Remembering to Forget: Identity, Memory and Mourning among the Jivaro. *Man* 28(4) December, pp. 653-678

Taylor, Julie
>1998. *Paper Tangos*. Durham; London: Duke University Press.

Tedlock, Dennis
>1983. *The Spoken Word and the Work of Interpretation*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Terwindt, Carolijn
>2009. The Demands of the 'True' Mapuche: Ethnic Political Mobilization in the Mapuche Movement. *Nationalism and Ethnic Politics* 15(2), pp. 237-257.

Timerman, Jacobo
>1987. *Chile: Death in the South*. New York: Knopf.

Tinsman, Heidi
>2002. Partners in Conflict: The Politics of Gender, Sexuality, and Labor in the Chilean *Agrarian Reform, 1950-1973*. Durham NC: Duke University Press.

>2006. Politics of Gender and Consumption in Authoritarian Chile, 1973-1990: Women Agricultural Workers in the Fruit-Export Industry. *Latin American Research Review* 41, pp. 7-31.

Todorov, Tzvetan
>1998. *Les abus de la mémoire*. Paris: Arléa.

Tolkien, JRR. 1965[1964]. *Tree and Leaf*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin.

Tonkin, Elizabeth
    1992. *Narrating our Pasts: The Social Construction of Oral History*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Tsing, Ana
    1993. In the Realm of the Diamond Queen: Marginality in an Out-of-the-Way Place. Princeton NJ: Princeton University Press.

Tyler, Stephen A.
    1986. Post-Modern Ethnography: From Document of the Occult to Occult Document. *Writing Culture: The Politics and Poetics of Ethnography*. Berkeley CA: University of California Press, pp. 122-140.

Uribe, Daniel with Juan Salamanca
    2007. Country Background Report – Chile: O.E.C.D. Thematic Review of Tertiary Education. *OECD, Higher Education and Adult Learning Division*. Accessed November 15, 2012:
    http://www.oecd.org/education/highereducationandadultlearning/41473042.pdf

Valdés, Ximena
    2011. Se mata la perra, se acaba la leva. *Nación.cl*. Accessed November 15, 2012: http://www.lanacion.cl/se-mata-la-perra-se-acaba-la-leva/noticias/2011-08-05/092804.html.

Vargas Llosa, Mario
    1996. *La Utopia Arcaica: José María Arguedas y las ficciones del indigenismo*. México: Fondo de Cultura Económica.

Verdugo, Patricia
    1994[1989]. *Los zarpazos del puma*. Santiago: CESOC.

Villapolo Herrera, Leslie
    2003. Senderos del desengaño: Construcción de memorias, identidades colectivas y proyectos de futuro en una comunidad asháninka. *Jamás tan cerca arremetió lo lejos: Memoria y violencia política en el Perú.* Lima: IEP Ediciones, pp. 135-173.

Warren, Kay
    2005. Repositioning without Capitulation: Discussions with June Nash on Identity, Activism and Politics. *Critique of Anthropology* 25, pp. 217-228.

Webber, Jude

2012. Chile Axes 'Dictatorship' from School Books. *Policy & Politics*, 5 January. Accessed November 15, 2012: http://www.ft.com/cms/s/0/ed025638-37bc-11e1-9fb0-00144feabdc0.html#axzz272xsyq4E

Whitehead, Neil L.

2003. *Histories and Historicities in Amazonia*. Lincoln NE: University of Nebraska Press.

Wikan, Unni

1992. Beyond the Words: The Power of Resonance. *American Ethnologist* 19, pp. 460-482.

Williams, Raymond

1977. *Marxism and Literature*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Winn, Peter

2004. *Victims of the Chilean Miracle: Workers and Neoliberalism in the Pinochet Era, 1973-2002*. Durham NC: Duke University Press.

2005. *Americas: the Changing Face of Latin America and the Caribbean*. Berkeley CA: University of California Press.

Wellmann, Danka Ivanoff

2011. La Historia Reciente. Accessed November 15, 2012: *www.chilechico.cl/comuna/historia.htm*

Yerushalmi, Yosef

1988. *Usages de l'oubli*. Paris: Éditions du Seuil.

Yengoyan, Aram

1986. Theory in Anthropology: On the Demise of the Concept of Culture. *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 24, pp. 368-74.

Appendices

Appendix A: Panguipulli's Social Geography

While thousands of foreigners descend year round onto towns like Pucón, which sits on the northern slopes of the Villarrica volcano, vacationers who sweep into the lakes of Panguipulli are primarily Chilean. In both communes, tourism is an important local economy, where pockets of wealth prosper off the zone's snow-capped volcanoes, ancient forests (protected in national parks and private reserves), hot springs, and beaches. However, the communes of Pucón and Panguipulli are host to quite distinct types of wealth. In the first case, as an adventure sports hub, Pucón receives backpackers in dozens of hostels, as well as caters to a well-heeled clientele with a handful of five-star hotels and a new casino. Dozens of tour companies line the main street offering expeditions for rafting, canopy zip-lines, volcano ascents, skiing, rock climbing, mountain biking, and horseback riding. By contrast, Panguipulli is largely owned by formidably wealthy Santiagans who have built large summer cottages on isolated estates tucked into the rugged hillsides. Local workers today, who live on or adjacent to the expansive properties year round, permanently manage many of these cottages.

The surnames of Panguipulli's current large estate owners include some of Chile's most powerful elite. It includes the owner of one of the country's largest grocery chains, another the owner of all the major national brands of beer and pisco, owners of canned foods and plastics companies, state ministers, and a foreign opera singer. Many of these have come together as Panguipulli's organized benefactors, calling their charitable committee the Friends of Panguipulli (*Los Amigos de Panguipulli*). They meet regularly, usually in Santiago where most permanently reside, to coordinate development initiatives in the commune. Among these benefactors were the owners of the five-star hotels constructed less than a decade ago a short distance from Neltume.

While some local entrepreneurs have introduced outdoor tours to the area, Panguipulli lacks the infrastructure (paved roads into the interior, varied types of rented accommodations) to effectively mirror Pucón's rapid expansion in recent decades. In the commune's capital city, also called Panguipulli, tourists accustomed to cosmopolitan

amenities that are available in Pucón are easily disappointed by only a handful of typical Chilean restaurants (offering mostly the standard fare of beef, fried eggs, mashed potatoes, and soups), as well as a few modest hotels. Travellers who frequent Panguipulli often come for its famous thermal hot springs in the town of Liquiñe. In the past decade, the installation by a single owner of the two five-star hotels in the forest near Neltume has seen some tourists on package trips shuttled into the interior. In that case, nearly all their activities are managed by a single enterprise. That initiative underscores Panguipulli's social organization as highly class stratified. However, to presume that the the wealthy in Pangupulli are of long-term duration in the zone would miss a very important dimension of the commune's recent history, as it was host to repressions during the Pinochet regime and saw peasant-appropriated properties redistributed (in several cases under unclear terms) among powerful elite. Pangupulli's layered history of struggles against exploitation of both ethno-cultural and class nature render it an opportune window onto Chilean society's systematic exploitation of the rural South.

Appendix B: What can a family of four purchase on Chile's minimum age?

This diagram was posted on the Facebook page of the Universidad de Chile group *Estudiantes Informados* (Informed Students) on 19 July, 2012. It was inspired by the government's proposal to raise the minimum wage only 5% to approximately $400/month, an amount that even parties within the governing coalition found unreasonably low. The refusal to raise the minimum wage to a liveable level came only three months after the country's 38 senators received a self-assigned $2 million peso/month raise for their operating budgets (an amount of over $4000 a month). Calculating the very basic needs for a family of two adults and two children to survive, any family living on minumum wage is shown to fall short, often unable to afford hot water, school fees, fruits and vegetables, milk, clothing, medication, and any budget for entertainment.

WHAT YOU CAN BUY OR PAY FOR ON MINIMUM WAGE FOR A FAMILY COMPOSED OF 2 ADULTS AND TWO CHILDREN	
Afp-health insurance-unemployment insurance	$76
Mortgage or rent for a 1 room	$62
Gas (heating)	$23
Lights	$31
Water	$20
Transit for 21 days a month	$62
Bread (8 buns / day)	$56
12 eggs	$3
1 bag of salt	$0.75
25 bags of tea	$1.25
2 kilos of sugar	$2.50
6 packs of 400g pasta, no brand name	$5
2 kilos of rice, no brand name	$3.30
2 litres of cooking oil, no brand name	$3.75
2 packs of hot dog sausages	$8.30
2 tubs of 500g margarine	$4
Ground beef	$2.50
1 kilo of beans	$3.75
1 kilo of lentils	$3
3 kilo detergent, no brand name	$8
1 L of shampoo in a bag	$2.50
1 L of soap or 3 bars	$2.50
2 tubes of toothpaste	$3.75
8 rolls of toilet paper, no brand name	$6.60
4 L of kerosene *(for heating & other combustion)*	$5
Gas for hot water	$0
School fees	$0
Fruit	$0
Vegetables	$0
Milk	$0
Clothing	$0
Medication	$0
Entertainment	$0
total	$400CDN

QUÉ PUEDE COMPRAR Y PAGAR CON EL SUELDO MÍNIMO UNA FAMILIA INTEGRADA POR 2 ADULTOS Y DOS NIÑOS	
afp-fonasa-seguro cesantía	$ 36.670
dividendo o arriendo de 1 pieza	$ 30.000
gas	$ 11.000
luz	$ 15.000
agua	$ 10.000
locomoción 21 dias al mes	$ 29.400
pan 8 diarios	$ 27.000
12 huevos	$ 1.400
sal 1 bolsa	$ 350
te 25 bolsitas	$ 600
azucar 2 kilos	$ 1.200
fideos s/marca 6 paq de 400 gs	$ 2.500
arroz s/marca 2 kilos	$ 1.600
aceite s/marca 2 litros	$ 1.800
vienesas 2 paq	$ 4.000
margarina 2 de 500 gms	$ 2.000
carne molida	$ 1.200
porotos 1 k	$ 1.800
lentejas 1 k	$ 1.500
detergente s/marca 3k	$ 3.800
champu 1 litro en bolsa	$ 1.200
jabon 1 litro o 3 barras	$ 1.200
pasta de dientes 2 tubos	$ 1.800
papel higienico 8 rollos s/marca	$ 3.200
parafina 4 litros	$ 2.500
gas para calefont	$ 0
colegio	$ 0
frutas	$ 0
verduras	$ 0
leche	$ 0
vestuario	$ 0
medicamentos	$ 0
entretencion	$ 0
total	$ 192.720

Appendix C: Ethno-Cultural Profiles

Members of only one of the eleven families described themselves as descending from nineteenth century Europeans who were recruited by the state to colonize the southern provinces. Two families had grandparents on one side from known immigrant origins, these from waves of Palestinians and Croatians who arrived in Chile in the early decades of the twentieth century. The remaining families either traced their heritage to Mapuche ancestors or Chileans of unknown European origin who moved into the southern territories following the Pacification of the Araucanía. It was nevertheless common for non-indigenous families to indicate that their parents and grandparents arrived in Mariquina and Panguipulli from areas further to the South, and not from the Central Valley or the capital region further north. This suggests that distant relatives of some families may very well have arrived from Europe as recruited settlers, but that knowledge today about one's own immigrant origins is vague at best. Some Mapuche residents in the cordillera spoke of family having fled colonial violence in the Araucanía and the Argentinian pampas, but not all could trace their family histories as far back as the nineteenth century. Meanwhile, others in the same area identified knowledge about the specific landscape in which they lived that draws on the experiences of several generations (evident in stories about a number of major earthquakes), reinforcing that Panguipulli has been inhabited by indigenous people for at least several centuries.

Among the three families with no immediate members of Mapuche descent, two conveyed in stories of family origin significant intercultural pasts, which betray intriguing alliances and tensions between Mapuche and non-indigenous peasants. One deceased grandfather was described as having fluently spoken the Mapudungun language, apparently learned during childhood as a slave of a Mapuche cacique. His daughter described it as slavery, indicated that her father was sold and later bought out of the situation by an uncle. In the absence of a formalized slave system in the area during the twentieth century, this arrangement may have been a form of tenant labour.

Appendix D: Mapuche-Huilliche and Land Usurpations in Panguipulli

      Anticipating that I had heard complaints that Mapuche communities in Panguipulli are today pinched onto small plots of land and surrounded by vast estates owned by a handful of wealthy families based in Santiago, Don Baltasar suggested that problems surrounding indigenous land tenure have been produced by Mapuche people's own ignorance. In his words, "*they multiplied,*" creating a crisis on *reducciones*, whereby adult children and grandchildren needing their own spaces to survive, have been unable to live according to a traditional way of life. Don Baltasar's assessment of Mapuche society being cornered onto small plots elides historical facts. As mentioned previously, only 20% of Mapuche society lives in the ancestral territory today, the result of a dramatic out-migration from the countryside throughout the latter half of the twentieth century. Had the population primarily remained in rural *reducciones*, his explanation might make sense. However, Mapuche historian Doris Millanguir Neutopan (2007) offers a more probable reason, relating to Panguipulli's relatively delayed colonization. When the state declared the formation of Mariquina and Panguipulli's Province of Valdivia in 1826, it named all unsettled lands below the Toltén River fiscal property, opening these to auctions and other redistributive methods directed at increasing foreign productive presence to the south of the autonomous territory. The historian argues that for decades following mid-nineteenth century declarations to settle Valdivia, a substantial portion of the newly annexed province was only nominally under Chilean control (2007: 118):

      …pues extensas zonas cordilleranas y del río Tolten [sic] se mantenían bajo el dominio, jurisdicción independiente y administración autónoma mapuche, como es el caso de la sociedad mapuche-huilliche de Panguipulli.

      My translation: "…since extensive parts of the cordillera and around the Toltén River remained under the dominion, independent jurisdiction, and autonomous administration of the Mapuche, as was the case with

Mapuche-Huilliche society in Panguipulli." Note that Hilliche denominates Mapuche people living in southern territories, often marked by theToltén River, but also involving a unique historical and cultural trajectory due to longer contact with settlers.

Given that the militarization of the Araucanía moved from north to south, and from the coast eastward towards the cordillera over a period of several decades, colonial settlement was delayed in areas along the southern frontier of the autonomous territory. That was a time when Argenitnian forces carries out the *campaña al desierto* (literally, the campaign to the desert) to exterminate indigenous inhabitants on the opposite side of the cordillera. That operation aimed to crush resistance among Mapuche and Ranquel peoples who had not already been forced into wage labour on expropriated lands (Gordillo & Hirsch 2003: 7-8). Until 1881, the two young republics had competed for territorial control, but struck a treaty that year to delineate the international frontier. This effectively cut the *Wallmapu* into two, with the new border following the highest mountain peaks between rivers and springs whose waters run in opposite directions. Waterways winding to the Atlantic determined Argentinian territory and those flowing to the Pacific determined Chilean. Skirting the southern reaches of the autonomous territory, as well as the new international border, Panguipulli and especially the Liquiñe valley became a zone of refuge for Mapuche families fleeing colonial violence in the Araucanía and in the Argentinian pampas. At the arrival of surveyors, several Mapuche families were already cornered into a restricted space and were themselves viewed as settlers.

In her assessment, while the titling of indigenous lands in the Araucanía was slow and ineffective throughout the autonomous territory's occupation in the late 1800s, no such formal protections existed to the south of the Toltén until 1908. Before that time, no legislation and no commission to legalize indigenous property existed in the Province of Valdivia or further to the south, even though European settlers were being recruited *en masse*. Therefore, for nearly two decades after the Araucanía was formally annexed to Chile, Panguipulli did not have a commission responsible for protecting indigenous claims

to land. During that time, Panguipulli was host to especially ambitious settlers, some of whom were former soldiers seeking to appropriate themselves of territory as reward for their role in the conquest of the autonomous territory. These soldiers who had participated in the occupation of the Araucanía and who had lost out in the partitioning of lands to the north of the Toltén, sought small and medium sized properties known as *hijuelas* in Panguipulli. For their services to the Chilean state, at the end of the war (Millanguir Neutopan 2007: 142):

> …muchos de estos « colonos », comenzaron a mirar territorios mapuche que aún no habían sido regulados por la legislación chilena, -como la provincia de Valdivia-, y motivados por la necesidad o la avaricia, es que comenzaron a ocupar terrenos mapuche [ahí].

> My translation: "many of these 'settlers,' began to look at Mapuche territories that had yet to be regulated by Chilean legislation—as in the Province of Valdivia—and motivated by need or by greed, they began to occupy Mapuche lands [there]."

Documented modes of dispossession include fraudulent land purchases, fake deeds, and more sinister tactics like the so-called running of fences and the outright murder of Mapuche families living on coveted land (See Bernedo Pinto 1994; Díaz Meza 2007[1907]). These were conditions that instigated the original *Koz Koz Parliament* in 1907, when *lonkos* (leaders) gathered in a field near the contemporary city of Panguipulli to generate a common strategy for confronting growing violence at the hands of settlers in their territories.

Contested by Millanguir Neutopan's analysis, Don Baltasar's sanitized historical narrative of the establishment of private property in the interior suggests that the coincidence of state authority and commerce was a well-orchestrated historical project. It is therefore not casual that Don Baltasar and Rencoret Orellana dismiss both poor settlers and Mapuche residents of the interior as unreliable witnesses to history. Yet, their vision of the

natural landscape involves more than selective attention to historical facts, as their "talk" about it reveals the social construction of exclusion from the Chilean nation, which has very material consequences for who may or may not influence how the physical world is occupied.

Appendix E: The Huilo Huilo Initiative in Neltume

Huilo Huilo is a relatively new initiative, as the family behind it has only recent ties to Panguipulli. Its owners were not the first to acquire *fundos* surrounding Neltume following the state sell-off of the Panguipulli Forestry and Timber Complex in the late-1980s. However, this has not spared controversy in the eyes of locals over the means by which Huilo Huilo's patriarch, Víctor Petermann, acquired what land he owns. His properties stretch from town both southward to the limits of the Mocho-Choshuenco volcanic complex, and northward through the peaks that separate Neltume from Liquiñe. Technically two volcano peaks that share a base, Mocho-Choshuenco is referred to as a volcanic complex or more specifically as a compound stratovolcano. Covered in a glacier, missionary reports indicate that its last known extended eruption occurred in 1864. They include the Carranco estate, described in the previous chapter. In what remain unclear circumstances, French owners first purchased several of the twenty-two properties, part of the former forestry complex that was once managed by Pinochet's son-in-law. So did one of Chile's wealthiest business magnates, Andrónico Luksic.[cli] Now deceased, the *fundos* Enco, Quechumalal, Chan Chan and Puñir have passed onto Adrónico Luksic's family. However, the workers' union, which by 1988 composed some 400 members, also got a piece of the pie. Workers acquired the Huilo Huilo *fundo* as a severance payout. Ten years later, Víctor Petermann began purchasing properties in the area, including the Pilmaiquén *fundo*, which was renamed the Huilo Huilo nature reserve after the prominent cascades of that name that run through the property. His acquisition of the worker-owned estate would prove unsettling.

A number of manual labourers in Neltume indicated to me resentment for Petermann's purchase of the union's collectively owned *fundo*. Some believed that he negotiated secretly with former office staff, many of whom by 1999 no longer lived in Neltume, to purchase only 51% of shares to the more than 50,000 hectare Huilo Huilo estate owned collectively. Manual labourers, commonly referred to as *jornaleros*, were then left with little control over their *fundo*. *Jornaleros* technically means day-labourers, although as

members of the union their employment status was more secure than daily contracts. They too eventually sold their shares to Petermann, but at less than half of the price of shares for the first 51%. While the sale of the shares led to large payouts of money to several families in town, in some cases $20,000 or $30,000, the influx of cash which occurred just over a decade ago was quickly consumed in home improvements, the purchase of vehicles, and everyday expenses amidst increasingly precarious employment. A high school student described it to me as a period when everyone in town came to own washing machines. Some today are indebted because of the estate's sale, having neglected to pay taxes on income generated.

Appendix F: Endesa's Competitive Funds in Neltume

In the August 2009 Neltume town hall forum, after listing the Roundtable's year and a half of achievements, the next item on the agenda was to summarize results for the competitive fund. The speaker indicated that the money dispensed had now benefitted twenty institutions in Neltume. The summary on the overhead projector indicated that while there were that many projects supported, the number of organizations that received awards was far fewer. As the list was projected in a single page on the overhead, text was so small to be nearly illegible for anyone without a sense of what information to note. To my left, my colleague Don Oscar whispered with a grin "*Oh, how clear everything appears now*." The projects listed the purchase of materials for sports clubs, evangelical churches, a handscrafts group, and a women's collective of honey producers.

The $16,000 a year for five years offered by the company to the Neltume Lake communities was meant as compensation for more than a thousand people in the affected Mapuche communities. It could only be used to cover materials and labour for the construction of specified development projects, but community leaders were required to specify the projects that would come of the money. I made the mistake of understanding that this compensation was $16,000 a year per resident family, and not rather for the entire indigenous sector composing several hundred families living along the eastern slopes adjacent to Neltume Lake. Prior to Endesa's arrival, this sector composed two communities recognized by the national commission for indigenous development, known as the CONADI (*Comissión Nacional de Desarrollo Indígena*). Nevertheless, leaders told me that the company had determined that community negotiation would occur in four geographically partitioned sectors, a separation contrary to community organization that generally follows familial relationships. On occasions in which I observed company representatives encounter unsupportive audiences, be it for Endesa, SN Power, or Celco, corporate agents often emphasized respect for their personal rights. On several occasions, I observed company agents who were set to meet with Mapuche communities that were

opposed to industrial activities in ancestral territories, arrive accompanied by Special Forces officers, claiming fear for their personal security.

Appendix G: 2011 Students Protests

For the duration of the 2011 protests, police were accused of excessive force, unlawful arrests, and even torture of protesters. At a number of public marches, a small number of young, hooded participants were captured by reporters with their faces covered and in the process of damaging public and private property, creating street barricades out of trees and other objects they could uproot and set on fire. These particularly lawless protesters, it would seem often of high school age, became the infamous *encapuchados* (hooded ones). Their masks suggested to media speculators a willingness to take their protest to violent measures. Following the largest manifestations, videos were frequently posted on social media websites showing mainstream marchers in heated debate with those whose aggressive activities were feared to delegitimize the movement in the eyes of the public.

Fears about protesters being delegitimized for the tactics of a few were not unfounded. Much like Don Erwin mentioned earlier believed popular news to be 90% coverage of police activities, mainstream coverage of the early marches was heavily focused on pockets of destruction that were yet isolated. In one www.youtube.com video that went viral online, Chief of Police for metropolitan Santiago General José Luis Ortega is seen explaining to a reporter of a major television outlet how to recognize an *encapuchado*. He begins by identifying similarities in a projected video recording of protestors, pointing to successive individuals on the screen (Accessed online November 15, 2012: http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=_Ug7QoVzGrA):

> *How do they dress? Jeans…jeans…jeans…running shoes…running shoes…running shoes. So when you see a person with these characteristics, even if you don't know them, even if you have never before seen them before, you know that they belong to that group.*

Online commentary in response to the video suggests that its popularity among viewers lay in a disconnect percieved to exist among the police forces, between assessments

of threats and actual dangers. Although worn by the vast majority of society, jeans and running shoes seemed to make all youth in public spaces potential targets of repressive tactics. Santiago's Chief of Police was understood by many to be saying that pretty much anyone of a younger age group caught protesting was likely delinquent.

In another instance in August 2011, protesters in the city of Valparaíso caught on camera a masked man throwing stones at the National Congress building in the heat of a march. As he was persevered by marchers seeking to denounce his activities, the man ran towards the guardhouse of the Congress and was permitted by police officials to enter and disappear within. Those chasing him were swiftly stopped at the entrance by the same agents, as were deputies who attempted to enter the site in the moments following the fray. Other deputies from the Congress, who happened to be exiting a meeting at the time began to confronted the head security guard, insisting that an explanation be provided for the apparent cover-up. In a video also posted throughout social media sites, the head guard is seen eventually admitting that a plain-clothes police officer was inside the guard house and had been working within the crowds to keep the public order (Accessed online 31 January 2012: http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-ca4aCdfX5c). Among a number of similar encounters, evidence that police officers may have inflitrated protests in order to stir up violence helped to push public sympathies in favour of the students, who often endured the barrages of tear gas and water cannon trucks seemingly unprovoked.

Appendix H: Marileo-Calbucura Critique of Magnus Course with Response

Background of Parties Involved, prepared by Ana Mariella Bacigapulo, September 2012:

Armando Marileo is a Mapuche man who was born and raised in the Mapuche community of Huapi in Southern Chile. He performs as one of the ngenpin or ritual orators in the Rewe on Panku despite opposition from some members of the ritual community. He had some formal education in communication studies in the city of Temuko and also gives talks on Mapuche traditions, philosophy and culture. He directs the Center for the Study of the Mapuche world in Temuko. Huapi is 91 km from Temuko (85 km of the road are on an asphalt highway). Marileo divides his time between living in the community with his family and working in Temuko.
(*email withheld*)

Magnus Course was born and raised in England and completed his doctorate in anthropology at the London School of Economics in 2005. He is currently a Lecturer in Social Anthropology at the University of Edinburgh. He has done ethnographic fieldwork in the communities of Huapi, Budi, and Piedra Alta.
(*email withheld*)

Jorge Calbucura was born in a Mapuche community in Chile and completed his doctorate in sociology and teaches at Mittuniversitetet (Mid Sweden University). He coordinates Ñuke Mapu the Mapuche Documentation Center. He has done ethnographic fieldwork in the communities of Huapi and Budi.
(*email withheld*)
(*email withheld*)

Armando Marileo's Email Circulation, September 2012:

BRITISH ANTHROPOLOGIST IGNORES WORK OF MAPUCHE INTELLECTUAL AND ANCESTRAL AUTHORITY IN THE SAME COMMUNITY WHERE HE WORKS

I am a Ngenpin (Mapuche ancestral authority) of the Rewe of Pangku in costal southern Chile and a professor of Mapuche philosophy at the Universidad Católica de Temuco. In this Rewe we have our own system of spiritual, socio-cultural and political organization which is led by ancestral authorities. I was born in Huapi and as Ngenpin I am the main spiritual authority responsible for the performance of sacred Ngillatun ceremonies. I preside over a 45 lof (communities) including Piedra Alta and Huapi. British anthropologist Magnus Course did research in these communities and specifically on the sacred ceremonies of our people, the Ngillatun, in the Rewe of Panku which I preside over as the main spiritual authority. He extracted sacred

information from these sacred ceremonies without my authorization and without the authorization of the Longkos—authorities and heads of this sacred space. Then Magnus Course wrote a book titled "Becoming Mapuche: Person and Ritual in Indigenous Chile" about the communities of Piedra Alta and Huapi and the ceremonies we do in the sacred space of the Rewe of Pangku. The information he presents in his book is a theft of sacred knowledge of the members of the Mapuche Lafkenche territory. He did not contact me in person, he did not ask for my authorization, and he does not cite any of my publications on Mapuche cosmology, philosophy and ceremony in his book. Course manipulates the information and presents as "informants" people who are really authors of this knowledge.

I have published extensively about Mapuche cosmology, philosophy, and ceremony and have given workshops and lectures about Mapuche throughout the Americas. I have collaborated with many indigenous people including the First Nations people and Tsuu T'ina of Canada, Totonacs, Nahuas, Tarahumaras, Aymaras, and Quichuas. I am also now writing "the Fourth Mapuche History" where I reconstruct ancestral knowledge through time and look at the coexistence of all forms of life that sustain our mother earth. I have also created a "Mapuche University without walls" to continue teaching Mapuche ancestral knowledge. It is unethical that Magnus Course did not seek my authorization to conduct his research and that he exclude my words and my publications from his book. I am offended.

I would be grateful if you would circulate my letter on the listserves of the association of indigenous anthropologists and the association of indigenous religions as well as other pertinent listserves on indigenous people and in anthropology. If you have any ideas of how you can help me stop Course's colonialist unethical behavior and have him recognize his errors and mend his ways, I would be grateful. I speak Spanish, not English. I read a Spanish translation of the book and a friend translated this message into English to send to you. Please write to me in Spanish to the following email

Armando Marileo Lefio
(*email withheld*)
Ngenpin (Ancestral mapuche Authority) of Panku, Costal region of Budi in Chile.
Director, Center for the Study of the Mapuche World
Profesor of Mapuche Philosophy, Universidad Católica de Temuco

Armando Marileo's Publications

-2008 Marileo, Armando (with Dalai Lama, Gorbachov, Michael Douglas,
Mario Vargas Llosa) "Arte De Vivir, Ideas Prácticas de Grandes
Líderes", Editorial Kairós. Barcelona-España.

-2007 Marileo, Armando "Sueños de Wilimañ: La Naturaleza nos Cuenta su
Historia" Financiado por AVINA-MASISA.

-1995 Marileo, Armando with Ana Mariella Bacigalupo, Ricardo Salas,
Ramón Curivil, Cristián Parker, and Alejandro Saavedra Modernización o
Sabiduría en Tierra Mapuche? (Modernization or Traditional Wisdom in
Mapuche Land). Santiago, Chile: San Pablo.

-1995 Marileo Amando "Autoridades Tradicionales y Sabiduría Mapuche"
In ¿Modernización o Sabiduría en Tierra Mapuche?, (Modernization or
Traditional Wisdom in Mapuche Land). Co-authored, with Ana Mariella
Bacigalupo, Marileo, Ricardo Salas, Ramón Curivil, Cristián Parker,
and Alejandro Saavedra. Santiago, Chile: San Pablo. Reprinted in
Revista Educación Intercultural Bilingüe, Universidad Politécnica
Salesiana del Ecuador 1998.
-1995 Marileo Amando, "Mundo Mapuche" In: Medicinas y Culturas en la
Araucanía, Editorial Sudamericana. Santiago-Chile. Reprinted in
Teología India, Editorial ABYA-YALA, Ecuador 1998.
-1998 Marileo Armando "We-tripantu" (Año Nuevo Mapuche),CONADI.
-2006 Marileo Amando "Calendario integral Mapuche".
-2011 Marileo Amando "Curso Básico del Mapudungun" año 2011.
-2012 Marileo Amando "Diseño y publicación de un afiche CHE-ÑI-KALÜL
(cuerpo humano
mapuche) en chedungun y castellano."

Two International Mapuche Scholars Lend Support to Marileo, September 2012:

As Mapuche scholars we feel compelled to express our views on the book " Becoming
Mapuche: Person and Ritual in Indigenous Chile ", written by Magnus Course and
published by the University of Illinois Press. Magnus Course is a lecturer in social
anthropology at the University of Edinburgh.

People in different parts of the world have criticized the book pointing out the mistaken
perceptions of Mapuche politics. According to informed opinions on the issue, this author's
claim that the Mapuche people from Piedra Alta and Budi do not participate in the larger
Mapuche movement. According to the reader, it's simply untrue. The leader Longko
Kalfuqueo from Budi recently proclaimed his support for the territorial demands of the

communities in the region or Ercilla, and many scholars have demonstrated that rural Mapuche communities are connected to urban native politics and do participate in Chilean national politics.

Another reader points out how the author ignores the Mapuche traditional authority of the communities of Piedra Alta, Huapi and Trawa- Trawa completely. The Ngenpin Armando Marileo, a religious leader never been consulted or mentioned in the book and the author does not cite of Marileo's writings either.

According to the people in Canada and Europe, who express criticism, it is offensive and colonialist that the author would ignore the words of an indigenous ancestral authority and intellectual who is of such importance to the communities of Piedra Alta, Huapi and Trawa- Trawa.

We have taken note of the letter from Armando Marileo Lefio regarding how anthropologist Magnus Course has ignored and discriminated against him. We reiterate our commitment, and we express our support to Ngenpin Armando Marileo Lefio, and we demand respect for our brothers who are scholars and authorities and we demand the recognition and honor they deserve.

We recommend to the author that in the future, if you wish to get involved with indigenous issues, you should get permission from those community leaders. Finally, you should apologize to Leader Armando Marileo for retrieving information and publishing without his consent.

Jorge Calbucura
PhD in Sociology
Author: 2011 Consecuencias de la Privatización de las Reservas Indigenas Mapuche. Puerto Saavedra. Comunidad Ruca Traro. Ñuke Mapuforlaget

Victor Gavilan
Historian
Author: 2011 La Nación Mapuche-Puelmapu ka Gulumapu.Ñuque Mapuforlaget

Magnus Course's Response to Marileo, Calbucura, and Gavilan, Email Circulation, September, 2012:

Dear All,
Please find below my response, in English and Spanish, to the accusations recently made against me by Armando Marileo. Please forward to the relevant lists if you deem it appropriate.
Best wishes,
Magnus

I am both saddened and sickened to read of Armando Marileo's accusations against me. I owe it to myself, to my friends in Piedra Alta and Isla Huapi, and to the genuine holders of Mapuche sacred responsibilities, to respond to the false claims of Marileo, a man who resides in the regional capital Temuco, and has not lived in the community of Piedra Alta (where I carried out fieldwork) for over twenty years.

My research has been based in the community of Conoco Budi for the past sixteen years and I lived there permanently for three years between 2000 and 2003. Not only did I seek and receive permission and support for my research from both the lonkoheadman – Feliciano Ñancucheo - and the president of the community – Sergio Painemilla, I also asked permission from every single household within the community to check that my presence was welcome. As was made clear to me upon my arrival, no Mapuche person has authority over any other, so permission must be asked from each person involved. As people from Conoco Budi participate in the ngillatun ritual, I devote one chapter of my book to the organization of that event, not its "secret knowledge". Before carrying out this research I sought permission from both of the two ñidol ngenpin or "head priests" at that time– Orlando Huarapil and Fabio Colihuinca - both of whom gave me their support and advice.

It is sad that Marileo has distorted and corrupted the basic tenets of Mapuche philosophy – respect and personal autonomy – both in his writings and in his personal behaviour. I have ignored his publications because I believe they present an inaccurate and misleading picture of Mapuche reality, a picture which he supports by claiming in his writings to be a "lonko" headman. Armando Marileo is not a lonko, he has never been a lonko, and he never will be a lonko. I have never met a single person in either Piedra Alta or Isla Huapi who support this claim. Indeed, to the many Mapuche people who live in Piedra Alta and Isla Huapi his claims to be their "authority" and their "lonko"are not only ridiculous but deeply offensive. His claim to be ngenpin "ritual priest" is also refuted by many, especially as he has not lived within "his" rewe congregation for over two decades. Contrary to Marileo's claims, I did try and make personal contact with him. I went with my comadre Maria Antileo to meet him at his office in Temuco in 2000. He demanded that I should ask permission from him as "lonko"to carry out research in Piedra Alta. I was subsequently advised by the elders of Conoco Budi to refuse Marileo's demand as, in their words, "he might have authority in Temuco, but he has none here."

There is certainly colonialism at play here, but not by me. It lies in the attempt by Armando Marileo to monopolize all intellectual engagement with people in Piedra Alta and Isla Huapi for his own financial gain. The imperialistic claims of Marileo to be an "authority"over "his" people are an absolute contradiction and insult to the values I have learnt from the many rural Mapuche intellectuals I have spent most of the past two decades engaging with.

Marileo is correct that there is a politics of knowledge at play here, and he is also correct that there are ethical implications to this. I am painfully aware that I have benefitted from my engagement with Mapuche life. I have a job and a career because of it, whereas the people I work with remain poor and marginalized. So yes, I have failed them, and yes, the consequences of this politics of knowledge are asymmetrical and must be addressed. Yet

perhaps Armando Marileo should consider his own ethics as he reaps the rewards of commoditizing and selling his knowledge to the highest bidder?

I'm sure the disagreement between Marileo and myself will lead to further debate about the role of anthropology in contemporary Mapuche life, and to this extent it must be a positive thing. It's a shame, however, that the starting point of the debate consists solely of false accusations.

Dear Jorge and Victor,

Thank you for your contribution to the debate. Just to clarify briefly a couple of the points you raise:

- 1) My book is not about politics, but I do mention the theme briefly in the conclusion. I try and ask the question of why many people in Piedra Alta and Isla Huapi are relatively uninterested in the wider Mapuche movement, an issue Jorge Calfuqueo himself has noted. I certainly don't mean to suggest that nobody from the area participates in politics. This would clearly be incorrect, and if I've given this impression then it is my error for which I apologize, and will make more explicit in any future editions. I thank you both for bringing this point to my attention.

- 2) As I pointed out in my previous response, I sought and obtained permission from every relevant person within my fieldsite. Armando Marileo neither speaks for these people nor has any authority over them.

I think ultimately this debate is about a struggle for representation, not solely between Mapuche and non-Mapuche, but between rural and urban voices. I had hoped that by trying to give voice to rural Mapuche ideas in the context of the realities of rural Mapuche life, they would be of interest, perhaps even inspiration, to the many Mapuche intellectuals based in urban centres in Chile and overseas. I hope I haven't failed entirely in this task.

Thanks again for your contribution,

Magnus.

xl